The comments in "Commentary" format required in 802.16 WG have been uploaded to 802.16 WEB site at http://dot16.org/CSUpload//upload/NetMan_db/16g_D7_Yanover_Vladimir.cmtb

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment #</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>Technical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part of Dis</td>
<td>☒ Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Line</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig/Table#</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subclause</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suggested Remedy**

**Group Resolution**

**Decision of Group:** Agree

**No action required**

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

Comments incorporated into the commentary database for individual comment resolution

**Group’s Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor’s Notes**

**Editor’s Actions** b) none needed
I do not agree with the resolution of comment #53 in the 80216-07_002r5 dbase.
The current NSP mechanism using SII-ADV and SBC messages is unnecessarily complex, badly documented and it may generate
unnecessary (partial) network entries by MS' looking for a network. NSP TLVs should be communicated through DCD messages, rather
than through the SII-ADV and SBC-REQ/RSP messages. That is much simpler for both the MS and the BS, it is more in line with the
current network entry procedures and it is more flexible as it makes it possible for a BS to inform an MS of its' neighbours NSPs
(through the MOB_NBR-ADV and the DCD settings TLV).

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from 'General'.

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_027.doc.

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
The analysis is useful, but flawed. The underlying assumptions are likely wrong. Assume that DCD in mobile networks is transmitted at
least 1x per second; that SII-ADV is transmitted 1x per 60 seconds; MS will wait for SII-ADV before attempting initial network entry.
Partial entries are eliminated.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 1
Richard van Leeuwen

Against: 4
David Johnston
Peretz Feder
Achim Brandt
Joey Chou

Abstain: 1
Sang-Youb Kim

Comment Rejected
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Notes</th>
<th>Editor's Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) none needed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The primitives in Figure F1..F6 do not use the naming schema defined in 14.1.1.

Suggested Remedy

In Figure F1, F2 and F3:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start/Cancel" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start / HO-Cancel)"

In Figure F4:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start)"
Replace "HO Cancel" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Cancel)"

In Figure F5 and F6:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start)"

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

In Figure F1, F2 and F3:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start/Cancel" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start / HO-Cancel)"

In Figure F4:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start)"
Replace "HO Cancel" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Cancel)"

In Figure F5 and F6:
Replace "HO Request" by "C-HO-REQ"
Replace "HO Response" by "C-HO-RSP"
Replace "HO Start" by "C-HO-IND (HO-Start)"
The examples in Figure 470 only show C-SAP primitives. C-SAP primitives will never be sent to or received from the M-SAP.

Chair changed the comment type to 'Technical' from 'Editorial'

In figure 470 replace "C-SAP/M-SAP" by "C-SAP"
The caption of Figure 508 does not use the function abbreviation defined in 14.1.1.

Suggested Remedy
Replace "M-TM" by "M-MTM"

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Agree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions
a) done
Typos in DCS-RSP and DCS-ACK

Suggested Remedy
Replace "DCS-RSP" by "DSC-RSP"
Replace "DCS-ACK" by "DSC-ACK"

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Agree

Replace "DCS-RSP" by "DSC-RSP"
Replace "DCS-ACK" by "DSC-ACK"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions: a) done
The GPCS_PROTOCOL_TYPE value for MPLS should be 0x0001. Note that line 44 specifies that the current value of 0x0010 is Reserved.

Suggested Remedy

Replace 0x0010 by 0x0001

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Replace 0x0010 by 0x0001

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done
"ACK_transfer" should be "AK_Transfer"

Suggested Remedy
Replace "ACK_transfer" by "AK_Transfer"

Group Resolution

Replace "ACK_transfer" by "AK_Transfer"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
Figure 474 does not show whether the 802.16 Entity is a BS or MS.

Suggested Remedy
Change "802.16 Entity" to "802.16 Entity (BS)"

Decision of Group:
Agree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Actions a) done
In the enumeration of Security Information, SAID is mentioned twice.

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove one instance of "SAID,"

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove one instance of "SAID,"

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

Editor's Actions: a) done
This clause specifies the following effect of the reception of a C-SM-REQ primitive: "In addition, if the serving BS issues this primitive for the MS security information, the NCMS entity shall forwards the MS information to the target BS or another NCMS entity using C-SM-RSP/Context Transfer primitive."

However the C-SM-RSP/Context Transfer primitive in 14.2.2.3.1.2 does not have a parameter to carry the Security Information.

**Suggested Remedy**

Add the following parameter to the C-SM-RSP/Context Transfer primitive in 14.2.2.3.1.2:

"Security Information
The information negotiated during PKM procedure. It is present when the information could be provided. AK and AK sequence number transmitted by NCMS, TEK, TEK key lifetime, TEK sequence number, CBC Initialize Vector (the reuse of IV is TBD because of the security issue), SAID, GKEK, GKEK lifetime, GKEKKID, SA-type, SA service type, Cryptographic-Suite, and Authenticator ID"

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group: Agree

Add the following parameter to the C-SM-RSP/Context Transfer primitive in 14.2.2.3.1.2:

"Security Information
The information negotiated during PKM procedure. It is present when the information could be provided. AK and AK sequence number transmitted by NCMS, TEK, TEK key lifetime, TEK sequence number, CBC Initialize Vector (the reuse of IV is TBD because of the security issue), SAID, GKEK, GKEK lifetime, GKEKKID, SA-type, SA service type, Cryptographic-Suite, and Authenticator ID"

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

Parameter added to 1) the Attribute list of C-SM-RSP, and 2) the following Description.
Change "6.3.25 MIH handover function" to "6.3.25 MIH Function (optional)". Moreover change "MIH handover function" to "MIH function" throughout the document.

Suggested Remedy

MIH Functions are optional, same as 6.3.24 MS Idle Mode. So it should be labelled "optional", for consistency with 6.3.24. - Moreover "MIH handover" is redundant.

Suggested Remedy

Change "6.3.25 MIH handover function" to "6.3.25 MIH Function (optional)". Moreover change "MIH handover function" to "MIH function" throughout the document.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

change "MIH handover function" to "MIH function" throughout the document.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done
Delete "Action_info" and "Action_replay_info" from the Attribute list and from the table in that section.

Suggested Remedy
Delete "Action_info" and "Action_replay_info" from the Attribute list and from the table in that section.

