
Title: Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #36

Date Submitted: 2005-01-27

Source(s): Dean S.K. Chang
Aperto Networks
Voice: +1 408-719-9977
mailto:dchang@apertonet.com

Re: IEEE 802.16 Session #36 Minutes (Atlanta, GA, USA)

Abstract

Purpose: To record minutes of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group’s Opening and Closing Plenary meetings.

Notice: This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release: The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE’s name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE’s sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.

Patent Policy and Procedures: The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>, including the statement “IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard.” Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <mailto:chair@wirelessman.org> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>. 


Minutes of IEEE 802.16 Session #36
IEEE 802.16 Working Group
Atlanta, GA, US
14-17 March 2005

Opening Plenary

Call to Order
Roger Marks called the meeting to order at 1:05 pm, 14 March 2005.

IEEE 802.16 Working Group Officers
Chair: Roger Marks
Vice Chair: Ken Stanwood
Secretary: Dean Chang

802.16 Membership
220 Members
127 Potential Members
117 Official Observers

272 people registered with the IEEE 802.16 as their primary or secondary selection.

Attendance

Attendance Sign-In procedure:
Attendance Intervals: 10 [Mon pm; Mon night; Tue am; Tue pm; Tue night; Wed am; Wed pm; Thu am; Thu pm; Thu night]
“Participation” Requirements: 7 intervals
No Attendance Books; electronic only
Attendance credit is not granted for participation in meetings of other Working Groups at interim sessions.

Attendance credit granted to 802.16 members for participation in IEEE 802.18, 802.19, and 802.21; you are responsible to note this in the IEEE 802.16 attendance log and forward proof of participation to WG Chair by Friday 18 March.

Agenda

Motion 1: David Johnston, to approve the Opening Plenary Meeting Agenda as presented, 2nd Brian Kiernan.
Motion 1: approved by unanimous voice vote.

See http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg36/opening.html

Motion 2: Ron Murias, to approve Minutes of Session #35 (IEEE 802.16-05/006r1), 2nd Gordon Antonello.
Motion 2: approved by unanimous voice vote.

Chair’s Status Report (IEEE 802.16-05/014)
The Chair presented a report, including rules of operation for the IEEE 802.16 Working Group.

Copyright Procedures
The Chair reviewed copyright procedures and referred to the following link, which covers information regarding copyrights for documents submitted to IEEE 802.16:
IEEE-SA Rules (Patents)

The following advice was provided by the Chair:

The IEEE’s Patent Policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws;
Early disclosure of patents, which may be essential for the use of standards under development, is encouraged;
Disclosures made of such patents may not be exhaustive of all patents that may be essential for the use of standards under development, and that neither the IEEE, the WG nor the WG Chairman ensure the accuracy or completeness of any disclosure or whether any disclosure is of a patent that in fact may be essential for the use of standards under development.

Slide #1 (“IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws on Patents in Standards”) and Slide #2 (“Inappropriate Topics for IEEE WG Meetings”) were shown.

An opportunity was provided for WG members to identify or disclose patents that the WG member believes may be essential for the use of that standard.

One question was made regarding a patent by AT&T Wireless which has been transferred to another party. As soon as possible, the Chair will send another letter to the legal counsel to the new company that owns this patent.

No responses were given regarding this announcement.

802 Plenary Meetings Outside of North America

A motion was passed in the 802 EC to hold at least one plenary meeting outside North America each year, beginning in 2008.

IEEE-SA News

A new procedure has been developed for IEEE-SA Sponsor Ballot. IEEE-SA calls this “myBallot.” For more information, see <http://standards.ieee.org/sa/ballotnews.html>. The existing invitation pools are not carried over to myBallot, so those interested in participating in Sponsor Ballot need to enroll through myBallot.

Entity Balloting

The EC affirms that 802 uses only individual participation in Sponsor Balloting

802.22

The IEEE 802.22 Working Group notified the EC today that it expects to schedule a Call for Interest on Tuesday night regarding beacons for devices such as wireless microphones. [Note: Call for Interest did not occur.]

Schedule for the Week

The schedule for the week was presented, including meetings from all task groups. A few changes were made to the schedule for NetMan and also Maintenance. See <http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg36/schedule.html>.

