MEMO:
FROM: Michelle Turner
Date: 14 August 2003
Re: Editorial Review of P802.16/Conformance02-D3

Upon editorial review of IEEE P802.16/Conformance02.

For further guidance in preparing an IEEE Standard, here's the URL for access to the on-line version of the IEEE

1) In some of the tables 1802.16.1 is used. Please change to the correct designation. IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01-2003.

-----------------------------
Note also this followup:

Michelle,

We'll address Point (1). Did you mean to include a Point (2)?

Roger

No, sorry about that. I should have just left the one comment unnumbered.

Thanks.

Michelle Turner

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Resolution of Resolution
Table: IEEE Standard for Conformance to IEEE 802.16(TM) Part 2: Test Suite Structure and Test Purposes for 10-66 GHz WirelessMAN–SC™ Air Interface

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document under Review</th>
<th>Ballot Number</th>
<th>Comment Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P802.16/Conf02/D3</td>
<td>0000505</td>
<td>2003/09/02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment # 002**

Comment submitted by: Roger Marks

**Comment**

Title should be modified to parallel that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01, which was modified by editorially staff.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change title to: "IEEE Standard for Conformance to IEEE 802.16(TM)"

Part 2: Test Suite Structure and Test Purposes for 10-66 GHz WirelessMAN–SC™ Air Interface"

Make change on Pages i and 1.

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation by

**Reason for Recommendation**

Resolution of Group

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Ken Stanwood is now the WG Vice Chair.

Suggested Remedy

On line 10, change WG Vice Chair to Kenneth Stanwood.

At line 13, add:

Carl Eklund served as Working Group Vice Chair during Working Group Letter Ballot.

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation:  Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes  Editor's Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
In the title, "10-66" should use an n-dash and "WirelessMAN–SC" a hyphen, as in IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

**Suggested Remedy**

In the title, make sure that "10-66" uses an n-dash and "WirelessMAN–SC" a hyphen.

Make change on Pages i and 1.

**Proposed Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Resolution of Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decision of Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group's Notes</th>
<th>Group's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editor's Notes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>k) done</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Copyright notice should be moved into source files, not just be pasted in as a comment.

Suggested Remedy

Move Copyright notice into source file, and modify to:
"IEEE and 802 are registered trademarks in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

WirelessMAN and WirelessMAN-SC are trademarks owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions f) pass off to other editor

IEEE Staff editor

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy


Reorder the references so that IEEE standards and drafts are together, followed by ISO/IEC standards.

Proposed Resolution: Reorder the references so that IEEE standards and drafts are together, followed by ISO/IEC standards.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions: k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns
In IEEE editorial style, references are not numbered.

**Suggested Remedy**

Delete reference numbers.

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation:  

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

**Need to also delete section 6.1.3 on page 13.**

**Editor's Actions**

f) pass off to other editor

**Section 6.1.3 deleted. IEEE staff editor will deal with rest.**
Opening of References should be parallel to that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy
Replace entire opening of Clause 2 (everything before the references themselves) with:

"The following documents contain provisions which, through reference in this text, constitute provisions of the present document. References are either specific (identified by date of publication, edition number, version number, etc.) or non-specific. For a specific reference, subsequent revisions do not apply. For a nonspecific reference, the latest version applies."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The reference to the TGd document assumed an accepted amendment. Currently, it's not accepted, and it may become a revision instead.

Suggested Remedy
We need to figure out what this reference should be.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Refer to "IEEE P802.16d/D3-2003" Put "Draft" as first word in title. Capitalize "Profiles"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Definitions statement should be parallel to that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01

Suggested Remedy

Change the contents of 3.1 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following terms and definitions apply in conjunction with the terms defined in IEEE 802.16."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Refers to Section 4.1. Change the contents of 4.1 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the definitions in IEEE 802.16, as well as those in ISO/IEC 9646-1, ISO/IEC 9646-2, ISO/IEC 9646-6, and ISO/IEC 9646-7, apply."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Comment # 011
Comment submitted by: Kenneth Stanwood

Comment Type: Editorial
Starting Page # 2
Starting Line # 50
Fig/Table# 011
Section 4.1

