



Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #25 Meeting Minutes	
Date Submitted	2003-05-16	
Source(s)	Dean S.K. Chang Aperto Networks 1637 S. Main Street Milpitas CA 95035	Voice:(408) 719-9977 Fax:(408) 719-9970 [mailto:dchang@apertonet.com]
Re:	IEEE 802.16 Session #25 Minutes (Dallas/Fort Worth Airport, Texas, USA)	
Abstract		
Purpose	To record meeting minutes.	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < mailto:chair@wirelessman.org > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices >.	

Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #25

*IEEE 802.16 Working Group
Dallas/Fort Worth Airport, USA
12-16 May 2003*

Opening Plenary

Call to Order

Roger Marks called the meeting to order at 1:10pm, 12 May 2003.

802.16 Officers

Chair: Roger Marks
Vice Chair: Carl Ekund (absent for entire session)
Secretary: Dean Chang

Members

70 individuals were members before the session. However, 12 people have lost membership due to lack of participation in WG Letter Ballots #10 and/or #11 (see Annex A).

Attendance

There are 4 books this week: TGd, TGe, TGC, and Mesh Ad Hoc Committee.

Participation credit requires attendance in 6 of the 8 intervals for this session.

Agenda <<http://iee802.org/16/meetings/mtg25/opening.html>>

Motion 1: Gordon Antonello To approve Opening Plenary agenda on the 802.16 website with one change: to move TGd after TGe , 2nd Bob Nelson.

Motion 1: carries by unanimous voice vote.

Motion 2: Brian Kiernan, To approve Minutes of Session #24 (802.16-03/15), 2nd Phil Whitehead.

Motion 2: carries by unanimous voice vote.

Chair's Status Report (IEEE 802.16-03/21)

IEEE Copyrights

The Chair reviewed copyright procedures and referred to the following link, which covers information regarding copyrights for documents submitted to IEEE 802.16:

<http://iee802.org/16/ipr/copyrights>

IEEE 802 Rules (Patents)

The following advice was provided by the Chair:

- The IEEE's Patent Policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws;
- Early disclosure of patents which may be essential for the use of standards under development is encouraged;
- Disclosures made of such patents may not be exhaustive of all patents that may be essential for the use of standards under development, and that neither the IEEE, the WG nor the WG Chairman ensure the accuracy or completeness of any disclosure or whether any disclosure is of a patent that in fact may be essential for the use of standards under development.

Slide #1 ("IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws on Patents in Standards") and Slide #2 ("Inappropriate Topics for IEEE WG Meetings") were shown.

An opportunity was provided for WG members to identify or disclose patents that the WG member believes may be essential for the use of that standard.

No responses were provided.

IEEE-SA Actions:

1 April 2003:

Published, as an IEEE Standard,

IEEE 802.16a-2003 ("IEEE Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems – Medium Access Control Modifications and Additional Physical Layer Specifications for 2-11 GHz ")

Congratulations to TGc:

Brian Kiernan, Chair

Nico van Waes, Technical Editor

IEEE-SA News

Information was provided regarding claims of conformance to drafts.

802 Handoff Study Group

Setup in March 2003 as Executive Committee Study Group

David Johnston, Chair

Meeting here this week

IEEE 802.16/802.20 Names

There was a discussion about changing the names of the two groups. This did not happen in March.

Agenda for the Week

The agenda of the week is located at the following link.

<http://iee802.org/16/meetings/mtg25/agenda.html>

Task Groups

TG2

Phil Whitehead, Chair
Nico van Waes and Reza Arefi, Technical Editors

Sent to RevCom for Early Consideration in April 2003, but ran into issues. It is now moved to the June 2003 RevCom agenda. The concern was that this should have been a revision instead of an amendment.

TGC

Ken Stanwood, Chair
Carl Eklund, Technical Editor

P1802.16.1 in on the June RevCom agenda. Work will focus on 1802.16.2/D1 (10-66 GHz TSS&TP) to resolve comments from WG Letter Ballot #10. The group expects to open a WG letter ballot on a draft of 1802.16.3 (Radio Conformance Tests).

The WG Chair noted that IEEE-SA editorial staff are seeking to renumber the 1802.16.X PARs.

