Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #14
A Plenary Session of IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access
Portland, OR, USA
July 09-13, 2001

1) Opening Plenary, Monday 07/09/2001

At 1:45, Roger Marks, 802.16 Chair, called Session #14 to order.

Marks presented the Opening Plenary agenda <http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg14/opening.html>.

Marks presented the schedule for the week <http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg14/schedule.html>.

Motion#1, To approve the agenda as modified by Roger Marks: Walt Roehr, Anader Benyamin-Seeyar 2nd:
By voice vote, all for, none opposed
Motion#1 carries.

Marks reviewed the 802.16 processes including the rights of all attendees and rights of members.

Membership and voting was discussed

Members: 137
Potential Members: 98
Members in Peril: 6

Marks announced that the participation requirement for Session #14 is 6 of 8 intervals.

Carl Bushue, 802.16 Secretary, introduced the attendance and membership-token books. Four attendance books (one for each task and study group) will be used. The Task Group Chairs are responsible for insuring that the books are distributed to simultaneous meetings of their groups.

Voting tokens for members are with the Secretary. Members should place the tokens on their name badge.

Rights of all, rights of observers, rights of members were presented.
Participation is by individuals, not companies.
Group process steps, rules, legal/antitrust and patent policy (in detail) were covered <http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg14/opening_chair.pdf>.

802 Issues

Ethernet in the first mile PAR — This project may have issues involving a point to multi-point MAC for passive optical networks.
About 15 802.16 members plan to attend the Monday night tutorial.

802.11 has a new PAR that we will review.

802 Co-existence Study Group — The issue is to work out fair representation from 802.11/15/16

Regulatory Ad Hoc — Work initiated from 802.11 and will progress in conjunction with .15 and .16

Approvals:

Motion#2, Benjamin-Sayar, Paul Thomson 2nd: To Approve Minutes of Session #13 (IEEE 802.16-01/26)
By voice vote, all for, none opposed
Motion#2 carries.

Chair s expresses appreciation to TG2 for their work - Their document is almost ready for publishing.
Task Group reports:

Phil Whitehead, TG2 Chair reported: Final work is being put on the recommended practice **P802.16.2/D3**. Copyright releases and small editorial changes are needed.

Roger Marks, TG1 Chair, reported on TG1 status:
Working group Letter Ballot #3: The initial Ballot closed March 13 with approve 69, disapprove 17, abstain 7. The re-circulation closed June 18 with approve 76, disapprove 9, abstain 8.

Brian Kiernan, TG3 Chair, reported on TG3. TG3 and TG4 have agreed to produce a joint document. A joint editing session was held and comments on the completed document have been received. These comments will be resolved this week in joint sessions. Document comments go to the TG3 upload area unless a specific instruction is issued with a call for comments.

Durga Satapathy, TG4 Chair, reported on TG4. Work in regulatory co-existence will be worked on in addition to work with TG3.

Phil Whitehead, Study Group 2a Chair, reported on SG2a. The group is authorized as a Study Group till Friday. Final work on the PAR and five criteria will be done this week. The Working Group must approve the documents this week, to be forwarded to 802. Assuming the documents are approved, the group will need a secretary and an editor.

**Liaison Issues**

ETSI BRAN Hiperaccess—Jay Klein: They are just starting their drafting process, which is very different from the IEEE process. They are discussing using the IEEE PHY and MAC methods but there is no consensus on this yet.

ETSI BRAN HIPERMAN—Marianna: BWIF is being seriously considered as an alternative to IEEE 802.16 for use in HIPERMAN. Work is proposed to rewrite the compliance input from the IEEE that would provide specific input and not just refer to the Functional Requirements Document.

**Charge to Task Groups:**

- Complete the tasks on your agenda
- Update agendas on the bulletin board
- Prepare for next meeting
- Prepare for closing plenary
- Document everything
- Transfer presentations to the server 2 hours in advance
- Prepare input for session #14 report — draft on the web site

**Future sessions:**

#15 September 10-14 -- Denver
#16 November 12-16 — Austin
#17 January, 2001 — Finland?
#18 11-15 March 2002 -- St. Louis

New business: none

Motion#3 to adjourn:
Moved by Durga Satapathy, Phil Whitehead 2nd
Voice vote at 10:35: All For, none opposed.
Motion#3 carries.
2) Closing Plenary
Friday 07/13/2001

Called to order by Chair, Roger Marks at 9:50 A.M.

802.16 members who have not received a copy of the IEEE standards CD in 2001, send a note to the secretary requesting a copy.

The agenda was displayed and discussed: http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg14/closing.html

Motion#1 to approve agenda
So moved by Carl Eklund, Marianna Goldhammer 2nd
Motion#1 Approved without objection

Group Reports:

Regulatory: Report by David Chauncey, on rules and structure for the inter-Working Group regulatory group being formed. A number of responses are proposed:

Approval for NPRM response 11-01-391r4-R-NPRM.doc as posted on the server with paragraph 2.2.2 struck.
Motion#2 to support the document by David Chauncey, Durga Satapathy 2nd.
Comments by Marianna Goldhammer
Vote: 19 for, 0 against, 1 abstain.
Motion#2 carries.