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Agree
Delete "Action_info" and "Action_replay_info" from the Attribute list and from the table in that section.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions  b) none needed
Already done by Comment t#44; no additional action needed.
Fig. 473 fails to show all the Operation Types of table 450.

Suggested Remedy

Add "Authenticated EAP Start" and Authenticating EAP Transfer" into this figure or add a separate figure with these primitives, whatever is more appropriate.

Group Resolution

In figure 473, change the text as:
'PKMv2 EAP-Start' to 'PKMv2 EAP-Start, PKMv2 Authenticated EAP-Start'
and
'PKMv2 EAP-Transfer' to 'PKMv2 EAP-Transfer, PKMv2 Authenticated EAP-Transfer'
and
'PKMv2 EAP-Transfer' to 'PKMv2 EAP-Transfer, PKMv2 Authenticated EAP-Transfer'
and
'EAP Start' to 'EAP Start, Authenticated EAP Start'
and
'EAP Transfer' to 'EAP Transfer, Authenticated EAP Transfer'
and
'EAP Transfer' to 'EAP Transfer, Authenticated EAP Transfer'

In Table 450, change the heading as:
'Table 450—C-SM-IND Operation Types' to 'Table 450—C-SM-IND Event Types'

On page 52, lines 31-38, modify text as:
This primitive informs the authenticator in the NCMS that an SS is going to start an EAP-based authentication. The PKMv2 EAP-Start is sent by the SS to initiate either an initial EAP authentication or EAP re-authentication exchange. [BEGIN DELETE]In case of EAP re-authentication, the BS shall send EAP-Start to the authenticator in NCMS only if the PKMv2 EAP-Start message received from the SS is authenticated and protected by a CMAC or HMAC; otherwise, the BS shall drop the PKMv2 EAP Start message. [END DELETE]

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition
| Editor's Notes | Editor's Actions | a) done |
Add the following statement to the end of the paragraph in subclause 1.1.1:

"All features described in this standard are optional unless specifically stated otherwise."

Suggested Remedy:
Add the following statement to the end of the paragraph in subclause 1.1.1:

"All features described in this standard are optional unless specifically stated otherwise."

Group Resolution:

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution:
Commenter recommended that the comment be rejected.

Use of such global language would break backwards compatibility.

Group's Notes:
Vote:
In Favor: 0
none
Against: 5
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 0
none

Comment rejected

Editor's Notes:
Editor's Actions: b) none needed
Suggested Remedy

Note: for the NAS-Port-Type RADIUS Attribute 61 [RFC 2865], the 802.16 AAA service in the NCMS is assigned the value "27"

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Note: for the NAS-Port-Type RADIUS Attribute 61 [RFC 2865], the 802.16 AAA service [BEGIN INSERT] in the NCMS [END INSERT] is assigned the value "27"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done
Change

5.3 Generic Packet Convergence Sublayer (GPCS)

The Generic Packet CS (GPCS) is an upper layer protocol-independent packet convergence sublayer that supports multiple protocols over 802.16 air interface. Implementation of GCPS is optional.

It is defined as follows:

Suggested Remedy

Recommendation: Define GPSC support as optional in 802.16g

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from empty.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

The place to specify mandatory or optional features is a PICS.

The support of this feature is already optional via indication using the REG-REQ/RSP (See 11.7.7.1), through capabilities negotiation. The commenter gives no specific rationale why this feature should be singled-out for such declarative language, while similar features
including IP CS and Ethernet CS do not have similar language, while being similarly negotiated. There are in fact many negotiated parameters throughout the standard that do not have such specific declarative language, but are negotiated in capability negotiation as optional features.

**Group's Notes**

**Vote:**

*In Favor: 1*

Sang-Youb Kim

*Against: 5*

Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Joey Chou

*Abstain: 0*

none

Comment rejected

**Editor's Notes**

b) none needed
Suggested Remedy

Replace paragraph on lines 52-56 by:

PHS header suppression and reconstruction according to chapter 5.2.3 may be deployed on particular GPCS service flows by installing PHS rules at the receiving side of the service flow using the procedures described in chapter 5.2.3.2. As classification is outside of the scope of GPCS, the Classifier Rule Index in the DSC-REQ message should be set to '0' when configuring the PHS rules.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Actions a) done

In fact the inserted words replaced existing ones which had to be deleted (not shown in the remedy above).
WiMAX NWG and MTG decides to add ND/S TLV coverage in PICS, and have requested that MS should be able to display network name. Therefore, NSP Mapping List TLV that was removed from D3 draft should be restored.

**Suggested Remedy**

Add the following text

NSP Mapping List (11.1.8.3)

**Group Resolution**

**Decision of Group:** Disagree

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

Remedy makes inclusion mandatory, which is unacceptable. Realms are not required in many cases.

Realms can be up to 260 bytes long. Inclusion of Realms in SBC messages is problematic as SBC is on Basic CID, cannot be fragmented. Will cause more retransmissions of SBC, increase overhead and network entry latency.

**Group’s Notes**

**Vote:**

In Favor: 2
Joey Chou
Sang-Youb Kim

Against: 3
David Johnston
Peretz Feder
Achim Brandt

Abstain: 1
Richard van Leeuwen

Comment rejected

**Editor’s Notes**

b) none needed
Advertisement of Service providers IDs makes sense only for mobile and may be nomadic systems. It should be defined as optional in the standard to make it "required" in specific profiles.

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from empty.

Suggested Remedy

**Change**

6.3.2.3.63 Service Identity Information (SII-ADV) message

A BS may use the SII-ADV message to broadcast a list of Network Service Provider (NSP) Identifiers. The message may be broadcast periodically without solicitation or may be solicited by an SS during network entry by including the SIQ TLV in the SBC-REQ message (see section 6.3.2.3.23). This message is sent from the BS to all SSs on the broadcast CID. Implementation of SII-ADV message is optional for both BS and MS. Assignment method, administration, and usage of NSP IDs are outside the scope of this standard. The list of NSP IDs to be included in this message and the message transmission frequency are programmable.

**Change in p.27, line 4**

11.1.8 NSP List encodings

11.1.8.1 NSP List

The NSP LIST TLV contains one or more 24-bit Network Service Provider Identifiers. Implementation of NSP List TLV is optional for both BS and MS.

11.1.8.2 NSP Change Count

The NSP Change Count TLV indicates a change of the NSP list. Its value shall be increased by one (modulo 256) whenever the NSP list changes. Implementation of NSP Change Count TLV is optional for both BS and MS.