Suggested Remedy
Change "]6, [7], and [8] apply" to "[6], [7], and [8] apply"
On line 51 change "]2, [3], [4], and" to "[2], [3], [4], and"
On line 57 change "]6, [7], and [8] apply" to "[6], [7], and [8] apply"
On line 58 change "]2, [3], [4], and" to "[2], [3], [4], and"

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Superceded

See comment 010

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions 1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change the title of 3.2 to: "Abbreviations".
Change lines 56-61 of 3.2 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following abbreviations apply in conjunction with the abbreviations defined in IEEE 802.16."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Change the title of 4.2 to: "Abbreviations".
Change lines 56-61 of 4.2 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following abbreviations apply in conjunction with those defined in IEEE 802.16 as well as those in ISO/IEC 9646-1, ISO/IEC 9646-2, ISO/IEC 9646-6, and ISO/IEC 9646-7."
The "X"s in table 1 aren't filled in.

Suggested Remedy

I can fill them in if I have a FrameMaker 6 version, but I don't want to recreate the entire table in Word just to provide the input.

Proposed Resolution: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Is InterCell Link the same as repeater station?

If so get rid of one in favor of the other. It is not clear from Figure 1 that the definition of intercell link applies to BS.

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Rejected

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Notes

Editor's Action Items

Editor’s Action Items

none needed
Patent section is inappropriate since no claims have been made. Should instead use the Patent clause from IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy

Replace Patent clause with:
"Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. The IEEE shall not be responsible for identifying patents for which a license may be required by an IEEE standard or for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of those patents that are brought to its attention."

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Conformance test methodology should match that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

**Suggested Remedy**

Replace Conformance test methodology clause with:

The multipart conformance test documents for IEEE Standard 802.16 are identified by “IEEE Standard 802.16/ConformanceXX”. For example, the first part of the conformance specification for IEEE 802.16 is designated “IEEE Standard 802.16/Conformance01.”

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation by

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

Changed the page number from 4 to vi to reference the correct section.

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**

k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
Suggested Remedy

add the following text: "The two most important characteristics of which are level crossing rate and average fade duration."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions 1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
replace "A propagation phenomenon caused by the reception of a large number of reflected"

replace with "A channel characterization where the received signal is composed of waves with random amplitudes, angles of arrival and phases and the absence of a non fading signal."

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

replace with "A channel characterization where the received signal is composed of waves with random amplitudes, angles of arrival and phases and the presence of a non fading signal. As the presence of the non fading component goes to zero, the Ricean Distribution approaches the Rayleigh distribution."

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation:  Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions  ) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Add AGL

Suggested Remedy
It appears in Table 9—Horizon range for different radio heights AGL (in km)

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions 1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Add X-Pol and C-Pol and H-POL

Suggested Remedy
It appears in Table 14,15

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Add definition for dynamic range

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions i) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.
Incorrect protocol name - Internet Time. According to RFC 1305, the time synchronization protocol name is Network Time Protocol (NTP).

Suggested Remedy
Tests for verifying DHCP, Network Time Protocol (NTP) and TFTP related functions.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
There is an additional "to verify" phrase in the sentence "Tests to verify to verify the request/grant protocol".

Suggested Remedy
Remove the additional "to verify" in that sentence

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Remove the additional "to verify" in that sentence

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Tests to verify the request/grant protocol.

Suggested Remedy
Tests to verify the request/grant protocol.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Duplicate

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Mistyped 'procedured' instead 'procedures'.

Suggested Remedy
Tests of the procedures for adding and removing an SS to/from a multicast polling group.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change 'Reference.' to 'Reference:' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Throughout the document, sometimes a period, ".", is used after Reference, Initial Condition, Stimulus, or Expected Behavior. We should do a global change to a colon, ":", instead.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested Remedy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Replace the periods with colons in the test purpose descriptions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation:</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resolution of Group</th>
<th>Decision of Group: Accepted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group's Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Actions</th>
<th>k) done</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Questions and Concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
The reference *must* contain ...

**Suggested Remedy**

Change 'should' to 'must'.

**Proposed Resolution**

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Modified

change "should contain" to "contains".

