Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: Accepted

No action required.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

No action required.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions: l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Separate electronic files of figures shall be supplied in TIFF format (unless created in FrameMaker).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested Remedy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation: Accepted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No action required.</td>
<td>Recommendation by</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resolution of Group</th>
<th>Decision of Group: Accepted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No action required.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group’s Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Actions</th>
<th>l) none needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Questions and Concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
This section misses any description of the wmanDevMIB. Add a subsection (9.3.3?) on the wmanDevMIB (relationship to the 1.0.8802 structure, integration, etc.). There needs to be some justification why there are two MIBs now.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified Recommendation by see resolution of comment 1039L

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified see resolution of comment 1039L

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The description "this MIB." is ambiguous, as this document specifies two MIBs now. Which one is meant here?

Replace "this MIB." By "the wmanIfMib" (?)

**Suggested Remedy**

**Proposed Resolution**

Replace
"... shall support this MIB."
with
"... shall support wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib."

**Reason for Recommendation**

Resolution of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

Replace
"... shall support this MIB."
with
"... shall support wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib."

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**

I) none needed

The resolution of this comment is superceded by 1039L

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested Remedy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reference to RFC 1213 is incorrect (&quot;I&quot; is missing). “ETF RFC 1213” should be “IETF RFC 1213”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation: <strong>Accepted</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reference to RFC 1213 is incorrect (&quot;I&quot; is missing). “ETF RFC 1213” should be “IETF RFC 1213”.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reference to RFC 1213 is incorrect (&quot;I&quot; is missing). “ETF RFC 1213” should be “IETF RFC 1213”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group’s Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Notes</th>
<th>Editor’s Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>k) done</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor’s Questions and Concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Action Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Starting Page #</th>
<th>Starting Line #</th>
<th>Fig/Table#</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 8 shows the `wmanIfSsFecCounterTable` as the first object under `wmanIfSsStatisticCounter`. There is no `wmanIfSSFecCounterTable` in the MIB's ASN.1 Definitions.

Remove the object `wmanIfSsFecCounterTable` from Figure 8.

**Suggested Remedy**

**Proposed Resolution**

Remove `wmanIfSsStatisticCounter` and `wmanIfSSFecCounterTable`.

Move `wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable` to `wmanIfSsCps`.

Remove `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`.

Move `wmanIfBsChannelMeasurementTable` to `wmanIfBsCps`.

Update Fig 4, Fig 8, and the corresponding ASN.1 text.

**Reason for Recommendation**

Remove `wmanIfSsStatisticCounter` and `wmanIfSSFecCounterTable`.

Move `wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable` to `wmanIfSsCps`.

Remove `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`.

Move `wmanIfBsChannelMeasurementTable` to `wmanIfBsCps`.

Update Fig 4, Fig 8, and the corresponding ASN.1 text.

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

k) done
In the P80216f_D4, a new section "13.2 wmanDevMib" was introduced. On one side, there will be a requirement to upgrade the software that run in the device (such as BS). And there should have some way to upgrade the software that run in the device. So a way that upgrade the device’s software should be defined in the network management system. On the other side, there are several object instances in a device. So a event log’s property that describe which object instance generate the event log should be defined in the corresponding MIB tree.

Suggested Remedy

The remedy will be provided in the IEEE San Francisco meeting.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Rejected

Reason for Recommendation
No specific text provided.

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
No specific text provided.

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Replace "((" with "(").

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Recommendation by
Replace "((" with "(").

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Replace "((" with "(").

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Comment # 1009
Comment submitted by: Richard van Leeuwen, Member

**Suggested Remedy**

**Comment**

`wanIfMib`

the sub-clause title should be "wmanIfMib"

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:** Superceded

**Reason for Recommendation**

See resolution of comment 1010

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Superceded

See resolution of comment 1010

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions** k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
Subclause headings are misspelled.

**Suggested Remedy**

Subclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation: Accepted**

Subclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group: Accepted**

Subclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**

k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
"WmanIfEventSeverity" is not referenced in the WMAN-IF-MIB.

Suggested Remedy
Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from the MIB. (Remove lines 17-31 on this page.)