TGe

Brian Kiernan , Chair
Shawn Taylor, Vice Chair
Ron Murias, Technical Editor

The group is currently reviewing contributions and reviewing comments. Intent is to open WG Letter Ballot in July.

TGd

Gordon Antonello, Chair
Nico van Waes, Technical Editor

The group will work on comment resolution, reviewing 116 comments on P802.16d/D3 received in WG Letter Ballot #11. The goal is to have a version ready for working group recirculation ballot by May 23, 2003.

Some issues regarding the clarification of the scope of the PAR were reviewed. The group needs to draft some language to clear up these issues.

The TG Chair proposed that any changes intended to influence the work of other TGs or make major modifications to the defined methods is out of scope. He discussed how to define what is in the scope of the PAR regarding errors and inconsistencies. Some ideas will be developed in this area and then TGd will review this in their meetings this week.

Mesh Ad Hoc Committee

A WG Mesh Ad Hoc Committee was created at Session #24 to consider the introduction of mesh enhancements. It will meet this week to discuss some possible enhancements to the existing mesh mode in the 802.16a standard.

Scheduling of TGd and TGe

Naftali Chayat expressed some interest in having no overlapping meetings for TGd and TGe.

A number of comments were made. Some people were concerned that the groups will not have enough time to complete all of the work. After a bit more discussion, the Working Group made the decision that TGd and TGe would meet jointly on 12 May 2003.

Liaison

IEEE ISTO

In March, the 802 Executive Committee forwarded 802.16's letter was to IEEE-ISTO (IEEE L802.16-03/03r1). ISTO replied in IEEE L802.16-03/05. The letter notes that the BWIF organization is in "maintenance mode".

The Chair noted that Andrew Kreig has invited IEEE 802.16 to endorse the WCA2003 conference in Washington, DC, USA on 8-11 July 2003. No motions were made at this time.

Future Sessions

Session #26:

21-24 July 2003 at the Hyatt Regency SF, San Francisco, CA, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session.

Session #27:

8-11 September 2003 in Denver or Boulder, CO, USA (discuss hotel options at Closing Plenary).

At the last meeting, we voted to have the meeting in Denver and invite the participation of the other 802 wireless groups. The other wireless groups plan to meet in Singapore. The Chair has three contract proposals and plans to discuss them at the closing plenary.

New Business

None.

Closing

Motion 3 Bob Nelson, To adjourn the meeting 2nd Brian Kiernan.

Motion 3 carries by unanimous voice vote.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:30pm

Closing Plenary

Opening

Chair Roger Marks called the meeting to order at 7:00pm on 15 May 2003.

Agenda

Motion 4: Itzik Kitroser, to approve the agenda as presented, 2nd Lars Lindh

Motion 4: carries by unanimous voice vote

A request was made to have the TGe presentation before TGd presentation. This was accepted by unanimous consent.

802.18

Chair: Carl Stevenson

Carl Stevenson presented the closing report from IEEE 802.18 Regulatory TAG.

Motion 5: Heinz Lycklama, To approve document 18-03-029r0, authorizing the Chair of 802.18 to do necessary editorial and formatting changes, seek SEC approve as an 802 document, and file the document in a timely fashion with the FCC. 2nd Brian Kiernan.

Motion 5: carries 14-0-5.

Motion 6: Heinz Lycklama, To approve document 18-03-030r0, authorizing the Chair of 802.18 to do necessary editorial and formatting changes, seek SEC approve an an 802 document, and file the document in a timely fashion with the FCC, 2nd Yossi Segal.

Motion 6: carries 7-0-11.

Task Group 2

Chair: Phil Whitehead

There were no meetings this week, however Phil developed document 802.16.2a-03/06, entitled, "Changes in amendment to coexistence recommended practice 802.16.2a that affect the original published document."

Motion 7: Phil Whitehead To approve the explanations of changes to IEEE802.16.2a/D5, provided in document 802.16.2a-03/06 and, at the discretion of the WG chair, to forward to RevCom," 2nd Nico van Waes.

Motion 7: carries 20-0-1.