Additionally, split table 2 into two tables. The first row should be a standalone table titled "Test Purpose Description Structure". Remove the words "IEEE P802.16/Conformance01-2003, Table A3/3" from the first row since they are an example, not part of the structure.

Additionally, change the text in the TP Id row from "The TP Id is a unique identifier it shall be specified" to "The TP Id is a unique identifier specified".

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
We don't use "protocol group" followed by "protocol subgroup", but instead use "test suite group" followed by "protocol group".

Suggested Remedy
Change "TP/<st>/<pg>/<sg>/<x>-<nnn>" to "TP/<st>/<tg>/<pg>/<x>-<nnn>".
Insert a new row before line 45: ":<tg> = test suite group I See Table 1"
Delete the row on lines 48-49.
On page 13, line 5 change "Addition protocol subgroup of the Dynamic Services protocol group" to "Addition protocol group of the Dynamic Services test suite group"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
According acronym definitions (4.2) CA, BV etc. named 'test category'

Suggested Remedy

<*> = test category

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"Small gap above section number, huge gap below section number."

Suggested Remedy
Adjust formatting. Check also elsewhere.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Need to verify if this is a heading style issue or whether there are extra blank lines after headers.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions f) pass off to other editor

IEEE staff editor will deal with style issues.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"Stimulus:' not 'Stimulus.' ' ' instead of ':' appears throughout the document. The same applies to 'Expected behavior', etc."

Suggested Remedy

Change 'Stimulus.' to 'Stimulus:' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Duplicate

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"No reference given. Applies to entire Table 5. Each case requires a reference or a reason. Same for Table 6, 7, etc."

Suggested Remedy
Provide Reference or reason.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Provide references where there are none. Additionally, validate existing references.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The wording is kind of bland and implies we may have just not gotten around to defining tests.

Suggested Remedy
Change the wording of section 6.2.1.4, 6.2.1.2.2, 6.2.1.2.3, and 6.2.1.4 to use wording like in section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation:  Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation
Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes  Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The base station should never be provoked...

Suggested Remedy
Change "provoked" to "stimulated"
Same change on page 18, line 7.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions  k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change "UCD Count." to "UCD Count".
Make the same change on page 18, line 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation:</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for Recommendation:

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution:

Group's Notes:

Group's Action Items:

Editor's Notes:

Editor's Actions:

k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns:

Editor's Action Items:
Suggested Remedy

Word sections 6.2.1.3.2, 6.2.1.3.3, 6.2.1.3.4, and 6.2.1.3.5 like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation by

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Action Items

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Notes

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"Very vague statement. Also, specify a test fixed and 'random' test message to ensure coverage."

Suggested Remedy
Provide reference to where such is specified.

Proposed Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Per the suggested remedy, add to the end of the sentence "per Clause 12 of IEEE 802.16".

The tests referenced in this section should be changed to "TP/SS/CDM/CDC". Also the references in the similar section 6.2.1.2.6 on page 17, line 27 needs fixed. All similar sections should be reviewed for correctness.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"Very vague statement. It makes little sense to state this, as otherwise an incorrect test method would result, invalidating the test. This statement has little to do with 'Message Formats'."

**Suggested Remedy**

"Remove comment, mark as comment, or include a subclause entitled 'Comments' (which may be a good idea)."

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted-Duplicate

The resolution of this comment is described and covered by the resolution of comment 40.

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

1) none needed

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Incorrect DHCP message naming. According RFC 1541 this message name is DHCPDISCOVER

Suggested Remedy

IUT send DHCPDISCOVER on said connection

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Actually on page 27, not page 21 - changed page number above to allow ordering comments by page number.

Appears on page 27, line 28 also.

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns
I believe Clause 3.2 should replace what appears in 5.5.1.1

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions 1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change "limit.." to "limit."

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
ICL is it Interference coupling loss or interference coupling level

Suggested Remedy

3.2 Has it as interference coupling loss, but 5.5.1.3 has it as coupling level

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
OOB is it out of band or out of block

Suggested Remedy

3.2 has it as out of block, but 5.5.1.3 has it as out of band.

