P802.16/Conformance04 to Sponsor Ballot: Conditional Approval

18 November 2005
Rules

Motions requesting conditional approval to forward where the prior ballot has closed shall be accompanied by:

- Date the ballot closed
- Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes
- Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses.
- Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting.
Date the ballot closed:  
9 November 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Open</th>
<th>Close</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ballot</td>
<td>D4</td>
<td>25 Oct</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

- 178 Approve  89%
- 22 Disapprove
- 18 Abstain
- 70 not voting

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

• attached
Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting

- Dec 9: Issue D5
- Dec 9-Jan 4: extended recirc
- Jan 9-12: comment resolution at 802.16 Session #41
802.16 WG Motions

802.16 Closing Plenary: 17 Nov 2005:

Motion: To request conditional approval from EC to move IEEE 802.16/Conformance04/D5 to Sponsor Ballot

- Proposed: Gordon Antonello
- Seconded: Herbert Ruck
- Approved 38-0-0.
Motion

To grant conditional approval, under Clause 21, to forward P802.16/Conformance04 for Sponsor Ballot

Moved: Marks
Seconded:

Approve:
Disapprove:
Abstain:
The current document suffers from serious flaws. These are discussed in the contribution.

**Suggested Remedy**

Adopt the remedies proposed in the contribution "C80216Conf04-05_001" except section 3 "Annex A: Example of PICS Document Partitioning Based on Functions".

### Proposed Resolution

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**

**Decision of Group:** Accepted-Modified

Adopt the remedies proposed in the contribution "C80216Conf04-05_001" except section 3 "Annex A: Example of PICS Document Partitioning Based on Functions".

### Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

### Group's Notes

### Group's Action Items

### Editor's Notes

### Editor's Actions

### Editor's Questions and Concerns

### Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy

Change the scope in section 1 to accurately reflect the PAR scope. Because referring to IEEE 802.16 in the document scope as opposed 802.16REVd (or equivalently 802.16-2004), is expanding scope by violating the PAR.

Hence change the scope to:

This standard represents the Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma, per ISO/IEC Standard 9646-7 (1995) and ITU-T X.296, for conformance specification of base stations and subscriber stations based upon the air interface specified in IEEE 802.16-2004 for frequencies below 11 GHz.

In addition on page 7 in Annex A the following text should be changed from: "Protocol ICS Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz". This will remove any ambiguity that indeed the document only applies to Fixed systems.

to "Protocol ICS Proforma for Fixed systems based on Frequencies below 11 GHz"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Superceded

Comment 3

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
This comment is resolved as defined in summary comment database comment #078

Group’s Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions
In the 'Scope' section on page number 5, 'air interfaces specified in IEEE 802.16' violates the scope of PAR of P802.16/Conformance04 which describes as 'air interface specified in IEEE P802.16-REVd for frequencies below 11GHz'.

Suggested Remedy

Change 'IEEE 802.16' to 'IEEE P802.16-REVd for frequencies below 11GHz' as it is in the PAR.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Page 3 line 38

Change line 38 from:
"Wire-lessMAN-OFDM, and WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interfaces specified in IEEE 802.16."

To:
"Wire-lessMAN-OFDM, and WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interfaces specified in IEEE 802.16-2004 and subsequent Corrigenda."

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The document does not contain statement that it is for fixed wireless access systems only though the content is derived from IEEE 802.16-2004 standard. Obviously for mobile systems PICS should be different.

Suggested Remedy
At page 5 line 18 add

"Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

This document describes the capabilities and options within the WirelessMAN (below 11 GHz) air interface specified in IEEE Std 802.16-2004 and included here by reference: [1] IEEE Std 802.16-2004: "Local and Metropolitan Area Networks – Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems". This reference clearly states that this is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems and adding another such statement is redundant.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
This comment is resolved as defined in summary comment database comment #078

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The document does not contain statement that it is for fixed wireless access systems only though the content is derived from IEEE 802.16-2004 standard.

Suggested Remedy
At page 5 line 18 add "Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems"

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Superceded

Comment 5

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
This comment is resolved as defined in summary comment database comment #078

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The current structure, organization, and technical content of draft standard for conformance to IEEE Standard 802.16 - Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz is not designed properly for the target usage.