Mesh Ad Hoc Committee

Chair: Kamlesh Rath

Kamlesh reported for the Ad Hoc Committee and displayed a draft PAR. Many concerns arose, particularly on the question of whether the intent is to create a new mesh mode or to modify the existing one. No motions were made.

Task Group C

Chair: Ken Stanwood

Ken presented the closing report for TGC (IEEE 802.16C-03/04).

Motion8: To adopt document 802.16-03/17r2 as the resolutions of Letter Ballot #10 comments, use them as the basis of draft P1802.16.2/D2, initiate Working Group Recirculation Ballot #10a, and empower Task Group C to resolve the comments received in recirculation and produce a resulting P1802.16.2/D3 for a second recirculation ballot prior to Session #26, 2nd Lars Lindh.

Motion8: carries 20-0-0.

There is a strong request by the IEEE editorial staff to renumber conformance test documents. A proposed format was discussed, of the form 802.16/Conformance01-2003. No objections or concerns were raised.

Task Group e

Chair: Brian Kiernan

Brian Kiernan presented the closing report (IEEE 802.16e-03/12).

Roger asked if the longer term schedule was discussed. The current schedule is to go to Working Group ballot after the next session. A number of contributors were tasked to provide performance information, simulation results, process flow, etc. If this information does not come by next meeting, then there is possibility that WG ballot could be delayed.

Task Group d

Chair: Gordon Anotello

Gordon presented the closing report (IEEE 802.16d-03/08).

Motion 9:Gordon Anotello, "To accept changes defined in 802.16-03/18r2 and generate the next draft pending resolution of a copyright issue on contributions made to TGd," 2nd Shawn Taylor.

Friendly Amendment Itzik Kitroser – after "the next draft" by May 23, 2003.

Not accepted by Gordon and Shawn.

Friendly Amendment Gordon Anotello: To accept changes defined in comment database 80216-03/18r2 and generate the next draft of the standard based on the condition that the TGd editor is directed to not include the conditionally accepted comments into P802.16d03/D2-2003 if the copyright issue with the associated material has not been resolved to the satisfaction of the 802.16 WG Chair. Accepted

Friendly Amendment Roger Marks : To accept changes defined in comment database 80216-03/18r2 and generate the next draft of the standard by May 23, 2003, based on the condition that the TGd editor is directed to not include the conditionally accepted comments into P802.16d/D2-2003 if the copyright issue with the associated material has not been resolved to the satisfaction of the 802.16 WG Chair. Accepted

Friendly Amendment Bob Nelson, to change the date to May 30, 2003. Accepted

Motion 9: as fully amended: To accept changes defined in comment database 80216-03/18r2 and generate the next draft of the standard by May 30, 2003, based on the condition that the TGd editor is directed to not include the conditionally accepted comments into P802.16d03/D2-2003 if the copyright issue with the associated material has not been resolved to the satisfaction of the 802.16 WG Chair.

Motion 9: carries 11-0-6

Motion 10: Naftali Chayat, To conduct a 30 day recirculation ballot on the P802.16d/D2-2003 draft in which the entire draft is in the scope of the ballot, 2nd Itzik Kitroser.

Motion 10: carries 14-0-2.

Comment resolution scheduled for the July Session #26.

PAR Revision

Motion 11: Gordon Antonello, To modify the 802.16d PAR for a revision for fixed. No existing modes shall be deleted, 2nd Shawn Taylor.

The working group made edits to a revised PAR submitted by Roger Marks, C802.16-03/08r0, following the early TGd/TGe decision to initiate a change of the 802.16d PAR from an Amendment PAR to a Revision PAR.

A straw poll was taken to leave in the comment, “no new MAC or PHY modes will be added or deleted.” The poll was 11-3 in favor of leaving in the comment.

A vote was taken to determine the completion date for a standard. 20 voted for May and 3 voted for March.

Friendly amendment – the working group agrees to submit PAR C802.16-03/08r1 to the SEC for approval. Accepted.

Motion 11 as amended: To modify the 802.16d PAR to be a Revision PAR for fixed broadband wireless access. No existing modes shall be deleted. The working group agrees to submit PAR C802.16-03/08r1 to the SEC for approval.

Motion 11: carries 21-0-1.