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes  Editor's Actions  l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>047</th>
<th>Comment submitted by:</th>
<th>Kenneth Stanwood</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Comment** Editorial

**Starting Page #** 28  **Starting Line #** 24  **Fig/Table#** 6.2.3.1.4

**Suggested Remedy**

Change the contents of sections 6.2.3.1.4, 6.2.3.2.2, 6.2.3.2.3, and 6.2.3.2.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

**Proposed Resolution** Recommendation: **Resolution of Group**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions** k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>048</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment submitted by</td>
<td>Kenneth Stanwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document under Review</td>
<td>P802.16/Conf02/D3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballot Number</td>
<td>0000505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Date</td>
<td>2003/08/19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table #</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.2.3.2.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**

change "reveives" to "receives"

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

Resolution of Group: Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Comment # 049
Comment submitted by: Mark Tillinghast
Technical

Starting Page # 29
Starting Line # 59

Figure 11 Add note

Suggested Remedy

Note: for values 0-90, class 1 and class 2 are colinear.

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
change "TFTP-CPLT." to "TFTP-CPLT."

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Editor's Action Items

k) done
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>051</th>
<th>Comment submitted by:</th>
<th>Kenneth Stanwood</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.2.4.1.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**

change "condition:Basic" to "condition: Basic"

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation: change "condition:Basic" to "condition: Basic"

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: **Accepted**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Change "of the SS antenna is a factor in determining intersystem"

Suggested Remedy
Change to "of the SS antenna is a palpable factor in determining intersystem"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The references list is unnecessarily broken in the middle

Suggested Remedy
Remove the extra carriage return.

Proposed Resolution: Remove the extra carriage return.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions: k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.4.2.2, 6.2.4.3.2, 6.2.4.3.3, and 6.2.4.3.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.2.4.4.2, 6.2.4.4.3, 6.2.4.4.4, and 6.2.4.4.5.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.
This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Suggested Remedy

QPSK or alternatively define 4-QAM in the definitions 3.1
Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
On line 17, change "condition:IUT" to "condition: IUT"
On line 27, change "condition:IUT" to "condition: IUT"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
replace Second Adjacent

Suggested Remedy

with alternate. If channel 13, 14, and 15 are specified channel 13 is channel 15's lower alternate channel should be defined in 3.1

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions 1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Should be stated in clause 1: NOTE—National regulation and/or international agreements may impose tighter limits than the following and shall take precedence in this case.

Suggested Remedy
Move statement to clause 1.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor’s Actions l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Replace with: "The operators are encouraged to use principled negotiations arrive at mutually acceptable sharing agreements that would allow for the provision of service by each licensee within its service area to the maximum extent possible."
See for example:http://www.colorado.edu/conflict/peace/treatment/pricneg.htm
Suggested Remedy
Replace with more specific recommendation, perhaps a reference to another IEEE standard

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Replace "good engineering practices"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Action Items

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Actions

Incorrect references to other tests

Suggested Remedy
Change "BV-003" to "BI-002"
On line 48, change "BV-005" to "BI-004"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
On lines 17, 24, and 34, change "has has" to "has"
Suggested Remedy
Change section 6.2.5.3.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change sections 6.2.6.1.3, 6.2.6.1.4, and 6.2.6.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
On lines 32 and 41, change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

k) done

Editor's Action Items

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution: Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted
Decision of Group:

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions: k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
**Suggested Remedy**

Change "Reference" to "Reference:

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor's Actions**  k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

### Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Starting Page #</th>
<th>Starting Line #</th>
<th>Fig/Table#</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>069</td>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>6.2.4.2.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment Date** 2003/08/19

**Comment** missing colon

**Ballot Number:** 0000505

**Editorial**

**Member** Kenneth Stanwood

**Document under Review:** P802.16/Conf02/D3

**Comment submitted by:** Kenneth Stanwood

**Ballot Number:** 0000505

**Comment Date** 2003/08/19

**Comment** missing colon

**Comment #** 069 **Type** Editorial **Starting Page #** 50 **Starting Line #** 32 **Fig/Table#** 67 **Section** 6.2.4.2.4
Suggested Remedy
change section 6.2.6.2.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 52.