Contribution Procedures

http://wirelessman.org/submit.html

Submittals that violate the procedures will not be accepted.

TGe

Brian Kiernan, Chair
Ron Murias, Technical Editor
See opening report IEEE 802.16e-05/004 for more details.

Sponsor Ballot Recirc concluded on P802.16e/D6 with ~560 comments
Current standing: 94 Approve, 42 Disapprove (69% affirmative; requires 75% minimum for ballot approval)

94 on-time contributions were received regarding the comments.

Rather than going through the comments one by one, the group will form drafting groups based on particular topics. The thought would be to do this on Tuesday night.

Expected Closing Plenary Motion: “To accept IEEE 802.16-05/012r1 as the Sponsor Ballot comment resolutions, develop Draft P802.16e/D7 based on those resolutions, and initiate Recirculation”

Reconsideration of development schedule is in order, since it seems to not be feasible to request Conditional approval from 802 EC this week to submit to RevCom.

**Maintenance Task Group**

Jon Labs, Chair
Itzik Kitroser, Editor

See opening report IEEE 802.16maint-05/006 for details.

Results of WG Letter Ballot #17 (concluded last night): 151 submitted votes, 127 approve and 24 disapprove, for a 95% approval ratio, and return ratio of 71%

Review of development schedule: very challenging to get Sponsor Ballot closed by Session #37. It may be difficult to get Conditional Approval from 802 EC this week to submit to RevCom. Note: Sponsor Ballot Group invitation set to close on 30 March.

Expected Closing Plenary Motion: “To accept IEEE 802.16-05/015r1 as the WG Letter Ballot #17 comment resolutions, initiate a 15-day recirculation, and develop Draft P802.16-Cor1/D2 based on the resolutions for addition to the recirculation package within one week of the opening of the recirculation”

Expected Closing Plenary Motion: “To request conditional approval from the LMSC EC to forward P802.16-Cor1 for Sponsor Ballot.”

**Network Management Task Group**

Phillip Barber, Chair

The group will have a couple of joint sessions with 802.21 this week.

The opening meeting for the Task Group will be on Wednesday this week starting at 8:00am.

There have not been many comments or contributions to this group. It’s important to submit material

Completion of WG Letter Ballot #16 on P802.16f/D3
No comments or votes received. No outstanding unresolved Disapprove comments.

Motion: “To request approval from the LMSC EC to forward P802.16f/D3 for Sponsor Ballot.”
Note: Sponsor Ballot Group invitation closed on 11 March. 26 people joined. Ballot will conclude before Session #37. [Note: Ballot invitation was later extended by IEEE-SA Balloting Center.]

Responses to Call for Contributions on P802.16g; plans for draft development.
TGC
Gordon Antonello, Chair

No new input received in response to Call for Comments on Working Document. Meeting are scheduled anyway.

Licensed-Exempt Task Group
Mariana Goldhamer, Chair

A Call for Contributions had been issued regarding P802.16h draft according to the initial table of contents. A number of contributions were received.

The meeting will be held on Tuesday.

Liaison

IEEE 802 Architecture Group Report
David Johnston and Philip Barber

The IEEE 802 architecture group is maintaining a running list of issues on the 802.1 web site.

3GPP2 Report
Scott Migaldi
Liaison Statement from 3GPP2 TSG-S (IEEE L802.16-05/012); need to develop response.

This is a response to an 802.16 liaison. There were a few questions about referencing specific documents and also addressing copyright issues.

ITU-R Report
José Costa
Follow up to contributions to ITU-R JTG 6-8-9 (IEEE L802.16-05/013). JTG 6-8-9 requested more information, such as antenna patterns, and the next meeting will be in Seoul on 25-31 August 2005. José proposes that we prepare a response to be developed by the July 802 Plenary. Roger Marks designated José Costa to develop this response document. A meeting was scheduled for this week to discuss this and other ITU-R issues.

ETSI BRAN Report
Mariana Goldhamer

Liaison from ETSI BRAN to IEEE 802.16 on “Harmonization of HiperMAN PHY and DLC” (IEEE L802.16-05/016) was presented. There are some new work orders in HiperMAN to harmonize with 802.16-2004 and to add OFDMA (from IEEE 802.16e and 802.16-2004) to improve the nomadic capabilities for HiperMAN. The group may need a copyright agreement between both groups to provide up to 10% of the published standard within a future HiperMAN document.