Liaison***What is 802.19 doing?***

Phil Whitehead made a presentation regarding 802.19 (IEEE L802.16-03/06).

In response to a question from the Chair, Phil Whitehead said he was open to being appointed as the liaison to IEEE 802.19 for the time being. No action was taken.

Other

Motion 12: Dean Chang for the IEEE 802.16 WG to endorse the WCA2003 conference in Washington DC on July 8-11, 2003, 2nd Shawn Taylor.

Motion 12: carries 10-0-5.

ETSI BRAN

The Chair noted the receipt of a letter from ETSI BRAN (IEEE L802.16-03/05) regarding copyright permission.

802.20 Liaison

Naftali Chayat brought up the issue as to whether or not we need a liaison to 802.20. Discussion followed. No action was taken.

Future Sessions

Session #26:

21-25 July 2003 at the Hyatt Regency SF, San Francisco, CA, USA with the IEEE 802 Plenary Session.

Schedule, including timing of Closing Plenary

Roger Marks requested that the WG hold its closing plenary meeting on Friday 25 July, instead of on Thursday, due to his unavailability on Thursday night. Itzik Kitroser suggested a hard limit of 11 am on the closing time. Without objection, the Closing Plenary was schedule for 8-11am on Friday 25 July, with no votes to be held past 11am.

Session #27: 8-11Sept 2003; Denver or Boulder, CO, USA

Boulder hotel: \$103 room rate, plenty of meeting space.

Downtown Denver hotels– 2 possibilities, with room rate offers of \$119 and \$109.

\$140-180 registration fee

802.11 and 15 are planning to meet in Singapore.

Straw Poll: 18 for Denver and 4 for Boulder.

It was reported that 802.20 had a long discussion regarding 802.16 invitation to join 802.16 in Colorado. Most of the people preferred to go to Singapore, with the condition that there would be no SARs concern, but they wanted to stick with September 15th.

Session #28:

9-14 Nov 2003: Hyatt Regency Albuquerque, NM, USA with the IEEE 802 Plenary Session.

Session #29:

12-15 Jan 2004: Fairmont Hotel Vancouver, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada (with 802 wireless Working Groups)

Publicity

The chair was authorized, without objection, to create the Session #25 Report <<http://iee802.org/16/meetings/mtg25/report.html>>.

New Business

Kamlesh Rath thanked the group regarding the comments made regarding work from the Mesh Ad Hoc Committee. The Ad Hoc Committee charter is extended to the next meeting.

Nico van Waes announced his immediate resignation as the TGd Editor.

The Chair requested volunteers to become editor for TGd. Itzik Kitroser volunteered. TGd Gordon Antonello agreed. Without objection, Kitroser's offer was accepted.

Closing

Motion13: Bob Nelson, To adjourn the meeting, 2nd .Itzik Kitroser.

Motion13: carries by unanimous voice vote.

Annex A: Membership lost prior to Session #25 due to lack of participation in WG Letter Ballots #10 & #11:

Brian Banister
 Anader Benyamin-Seeyar
 Baruch Buskila
 John Fan
 Mark Klerer
 Chun-Ming Kuo
 Seung-Hwan Lee
 James Mollenauer
 Vincentio Roman
 Randall Schwartz
 James Simkins
 Robert Ward

Annex B: Attendance List: 802.16 Session #25

12-15 May 2003

This is the attendance list for Session #25 (with 59 names):

"Participated"	Name\Given	Name\Family	Company	City	State\Province	Country
Yes	Aditya	Agrawal	Fujitsu Microelectronics Inc.	Cupertino	CA	USA
Yes	Baraa	Al Dabagh	Intel Corporation	San Jose	CA	USA
Yes	Gordon	Antonello	Wi-LAN Inc.	Calgary	AB	Canada
	Malik	Audeh	Trapeze Networks, Inc.	Pleasanton	CA	USA
	Roger	Bertschmann	SiWorks Inc.			Canada
	Jerry	Carr				
Yes	David	Castelow	Airspan			UK
Yes	Dean	Chang	Aperto Networks	Milpitas	CA	USA
Yes	Naftali	Chayat	Alvarion Ltd.	Tel Aviv		Israel
	Steven	Conner	Intel Corp.			USA
Yes	Stephen	Dick	InterDigital Communications Corp.	Melville	NY	USA
	John	Dring				
Yes	Adam	Efron	Proxim Corporation			USA
Yes	Roger	Eline	Intel Corp.			USA
Yes	Jan	Erreygers				Belgium
	Lars	Falk	TeliaSonera			Sweden
Yes	Zion	Hadad	Runcom Technologies Ltd.	Rishon Le Zion		Israel
Yes	Takanari	Hayama	IGEL Co. Ltd.	Tokyo		Japan