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions
k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy:
change "Comparisonat" to "Comparison at"

Proposed Resolution: change "Comparisonat" to "Comparison at"

Reason for Recommendation:

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Group's Action Items:
k) done

Editor's Action Items:

Editor's Questions and Concerns:

Editor's Action Items:
Nyquist filter \( \alpha \) is not a percentage

**Suggested Remedy**

It is a measure of excess bandwidth with respect to brick wall filter. Replace 25\% rolloff with \( \alpha = 0.25 \)

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions** I) none needed

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
Suggested Remedy
Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change sections 6.2.9.4 and 6.2.9.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Drop case of capital K.

Proposed Resolution
Suggested Remedy

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

k) done

Editor's Notes

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The '-' in front of '-80' is a bit small compared to the '+' in front of numbers later.

Suggested Remedy
"More prominent '-'. Perhaps increase font by 1 point, or change to bold?"

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Fix the minus sign in the manner most appropriate for the editor.

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Fix the minus sign in the manner most appropriate for the editor.

Group's Action Items
k) done
Throughout the table and the document, full stops are missing at the end of several sentences.

Suggested Remedy
Place full stops where necessary.

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: 

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Action Items
"Define 'modulation accuracy', state equation, or provide a reference for its definition for clarity. Perhaps in section 4."

**Proposed Resolution**

"Modulation accuracy is expressed in error vector magnitude (EVM), as defined in IEEE 802.16 for WirelessMAN-SC." Do the same for subclause 6.3.12.8 for the BS.

**Group's Action Items**

- k) done
What is meant by 'according to the transmitter characteristics'?

Suggested Remedy
More specific. Perhaps an example might help.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Modified

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Editor’s Notes

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

k) done
"On my screen and printout, the '-' in front of '+94' appears significantly fainter then the '+'."

Suggested Remedy
"More prominent '-'. Perhaps increase font by 1 point, or change to bold?"

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Changed whole expression into FM Equation

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
MBaud. Please verify if 'MBaud' can not be written as 'Mbit/s'.

**Suggested Remedy**
Verify if comment is appropriate to ensure use of consistent units.

**Proposed Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Change &quot;MBaud&quot; to &quot;Msymbols/s&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reason for Recommendation**
Do same change other places where MBaud refers to the symbol rate.

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**
In this context, MBaud is referring to "mega symbols per second" for QPSK the actual Mbits/s would be double the MBaud referred to here.

**Group’s Notes**

**Editor’s Action Items**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>k) done</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**
2003/10/16

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3

Comment # 082

Comment submitted by: Ingolf Meier

Member

IEEE 802.16-03/40r2

Comment Date 2003/08/10

Comment Type Editorial

Starting Page # 72 Starting Line # 51

Fig/Table# Section 6.2.12.13.1

2 µs' and '20 µs'. Use small Greek mu 'µ' instead 'u'.

Suggested Remedy

Change 'u' to 'µ' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Potentially dangerous edit. The character 'µ' is acheived by changing the font of that character to 'Symbol'. If paragraph definition is updated and overrides are removed it might revert to a 'm' wreaking havoc in the specifications.
"Consistency. In line 39 '1^st', where ^ indicates superscript, is used. Here, however, 1st without superscript appears. This applies to the remainder of the document too. E.g. Tables 107, 216, 217, etc. The Table caption uses 1^st."

Suggested Remedy
"Choose a consistent format throughout the document. Suggested to use 1^st, 2^nd, that is with superscript."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation:</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions: k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
It appears as if the line spacing increases between the line on which superscript is used and the line above it. Word processor?

**Suggested Remedy**

Maintain consistent format and in this case line spacing.

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation:

**Reason for Recommendation**

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: **Rejected**

Agree, in principle, but can't do much about it. See reason below.

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

This is a word processor issue. The only way to change it would be to deviate from standard IEEE styles.

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Use non-breaking hyphen between 49 and byte to keep them together.

Suggested Remedy
Use non-breaking hyphen between 49 and byte to keep them together.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group:

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Is this possible in FM?