**GroupResolution**

Decision of Group: Disagree

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

The place to specify mandatory or optional features is a PICS.
The support of this feature is already optional via usage of 'MAY' in its invocation. There is no requirement that either a BS or SS support this message, and no failure in communication will result if either does not support the message.

**Group's Notes**

**Vote:**
In Favor: 0

*none*

Against: 6
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim
Joey Chou

Abstain: 0

*none*

**Comment Rejected**

**Editor's Notes**

b) none needed
WiMAX NWG and MTG decides to add ND/S TLV coverage in PICS, and have requested that MS should be able to display network name. Therefore, NSP Mapping List TLV that was removed from D3 draft should be restored.

Suggested Remedy
Add the following text

NSP Mapping List TLV (see 11.1.8.3)

The NSP Mapping List TLV contains one or more mapping relations between 24-bit format NSP Identifier(s) and NSP realm(s),

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Remedy makes inclusion mandatory, which is unacceptable. Realms are not required in many cases.

Realms can be up to 260 bytes long. Inclusion of Realms in SBC messages is problematic as SBC is on Basic CID, cannot be fragmented. Will cause more retransmissions of SBC, increase overhead and network entry latency.

Group’s Notes

Vote:
In Favor: 2
Joey Chou
Sang-Youb Kim

Against: 3
David Johnston
Peretz Feder
Achim Brandt

Abstain: 1
Richard van Leeuwen

Comment rejected
Introduce changes to section 6.3.9.3 enabling SS/MS avoid network entry into a loaded BS

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_028.doc

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
While the group felt that the feature had merit, there was concern that additional text changes, and changes to the figures were still required. Also, seeking additional study on impact for Idle Mode and Sleep Mode MS. Group requests commenter to resubmit during recirculation.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 1
Peretz Feder

Against: 3
Joey Chou
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 2
David Johnston
Achim Brandt

Comment rejected
Introduce changes to section 6.3.9.5.1 - Contention based initial ranging and automatic adjustments and section 6.3.10.3.1 Contention based initial ranging and automatic adjustments enabling a BS to redirect SS/MS to another BS on another acrrier or channel

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_029.doc

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Principle

Accept contribution C802.16g-07/029r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done

In section 6.3.10.3.1, Editor inserted the word "SHOULD" with lower case letters "should", in alignment with the rest of that section.
Some 802.16 members noticed that more analysis needed, particularly about PHY features to be used in locating the terminal's position. Meanwhile it should be defined as optional.

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from empty.

Suggested Remedy

6.3.2.3.64 Location Based Services (LBS-ADV) message
A BS may use the LBS-ADV message to broadcast the LBS information. The message may be broadcast periodically without solicitation. This message is sent from the BS to all MSs on a broadcast CID.

Implementation of LBS-ADV message is optional for both BS and MS.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

The place to specify mandatory or optional features is a PICS.

The support of this feature is already optional via usage of 'MAY' in its invocation. There is no requirement that either a BS or SS support this message, and no failure in communication will result if either does not support the message.

Group's Notes

Vote: 0
none

Against: 5
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 0
Introduce changes to "6.3.22.2.2 HO decision and initiation" allowing the MS to factor the BS loading condition when selecting the target BS for HO

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_030.doc

Accept contribution C802.16g-07/030r1

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition
MIH handover function is the support of IEEE Std 802.21 specific features and functions. The 802.16 entity may send or receive the MOB_MIH-MSG message to or from the peer 802.16 entity in order to convey MIHF Frames carrying the 802.21 MIH protocol messages. Implementation of MIH handover function is optional.

Suggested Remedy

6.3.25 MIH handover Function
MIH handover function is the support of IEEE Std 802.21 specific features and functions. The 802.16 entity may send or receive the MOB_MIH-MSG message to or from the peer 802.16 entity in order to convey MIHF Frames carrying the 802.21 MIH protocol messages. Implementation of MIH handover function is optional.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

The place to specify mandatory or optional features is a PICS.

The support of this feature is already optional via usage of 'MAY' in its invocation. There is no requirement that either a BS or SS support this message, and no failure in communication will result if either does not support the message. Support of this MIH function is negotiated in 11.8.10, capability negotiation.

Group's Notes

Vote:
In Favor: 0

Against: 5
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 0
none
Comment Rejected

2007/02/22

Editor's Actions b) none needed

Comment # 127 Editorial

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16g/D7

Comment by: Joey Chou Membership Status: Member

Decision of Group: Agree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Change the font size to be the same as other columns.

Group's Notes Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions a) done

Comment

The font size in the Note column is bigger than other columns

Suggested Remedy

Change the font size to be the same as other columns.
Suggested Remedy

MS: In case of broadcast method, MS shall monitor the frame at every cycle time for transmission of SII-ADV up to the Query Retry Counter value.

BS: In case of unicast method, BS shall poll the MS to deliver PKM-RSP carrying Query Response up to the Query Retry Counter value. If the BS does not receive a PKM-REQ (code=33) until the counter is exhausted, management CIDs shall be released.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree

MS: In case of broadcast method, MS shall monitor the frame at every cycle time for transmission of SII-ADV up to the Query Retry Counter value.

BS: In case of unicast method, BS shall poll the MS to deliver PKM-RSP carrying Query Response up to the Query Retry Counter value. If the BS does not receive a PKM-REQ (code=33) until the counter is exhausted, management CIDs shall be released.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions  a) done
Add the following type to table 346

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>141</td>
<td>NSP Mapping List</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Suggested Remedy

Add NSP Mapping List TLV to Table 346

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Remedy makes inclusion mandatory, which is unacceptable. Realms are not required in many cases. Realms can be up to 260 bytes long. Inclusion of Realms in SBC messages is problematic as SBC is on Basic CID, cannot be fragmented. Will cause more retransmissions of SBC, increase overhead and network entry latency.

Group’s Notes

Vote:
In Favor: 2
Joey Chou
Sang-Youb Kim

Against: 3
David Johnston
Peretz Feder
Achim Brandt

Abstain: 1
Richard van Leeuwen

Comment rejected

Editor’s Notes

b) none needed
There are several problems in MAC version encoding (11.1.3).