	Christopher	Hinsz	Symbol Technologies, Inc.	San Jose	CA	USA
Yes	David	Husson	Sandy Neck Consulting	East Sandwich	MA	USA
Yes	Brian	Johnson	Nortel Networks	Germantown	MD	USA
Yes	David	Johnston	Intel Corporation	Hillsboro	OR	USA
Yes	Panyuh	Joo	Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.	Sungnam	KYUNGGI	Korea
Yes	Tal	Kaitz	Alvarion Ltd.	Tel Aviv		Israel
	Phil	Kelly	BeamReach Networks, Inc.	Sunnyvale	CA	USA
Yes	Ofer	Kelman	Airspan Networks (Israel) Ltd.	Lod		Israel
Yes	Brian	Kiernan	InterDigital Communications Corp	King of Prussia	PA	USA
Yes	Byung-Sik	Kim	Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.			Korea
Yes	Itzik	Kitroser	Runcom Technologies ltd	Rishon Le Zion		Israel
Yes	Changhoi	Koo	Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.	Suwon-si	Gyeonggi-do	Korea
	Lalit	Kotecha	Sharp Labs	Union City	CA	USA
Yes	Barry	Lewis	Radiant Networks PLC	Little Chesterford	ESSEX	UK
Yes	Hyoungsoo	Lim	ETRI	Daejeon		Korea
Yes	Lars	Lindh	Nokia Research Center	Helsinki		Finland
Yes	Heinz	Lycklama	Vectrad Networks	Arlington	WA	USA
Yes	Martin	Lysejko	Airspan	Uxbridge	Middlesex	UK

Yes	Roger	Marks	NIST	Boulder	CO	USA
Yes	Russell	McKown	MacPhy Modems	Richardson	TX	USA
Yes	Andrew	Middleton	Airspan Communications	Uxbridge	Middlesex	UK
	Rias	Muhamed	SBC-TRI			USA
Yes	Ronald	Murias	Wi-LAN Inc.	Calgary	AB	Canada
Yes	Robert	Nelson	MacPhy Modems	Richardson	TX	USA
Yes	Kamlesh	Rath	Arcwave Networks	Fremont	CA	USA
	Mark	Rich	SkyPilot Network, Inc.	Belmont	CA	USA
Yes	Randall	Schwartz	BeamReach Netwroks	Sunnyvale	CA	USA
Yes	Yossi	Segal	Runcom Technologies Ltd.	Rishon Le Zion		Israel
	Paul	Senior	Airspan Networks	Uxbridge	Middlesex	UK
	Yeong Moon	Son	Samsung			Korea
Yes	Kenneth	Stanwood	Ensemble Communications	San Diego	CA	USA
Yes	Yoshihiro	Suzuki	Panasonic	Yokohama City		Japan
Yes	Shawn	Taylor	Wi-LAN	Calgary	AB	Canada
	Lai-King Anna	Tee	Consultant			USA
Yes	Jose	Tellado	Intel Corporation	San Jose	CA	USA
Yes	Rainer	Ullmann	Wavesat Wireless Inc.	Ville St.Laurent (Montreal)	PQ	Canada
Yes	Nico	van Waes	Nokia Networks	Mountain View	CA	USA

Yes	Arthur	Wang	Proxim Corporation	Long Beach	CA	USA
	Stanley	Wang	CyberTAN Technology, Inc.	San Diego	CA	USA
Yes	Philip	Whitehead	Radiant Networks PLC	Little Chesterford	ESSEX	UK
Yes	Choong-il	Yeh	ETRI	Deajeon		Korea