Proposed Resolution

Recommended: Accepted

Recommended by
Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from the MIB. (Remove lines 17-31 on this page.)

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from the MIB. (Remove lines 17-31 on this page.)

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions
k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
What is the purpose of "wmanIfBsConfiguration"? The SS and Comon groups do not contain this entry, but do contain the configuration table child node.

(For example: "wmanIfBsConfigurationTable" is child of "wmanIfBsConfiguration" but "wmanIfSsConfigurationTable" is not a child node of "wmanIfSsConfiguration" (not defined).

Suggested Remedy
Treat all such config tables the same.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>1013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Document under Review:</td>
<td>IEEE P802.16f/D4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballot Number:</td>
<td>0001046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment submitted by:</td>
<td>Richard van Leeuwen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment Date:</td>
<td>2005/06/15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Page #:</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting Line #:</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section:</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ASN.1 Definitions (page 132, line 42), item wlanIfBsOfdmaBandAMCAllocTimer**

“tomer” should be “timer”.

**Suggested Remedy**

**Proposed Resolution**

Recommendation: **Accepted**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: **Accepted**

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Editor’s Notes**

Editor’s Actions: k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 19), item wmanIfSsCps
“Base Station” should be: “Subscriber Station”.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution: Accepted

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions: k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 24, through page 144, line 9), item wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable
The SsConfigFileEncoding table is now in both wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib, and according to section 13.1.2.1 should be no longer in wmanIfMib.
Remove this table and its objects from wmanIfMib (and renumber the remaining wmanIfSsCps objects accordingly).

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution

Recommended by

ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 24, through page 144, line 9), item wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable
The SsConfigFileEncoding table is now in both wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib, and according to section 13.1.2.1 should be no longer in wmanIfMib.
Remove this table and its objects from wmanIfMib (and renumber the remaining wmanIfSsCps objects accordingly).

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 24, through page 144, line 9), item wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable
The SsConfigFileEncoding table is now in both wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib, and according to section 13.1.2.1 should be no longer in wmanIfMib.
Remove this table and its objects from wmanIfMib (and renumber the remaining wmanIfSsCps objects accordingly).

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 156, line 7), item wmanIfSsPkmAuthInvalidErrorCode
Editorial: “Authorization Invalid message” should be “Authorization Invalid message”.
(Note: This used to be in 2 places; only one has been corrected.)

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

Decision of Group: **Accepted**

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Action Items**

k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
ASN.1 Definitions (page 180, line 49), item wmanIfSsOfdmaBandAMCAllocTimer
“tomer” should be “timer”.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

ASN.1 Definitions (page 180, line 49), item wmanIfSsOfdmaBandAMCAllocTimer
“tomer” should be “timer”.

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
1.1 “OLD” COMMENTS FROM D3, ACCEPTED BUT NOT INCORPORATED IN D4:

14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 184, line 8), item `wmanIfSsOfdmaBsEIRP`
Editorial: The description ("Signed in units of 1 dBm.") is incomplete.
Complete the description.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

-wmanIfBsOfdmaBsEIRP and `wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP`
Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

-wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP and `wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP`
Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

-wmanIfBsOfdmaBsEIRP and `wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP`
Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

-wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP and `wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP`
Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
1.1 “OLD” COMMENTS FROM D3, ACCEPTED BUT NOT INCORPORATED IN D4:

14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 192, line 1), item wmanIfCmnClassifierRulelpTosMask
   Editorial: “..this value is used check range checking of..” is no proper English; should be…??.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified Recommendation by
Replace
..this value is used check range checking of..”
with
..this value is used for the range checking of..”

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified
Replace
..this value is used check range checking of..”
with
..this value is used for the range checking of..”

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
wmanIfSsStatisticsCounter (page 15, lines 49 and 51)
In the ASN.1 Definitions as well as in Figure 8, this object is called wmanIfSsStatisticCounter (without ‘s’).
Change “wmanIfSsStatisticsCounter” into “wmanIfSsStatisticCounter” in both the heading and the text.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Superceded Recommendation by

See resolution of comment 1033

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Superceded

See resolution of comment 1033

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
ASN.1 Definitions (page 207, line 26), item wmanIfCmnSfCsSpecification
MAX-ACCESS “read-create” is inappropriate here.
Change to “read-only”.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

ASN.1 Definitions (page 207, line 26), item wmanIfCmnSfCsSpecification
MAX-ACCESS “read-create” is inappropriate here.
Change to “read-only”.