1. The text says [about TLV value]:


The problems:
- needs clarification as there is no “conformance with IEEE Std 802.16e-2005” alone (which is a combination of amendment and corrigenda to IEEE Std 802.16-2004)
- Conformance to IEEE Std 802.16-2004 + IEEE Std 802.16e-2005 is surprisingly bound to the conformance to IEEE Std 802.16f-2005 (MIB for fixed OFDM applications)
- Value 7 indicates conformance to 802.16g-2007 as a whole. Unfortunately the 16g standard includes so many topics not related to each other (ND&S, LBS, MIH, RRM, management primitives) that the only reasonable way of handling them is to make all optional and select features using profiles mechanism. It means that there should not be mandatory features in 802.16g. In this sense any system will be conformant to 802.16g, so no need to indicate conformance in the TLV

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from *empty*.

**Suggested Remedy**

**Change**

6: Indicates conformance with IEEE Std 802.16-2004 *as amended and corrected* IEEE Std 802.16e-2005
79-255: Reserved

**GroupResolution**

**Decision of Group:** Disagree

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

The proposed remedy in all ways is inconsistent with practice and precedence in IEEE 802 for identification of MAC version support.
The proposed changes to line 6 fails to be backwards compatible with previous amendments.

Commenter's argument regarding the optionality of supporting 802.16g features is inaccurate. While some changes introduced in 802.16g, such as fundamental changes to the 802.16 architecture and reference model are not overly testable, compliance is required to ensure proper support for future 802.16 activity. Thus, compliance with 802.16g is material, and identification of MAC support is important.

**Group's Notes**

**Vote:**
In Favor: 0
none

Against: 6
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim
Joey Chou

Abstain: 0
none

Comment Rejected

**Editor's Notes**

**Editor's Actions**
b) none needed
WiMAX NWG and MTG decides to add ND/S TLV coverage in PICS, and have requested that MS should be able to display network name. Therefore, NSP Mapping List TLV that was removed from D3 draft should be restored.

Suggested Remedy

Add the following TLV

11.1.8.3 NSP Mapping List TLV

NSP Mapping List is an optional compound TLV that contains one or more mapping relations between 24-bit format NSP Identifier(s) and NSP realm(s), and it may be included in a SBC-RSP message. BS shall respond to SBC-REQ including SIQ TLV with value=0 with an SBC-RSP message including NSP Mapping List TLV.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Length</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Scope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSP Mapping List TLV</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>variable</td>
<td>Compound (the compound</td>
<td>SBC-RSP, SII-ADV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>field contains sub-attributes</td>
<td>as defined in Table 113)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 113—NSP mapping List sub-attributes field

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Length</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSP Identifier</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>24-bit format NSP identifier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSP realm</td>
<td>variable</td>
<td>NSP realm, the fully qualified domain name</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Remedy makes inclusion mandatory, which is unacceptable. Realms are not required in many cases.

Realms can be up to 260 bytes long. Inclusion of Realms in SBC messages is problematic as SBC is on Basic CID, cannot be fragmented. Will cause more retransmissions of SBC, increase overhead and network entry latency.

Group’s Notes

Vote:
In Favor: 2
Comment rejected

**2007/02/22**

**Comment by:** Peretz Feder **Membership Status:** Member **Date:** 2007/02/13

**Comment #** 132 **Document under Review:** P802-16g/D7 **Ballot ID:** P802.16g_D7

**Comment** Text correction

**Suggested Remedy**

Cycle TLV is included to indicate when Query Response is expected. MS shall only check the cycle for the SII-ADV transmission in case of broadcast transmission method or the MIH_Polling_IE in the UL-MAP in case of unicast transmission method, and MS can switch to power saving mode while waiting for the Cycle.

**GroupResolution**

**Decision of Group:** Agree

Cycle TLV is included to indicate when Query Response is expected. MS shall only check the cycle for the SII-ADV transmission in case of broadcast transmission method or the MIH_Polling_IE in the UL-MAP in case of unicast transmission method, and MS can switch to power saving mode while waiting for the Cycle.

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor’s Notes** Editor’s Actions a) done
Introduce changes to "11.3.1 UCD channel encoding" and "11.4.1 DCD channel encoding"

adding TLV 23 and 24 Non-pre-assigned DL radio resources

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from 'Editorial' at the commenter's request

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_031.doc

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
While the group felt that the feature had merit, there was concern that additional text changes, and changes to the figures were still required. Also, seeking additional study on impact for Idle Mode and Sleep Mode MS. Group requests commenter to resubmit during recirculation.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 1
Peretz Feder

Against: 3
Joey Chou
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 2
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Comment rejected

Editor's Notes

b) none needed

2007/02/22

Editor's Actions

Editor's Notes

The text in the introductory paragraph is unclear, especially how the combination of the setting of bits #0 and #1-#3. Existence of an information service on the layer 2 broadcast area is outside the scope of 802.16, as the case is for, e.g., ARP and DHCP discovery. What the bits should indicate is which MAC management messages and attribute values are supported by the BS.

Suggested Remedy

Disallow setting of bits #1-#3 to 1 when bit #0 is set to 0. Remove text that pertains to the setting of bit #0 to 0 and bits #1-#3 to 1, - or clarify the meaning of these settings.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Accept contribution C802.16g-07/034r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

a) done
Modify Type 3 to allow channel redirection

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_032.doc

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle

Accept contribution C802.16g-07/032r1

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
The text in the introductory paragraph is unclear, especially how the combination of the setting of bits #0 and #1-#3. Existence of an information service on the layer 2 broadcast area is outside the scope of 802.16, as the case is for, e.g., ARP and DHCP discovery. What the bits should indicate is which MAC management messages and attribute values are supported by the BS. Also the setting of the bits is asymmetrical; not all settings apply to the MS.

Suggested Remedy
Disallow setting of bits #1-#3 to 1 when bit #0 is set to 0. Remove text that pertains to the setting of bit #0 to 0 and bits #1-#3 to 1, - or clarify the meaning of these settings. Also, clarify the setting of the bits at the MS.

