Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group http://ieee802.org/16 >		
Title	802.16.3 Functional Requirements Comments for Session #9		
Date Submitted	2000/09/09		
Source(s)	Brian Petry 3Com 12230 World Trade Dr. San Diego, CA 92128 Voice: 858-674-8533 mailto:brian_petry@3com.com		
Re:	This document is a report of comments received against the 802.16.3-00/02r3, Functional Requirements for the 802.16.3 Air Interface Standard . These comments are input to session #9. Please refer to the call-for-comments, IEEE 802.16.3-00/11r0, at http://ieee802.org/16/sub11/docs/802163-00_11r0.pdf.		
Abstract	This document lists all comments received. It is divided into two sections:		
	Pages 2-10: Sorted by page number and then line number		
	Pages 11-18: Sorted by submitter name, then page number, then line number		
	Total comments: 74 Technical comments: 40 Editorial comments: 34		
	Note that, although 802.16.3 does not have a formal mechanism for receiving comments from organizations, Reza Arefi has submitted comments on behalf of the WCA Engineering Committee.		
	And congratulations to Reza for collecting the most technical comments (17). But the most prolific overall commentor was Demosthenes Kostas with 32 editorial and 10 technical comments.		
Purpose	Input to session #9. Comment submitters should verify that all their comments were received and processed correctly.		
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.		
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate text contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereo in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may includ portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.		
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures (Version 1.0) http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html , including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, if there is technical justification in the opinion of the standards-developing committee and provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder that it will license applicants under reasonable terms and conditions for the purpose of implementing the standard."		
	Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <mailtoir.b.marks@ieee.org> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, of any patents (granted or under application) that may cover technology that is under consideration by or has been approved by IEEE 802.16. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices.</mailtoir.b.marks@ieee.org>		

802.16.3 Functional Requirements Comments for Session #9

Brian Petry 3Com

Unresolv	ved Comme	ents by Pa	age #/Line#

Page/Line: 4 /8

Description:

Number 11

The sentence starting on this line should read

"The model identifies the main features...

Date:

Page/Line: 0 /0 Number 0 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved To correct use of undefined messages **Empty** Notes: Page/Line: 1 /43 Number1 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved Sentence starting in this line should read: So, "functional requirements" Clarifies meaning describes the functions of typical systems... Notes: Date: Page/Line: 1 /46 Number 2 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved requirements in broad terms: what the required functions are but not how Clarifies meaning Notes: Page/Line: 2 /2 Number 3 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved functions and procedures of the PHY and MAC protocols. improve sentence Notes: Page/Line: 2 /5 Number 4 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved line should read not all service capabilities are transported support. These services have... Notes: Page/Line: 2 /8 Number 5 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Delete the word "neatly" undefined and unnecessary term Notes: Page/Line: 2 /26 Number6 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Sentence should read, "Other medium access types are ... Clarifies meaning Notes: Page/Line: 2 /28 Number7 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Replace the word "technologies" with either "services" or preferable terms functionalities. Notes: Page/Line: 3 /23 Number8 Demosthenes Type: Editorial Date: 9/9/00 **Name:**Kostas Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved End sentence after "forth" and delete the rest of the sentence To correct use of undefined messages What follows are not 5 criteria Notes: Page/Line: 3 /32 Number9 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon Type: Editorial David Description: Resolution unresolved Move item up one line and delete editorial comment Implementation of previously approved editorial change Notes: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Page/Line: 4 /3 Number 10 Date: Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Sentence should read: 802.16.3-based systems serve fixed location or To remove confusion relocatable customer terminals, but not mobile terminals. Rest of sentence should be deleted Notes:

Demosthenes Type: Editorial

main features should not be left out of the model.