Suggested Remedy
Implement changes according to contribution C80216Conf04-05_001.pdf

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: Superceded

Comment 1

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The Scope of draft standard for Conformance to IEEE Standard 802.16 - Part 4 does not match word for word the IEEE 802.16/Conformance04 PAR except for the reference to rev.d

Suggested Remedy
Replace the draft Scope with the following paragraph:


Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted


Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items
The present Scope and Purpose are not the same as that in the PAR document. These sections are typically applied directly from the PAR.

Suggested Remedy
Take the scope and purpose from the PAR document and apply as is without any elaboration or clarification. The only change should be the reference to 802.16REVd which should be changed to 802.16-2004.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Superceded
superceded by 02 (049 in summary database)

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The present Scope clause goes beyond the PAR for this project.

**Suggested Remedy**

Copy the scope from the PAR document and apply exactly without any elaboration or clarification.

**Proposed Resolution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Decision of Group:** Superceded

superceded by 02 (049 in summary database)

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**
I am not satisfied with resolution of comment #005 in IEEE 802.16-05/024r3. The document does not state explicitly that it is for fixed systems only.

Suggested Remedy
At page 5 line 20 add
"Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems"

Proposed Resolution Recommendation:
Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified
At page 5 line 20 add:
"Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems as specified in IEEE 802.16-2004"

This comment is resolved as defined in summary comment database comment #078

k) done
The Purpose of draft standard for Conformance to IEEE Standard 802.16 -Part 4 does not match word for word the IEEE 802.16/Conformance04 PAR except for the reference d.

Suggested Remedy
Replace the draft Purpose with the following paragraph:
"This document describes the capabilities and options within the air interface specified for frequencies below 11 GHz in IEEE 802.16-2004. It is to be completed by the supplier of a product claiming to implement the protocol. It indicates which capabilities and options have been implemented. It allows a user of the product to evaluate its conformance and to determine whether the product meets the user’s requirements."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Replace the entire text of draft Purpose with the following paragraph:
"This document describes the capabilities and options within the air interface specified for frequencies below 11 GHz in IEEE 802.16-2004. It is to be completed by the supplier of a product claiming to implement the protocol. It indicates which capabilities and options have been implemented. It allows a user of the product to evaluate its conformance and to determine whether the product meets the user’s requirements."

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions k) done

Editor’s Questions and Concerns
Editor's Action Items
Suggested Remedy
Divide PICS for WirelessMAN-OFDMA based on contribution C802.16Conf04-05_002

Proposed Resolution

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified
Divide PICS for WirelessMAN-OFDMA based on section 2.3 (PHY) and 2.4 (PHY/MAC) of contribution C802.16Conf04-05_002r1. Does not include the recommendation in 2.5 that remains informational.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

In order to implement the comment on introducing a section on PHY and PHY/MAC. I made the following changes so that the main section A7 is not modified. The section A7 has numerous references to on its own content, and any change will bring about a massive renumbering.

Changed the title of sections A5, A6 and A7 to reflect the partitioning
A.5 Protocol ICS for Physical Layer Partitioning of WirelessMAN OFDMA
A.6 Protocol ICS for MAC/PHY Layer Partitioning of WirelessMAN OFDMA
A.7 Protocol ICS for MAC Layer of WirelessMAN OFDMA
Moved the two sections (previously A.5 and A.6) to the end where they become sections A.8 and A.9. These sections are empty so moving them does not change the flow of the document.

A.8 Protocol ICS for WirelessMAN SCa

A.9 Protocol ICS for WirelessMAN OFDM

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
The current draft standard of IEEE 802.16/Conformance04 PICS statement format is misaligned with the ISO/IEC 9646-7 (1995) guidelines, and our accepted contribution C802.16Conf04-05_001.pdf, which was not implemented in the IEEE 802.16/Conformance04/D2 draft.

It is the IEEE 802.16C chair responsibility to send a liaison to ISO to obtain a copy of ISO/IEC 9646-7 (1995) document for IEEE use.

Suggested Remedy

PICS Tables A.1 to A.184 should be modified with the Status and Predicate columns according to our accepted contribution C802.16Conf04-05_001.pdf.

Proposed Resolution

Add a Predicate column to each of the PICS Tables A.1 to A.184.

It is expected that the task group members will provide information for filling in the Predicate column and changing the Status column according to the ISO/IEC 9646-7 (1995).