Reason for Recommendation

Editor's Actions
k) done
**Comment # 1022**  
**Type** Editorial  
**Comment submitted by:** Richard van Leeuwen  
**Starting Page #** 226  
**Starting Line #**  

**Comment**  

** wanDevMib  
the sub-clause title should be “wmanDevMib”  

**Suggested Remedy**

**Proposed Resolution**  
**Recommendation:** Superceded  
**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**  
**Decision of Group:** Superceded

**Editor’s Action Items**

**k) done**
wmanDevBsSnmpAgentResetBs is defined as part of the WmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigEntry sequence. The description is: "When set to actionsResetBs value, instructs BS to reset itself".

This is a control function that does not have anything to do with the configuring the SnmpAgent. This is also not specific to the basestation.

Suggested Remedy

Rename wmanDevBsSnmpAgentResetBs to wmanDevReset and make it common to both BS and SS

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

see resolution of comment 1024
Description for "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigIndex" is confusing: "An arbitrary index. Must have value of 1."

(Why is this defined to be a table if there can only be one row?)

If there can only be exactly one row, and all columns in this 'table' are read-write, does there need to be a row-status column?

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove restriction on "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigIndex" (or remove "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigRowStatus").

I would argue that being able to define multiple trap destinations would be desirable. You may define inactive rows (which are still being written to).

**Proposed Resolution**

1. Remove table wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable
2. Create table wmanDevCmnSnmpV1V2TrapDestTable and object wmanDevCmnResetDevice as follows:

```plaintext
wmanDevCmnObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevMibObjects 3 }

-- wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent contain objects related to the SNMP agent implemented by the device

-- wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevCmnObjects 1 }

-- Bs SNMP agent trap destination table

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "This table contains the configuration objects for the device implementing SNMP agent."
INDEX { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "This table is indexed by wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex."
INDEX { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex }
```

```plaintext
::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable 1 }
```
WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
  wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex INTEGER,
  wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrType InetAddressType,
  wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddr InetAddress,
  wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPort Integer32,
  wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatus RowStatus
}

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX INTEGER (1..8)
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "The index identifies the trap destination. The number of rows is limited to eight."
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 1 }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrType OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX InetAddressType
MAX-ACCESS read-create
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "The type of IP address used in the object
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestV1V2TrapDestIpAddr."
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 2 }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddr OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX InetAddress
MAX-ACCESS read-create
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "IP address of SNMP manager configured as a trap
destination for versions V1 and V2 of SNMP. If this object
is not created or empty the traps are not sent."
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 3 }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPort OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Integer32 (0..65535)
MAX-ACCESS read-create
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION "Port number of SNMP manager configured as a trap
destination for versions V1 and V2 of SNMP."
REFERENCE 
"Section 11.13.19.3.4.6 in IEEE 802.16-2004"
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 4 }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatus OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX RowStatus
MAX-ACCESS read-create
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
"This object is used to ensure that the write operation to
multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic
operation by agent."
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 5 }

--
-- wmanDevCmnDeviceConfig contains common configuration objects for the device

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

1. Remove table wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable
2. Create table wmanDevCmnSnmpV1V2TrapDestTable and object wmanDevCmnResetDevice
as follows:

wmanDevCmnObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevMibObjects 3 }
--
-- wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent contain objects related to the SNMP agent implemented by the device
--
wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevCmnObjects 1 }
--
-- Bs SNMP agent trap destination table
--
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
"This table contains the configuration objects for the device
implementing SNMP agent."
 ::= { wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent 1 }

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
"This table is indexed by wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex."
INDEX { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex }
 ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable 1 }

WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex INTEGER,
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrType InetAddressType,
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddr InetAddress,
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPort Integer32,
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatus RowStatus

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX INTEGER (1..8)
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
"The index identifies the trap destination. The number of rows is limited to eight."