So remove words some of

Resolution

unresolved

9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Moreover it does not describe but just identify

Notes:

Page/Line: 4 /14 Number 12 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

replace the word "transported" with "supported' Clearer description

Page/Line: 4 /16 Number 13 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution unresolved

Its meaning is not clear. Perhaps because it states a partial truth that The sentence starting on this line should be deleted is obvious. LOS also may be possible if the span distance is appropriate

Notes:

Page/Line: 4/19 Number 14 Date: 9/9/00 Name: van Waes Nico Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Replace figure 2-1 with provided figure and replace "Figure 2-1 depicts a More comprehensive example of system configuration. (figure reworked typical 802.16.3 system. from TR

(Note: figure will be submitted directly to editor, as the reflector rejects

atachments) with:

Figure 2-1 shows an example deployment configuration including the optional

use of a repeater

Notes:

Type: Technical Page/Line: 4 /23 Number 15 Date: 9/9/00 Name: van Waes Nico

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Splitting the desired cell-sizes into tradional environments provides a Add after line 23:

better understanding

of what TG3 envisions and promotes more thorough coverage modeling However, cell-sizes as noted in Table 1 are envisioned as typical and SHOULD (especially of urban and

generally be suburban scenarios, which form the largest market-shares) than merely supportable by an 802.16.3 system with at least 95% cell-coverage. suggesting "up to 50 km".

LOS (km) | NLOS (km) | lenvironment | lurban 7.5 2.5 lsuburban 10 15 4 lrural

Table 1 Typical cell-sizes

Delete page 12, line 29 "* radio range (up to 50 km)"

Notes:

Page/Line: 5 /7 Number 16 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

The line should read Removes confusing phrase

To facilitate description, and 802.16.3 system consists...

Notes:

Page/Line: 5 /21 Number 17 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved The line should start Figure 2.2 The text refers to Figure 2.2 on the next page and not Fig 2.1 on this page

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /3 Number 18 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

The sentence should end with "...to support UNI and CNI requirements. more meaningful sentence

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /4 Number 19 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Resolution Description: unresolved Insert the following text: To avoid confusion, especially that delay and capacity parameters exclude voice

For clarification, the performance characteristics of the 802.16.3 air interface SHALL apply at a hypothetical point within the SS and BS where the

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 6 /6 Number 20 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Figure 2-2... Correction

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /10 Number 21 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Resolution

The word "affect" is repeatedly used in this paragraph requires WCA Engineering Committee: Insertion of a technical definition of the

word

"affect" is required to assure a common interpretation. For example, if the PHY

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /11 Number 22 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Delete the sentence that starts on this line WCA Engineering Committee: Sentence is dictating how the repeater

function is to be implemented. TDD repeaters optimal implementation may require

Date:

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /11 Number 23 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Deletion of Sentence starting on line 11

First the requirements document should not dictate how the repeater is to

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /13 Number 24 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete sentence starting on this line WCA Engineering Committee: Too rigid a requirement at this time.

Operations and

Maintenance procedures required by network providers will likely require

PHY

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /15 Number 25 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon Type: Technical David

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Clarification of intent. Insert the following text:

Note: This does not preclude the use of other methods of providing

relay or remote antenna capabilities using non 802.16.3 standard

interfaces

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /19 Number 26 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity" or "throughput" Technical accuracy

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /30 Number 27 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

replace the word "meaning" with "resulting in" To correct use of undefined messages

Improve meaning

Notes:

Page/Line: 7 /42 Number 28 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete sentence starting on this line Redundant sentence; improves the meaning w/o any loss

Page/Line: 8 /15 Number 29 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

To clarify meaning

Replace word Special with additional

Notes:

Page/Line: 8 /18 Number 30 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Replace the sentence that starts on this line with more appropriate wording

"The 802.16.3 protocols determine the interoperability of multiple

vendors'

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /3 Number 31 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:**Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

replace transport with support Improves meaning

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /8 Number 32 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Replace the sentence that starts on this line with Improve wording

Each of the protocols above the PHY and MAC support "convergence

Page/Line: 9 /17 Number 33 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Add a bullet: Other Convergence sub-Layers as may be required by additional

WCA Engineering Committee: To assure that the standard-based protocols can be

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /17 Number 34 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Insert To identify flexibility for supporting higher layer requirements

Other convergence sub-layers may be required by specific high layer requirements

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /18 Number 35 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

The sentence on this line should read The IEEE 802.16.3 PHY and MAC

For clarity

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /24 Number 36 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity"

Technical accuracy

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /0 Number 37 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Moshe Type: Technical

Description:Reason:Resolutionunresolvedsection 5.2 lines 1,3The reference design for the peak data rate should be at least 20Mbps.Change in section 5.2: 10 Mbps to 20 MbpsThis design goal for PEAK performance is not too optimistic based on
6 MHz channels and 4 bits/symbol. In any case this PEAK number should

be

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /16 Number 38 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Add sentence For clarity of objectives

This should not preclude a service provider from offering best effort

service performance

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /21 Number 39 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Goldhammer Marianna Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved
Insert new paragraph Introduce requirements to improve spectral efficiency.