ETSI is also working out an agreement with the WiMAX Forum.

The agreement between IEEE-SA and ETSI has expired. It would be good to arrange a meeting to re-establish this.

WiMAX Forum Report
The WiMAX Forum sent a letter to the 802.16 WG Chair (IEEE L802.16-05/017). A response should be developed to this letter. Roger Marks ask if there were any thoughts or comments on this. Ken Stanwood mentioned that we need to clarify what is meant by referencing technical documents. Marks assigned Ken Stanwood to draft a response to this letter and also asked the NetMan Task Group to provide Ken with comments.
TTA Report

Panyuh Joo presented letter from TTA PG302 to IEEE 802.16 Working Group (IEEE L802.16-05/018). The letter mentions that TTA will study the P802.16e draft and provide comments. It will also make efforts for complete harmonization of TTA PG302 and IEEE 802.16 specifications considering initial commercialization of WiBro services in early 2006 in Korea.

Roger Marks requested that Panyuh Joo draft a response letter for review before the Closing Plenary.

IETF Report

Marks reviewed a report of discussions with IETF (IEEE L802.16-05/019). EAP and MIB issues were discussed. It would be opportune to coordinate. David Johnston and Roger Marks will work on a draft liaison statement.

CCSA Report

Dong Xiaolu presented a report on the progress of CCSA TC5/WG3 (IEEE L802.16-05/020). He noted that WG3 meets once every two months.

Future Sessions

http://ieee802.org/16/calendar.html

Session #37: 2-5 May 2005 Sorrento, Italy

Session #38: 18-21 July 2005: San Francisco, CA, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session

Session #39: 12-15 Sept 2005 Taipei

Session #40: 14-17 November 2005: Vancouver, BC, Canada with IEEE 802 Plenary Session

Session #41: January 2006 interim session. According to the IEEE 802.16 Interim Session procedure, hosting proposals are welcome at each Plenary Session, where the Working Group normally chooses the site for the Interim Session to be held ten months later. Therefore, it is in order to introduce proposals for Session #41 during the current session. No proposals have yet been received.

New Business

Nothing discussed.

Closing

Motion 3: David Johnston, to adjourn the meeting 2nd Ron Murias.
Motion 3: carries by unanimous voice vote.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:45pm on 14 March 2005.
Closing Plenary

Call to Order
Roger Marks called the meeting to order at 7:52 pm, 17 March 2005.

IEEE 802.16 Working Group Officers
Chair: Roger Marks
Vice Chair: Ken Stanwood
Secretary: Dean Chang

Agenda
See http://ieee802.org/16/meetings/mtg36/closing.html

Motion 4: David Johnston, to approve the Closing Plenary Meeting Agenda as presented, 2nd Jon Labs
Motion 4: carries by unanimous voice vote.

License-Exempt Task Group
Mariana Goldhamer, Chair

The closing report IEEE 802.16h-05/009 was presented.

The group discussed the FCC announcement of opening 50 MHz in 3.65-3.7 GHz for wireless broadband. There are an unlimited number of licenses, so it is similar to licensed-exempt band. A “contention based protocol” needs to be defined by the industry. The Task Group expects to work in this area and believes this would be within its scope.

Conformance Task Group
Gordon Antonello, Chair, presented an oral closing report. No contributions or comments were received. Therefore, the Chair concludes that the WG is satisfied with the documents under review and proposes to advance the work to WG Letter Ballot.

Motion 5: To create a draft IEEE P802.16Conformance04/D1 from IEEE 802.16Conf04-04/04 (“Working Document towards the development of P802.16Conformance04”) and (C80216Conf04-04/02 “PICS Proforma for OFDMA PHY Mode”) and to initiate Working Group Letter Ballot,’ 2nd Phillip Barber
Motion 5: carries 51-3.

Maintenance Task Group
Jon Labs, Chair
Itzik Kitroser, Editor

The closing report, IEEE 802.16maint-05/006, was presented.

Comment database: IEEE 802.16-05/015r1
Total of 319 comments were received, and 20 late comments as well.