Reason for Recommendation

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

There are too many columns in some tables, which makes it hard to fit them onto the page and even harder to enter text in each column.
DBPC mechanism is not applicable for OFDMA (see corrigendum).

Suggested Remedy

Remove row containing Item 2 from Table A.19
and
Remove row containing Item 1 from Table A.40

Proposed Resolution  Recommendation:  Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group  Decision of Group: Rejected

Reject first part Remove row containing Item 2 from Table A.19

Reject second part of comment

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Consulted with experts who said DBPC is still valid and needed for burst profile changes and needs to be tested

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions  l) none needed

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items
The UCD-TLV table is missing. This table is part of 802.16-2004 specifications.

Suggested Remedy
Add UCD TLV table to Section A.7.5.2.1.3.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Following A.100 insert UCD TLV table to Section A.7.5.2.1.3 from D1

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes

Group’s Action Items

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Questions and Concerns

Editor’s Action Items

k) done
Secondary management connection is optional in 802.16 (see e.g. 6.3.9 in 802.16-2004), so it should be optional in the conformance document as well.

**Suggested Remedy**

Add a row to Table A.18 and fill its columns as follows:
- Item: "12",
- Name: "Managed mode",
- Reference: "[1] 6.3.9",
- Status "o"

Change the status of Item 8 of Table A.19 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:
```
"cxx-01 IF A.18/12 THEN m ELSE n/a"
```

Change the status of Item 4 of Table A.20 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:
```
"cxx-01 IF A.18/12 THEN m ELSE n/a"
```

Change the status of Items 7, 8 and 9 of Table A.31 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:
```
"cxx-01 IF A.18/12 THEN m ELSE n/a"
```

Change the status of Items 4 of Table A.36 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:
```
"cxx-01 IF A.18/12 THEN m ELSE n/a"
```

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.7:
"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.8:
"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.9:
"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"
Proposed Resolution

Recommendation:

Resolution of Group: Accepted- Clarified

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified

Add a row to Table A.18 and fill its columns as follows:

Item: "12",
Name: "Managed mode",
Reference: "[1] 6.3.9",
Status "o"

Change the status of Item 8 of Table A.19 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:

"cxx-01  IF A.18/12 THEN m  ELSE n/a" - if SS supports Managed mode

Change the status of Item 4 of Table A.20 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:

"cxx-01  IF A.18/12 THEN m  ELSE n/a" - if SS supports Managed mode

Change the status of Items 7, 8 and 9 of Table A.31 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:

"cxx-01  IF A.18/12 THEN m  ELSE n/a" - if SS supports Managed mode

Change the status of Items 4 of Table A.36 to a conditional "cxx-01" and add the following description below the Table:

"cxx-01  IF A.18/12 THEN m  ELSE n/a" - if SS supports Managed mode

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.7:

"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.8:

"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"

Add the following text at the beginning of Section A.7.2.3.2.8.9:

"Prerequisite: A.18/12: SS supports Managed mode"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

k) done

Change the numbering of cxx-01 as needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items
This project duplicates a lot of work with the WiMAX Forum PICS development and also it is not aligned with real market requirements. Hence it is questionable whether there is significant value in this project.

Also the document is substantially incomplete. The SCa PHY PICS are missing. Also all the WirelessHUMAN PICS are missing.

Also while the 802.16-2004 standard is the basis of this PICS, this document does not highlight the fact that the PICS is for fixed systems.

Suggested Remedy
Complete the incomplete sections identified and also call out the fact this is for Fixed Systems only.

Proposed Resolution

Resolution of Group: Accepted-Modified

The Task Group is open to contributions for SCa and WirelessHUMAN OFDMA PICS. However, the document does include sections on OFDM and OFDMA and therefore the document has value in spite of the missing material.

The item regarding that PICS is for fixed Systems is addressed in comment 2 (078 in the summary database)
Some clarification is needed to ensure that this document applies only to the fixed broadband application.

**Suggested Remedy**

Add the following sentence at the end of Scope section:

**Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems.**

**Proposed Resolution**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

In the Scope statement replace "IEEE 802.16-2004 for frequencies below 11 GHz." with "IEEE 802.16-2004 (Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems) for frequencies below 11 GHz."

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

**Group’s Action Items**

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions**

**Editor’s Questions and Concerns**

**Editor’s Action Items**