| Project | IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group <http://ieee802.org/16> | |
|---|---|---|
| Title | **Minutes of the GRIDMAN meeting, Jan. 2010, Approved** | |
| Date Submitted | 3/18/10 | |
| Source(s) | Eldad Zeira, GRIDMAN secretary<br>InterDigital Communications LLC | Voice:<br>E-mail: Eldad.zeira@interdigital.com<br><br>*<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html> |
| Re: | GRIDMAN meeting during session #65, San Diego | |
| Abstract | Minutes | |
| Purpose | | |
| Notice | *This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups.* It represents only the views of the participants listed in the "Source(s)" field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16. | |
| Patent Policy | The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures:<br>    <http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6> and<br>    <http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3>.<br>Further information is located at <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html> and<br><http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat>. | |

*Minutes of the GRIDMAN meeting, Jan. 2010*

The SG was convened Tuesday 1/12/10 AM and remained in session till 1/14/10. We have had 15-40 attendees at different times. Six presentations have been available and have been discussed.

Chair has read the IEEE patent policy statement.

Agenda C802.16gman-10/0006r1 has been approved unanimously.

The session has started with the Chair's presentation and review of the baseline draft in 802.16-09/0068r2. There was no discussion.

The following GRIDMAN contributions have been presented. Discussion on specific text proposals has been deferred till later in the meeting.

1. C802.16gman-10/0001: Maritime Multi-hop Networks, Dr Jaya Shankar, Institute for Infocomm Research

2. C802.16gman-10/0002: Network Architecture options for GRIDMAN – Smart Grid applications, Eldad Zeira, InterDigital Communications LLC

3. C802.16gman-10/0003: Spectrum management options for GRIDMAN – Smart Grid applications, Eldad Zeira, InterDigital Communications LLC

4. C802.16gman-10/0004: Selective GRIDMAN requirements, Mariana Goldhamer, Alvarion (Mariana has not been available to present, presented by Chairman)

5. C802.16gman-10/0005: Suggestions for GRIDMAN proposal, Jose Puthenkulam, Intel

6. C802.16gman-10/0007: (no title) Craig Rodine, Smart Grid R&D, EPRI

The Chair has presented IEEE C802.16-10/0001, "Proposed IEEE 802.16 content in NIST Wireless Standards Characterization Matrix for Smart Grid Applications", Roger Marks et. al.

The SG has discussed the appropriate source for the input we may provide to NIST, 802.16-2009 or 802.16m. Some in the group felt that 802.16m is the appropriate source.

Roger Marks clarified that 2009 has to be included as the finished standard and that 802.16m could be added as a separate column if so desired.

A motion to add 802.16m: 8 for 5 against, motion failed.

SG has then discussed the possible addition of a column related to 802.16j. Roger Marks clarified that 802.16j is not a certified and deployed standard and that fact must be clearly indicated if 802.16j related information is added.

Chair asked if there would be objection to NOT adding a column for 802.16j. No objections

A straw poll indicated preference to take a break and discuss the numbers offline.

SG then discusses again what would be the appropriate source for the NIST input. The SG has then examined the 3GPP submission to NIST, available on the NIST website and observed that several columns have been provided by 3GPP representing Edge, UMTS, HSPA and LTE respectively.

Roger Marks has then suggested (conveyed through Rakesh Taori) that SG could add an 802.16m related column but mark it "to be

provided" and conduct work to fill it before session #66.

Chair has asked whether there is any objection to add an empty 802.16m column, none expressed.

SG has then discussed whether C802.16-10/0001answers the NIST questions. SG then reviewed C802.16-10/0001 line by line and made changes.

Chair motion: for Chair to provide analysis from GRIDMAN SG relating to C802.16-10/0001 to 802.16 WG Chair for his consideration

For – 17 against – 0, abstains – 0, motion carries

Recess till Wednesday AM

0800 Wednesday

The motion taken yesterday at the close of the meeting was procedurally incorrect: no mover, no seconder. It will be treated as a straw poll and the Chair is willing to consider a formal motion to the same effect from the floor.

Motion: For the Chair to provide analysis from the GRIDMAN SG relating to C802.16-10/0001 to the 802.16 WG Chair for his consideration

Moved: Upkar Dhaliwal

Seconded: Arthur Wang

For: 11

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion carries.

SG then discussed the draft PAR from 802.16-09/0068r2.

Chair has suggested the following process, to use 802.16-09/0068r2 as baseline, considering recommended changes in contributions from yesterday. If straw poll shows more than 75% support we'll include changes in the draft to be placed to the study group for approval. After considering changes in contributions we'll consider other changes from the floor.

Chair asked if there are any objections, none expressed.

The following is a contribution by contribution discussion and record of changes:

1.  Changes from C802.16gman-10/0001

No specific changes spelled out in the contribution. The author has requested to under "broad market potential" in the 5C to modify "harbor" to "maritime".

Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed.