Total: 319 Late: 20
Accepted/Accepted-Modified: 188
Rejected: 52
Superceded: 44
Withdrawn: 21
Out-of-Scope: 14
1 voted in scope by the group, reversing the TG Chair’s ruling.

The current schedule on the website is not realistic, so a new schedule was drafted, see below for details.
Motion 6: Jon Labs, to accept draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D1, as modified by the comment resolutions (IEEE 802.16-05/015r1), and open a Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot on that Draft (P802.16-2004/Cor1/D2), 2nd Jose Puthenkulam. Motion 6: carries 72-0.

The TG was reported to have authorized the TG Chair to use the comment resolutions to comments 67, 68, 191, and 200 to draft, in collaboration with the WG Chair, a response to the Request for Interpretation from C. Ashok Kumar Reddy. There were no objections by the Working Group.

**Network Management Task Group**

Chair Phillip Barber

The closing report IEEE 802.16netman-05/006 was presented.

The group received 8 comments and 9 contributions for P802.16g. All comments were resolved.
4 Accepted/Accepted Modified
0 rejected
0 superceded
4 withdrawn

The editor was authorized to revise IEEE 802.16g-04/03r1, in accordance with the comment resolutions in IEEE 802.16g-05/003r1 and reissue the document as new Working Document IEEE 802.16g-04/03r2 (11/0)

**Task Group e**

Brian Kiernan, Chair
The Closing Report IEEE 802.16e-05/006r1 was presented.

560 ballot comments resolved – results are recorded in comment database IEEE 802.16-05/012r3.

TG has unanimously accepted comment database IEEE 802.16-05/012r3 as resolution of the Sponsor Ballot Recirculation comments:

- 384 Accepted or Accepted Modified
- 72 Rejected (O/S)
- 70 Superseded
- 34 Withdrawn
- 168 Editorial
- 390 Technical
- 2 Other

TG had unanimously authorized the editor to revise P802.16e/D6 in accordance with the comment resolutions in IEEE 802.16-05/012r3 and reissue the document as P802.16e/D7.

Motion 7: Brian Kiernan, to accept IEEE 802.16-05/012r3 as the Sponsor Ballot Recirculation comment resolutions, develop Draft P802.16e/D7 based on those resolutions, and initiate Recirculation, 2nd
Motion 7: carries 87-0.

**Liaison**

**ETSI BRAN Liaison**

Roger Marks reviewed the liaison letter L802.16-05/022d2.

Motion 8: Gordon Antonello, to approve liaison letter L802.16-05/022d2, 2nd Mariana Goldhammer
Motion 8: carries by unanimous voice vote.

**TTA**

Roger Marks reviewed the liaison letter L802.16-05/024d1.

Motion 9: Panyuh Joo, to approve liaison letter L802.16-05/0024d2, 2nd David Johnston.
Motion 9: carries by unanimous voice vote.

**IETF**

Letter from IEEE 802.16 to IETF (IEEE L802.16-05/025) was presented by Roger Marks

Motion 10: David Johnston, to approve liaison letter L802.16-05/025, with editorial changes by Roger Marks, 2nd Phillip Barber.
Motion 10: carries by unanimous voice vote.

**CCSA**

Liaison Letter from IEEE 802.16 to CCSA TC5/WG3 (L802.16-05/026)

Motion 11: Irving Wang, to approve liaison letter L802.15-05/026, 2nd Jose Puthenkulam.
Motion 11: carries by unanimous voice vote.

**3GPP**

Liaison statement to IEEE 802.16 from 3GPP TSG-SA5 (L802.16-05/029)
No objection to distributing this letter.
3GPP2

Liaison statement from IEEE 802.16 to 3GPP2 TSG-S and 3GPP TSG-SA5 (L802.16-05/027)  
Migaldi/Barber

Motion 12: Scott Migaldi, to approve liaison letter L802.16-05/027, 2nd Phillip Barber.  
Motion 12: carries by unanimous voice vote.

ITU-R

ITU-R Ad Hoc Report (L802.16-05/030) and Draft Contribution to ITU-R WP 8A (L802.16-05/028r1)  
Costa

Motion 13: [Costa?], to approve IEEE 802.16-05/028r1 and authorize the WG chair to submit it to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee for approval, with the intent to submit it to ITU-R as an IEEE contribution, 2nd David Johnston.  
Motion 13: carries 58-0.