Group’s Action Items
f) pass off to other editor

IEEE staff editor will handle this

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Use non-breaking hyphen between 51 and byte to keep them together.

Suggested Remedy
Use non-breaking hyphen between 51 and byte to keep them together.

Proposed Resolution
    Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
    Decision of Group:

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Is this possible in FM?

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions
    f) pass off to other editor

IEEE Staff editor

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Reference and/or reason missing. Applies to remainder of this table and subsequent tables.

**Suggested Remedy**
Include appropriate reference and/or reason.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation:</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reason for Recommendation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resolution of Group</th>
<th>Decision of Group:</th>
<th>Accepted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group's Notes</th>
<th>Group's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Notes</th>
<th>Editor's Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>k) done</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment Type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**


**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**

k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**

insufficient text
Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.14.2.4 and 6.2.14.2.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.2.14.3.2 and 6.2.14.3.3.
Do the same for sections 6.2.14.4.3 and 6.2.14.4.5

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
"For clarity please word, with this line as example."

Proposed Resolution
Rewrite in a non-language specific manner.

Reason for Recommendation
Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Rewrote the equation using the mathematical operator for exclusive and a single equality sign.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>091</th>
<th>Comment submitted by:</th>
<th>Kenneth Stanwood</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.2.14.4.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**

change "Reference" to "Reference:"

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**
k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
Adaptive Antennas is listed page 6 line 10 as advanced antennas

Suggested Remedy
Pick one and get rid of the other.

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions  1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
Do the same on page 96, line 7 and page 96, line 17

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Editorial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Use non-breaking hyphen between DL and MAP.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Resolution</td>
<td>Recommendation:</td>
<td>Recommendation by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reason for Recommendation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resolution of Group</td>
<td>Decision of Group: Accepted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group’s Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is this possible in FM?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group’s Action Items</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editor’s Notes</td>
<td>Editor’s Actions</td>
<td>k) done</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Added carriage return to keep DL-MAP together.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editor’s Questions and Concerns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editor’s Action Items</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>096</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment submitted by</td>
<td>Kenneth Stanwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Editorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.3.1.1.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "Expected results" to "Expected behavior"

Do the same on page 97, line 9

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>097</th>
<th>Comment submitted by:</th>
<th>Kenneth Stanwood</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Editorial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.3.1.1.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**British spelling**

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "behaviour" to "behavior"

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**

k) done
Change sections 6.3.1.1.4 and 6.3.1.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.3.1.2.2, 6.3.1.2.3, 6.3.1.2.4, and 6.3.1.2.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.1.3.2, 6.3.1.3.3, 6.3.1.3.4, and 6.3.1.3.5.
Two full stops.

Suggested Remedy
"Remove one full stop, leave the other."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Ranging Status bit set to 4'? A standard bit can only take on two options. Perhaps 'bits'?

Suggested Remedy
Please clarify and make appropriate changes if necessary.

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Modified
change "Ranging Status bit" to "Ranging Status"

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
Ranging Status is a defined field of the message. The word "bit" is a typo.

Group’s Notes
Group’s Action Items
k) done
Spectral power flux density does not match the acronym psfd

Suggested Remedy
change Spectral power flux density to power spectral flux density

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions I) none needed
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Colon where there should be a period.

Suggested Remedy
Change "CID:" to "CID."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:  Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes  Editor's Actions  k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
change sections 6.3.3.1.5 and 6.3.3.2.2 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for section 6.3.4.1.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.2.3, 6.3.4.2.4, and 6.3.4.2.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.3.3, 6.3.4.3.4, and 6.3.4.3.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.4.4 and 6.3.4.4.5.
Incorrect DHCP message naming. According RFC 1541 this message name is DHCPDISCOVER

**Suggested Remedy**

**SS sends DHCPDISCOVER on Secondary Management Connection**

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
"Is 'min' a valid unit? 'min' is also used in the sense of 'minimum'. If it is, then there should be a gap between the numeral and the unit. If it is not, then change to appropriate unit. Suggested to express time in seconds."

Suggested Remedy

"Verify if 'min' is a valid unit. If it is, then there should be a gap between the numeral and the unit. If it is not, then change to appropriate unit. Suggested to express time in seconds, that is '900 s'."