2.  Changes from C802.16gman-10/0002:

Objection expressed to the proposed text as a whole, Chair has partitioned the proposed text changes into 3 separate statements:

Regarding addition of "and data" – Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed

Regarding addition of "mobile and local and relaying, multi-hop relaying" – Chair conducted a straw poll, 11 for, 1 against, pass

3

Regarding addition of "optimizations for low cost mobiles"

Amending the proposed text above as "optimized for low ~~cost~~ complexity devices" passed (Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed)

Re amended text proposal "optimized for low complexity devices" Chair conducted straw poll, for 7, against 4, change fails

(Menashe Shahar expressed a concern that the same standard shouldn't address home and higher end Smart Grid devices)

3. Changes from C802.16gman-10/0003:

Propose to change "share" to "coexist" – Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed

Straw poll for modified text 9 for 1 against, carries

4. Changes from C802.16gman-10/0004:

Re deletion of "OFDMA" from scope: Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed

Re adding explanatory note in 8.1: for 0, against 1, abstain 9 – change fails

5. Changes from C802.16gman-10/0005:

Re amendment name change – Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed

Re elimination of PHY from scope: there was a discussion on the nature of PHY changes; it has been explained that the intent is for limited scope changes, not a whole new PHY. Chair asked for someone to speak in favor of this change, nobody has spoke in favor of this change.

Chair asked if there is any objection to reject the text, none expressed.

Additional changes in 5.5 given below were then requested from the floor and accepted without objections:

1'st paragraph – add words maritime, international maritime organizations, maritime safety at the appropriate locations – modify text as follows (underlined text is new)

"Work undertaken within Land Mobile Radio, Aeronautic, maritime and Government bodies, such as the TETRA Association, Eurocae, International Maritime Organizations and the US Department of Homeland Security and Federal Aviation Administration, regarding the deployment of IEEE 802.16 technology in Public Safety, Avionics, Airport Surface Communication, Maritime Safety and Surveillance applications, has raised specific issues which can only be addressed within IEEE 802.16."

Modify 2'nd paragraph as:

"Recently introduced legislation in U.S. and other countries encourages and funds a wide range of activities in communications technologies ~~geared at the~~ supporting Smart Grid applications such as monitoring and control of generation, transmission, distribution and consumption of energy ~~and other~~ resources."

1'st paragraph:

Modify as:

"…has raised specific issues which ~~can only~~ may be addressed within IEEE 802.16."

Chair intends to issue a new contribution containing changes to draft PAR at the end of this meeting as C80216gman-10/0008. He will send notice to 802.16 and GRIDMAN reflectors that the draft PAR is posted for consideration.

Chair asked if there where objections to this, none were expressed.

No objection to recess till 8am Thursday

0800 Thursday

Chair reviewed editorial changes to draft PAR for inclusion in C80216gman-10/0008r1. Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed.

Discussion of removal of PHY from scope. No change proposed at this point but Chair clarified that changes may be introduced from the floor at WG when brought to a vote.

Straw poll: how many will support MAC-only PAR? How many will oppose? 8/5

Straw poll: how many will support removal of PHY if it is the only way to approve the PAR at the WG? 12 / 0

Straw poll: how many will support modifying "PHY" to "minimal PHY" if it is the only way to approve the PAR at the WG? 13/0

Chair announced that at the WG he will try first "minimal PHY" and remove PHY only if absolutely necessary. Chair asked if there is any objection, none expressed.

Straw: how many people believe that the PAR as written will already address the changes requested in 8.1 by 10/0004? 13/0

Members of the SG provided the following rationales for why they didn't support this change yesterday.

1) Not obvious to the group that scarcity of spectrum exists or will exist

2) Requirement is redundant to other language already in PAR

Through an editorial error the requested change was accidentally included in C80216gman-10/0008r0. It is being removed in C80216gman-10/0008r1.

A proposed text change from Mariana

This amendment will support path redundancy, mobile and local relaying, multi-hop relaying, Mobile Base Station, Low Duty Ratio, as well as operation in licensed, unlicensed and lightly licensed spectrum bands below 6GHz ~~with~~ and will include means and mechanisms to coexist with other radio access technologies (RATs).

In the discussion it was noted that the proposed change doesn't change the meaning of the agreed text. No other comments were offered.

Strawpoll: how many for the proposed change above? For 0, against 0, abstain 7. The Chair ruled that the vote failed as passage requires at least one affirmative vote.

Motion:

Authorize GRIDMAN Chair to construct and present final report on work of GRIDMAN for session 65.

Moved: Upkar Dhaliwal

Seconded: Arnaud Tonnerre

For: 13

Against: 0

Abstain: 1

Motion carries

Motion:

Request GRIDMAN Chair to request authorization from the WG to conduct a series of conference calls prior to session 66 to address the NIST PAP-2 and other GRIDMAN related topics as needed with suggested dates / times of:

1/26 7pm EST

2/9 10am EST

And every 2 weeks going forward with alternating times.

Moved: Upkar Dhaliwal

Seconded: Steve Crowley

For: 13

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion:

Authorize the Chair to make editorial changes in C80216gman-10/0008r1 as needed prior to posting.

Moved: Craig Rodine

Seconded: Tim Godfrey

For: 13

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion:

Authorize the Chair to forward the draft PAR in C80216gman-10/0008r1 with changes approved in this meeting and other editorial changes required to the WG for approval.

Moved: Arthur Wang

Seconded: Jaya Shankar

For: 13

Against: 0

Abstain:  0

Straw poll: 10 people plan to participate in the planned conference calls

We note that we intend the final CC prior to meeting #66 to include planning of agenda for session #66.

Chair has announced his intent to not lead a task group once formed. He encouraged people interested in leadership roles for the group to present their names to Roger Marks for consideration.

Meeting adjourned 0950 Thursday.