ETSI BRAN

Liaison statement from IEEE 802.16 to ETSI BRAN regarding ITU-R (L802.16-04/031)  

Motion 14: Mariana Goldhamer, to approve L802.16-05/031d1, 2nd Margaret LaBrecque.  
Motion 14: carries by unanimous consent.

802.21

Ronny Kim presented L802.16-04/032 providing an update on activities in IEEE 802.21.

802.18

Mike Lynch presented three documents from IEEE 802.18 dealing with UK OFCOM regulator. These are available for review and comments from 802.16 Working Group members.

Corrigendum/16e Conflict Resolution

Roger Marks introduced the problem of conflicts and contradictions between the Corrigendem draft and the P802.16e draft. A significant concern is that both documents are now planned for approval at the same IEEE-SA Standards Board meeting. Normally, the most recently amendment and/or corrigendum would be definitive. In this case, a conflict (in which both documents changed the same text in different ways) would leave ambiguity. Also, the publication of two separate change documents would be very hard to read and understand.

Marks introduced Yvette Ho-Sang (Associate Manager, Standards Publishing, IEEE-SA) to review the problem and possible solutions. She suggested that the best alternative is to complete the corrigendum first, then identify the conflicts between the two documents and address them in the amendment. If it possible to publish both as a single document. Having them be simultaneous could make for extra difficulties. This issue is still open, but Yvette thinks a solution like this is workable.

Marks requested volunteers to serve on a committee to identify the contradictions in the two drafts. The following volunteered:

Jose Puthenkulam  
Jon Labs  
Dave Maez  
Reiner Olman  
Dave Peckner  
Ron Murias  
Herbert Ruck
Brian Johnson
Lei Wang

Ron Murias and Jon Labs were named the co-chairs of this committee.

**Future Sessions**

Session #37: 2-5 May 2005 Sorrento, Italy, hosted by Giulio Cavalli. Everyone needs to register as soon as possible for this event, and especially to reserve a hotel room as soon as possible. It was suggested that the session be extended to Monday morning and/or Friday. Cavalli indicated that Monday morning would not be a problem for the hotel, but Friday morning might not be available.

The Chair asked for any objection to opening the session at 9am on Monday morning? No objections. The Chair asked for objections to a Friday morning meeting? No objections, but the hotel needs to be consulted.

Session #38: 18-21 July 2005: San Francisco, CA, USA with IEEE 802 Plenary Session


Session #40: 14-17 November 2005: Vancouver, BC, Canada with IEEE 802 Plenary Session

Session #41: January 2006 interim session venue, not selected yet. According to IEEE 802.16 Interim Session procedures, hosting proposals are welcome at each Plenary Session, where the Working Group normally chooses the site for the Interim Session to be held ten months later. Therefore, it is in order to introduce proposals for Session #41 during the current session.

One proposal was received: IEEE C802.16-05/005 and S802.16-05/005, by Aditya Agrawal, for New Delhi, India. The presentation was made by Kamlesh Rath.

Motion 15: Mariana Goldhamer, to allow all people in the room to vote on the interim session selection, 2nd Ron Murias. Motion 15: carries with no dissenting votes.

Motion 16: Kamlesh Rath, to accept proposal IEEE C802.16-05/005 and S802.16-05/005 to hold Session #41 on 9-12 January 2006 in New Delhi, 2nd Jose Puthenkulam. Motion 16: carries 50-33.

**Publicity**

Chair is authorized to prepare a Session #36 Report. without objection.

**New Business**

IEEE 802 has some proposed rules changes. WG Chair will vote with no guidance provided by the Working Group.

Attendance Process Review – new electronic sign-in process is working well.

Server needs – Chair is seeking a site to host the 802.16 server.

Motion 17: Phillip Barber, To authorized the Working Group at Session #37 to proceed with its business with or without a quorum, 2nd David Johnston. Motion 17 carries by unanimous voice vote.

**Closing**

Motion 18: Jon Labs, to adjourn the meeting 2nd Rainer Ullmann
Motion 18: carries by unanimous voice vote.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:41pm on 17, March 2005.