Approval of ETSI BRAN response 11-01-468r2-R-BRAN.doc
Motion#3 to support the document by David Chauncey, Sonjay Moghe 2nd.
Discussion: The document is in pieces and needs to be reformatted. It will be submitted to IEEE802 where it will be reformatted again.
Vote: 20 for, none against.
Motion#3 carries.

Approval of ITU letter 11-09-469r0-R-ITU.doc
Motion#4 to support the document at the 802 level by David Chauncey, Sonjay Moghe 2nd.
Discussion: This will be sent through the USA State Department to the ITU.
Vote: 19 for, none against.
Motion#4 carries.

802.16 Coexistence Liaison Report: An 802 coexistence Study Group is proposed to deal with internal 802 issues. It will coordinate activity with the Regulatory TAG.

Marks: Thanks to David Chauncey and the group for their work. David will be the focal point for additional input to ETSI BRAN.  David Chauncey is named as the Parliamentarian of 802.16.

TG1: Report by Chair Roger Marks. Future Commentary (comment resolution) database files will have the extension .fp5 instead of .USR.

Motion#5 to accept the Comment Resolutions in 802.16-01/30r2, by Carl Eklund, Jay Klein 2nd.
Voice vote: all for, none opposed
Motion#5 carries.

Motion#6 To place the following motion in front of the LMSC SEC on July 2001: To grant conditional approval to forward IEEE P802.16 to LMSC Sponsor Ballot under Procedure 10 of the LMSC Operating Rules. by Carl Eklund, Jay Klein 2nd.
Vote: 40 for, none opposed, 1 abstain.
Motion#6 carries.
TG3: Report by Chair Brian Kiernan on comment resolution, a new call for comments on 
http://ieee802.org/16/tg3_4/docs/80216ab-01_01r1.pdf and the OFDM preamble comment deadlines are moved to 
August 24, 2001. The deadline for first Call is moved to August 27, 2001

TG4: Report by Chair Durga Satapathy:
Reviewed all MAC comments.
Held joint TG4/TG3 MAC meetings
— Got consensus on ARQ SR scheme
— Decided to employ block numbering sequence scheme
— Approved option to employ piggybacking
— Approved updates from MAC comments to document 802.16ab-01/01, establishing updated document as 
  baseline (i.e. requiring 75% majority vote for further changes)
Formed TG4 Coexistence Team, chaired by David Chauncey
Attended 802 Regulatory Group sessions & Coexistence Study Group sessions
Prepared responses to following:
  — FCC FNPRM 99-231
  — ETSI BRAN Letter
  — ITU- IWG5 & US JRG8A-9B

The Working Group Chair states his understanding that TG3 and TG4 agree that 802.16ab-01/01 as modified by the 
comment resolution in document 802.16ab-04r1 is approved as a baseline requiring a 75% approval for future 
changes. The Chair asked if there were any persons that disagreed with the statement and none came forward. 
There was discussion by Zion Hadid, David Trinkwon (about his being denied the chance to move that the approval 
be Tabled), and a number of members.

TG2: The TG2 Chair, Phil Whitehead, reported on Interpretation of Coexistence Recommended Practice

Motion#7 to approve interpretation (in IEEE 802.16-01/35) of section 6.1.3 of the coexistence recommended 
practice and submit it to the IEEE-SA secretary by Phil Whitehead, R mi Chayer 2nd
Vote: 27 for, none opposed.
Motion#7 carries.

Motion#8 to submit PAR 802.16.2a (document number 802.16-01/27r1) to the 802 SEC for approval by Phil 
Whitehead, Brian Kiernan 2nd
Vote: 28 for, none opposed.
Motion#8 carries.

New documents are on the server in the directories for each Task Group

Future sessions:
Interim/interim editorial meeting - June 7-8
Session #15 Interim — Denver, CO, USA September 2001
Session #16 Plenary — Austin, TX, USA November 2001
Session #17 Interim — Finland (?) January 2002
Session #18 Plenary — St. Louis, MO, USA 11-15 March 2002

Straw poll: At a Plenary meeting, how many want to be in a separate hotel - 13, how many would not want to be in a 
separate hotel - 9.

Finland — Levi http://www.levi.fi  The site is very close to Kittila airport. The schedule would be either January 7 or 
21.

Motion#9 to give the Working Group at the September meeting (Session #15) the authority to move the 
802.16ab-01/01rx document to the Working Group Letter Ballot, if so recommended, even in the absence of a 
quorum. By Brian Kiernan, Dean Chang 2nd.
Vote: 28 for, none opposed.
Motion#9 carries.