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The "wmanDevSsEventLogConfigTable" and "wmanDevBsEventLogConfigTable" appear to be identical definitions that are mutually exclusive.

Suggested Remedy
Rename and combine "wmanDevSsEventLogConfigTable" and "wmanDevBsEventLogConfigTable" to "wmanDevEventLogConfigTable"; make this definition common to both SS & BS.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

Reason for Recommendation
Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The "wmanDevBsEventTable" and "wmanDevsEventTable" appear to be identical definitions that are mutually exclusive.

**Suggested Remedy**

Rename and combine "wmanDevBsEventTable" and "wmanDevsEventTable" to a single "wmanDevEventTable"; make this definition common to both SS & BS

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation by**

Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted-Modified

Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**  k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
In table wmanIfBsSsProvisionedForSFTable the description of the object wmanIfBsSsProvisionedForSFRowStatus is incorrect.

Suggested Remedy

"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service-flow multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

Change p38, L42 from
"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service-flow is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

to
"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group decision: Accepted-Modified

Change p38, L42 from
"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service-flow is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

to
"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Resolution of the comment #110 not applied correctly. Instructed to move trap objects only below TrapPrefix. The draft 4 has all trap objects moved as instructed but also NotificationObjectsTable, which should stay at the same place as before the change.

Suggested Remedy
Move NotificationObjectsTables it at the same level as wmanIfBsTrapPrefix (wmanIfSsTrapPrefix, wmanDevBsTrapPrefix respectively)

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified Recommendation by

Replace:

```
Replace:

wmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX    SEQUENCE OF WmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS     current
DESCRIPTION "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfBsTrapPrefix 1 }
```

With:

```
Replace:

wmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX    SEQUENCE OF WmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS     current
DESCRIPTION "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 1 }
```

Replace:

```
Replace:

wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX    SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
STATUS     current
DESCRIPTION "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfBsTrapPrefix 1 }
```
reported by the trap.

```plaintext
::= { wmanIfSsTrapPrefix 5 }
```

With:

```plaintext
wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 1 }
```

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Replace:

```plaintext
wmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF WmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfBsTrapPrefix 1 }
```

With:

```plaintext
wmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF WmanIfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 1 }
```

Replace:

```plaintext
wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfSsTrapPrefix 1 }
```
"This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfSsTrapPrefix 5 }

With:

wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry
MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
STATUS      current
DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions  k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Comment #1029 should also be applied to SS objects.
Split of binary coded values not done for SS object wmanIfSsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull should follow example of wmanIfBsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull split as instructed in comment #308.

Suggested Remedy
Split object wmanIfSsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull into two objects in the same way the object wmanIfBsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull was split.

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Accepted

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted

Split object wmanIfSsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull into two objects in the same way the object wmanIfBsOfdmSubChReqRegionFull was split.

Editor’s Action Items
k) done
Change dbM to dBm in the objects:
wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP
wmanIfSsOfdmInitRngMaxRSS
wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP
wmanIfBsOfdmInitRngMaxRSS
and similar OFDMA objects

Proposed Resolution: Accepted

Resolution of Group: Accepted

Editor's Actions: k) done
Comment #314 is not implemented. BS notification group (wmanIfMibBsNotificationGroup) must be mandatory.

Suggested Remedy

Change the description of compliance statement from:

GROUP wmanIfMibBsNotificationGroup
DESCRIPTION
"This group is optional for Base Station."

to

GROUP wmanIfMibBsNotificationGroup
DESCRIPTION
"This group is mandatory for Base Station."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Recommendation

RChange the description of compliance statement from:
GROUP wmanIfMibBsNotificationGroup
DESCRIPTION
"This group is optional for Base Station."

to

GROUP wmanIfMibBsNotificationGroup
DESCRIPTION
"This group is mandatory for Base Station."
"This group is mandatory for Base Station."