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Principle

Accept contribution C802.16g-07/034r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done

Same remedy as comment#34.
Suggested Remedy

Raw IP packets. This is necessary for a point to point IP link since ARP cannot be supported. Note that the first byte of every IP packet allows the distinction between IPv4, IPv6 and ROHC (RFC 3095) IP packets so these protocols may be multiplexed over the same GPCS connection.
The following text in 802.16g is inconsistent and does not fit the scope of 16g project. It leaves to the implementation to choose if the reported value is before or after HARQ applied, so no way for proper interpretation by the peer device:

“This TLV indicates the target packet error rate (PER) for the service flow as defined below. This PER could either be the PER as seen by the application (post ARQ and/or HARQ processing) or as seen on the airlink (before the application of ARQ and HARQ). The particular use of this TLV is left open to implementations and vendor differentiations."

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from empty.

Suggested Remedy
Remove 11.13.38

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Principle

On page 37, in 11.13.38, in the Table, In the 'value' field, modify as:
'0 – PER measured by the application[BEGIN INSERT], post -ARQ and post-HARQ process[END INSERT]' '1 – PER measured on the airlink[BEGIN INSERT], before the application of ARQ and HARQ[END INSERT]' 

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions a) done
In Sections "11.18.2  Non-pre-assigned DL radio resources"
Add DCD to the scope entry in the table.
The Scope is changed to: MOB_NBR-ADV, DCD

Suggested Remedy
In Sections "11.18.2  Non-pre-assigned DL radio resources"
Add DCD to the scope of TLV 23 in section 11.18.2

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
While the group felt that the feature had merit, there was concern that additional text changes, and changes to the figures were still required. Also, seeking additional study on impact for Idle Mode and Sleep Mode MS. Group requests commenter to resubmit during recirculation.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 1
Peretz Feder
Against: 3
Joey Chou
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim
Abstain: 2
David Johnston
Achim Brandt

Comment rejected
Editor's Actions b) none needed
Add UCD to the scope of TLV 24 in section 11.18.3

Suggested Remedy
In Sections "11.18.3 Non-pre-assigned UL radio resources"

Add UCD to the Scope entry in the table.
The scope is changed to: MOB_NBR-ADV, UCD

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
While the group felt that the feature had merit, there was concern that additional text changes, and changes to the figures were still required. Also, seeking additional study on impact for Idle Mode and Sleep Mode MS. Group requests commenter to resubmit during recirculation.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 1
Peretz Feder

Against: 3
Joey Chou
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim

Abstain: 2
David Johnston
Achim Brandt

Comment rejected

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions  b) none needed
Section 14 "Management interfaces and procedures" must be informative as it addresses management primitives, which are not visible in the air interface.

Chair changed the Comment Type to 'Technical' from empty.

Suggested Remedy
Make section 14 an informative addendum

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Section 14 forms the basis for the normative model for 802.16 to provide a method for base station-to-NCMS-to-base station communications essential for mobility, as well as other features, to function. As such, while the primitives defined in section 14 are not conformantly testable (outside of a protocol implementation) on the air interface, they provide the essential key to mobility and other features.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 0
none

Against: 6
Peretz Feder
David Johnston
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim
Joey Chou

Abstain: 0
none

Comment Rejected
It appears the following parameters are not used in the primitives:

- Time,
- SAP_Error_code

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove the following parameters in the primitive template and the corresponding table:

- Time,
- SAP_Error_code

**Group Resolution**

- Remove the following parameters in the primitive template and the corresponding table:
  - Time,
  - SAP_Error_code

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

- Accepted without opposition

This is on page 44, not 42.
Confirmed_flag is not used in the primitives.

Suggested Remedy

Remove the Confirmed_flag parameter in the primitive template and the corresponding table

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove the Confirmed_flag parameter in the primitive template and the corresponding table

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

a) done

Editor's Actions
It appears the following parameters are not used in the primitives.
Filter,
Scope,
Action_info,
Action_replay_info,
Time,
SAP_error_code

Suggested Remedy
Remove the following parameters in the primitive template and the corresponding table
Filter,
Scope,
Action_info,
Action_replay_info,
Time,
SAP_error_code

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Agree
Remove the following parameters in the primitive template and the corresponding table
Filter,
Scope,
Action_info,
Action_replay_info,
Time,
SAP_error_code

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
Operation_type = Cancel is not used in the document

Chair changed Commen Type to 'Technical' from 'Editorial'

Suggested Remedy
Remove "Cancel" from the operation_type

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Agree

Remove "Cancel" from the operation_type

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
Remove "Set' in the Action_type

Suggested Remedy
Remove "Set' in the Action_type

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree
Remove "Set' in the Action_type

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Group's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done
Confirmed_Flag and Event_info are not used in the primitives.

Chair changed Commen Type to 'Technical' from 'Editorial'

Suggested Remedy
Remove the Confirmed_flag and Event_info parameter in the primitive template and the corresponding table

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Agree
Remove the Confirmed_flag and Event_info parameter in the primitive template and the corresponding table

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions
a) done
Remove DHC and MIP entries from the table. These IP assignment options were remove from D6 but were skipped in this table.

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove the following from the table:

* DHC_TRANSFER
* MIP_TRANSFER

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove the following from the table:

[BEGIN DELETE]* DHC_TRANSFER[END DELETE]
[BEGIN DELETE]* MIP_TRANSFER[END DELETE]

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

Editor's Actions: a) done

DHCP_TRANSFER and MIP_TRANSFER removed.
While we discussed the resolution of comment #32 in the last meeting, we agreed that we needed to improve the mechanics of the M-ACM-IND function. In the current draft, whenever accounting events (registration, service flow creation, de-registration, etc) are occurred, the BS gathers accounting information and reports it using M-ACM-IND primitive that does not require an acknowledgment. By definition, any indication primitive is used to just notify an event. Therefore, it doesn’t need to include any information.

**Suggested Remedy**

Adopt texts in C802.16g-07/026

**Group Resolution**

Adopt texts in C802.16g-07/026

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor’s Notes**

Table number 449 assigned - to avoid renumbering of all subsequent tables 450 to 461. Table number 449 seems to be available. (Not sure whether automatic linkage to table and figure numbers has been applied consistently yet, so we should avoid renumbering if possible.)

At this occasion, Editor spotted that Table 440 was incorrectly numbered and its heading is obsolete, so Editor removed that table heading in section 11.7.7.1.
Change Function: SMC payload is sent from NCMS (BS) to 802.16 Entity (BS).
To Function: SMC payload is sent from NCMS to 802.16 Entity.