Proposed Resolution

"min" referred to minutes. Determine valid abbreviation "min" or "m" and use that. If the appropriate abbreviation cannot be determined, replace "15min" with "15 minutes"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Clarified

The abbreviation is for minutes is min. Space added between numeral and unit.

Editor's Actions k) done
Consistency. A change in font size by about 1 point occurred compared to above. The 1 point larger font is more pleasing to the eye.

Suggested Remedy
Ensure consistency throughout the document.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:            Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group       Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions  k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
**Comment # 107**

**Type** Editorial

**Starting Page #** 120  
**Starting Line #** 37

**Fig/Table#** 163  
**Section** 6.3.5.1.2

**Suggested Remedy**

**Comment** missing space

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:** Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

k) done
Timers should be described using units of time, not as values.

**Suggested Remedy**

`timer T8 at maximum value' instead of 'timer T8 max value'.`

**Proposed Resolution**

`timer T8 at maximum value' instead of 'timer T8 max value'.`

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: **Accepted**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
http://www.rabc.ottawa.on.ca/english/pubs.cfm is a dead link

Suggested Remedy
remove or provide alternative for the derivation that can be accessed

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.
Suggested Remedy
Change "2,3" to "2,3"

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: Change "2,3" to "2,3"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor's Action k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"110%' is philosophically arguable. Perhaps write '..., within a time of below 10% above the maximum value of timer T8'."

Suggested Remedy

"Perhaps write '..., within a time of below 10% above the maximum value of timer T8'."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Rewrite as 1.10*Maximum value of T8.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Rewrite as 1.10*Maximum value of T8.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
No stimulus in test purpose

Suggested Remedy
Add "Stimulus: Passage of time."

Add the same stimulus to the next two test purposes (lines 19 and 25).
Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference: IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
Do the same on page 132, lines 3 and 11.

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
run together lines

Suggested Remedy
Insert a carriage return before "Initial Condition"

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
### Comment # 115

**Type:** Technical

**Starting Page #:** 132  **Starting Line #:** 55  **Fig/Table #:** 178  **Section:** 6.3.6.1.2

**Comment:** missing stimulus

**Suggested Remedy:**

Add "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the PM bit set."

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**  k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
| Comment # | 116 | Comment submitted by: | Kenneth Stanwood | Member |
|-----------|-----|----------------------|-------------------|

**Comment Type**: Technical  
**Starting Page #**: 132  
**Starting Line #**: 62  
**Fig/Table #**: 178  
**Section**: 6.3.6.1.2

**Missing Stimulus**

**Suggested Remedy**

Add "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the PM bit set."

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group**: **Accepted**

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**

**k) done**

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
Suggested Remedy

Insert "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the SI bit set."

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: 

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change sections 6.3.6.1.3, 6.3.6.1.4, and 6.3.6.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

k) done
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>119</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Editorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Page #</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Line #</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>6.3.6.2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comment**: missing colon

**Suggested Remedy**: Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

**Proposed Resolution**: Recommendation

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group**: Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**: k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
missing stimulus

Suggested Remedy
Add "Stimulus: Refer to PIXIT for information regarding conditions under which BS may create Multicat Polling groups."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change "Reference" to "Reference:"
Do also on lines 23, 30, and 46.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change "Stimulus:Timer" to "Stimulus: Timer"

Proposed Resolution: Change "Stimulus:Timer" to "Stimulus: Timer"

Reason for Recommendation:
Resolution of Group: Accepted
Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution:

Group's Notes:

Group's Action Items:

Editor's Notes:

Editor's Actions:
k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns:

Editor's Action Items:

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.9.4 and 6.3.9.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Recommendation

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Table 193 - Burst Preamble

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Verify if wording should not be as follows: '...which are integer multiples of ...' instead of '...which are multiples of ...'.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Modified

Change "The BS is able to generate frequencies which are multiples of 250 kHz" to "For each supported band, the BS is able to generate all in-band frequencies which are higher than the lower edge of the band by positive integer multiples of 250 kHz."

Editor's Notes and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

k) done
"Consistency. Here the unit 'sec' is used. Above, however, 's' was encountered already. ISO units are suggested."