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4

Ballot Number: 0001046

Comment # 1032

Comment submitted by: Krzysztof Dudzinski

Member

Starting Page # 999

Starting Line #

Fig/Table#

Section

Comments 5, 177-181 not applied properly. The instruction was to remove traps related to power, temperature, fan. The editor action was to move them to DEV-MIB.

Suggested Remedy

Remove from DEV-MIB the traps listed in the comment #005

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

Recommendation by

Editor to move the trap object tables to an Informative Annex, marked as a recommended practice, and provide appropriate description.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Editor to move the trap object tables to an Informative Annex, marked as a recommended practice, and provide appropriate description.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Single table in the "folder" doesn't make sense. This became an issue after deleting or moving a number of tables. The issue affects the following tables now:

- `wmanIfBsConfigurationTable`
- `wmanIfBsChannelMeasurementTable`
- `wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable`

Suggested Remedy

**Move objects:**

- `wmanIfBsConfigurationTable`
- `wmanIfBsChannelMeasurementTable`
- `wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable`

one level up

and remove the "folders":

- `wmanIfBsConfiguration`
- `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`
- `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`

Proposed Resolution

**Accept**

**Move objects:**

- `wmanIfBsConfigurationTable`
- `wmanIfBsChannelMeasurementTable`
- `wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable`

one level up

and remove the "folders":

- `wmanIfBsConfiguration`
- `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`
- `wmanIfBsStatisticCounter`

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: **Accept**
Index wmanIfBsOfdmaDiucIndex should have MAX-ACCESS not-accessible.

Suggested Remedy
Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanIfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accessible

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted
Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanIfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accessible

Reason for Recommendation
Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanIfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accessible

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Comment #332L remedy not implemented properly. wman(16) should be just object identification to allow creation of other mibs under the same root.

Suggested Remedy

IS: iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16) { 1 0 8802 16 }
SHOULD BE: iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDev(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

page 226, line 59-60
change iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16) { 1 0 8802 16 }
to iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDevMib(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }

k) done
Editor's Actions
Suggested Remedy

Import object identity iso8802 from relevant MIB module. Alternatively define it explicitly in our MIB.

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: **Rejected**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: **Rejected**

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Remedy is inadequate. Commenter agreed to provide more complete remedy during next recirculation.

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

1) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Since wmanDevMib is added to this document, it should be reflected in the scope.

Suggested Remedy
Change the text in section 1.1 from
"This document provides enhancements to IEEE Standard 802.16-2004 to define a management information base (MIB) for the MAC and PHY and associated management procedures."

to
"This document provides enhancements to IEEE Standard 802.16-2004 to define a management information base (MIB) and associated management procedures for the MAC and PHY, as well as the 802.16 device."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Rejected Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation
The original text is transcribed from the 802.16f PAR, and is required to appear in the amendment document verbatim. The group does not have the authority to change the PAR through the commentary process.

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
The original text is transcribed from the 802.16f PAR, and is required to appear in the amendment document verbatim. The group does not have the authority to change the PAR through the commentary process.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions
1) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Change from
"This subclause describes the integration with MIB-II under Interface Group MIB defined in IETF RFC2863"
to
"This subclause describes the integration of wmanIfMib with MIB-II under Interface Group MIB defined in IETF RFC2863"

Suggested Remedy
Change from
"This subclause describes the integration with MIB-II under Interface Group MIB defined in IETF RFC2863"
to
"This subclause describes the integration of wmanIfMib with MIB-II under Interface Group MIB defined in IETF RFC2863"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Recommendation

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
wmanDevMib MIB subtree location is missing.

Suggested Remedy

Add the following subclause

9.3.3 wmanDevMib MIB Subtree

This subclause specifies that wmanDevMib shall be accessed through the following MIB tree.

iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16)"
The management information base for BS and SS is defined as two ASN.1 MIB modules: wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for all BSs. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for SSs, which are managed using SNMP protocol. An SS that implements the SNMP agent shall support this MIB.

The wmanIfMib MIB module (interface MIB) defines management objects relevant to 802.16 broadband wireless interface as defined in this standard.

The wmanDevMib MIB module (device MIB) defines management objects relevant to the device implementing 802.16 interface. The objects of this MIB module may refer explicitly to terms defined in the standard (e.g. configuration file encodings) but mainly provides the mandatory support required to implement, manage and test the equipment implementing 802.16 interface.