Suggested Remedy

M-SMC-IND is applicable to both BS and MS

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Change

Function: SMC payload is sent from NCMS (BS) to 802.16 Entity (BS).
To
Function: SMC payload is sent from NCMS to 802.16 Entity.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Actions a) done
The Destination should be MS, since Figure 477 uses MS

Suggested Remedy
Change

Destination(SS, BS, or NCMS),

To

Destination(MS, BS, or NCMS),

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Principle

Change all instances of 'MS' to 'SS' in Figure 477, and throughout subclause 14.2.3

Change all instances of 'SS/MS' to 'SS' throughout subclause 14.2.3

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
Figure title is misleading. Make it consistent with Figure 480

**Suggested Remedy**

Change

Figure 481—Idle mode initiation (NCMS on the BS side)

To

Figure 481—Idle mode initiation (NCMS on the BS side Initiated)

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group: Principle

Change

Figure 481—Idle mode initiation (NCMS on the BS side)

To

Figure 481—Idle mode initiation (initiated by the NCMS on the BS side)

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

**Group’s Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor’s Notes**

a) done
Change the structure of Subclause 14.2.4.2.1 to the following:

14.2.4.2.1 C-PG-REQ

This primitive is used by an 802.16 entity or NCMS to trigger an idle mode service procedure. The Operation Type included in this primitive defines the type of idle mode service procedure to be performed. The possible Operation Types for this primitive are listed in Table below.

Table

14.2.4.2.1.1 C-PG-REQ (action type = Idle_Mode_Operation)

Function
This primitive is issued by a BS to inform the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity in the NCMS that an MS requests to initiate Idle Mode. This primitive can also be issued by the NCMS to force MS into an Idle mode by instructing the BS to initiate a DREG-CMD to the MS with Action Code = 0x05.

Semantics of the service primitive:

The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-REQ
(Operation_type: Action,
Action_type: Idle_Mode_Initiation,
Destination: NCMS, BS, MS
Attribute_List:
MS MAC Address
Paging Information
Paging Controller ID
Security Information
Idle Mode Retain Information)
MAC Hash Skip Threshold
Service Flow parameters
Service and operational information

When generated:
This primitive is generated when a BS receives a DREG-REQ message with Deregistration_Request_Code=0x01, "request for MS De-Registration from serving BS and initiation of MS Idle Mode".

Effect of receipt:
This primitive shall be generated on the BS side and the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity shall respond to this primitive by sending C-PG-RSP(Idle_Mode_Initiation).

14.2.4.2.1.2 C-PG-REQ (action type = Network re-entry from Idle mode)

Function
This primitive is issued by a BS to inform the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity of Paging Services that the specified MS is attempting to re-enter network.

Semantics of the service primitive:

The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-REQ
( Operation_type: Action,
Action_type: Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode,
Destination: NCMS,
Attribute_List:
MS MAC Address
Paging Information
Paging Controller ID
BSID
) When generated:
This primitive is generated by a BS when it receives a RNG-REQ message including Ranging Purpose Indication with setting bit #0 to 1 in combination with Paging Controller ID.

Effect of receipt:
C-PG-REQ(Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode) notifies the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity that the specified MS is attempting to
re-enter network through the specified BS in order to receive DL traffic. The management entity also checks the MS service and operational information for the MS, and transmits C-PG-RSP(Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode) in response to this primitive.

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle

Change the structure of Subclause 14.2.4.2.1 to the following:

14.2.4.2.1 C-PG-REQ

This primitive is used by an 802.16 entity or NCMS to trigger an idle mode service procedure. The Operation Type included in this primitive defines the type of idle mode service procedure to be performed. The possible Operation Types for this primitive are listed in Table below.

Table

14.2.4.2.1.1 C-PG-REQ (action type = Idle_Mode_Initiation)

Function
This primitive is issued by a BS to inform the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity in the NCMS that an MS requests to initiate Idle Mode. This primitive can also be issued by the NCMS to force MS into an Idle mode by instructing the BS to initiate a DREG-CMD to the MS with Action Code = 0x05.

Semantics of the service primitive:

The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-REQ

( Operation_type: Action,
  Action_type: Idle_Mode_Initiation,
  Destination: NCMS, BS, MS
  Attribute_List:
    MS MAC Address
    Paging_Information
    Paging Controller ID
    Security Information
    Idle Mode Retain Information
    MAC Hash Skip Threshold
    Service Flow parameters
    Service and operational information
)
When generated:

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Actions

This was accepted "in principle" because the agreed remedy is different from the original suggested remedy in a previous version of the commentary DB.

- Editor implemented "Inserted 14.2.4.2.1.1 C-PG-REQ (Action_Type==Idle_Mode_Initiation)", not (Action_Type==Idle_Mode_Operation). For consistency.
Subclause 14.2.4.2.2 contains two subfunctions that is hard to read. I suggest splitting the subfunctions into subclauses.

Suggested Remedy
Change the structure of Subclause 14.2.4.2.2 to the following:

14.2.4.2.2 C-PG-RSP

This primitive is used by an 802.16 entity or NCMS to respond to an idle mode service request. The Operation Type included in this primitive defines the type of idle mode service procedure to be performed. The possible Operation Types for this primitive are listed in Table below:

Table

14.2.4.2.2.1 C-PG-RSP (action type = Idle_Mode_Operation)

Function
This primitive is issued by the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity in the NCMS in response to the C-PG-REQ(Idle_Mode_Initiation) primitive.

Semantics of the service primitive:

The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-RSP
( Operation_type: Action,
  Action_type: Idle_Mode_Initiation,
  Destination: NCMS, BS, MS
  Attribute_List:
  Action code
  MS MAC Address
  Paging Information
  Paging Controller ID
  Idle Mode Retain Information
  MAC Hash Skip Threshold
REQ-duration
)

When generated:
This primitive is generated to request a BS to issue a DREG-CMD message.

Effect of receipt:
A BS receiving C-PG-RSP(Idle_Mode_Initiation) shall transmit DREG-CMD message with setting each field in accordance with the information elements in this primitive.

14.2.4.2.2.2 C-PG-RSP (action type = Network re-entry from Idle mode)

Function
This primitive is issued by the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity to confirm the MS Network Re-entry from Idle Mode and provide the BS, at which the MS is attempting to re-enter the network, with service and operational information.