Suggested Remedy
Ensure consistent use of units. ISO units are suggested.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

either use "2s" or "2 second"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Is there supposed to be a comma between the numerals -2 and 5 or should this form the number -2.5?

Suggested Remedy
Please see if comma between -2 and 5 is appropriate.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Change "-2,5" to "-2.5"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
There are several blank pages between pp. 152-169, leading the reader (and reviewer) to wonder if something is missing.

Suggested Remedy
Remove the blank pages.

Proposed Resolution
Remove the extra blank space, not all the pages are totally blank.

Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

k) done
lots of extra white space

Suggested Remedy
eliminate extra white space on pages 152, 153, 154, 157, 158, 161, 162, 163, 167, 168, and 169

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: 

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Duplicate

See Comment 128

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
"Pages 153 and 154 are empty. Why? Same applies to sections 6.3.12.10.1, 6.3.12.11.1, etc."

Suggested Remedy
Remove of fill empty pages. Correct formatting.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Duplicate

Comment 128

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

"It may be better to replace these with wordings such as larger then, smaller then, etc."

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

For "\leq" or "\geq" try to use appropriate symbol. "\==" has a special meaning and should be retained.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Appropriate mathematical symbols used. '==' is language specific, more specifically it is used for 'equals' where '=' implies a substitution. There is no possibility for confusion in this specification, thus a single '=' is used.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Use worded meaning of '<='.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Duplicate

Comment 131

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Replaced <= with the appropriate symbol

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
unresolved and incorrect reference to another test

Suggested Remedy
Change "TP/BS/xxx/xxx/xx-008" to "TP/BS/ACS/ATM/BV-007"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation
Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change "09" to "009"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
unresolved and incorrect reference to another test

Suggested Remedy
Change "TP/BS/xxx/xxx/xx-008" to "TP/BS/ACS/ATM/BV-007"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.14.2.2, 6.3.14.2.3, and 6.3.14.2.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51. Do the same for sections 6.3.14.3.2, 6.3.14.3.3, and 6.3.14.3.5.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
change "Descriplos" to "Descriptors"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
unused footnote symbol in table title

delete the footnote symbol

Proposed Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
**Comment # 139**  
**Comment submitted by:** Roger Marks  
**Type:** Editorial  
**Starting Page #:** 94  
**Starting Line #:** 4  
**Fig/Table#:** 119  
**Section:** 6.2.14.4.1

**Suggested Remedy**  
change "003" to "004"

**Proposed Resolution**  
**Recommendation:**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**  
**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**  
**Editor's Actions**  
k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Abbreviation for Identifier has incorrect case.

Suggested Remedy
change "Id" to "ID"
Also on page 12, line 4 (2 places).

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Stimulus and expected behavior are unclear.

Suggested Remedy

Change

"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size +(-) [0.5 – 2] dB
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be monotonically positive (negative)"

to

"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range 0.5 to 2 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be non-negative.

The test shall be rerun with the following conditions:
Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range -0.5 to -2 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be non-positive."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Split into two test purposes. Used standard mathematical notation instead of 'range of ... inclusive'.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Stimulus is unclear.

Suggested Remedy

Change

"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size +/- [2 - 5] dB
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within +/- 2 dB of the requested change."

to

"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range 2 to 5 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within 2 dB of the requested change.

The test shall be rerun with the following conditions:
Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range -2 to -5 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within 2 dB of the requested change."

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: k) done

Split into two TPs. Used mathematical notation for range.
First test case of table is unclear.

Suggested Remedy

Explain with less terse notation how the multiple PHS rules are being applied.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Extensive rewrite of the TP.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Last sentence incorrect in TP/SS/MAC/PDU/BV-002.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change to read "Verify the SS properly checks CRC on data received from BS."

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions** k) done

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI tests refer to incorrect message.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change DSA-REQ to DSC-REQ and DSA-RSP to DSC-RSP in TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI-000 to TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI-005

**Proposed Resolution**

**Resolution by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
Suggested Remedy
Change to "Initial condition: SS awaiting TFTP-RSP, retries exhausted."

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items