[Add new subclause:]

9.3.3 wmanDevMib MIB Subtree

This subclause specifies that wmanDevMib shall be accessed through the following MIB tree:

```
iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDev(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }
```

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change from 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
This table contains OFDM UCD channel
to 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable contains OFDM UCD channel

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted
Change from 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
This table contains OFDM UCD channel
to 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable contains OFDM UCD channel

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Change from 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
This table contains OFDM UCD channel
to 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable contains OFDM UCD channel

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns
Inconsistent object name

Suggested Remedy

Change from wmanDevBsTrapControlRegister to wmanDevBsTrapControl

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: **Accepted**

Change from wmanDevBsTrapControlRegister to wmanDevBsTrapControl

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: **Accepted**

Change from wmanDevBsTrapControlRegister to wmanDevBsTrapControl

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Change from
13.2.1.1.1 wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable
This table contains the configuration
to
13.2.1.1.1 wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable
wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable contains the configuration

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified

see resolution of comment 1024

Editor to make name changes in subclause 13 to match resolution of comment 1024

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

see resolution of comment 1024

Editor to make name changes in subclause 13 to match resolution of comment 1024

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

k) done
Inconsistent table name

Suggested Remedy

Change from
"13.2.2.1 wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable
wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station
such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision."

to
"13.2.2.1 wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable
wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station
such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items
Change the font size of "wmanDevSsTrapDefinitions group defines all the traps reported by SS." from 9 to 10.

Suggested Remedy
Change the font size of "wmanDevSsTrapDefinitions group defines all the traps reported by SS." from 9 to 10.

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Accepted
Recommendation by
Change the font size of "wmanDevSsTrapDefinitions group defines all the traps reported by SS." from 9 to 10.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group
Decision of Group: Accepted
Change the font size of "wmanDevSsTrapDefinitions group defines all the traps reported by SS." from 9 to 10.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
"This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events." is redundant.

Suggested Remedy
Delete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted
Delete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Accepted
Delete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevMib"

Proposed Resolution
Recommendation: Superceded

Reason for Recommendation
Resolution of Group: Superceded

See resolution of comment 1010

Editor's Notes
k) done
Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevMib"

Suggested Remedy
Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevMib"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Superceded

See resolution of comment 1010

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Superceded

See resolution of comment 1033

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
New material is more properly part of a new subclause within the 1.4 Reference Models subclause.

Suggested Remedy

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, modify text as:]

1.4 Reference Models

[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]

1.4.1 Management Reference Model'

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation: Accepted  
Recommendation by

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, modify text as:]

1.4 Reference Models

[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]

1.4.1 Management Reference Model'

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, modify text as:]

1.4 Reference Models

[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]

1.4.1 Management Reference Model'

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions  k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
Modify the language in the first paragraph to accommodate the addition of the \texttt{wmanDevMib}

\textbf{Suggested Remedy}

\texttt{[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]} \n'BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of \texttt{wmanIfMib} \texttt{and wmanDevMib} that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).'

\textbf{Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted}

\texttt{[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]} \n'BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of \texttt{wmanIfMib} \texttt{and wmanDevMib} that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).'

\textbf{Reason for Recommendation}

\textbf{Resolution of Group: Accepted}

\texttt{[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]} \n'BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of \texttt{wmanIfMib} \texttt{and wmanDevMib} that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).'

\textbf{Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution}

\texttt{[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]} \n'BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of \texttt{wmanIfMib} \texttt{and wmanDevMib} that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).'

\texttt{k) done}

\textbf{Editor's Action Items}

\textbf{Editor's Questions and Concerns}
Spelling and word choice use for Secondary Management Connection need to be corrected.

Suggested Remedy

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]
'The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the secondary management CID connection for managed SS. If the secondary management CID connection does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.'

Proposed Resolution

Recommendation: Accepted

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]
'The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the secondary management CID connection for managed SS. If the secondary management CID connection does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.'

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]
'The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the secondary management CID connection for managed SS. If the secondary management CID connection does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.'