Semantics of the service primitive:
The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-RSP
( Operation_type: Action,
  Action_type: Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode,
  Destination: NCMS,
  Attribute_List:
    MS MAC Address
    Security Information
    Service and operational information
  )

When generated:
This primitive is generated by BS when a RNG-REQ message including Ranging Purpose Indication with setting bit #0 to 1 in combination with Paging Controller ID.

Effect of receipt:
BS receiving C-PG-RSP(Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode) transmits RNG-RSP message including HO Process Optimization which is based on the service and operational information in this primitive. The BS acknowledges the receipt of this message by transmitting the C-PG-ACK(Network_Re-Entry_from_Idle_Mode) message to the NCMS.

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Agree
Change the structure of Subclause 14.2.4.2.2 to the following:

14.2.4.2.2 C-PG-RSP

This primitive is used by an 802.16 entity or NCMS to respond to an idle mode service request. The Operation Type included in this primitive defines the type of idle mode service procedure to be performed. The possible Operation Types for this primitive are listed in Table below:

Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>14.2.4.2.2.1 C-PG-RSP (action type = Idle_Mode_Operation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Function</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This primitive is issued by the Paging and Idle Mode Services entity in the NCMS in response to the C-PG-REQ(Idle_Mode_Initiation) primitive.

Semantics of the service primitive:

The parameters of the primitives are as follows:

C-PG-RSP

( Operation_type: Action,
  Action_type: Idle_Mode_Initiation,
  Destination: NCMS, BS, MS
  Attribute_List:
    Action code
    MS MAC Address
    Paging Information
    Paging Controller ID
    Idle Mode Retain Information
    MAC Hash Skip Threshold
    REQ-duration
)

When generated:
This primitive is generated to request a BS to issue a DREG-CMD message.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Changed "action type = Idle_Mode_Operation" to "action type = Idle_Mode_Initiation", for correctness.

2007/02/22

Comment by: Joey Chou
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16g/D7
Ballot ID: P802.16g_D7
Comment #: 155

Inconsistent Operation_type and Action_type.

Operation_type: Set,
Action_type: Location Update,

Operation_Type(Action),
Action_Type(HO-Target),

Suggested Remedy
Change all occurrence of Operation_type and Action_type to Operation_Type and Action_Type.

Change all occurrence of Operation_type and Action_type to Operation_Type and Action_Type.
Change Operation_type to Action

Suggested Remedy
Change Operation_type to Action

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Principle
Change Operation_type from 'Set' to 'Action'

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions: a) done

Action_type is valid only when Operation_type = action according to its definition in 14.1.2.1. It should be the same as 14.2.4.3.2.
Correct error in Figure 492. The report is not Local but rather targeted over the air (hence remote)

Suggested Remedy
Change in Figure 492 C-HO-REQ(HO-SCAN Report target: Local) to C-HO-REQ(HO-SCAB Report target: Remote)

Group Resolution
Change in Figure 492 C-HO-REQ(HO-SCAN Report target: Local) to C-HO-REQ(HO-SCAB Report target: Remote)

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions
a) done
Candidate target BS list
For BS generated primitive, this is the list of BSs which are recommended for a target BS [BEGIN DELETE]or an active BS by the MS [END DELETE]. Additional HO quality information such as Service Level Prediction and RF Signal Information also can be included in this list. For NCMS generated primitive, this is the list of recommended target BSs by the Mobility Management Services entity. The BSs in the list may be the candidate target BSs for HO or an Anchor BS or Active BSs for SHO/FBSS according to the value of HO type and Mode MS Access Information, Newly Allocation Information, and HO Quality Information can be included in this list.

Group Resolution
Decision of Group:  Agree

Candidate target BS list
For BS generated primitive, this is the list of BSs which are recommended for a target BS or an active BS by the MS. Additional HO quality information such as Service Level Prediction and RF Signal Information also can be included in this list. For NCMS generated primitive, this is the list of recommended target BSs by the Mobility Management Services entity. The BSs in the list may be the candidate target BSs for HO or an Anchor BS or Active BSs for SHO/FBSS according to the value of HO type and Mode MS Access Information, Newly Allocation Information, and HO Quality Information can be included in this list.

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions  a) done
Suggested Remedy

**Link Status Report Period**
Time period indicating when the scanning report shall be sent.

**Group Resolution**

**Decision of Group:** Agree

**Group's Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

The remedy was: Time period indicating when the scanning report shall be sent.
C-HO-IND can be sent from NCMS to 802.16 BS entity:

**Suggested Remedy**

**Change**

Destination(NCMS, MS),

To

Destination(NCMS, BS, MS),

**Group Resolution**

**Decision of Group:** Agree

**Change**

Destination(NCMS, MS),

To

Destination(NCMS, BS, MS),

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

Editor's Actions: a) done
Destination, Event_Type, Operation_type and Action_type have different definitions.

For example:

Operation_Type(Create),
Action_Type(Null),
Event_Type(Neighbor-BS Radio Resource Status Update),
Destination(MS, or BS, or NCMS),

Operation_Type: Get,
Action_Type: Null,
Event_Type: NBR_BS_Update,
Destination: BS

Suggested Remedy
use consistent definition throughout the whole document

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle
Editor to fix format for 'Semantics of the service primitive' throughout subclause 14.2 to be consistent with the rest of the document

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
In general, syntax used like:
Action_Type: Null,
Destination: MS, or BS, or NCMS, ....,
i.e. no brackets any more.
There are no "When generated:" and "Effect of receipt:" in the following subclauses:
14.2.6.1.1.1,
14.2.6.1.1.2,
14.2.6.1.2.1,
14.2.6.1.2.2,
14.2.6.1.3.1,
14.2.6.1.3.2,

Suggested Remedy
Remove all "When generated:" and "Effect of receipt:" throughout the document, since in many cases "When generated:" and "Effect of receipt:" don't contain meaningful information.

For example; P122, L54
When generated:
This primitive is generated when decided to notify the ranging result after receiving ranging request.
Effect of receipt:
MAC layer sends RNG-RSP message
P123, L49
Effect of receipt:
The upper layer entity receives the result of ranging.
When generated:
This primitive is generated when MAC layer receives RNG-RSP message.

Group Resolution
Decision of Group: Disagree

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
The group would prefer that commenters bring future comments to add 'When generated' and 'Effect of receipt' language to primitives currently missing such language. These sections are normative and useful.