Liaison:
Report by Marianna Goldhammer: on liaison to ETSI TM4

**Motion#10** To approve the presented letter, as appropriately edited by the Chair and Marianna Goldhammer, by Phil Whitehead, R mi Chayer 2nd
Voice vote: all for, none opposed.
Motion#10 carries.

Report by David Chauncey on input on FCC-FNPRM-99-231.doc

**Motion#11** That the purple paragraph in the displayed slide (not available on server) represent the working group's position with respect to the power issues in the NPRM if another Working Group tries to amend the current proposed response, by David Chauncey, Marianna Goldhammer 2nd
Hostile motion by Niko Van Waes to set the precise number for a power proposal, Yori 2nd
Vote: 5 for, 6 against hostile motion fails
Motion#11 Voice vote 8 for, 1 opposed
Motion#11 carries.

**Motion#12** (motion not captured) Marianna Goldhammer David Trinkwon 2nd
Motion#12 withdrawn

Session #14 report:
Draft presented by Roger Marks. Discussed and edited by the group.
http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg14/report.htm
There were no objections to the edited text becoming the Session #14 report, with editorial revisions by the Chair.

New Business:
None

Closing:
**Motion#13 to adjourn**: Nico Van Waes, David Trinkwon 2nd
Voice vote at 12:50: All For, None opposed.
Motion #13 Carries.

Attached: Appendix A: Attendance

Submitted by Carl Bushue, IEEE802.16 Secretary
Appendix A, Attendance at Session#14

Session #14 included 9 session intervals. The participation criteria was 6 or more intervals. Please contact the 802.16 Session #14 Secretary (carl.bushue@mail.sprint.com) if you feel your attendance has been recorded incorrectly.

The following 123 people registered attendance at 6 or more intervals and met the participation criterion:

Aditya Agrawal
Song An
Gordon Antonello
Jori Arrakoski
Malik Audeh
Dave Auer
Eli Avivi
Kalatzis Babis
C.R. (Rick) Baugh
Anader Benyamin-Seeyar
James Brennan
Carl Bushue
Charles Cahn
Gregory Caso
Dean Chang
Yuankai Chang
David Chauncey
R m Chayer
Ki Ho Chung
Brian Eidson
Henry Elits
Carl Eklund
Vinko Ercig
Avraham Freedman
Andrew Garrett
G. Jack Garrison
Brian Gieschen
Marianna Goldhammer
Zion Hadad
Joseph Hakim
David Husson
Du Wayne Jackson
Eric Jacobsen
Musa Jahanghir
Hamadi Jamali
Pan Yuh Joo
Dae Eop Kang
Jamie Kardontchik
Phillip Kelly
Ofer Kelman
Brian Kiernan
Young-Ju Kim
Daniel Kim
Itzik Kitroser
Jay Klein
Jerome Krinock
Jang Kyung Hun
Jonathan Labs
John Langley
Chin-Chen Lee
Yigal Leiba
Minfei Leng
Moshe Levinson
Lars Lindh
Fernando Lopez de Victoria
Hui-Ling Lou
Heinz Lycklama
Robert Malkemes
Garik Markarian
Roger Marks
Russell McKown
Sushil Mehta
Andrew Middleton
Apurva Mody
Sanjay Moghe
Ronald Murias
Wayne Musk
Jim Nadeau
Robert Nelson
Kim Olszewski
Uzi Padan
Mike Paff
Panos Panagiotopoulos
Bonghyuk Park
Won-Hyong Park
Manish Patel
Kenneth Peirce
Juha Pihlaja
Subbu Ponnuismawmy
Manouchehr Rafie
Moshe Ran
Einan Regev
Guy Resheff
Valentine Rhodes
Walt Roehr
Amir Sarajedini
Octavian Sarca
Hikmet Sari
Durga Satapathy
Carl Scarpa
Randall Schwartz
Yossi Segal
Radu Selea
David Shani
David Shaver
Chaim Shenhav
James Simkins
Manoneet Singh
Jung Je Son
Sean Sonander
Ken Stanwood
Michael Stewart
Paul Struhsaker
Shawn Taylor
Jose Tellado
Paul Thompson
Ayelet Tiram-Regev
David Trinkwon
Linh (Paul) Truong
Nico Van Waes
Subir Varma
Lei Wang
Stanley Wang
Robert Ward
Larry Watkins
Philip Whitehead
Robert Whiting
David Williams
Vladimir Yanover
Huanchun Ye
Heejung Yu
Wenhua Zhang
Paul Zyskowski
The following 23 people registered attendance at 5 or fewer intervals and did not meet the participation criterion:

Ludger Arnoldi
Sina Barkeshli
David Butler
Michael Derby
Kenneth Fairweather
Takashi Fukushima
Vafa Ghazi
Jin-Meng Ho
Youngsoo Kim
R. Bud Koch
Philip Kossin
Peter Nurse
Eiji Okamoto
Hiroya Osawa
Stanley Reible
Bhipender (sp?) Virk