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions  k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns
Fix some capitalization and spacing consistency problems.

Suggested Remedy

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

"The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP\textsuperscript{v2}, but is backward compatible to SNMP\textsuperscript{v1} through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP\textsuperscript{v1}, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerability."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

"The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP\textsuperscript{v2}, but is backward compatible to SNMP\textsuperscript{v1} through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP\textsuperscript{v1}, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerability."

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

"The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP\textsuperscript{v2}, but is backward compatible to SNMP\textsuperscript{v1} through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMP\textsuperscript{v3}: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP\textsuperscript{v1}, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMP\textsuperscript{v3} framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerability."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Fix word choice problem.

Suggested Remedy

[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:]
'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanIfMib is temporarily located under enterprise via'

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Recommendation by

[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:]
'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanIfMib is temporarily located under enterprise via'

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:]
'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanIfMib is temporarily located under enterprise via'

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>1053L</th>
<th>Comment submitted by:</th>
<th>Phillip Barber</th>
<th>Member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Comment**

Need to clarify the 'mandatory' or 'optional' status of SNMP support for BS in a couple of places.

**Suggested Remedy**

*[In 9.3 Management Information Base, page 4, line 19, modify text as:]*

'An SS or BS that implements the SNMP agent shall support this MIB.'

**9.3.1 SNMP**

SNMP is a protocol to access the managed objects in BS and SS. The support of SNMP is optional for SS and mandatory for BS.'

**Proposed Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Resolution</th>
<th>Recommendation: <strong>Accepted-Modified</strong></th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>see resolution of comment 1039L</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

| Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified** |
| see resolution of comment 1039L |

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions** k) done

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
All of the TLV items in section 11 only apply to the SS and are transferred via the configuration file. They are not MAC management message TLVs. How are we setting these values for BS? Do we need to create language to specify the mechanism in the standard, or just note that the mechanism is out of scope of the standard? Investigate security implications for 11.2.8 and 11.2.9.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Withdrawn Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Withdrawn

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The wmanIfMib defines a WmanIfClassifierBitMap with the following description: 'A bit of this object is set to 1 if the parameter indicated by the comment was present in the classifier encoding, and 0 otherwise.

There are separate bits defined for all classification parameters, but they are not grouped like in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4. For example, there are separate bits for `ipTosLow(1), ipTosHigh(2), ipTosMask(3).` However, the associated TLV does not allow to encode these three values separately; either all 3 are defined or none. Furthermore, having just one of the values would not be enough to do classification on the TOS field.'

**Suggested Remedy**

Change the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

```plaintext
SYNTAX  BITS {priority(0),
ipTos(1),
ipProtocol(2),
ipAddrType(3),
ipMaskedSrcAddr(4),
ipMaskedDestAddr(5),
srcPort(6),
destPort(7),
destMacAddr(8),
srcMacAddr(9),
ethernetProtocol(10),
userPriority(11),
vlanId(12)}
```

**Proposed Resolution**

**Recommendation:** Accepted-Modified

Change the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

```plaintext
SYNTAX  BITS {priority(0),
ipTos(1),
ipProtocol(2),
ipMaskedSrcAddr(3),
ipMaskedDestAddr(4),
srcPort(5),
destPort(6),
destMacAddr(7),
srcMacAddr(8),
ethernetProtocol(9),
userPriority(10),
vlanId(11)}
```

Editor to change 'Description' to include specific reference of TLV mappings to bit definitions.
Change the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

```plaintext
SYNTAX  BITS {priority(0),
ipTos(1),
ipProtocol(2),
ipMaskedSrcAddr(3),
ipMaskedDestAddr(4),
srcPort(5),
destPort(6),
destMacAddr(7),
srcMacAddr(8),
ethernetProtocol(9),
userPriority(10),
vlanId(11)}
```

Editor to change 'Description' to include specific reference of TLV mappings to bit definitions
Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout the document.

Suggested Remedy
Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout the document.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted
Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout the document.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout the document.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

k) done

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.

Suggested Remedy
Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted
Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
Editor to go through all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.

Suggested Remedy
Editor to go through all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Editor to go through all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted
Editor to go through all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items