Group's Notes
Vote:
In Favor: 0
none
Against: 5
David Johnston
Peretz Feder
Achim Brandt
Richard van Leeuwen
Sang-Youb Kim
Abstain: 1
Joey Chou

Comment Rejected

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions
b) none needed
This primitive can be used by RRC to inform a Serving BS about the list of Neighbor BSs which are potential HO Target Base Stations for any MS's being served by the SBS, including an information about their radio resource status. And it can also be used by the RRA to report the spare capacity information to the RRC periodically or as event driven. The possible event type for this primitive are listed in Table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested Remedy</th>
<th>Clarification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GroupResolution</td>
<td>Decision of Group: Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This primitive can be used by RRC to inform a Serving BS about the list of Neighbor BSs which are potential HO Target Base Stations for any MS's being served by the SBS, including an information about their radio resource status. And it can also be used by the RRA to report the spare capacity information to the RRC periodically or as event driven. The possible event type for this primitive are listed in Table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group's Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accepted without opposition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editor's Notes</th>
<th>Editor's Actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) done</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is not clear what (MS and BS) in the figure title means.

Figure 498—Ranging Primitives (MS and BS)  Figure 499—SS Basic Capability Negotiation Primitives (MS and BS)

**Suggested Remedy**

Change

Figure 498—Ranging Primitives (MS and BS)  Figure 499—SS Basic Capability Negotiation Primitives (MS and BS)

to

Figure 498—Ranging Primitive  
Figure 499—SS Basic Capability Negotiation Primitives

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group:  Agree

Change

Figure 498—Ranging Primitives (MS and BS)  Figure 499—SS Basic Capability Negotiation Primitives (MS and BS)

to

Figure 498—Ranging Primitive  
Figure 499—SS Basic Capability Negotiation Primitives

**Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor’s Notes**

a) done
Change Operation_type in the following subclauses to "Action"

14.2.7.1.1.1,
14.2.7.1.1.2,
14.2.7.1.2,
14.2.7.1.3.1,
14.2.7.1.3.2,
14.2.7.1.4,
14.2.7.2.1.1,
14.2.7.2.1.2
14.2.7.2.2,
14.2.7.2.3.1,
14.2.7.2.3.2,
14.2.7.2.4,

Suggested Remedy
Change Operation_type in the following subclauses to "Action"

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle
Change Operation_type in the following subclauses from 'Set' to "Action"

14.2.7.1.1.1,
14.2.7.1.1.2,
14.2.7.1.2,
14.2.7.1.3.1,
14.2.7.1.3.2,
14.2.7.1.4,
14.2.7.2.1.1,
14.2.7.2.1.2
Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes       Editor’s Actions
a) done
Enumerate Method of Allocation IP Address properly

**Suggested Remedy**
Static
DHCP V4
Mobile IPv4
DHCPv6
Mobile IPv6
IPv6 Stateless address auto configuration

**Group Resolution**

Decision of Group: Principle

In Table 459 and Table 460, change the 'Valid Range' for 'Method of Allocation IP Address' to:

Static
DHCP V4
Mobile IPv4
DHCPv6
Mobile IPv6
IPv6 Stateless address auto configuration

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**

Bullets applied for better readability.
2007/02/22

Why is "==" used? It should use "=" instead

14.2.8.1.1 M-MTM-REQ (Action Type == Power On)

Suggested Remedy

Change all occurrence of "==" to "=".

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Change all occurrence of "==" to "=".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions a) done
Remove "Action_Type: Null," in the following subclauses

14.2.9.1.1,  
14.2.9.1.2,  
14.2.9.1.3,  
14.2.9.2.1,  
14.2.9.2.2,  
14.2.9.2.3,  

Suggested Remedy

Action_type is valid only when Operation_type = action according to its definition in 14.1.2.1.

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove "Action_Type: Null," in the following subclauses

14.2.9.1.1,  
14.2.9.1.2,  
14.2.9.1.3,  
14.2.9.2.1,  
14.2.9.2.2,  
14.2.9.2.3,  

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes

Editor’s Actions

a) done
Why is there an Action_type = Set, when there is an Operation_type = Set?

Suggested Remedy
Change the Action_type to "Set", and remove the Action_Type(Set), for the following sunclauses

14.2.10.2.1,
14.2.10.2.2

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle

Change the Operation_type from 'Operation_Type(Action)' to "Operation_Type: Set," and delete the Action_Type(Set), for the following subclauses

14.2.10.2.1,
14.2.10.2.2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
Editor's Actions a) done
Action_type is valid only when Operation_type = action according to its definition in 14.1.2.1
Message_id is no longer valid

Suggested Remedy
Remove "Action_Type: Null," and Message_id in the following subclauses

14.2.10.3.2.1,
14.2.10.3.2.2,
14.2.10.3.3.1,
14.2.10.3.3.2,
14.2.10.3.2.1,

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove "Action_Type: Null," and Message_id in the following subclauses

14.2.10.3.2.1,
14.2.10.3.2.2,
14.2.10.3.3.1,
14.2.10.3.3.2,
14.2.10.3.2.1,

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Notes
a) done

Removed from 14.2.10.3.2.1, 14.2.10.3.2.2, 14.2.10.3.3.1, 14.2.10.3.3.2.
(The fifth entry in the remedy was a duplication.)
Action_type is valid only when Operation_type = action according to its definition in 14.1.2.1.

Suggested Remedy
Remove "Action_Type: Null,"

Decision of Group: Agree

Remove "Action_Type: Null,"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution
Accepted without opposition

Editor's Actions a) done
Remove "Action_Type: Null,"

**Suggested Remedy**
Remove "Action_Type: Null,"

**Group Resolution**
Remove "Action_Type: Null,"

**Decision of Group:** 
Agree

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**
Accepted without opposition

**Group's Notes**
Accepted without opposition

**Editor's Notes**
a) done

Action_type is valid only when Operation_type = action according to its definition in 14.1.2.1.
Add a new figure showing end to end MIH exchange in a pre authenticated mode

Suggested Remedy
Adopt contribution C80216g-07_033.doc

GroupResolution
Decision of Group: Principle
Editor to add the figures in contribution C802.16g-07/033 as Figures F10 & F11 on page 167, line 64

Reason for Group’s Decision/Resolution

Group’s Notes
Accepted without opposition

Editor’s Notes
Editor’s Actions  a) done
Figures added as Figures F11 & F12 since F10 exists already.