Insert new paragraph 5.3 Spectral efficiency

3.3 spectral efficiency is an important performance parameter of a wireless access system. The 802.16.3 system introduces specific aspects that shall be taken into consideration.

5.3.1 Cell size

The large cell radius, up to 50km, will produce a large propagation delay difference between near and far CPE units. This difference can be as large as 150us. The PHY and MAC protocol SHOULD provide

for far CPEs propagation delay compensation.

5.3.2 Multirate support

In order to preserve the same link budget, the wireless systems may use different modulation schemes for far and near CPEs. In this way the data rate to/from relatively near CPE can be higher, increasing the overall system capacity. The PHY and MAC protocols SHALL provide

for multirate support.

5.3.4 Interference minimization

The inter-cell and intra-cell interference have a negative effect on system capacity. The burst transmission in the down-link minimizes the interference effects, as the necessity to lower the rates or to retransmit data packets. The PHY and MAC protocols SHALL support bursty transmission and SHALL NOT use the spectrum if there is no information to transmit.

5.3.5 Packetized voice traffic

The SoHo, Small business and multi-tenant units will support a number of simultaneously voice call. The voice and associated signaling are transmitted in small packets, that have an intrinsic overhead due to the associated MAC and PHY headers. In order to improve the spectral efficiency, the MAC and PHY protocol SHALL permit the concatenation

of the short packets, going to the same destination, into a single larger packet.

5.3.6 Support for VAD and IP header compression

The voice activity detection and silence suppression are widely used to reduce the number of the transmitted packets. The MAC protocols

SHOULD permit to take advantage of the VAD benefits, while still providing for the same level of QoS.

The IP header, with IP v.4, is as large as 40bytes and will be much more with IP v.6. The IP header compression standard permits to reduce this overhead to 5 bytes. The 802.16.3 MAC protocols SHOULD permit to

advantage of the IP header compression benefits, while still providing for the same level of OoS.

5.3.7 Requests for bandwidth and retransmissions

To minimize the overhead associated with the ARQ process and the

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /23 Number 40 Date: David Type: Technical 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity" (multiple occurrences) Technical accuracy

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /32 Number 41 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Delete "better than" WCA Engineering Committee: Than standard should require better than

required BER

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /32 Number 42 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete the words better than Clarity

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /0 Number 43 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Type: Technical Moshe

Description: section 5.5 line 3 Reason: Resolution unresolved It stated in section 3.2 that the system MUST directly transport

Delete the sentence that begins with: variable length IP. So that section 5.5 must address packet error rate. with the following exeption: the bit error rate ratio (BER) SHALL be

10E-6 In addition it is necessary to define higher BER conditions, e.g., (in accordance with...) or better." QEF, for the headers of the packets.

Notes:

9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Page/Line: 11 /6 Date: Number 44

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

To clarify meaning

"It should be noted that although outages of a link can be minimized by appropriate location of antennas resulting in LOS links, this may not

always Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /9 Number 45 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Type: Technical Moshe

Resolution Description: unresolved

Add a sentence as follows: This sentence clearly states some guideline following the sentence:

The 802.16.3 MAC and PHY protocols SHALL be optimized to In a multicell environment, intercell interference can not be reasonable negelcted.

Interference environment under the previously mentioned [see sec 1.2]

critical

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 11 /30 Number 46 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Type: Technical Reza Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Change the first sentence of the paragraph so that it would become, WCA Engineering Committee: This paragraph is supposed to be about

"Delay and delay but it

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /34 Number 48 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Clarity

Change sentence to read: The end to end delay is a metric that depends on an entire

application-specific network often encompassing all 7 layers of the OSI model

Notes:

Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Page/Line: 11 /34 Number 47 Reza Type: Technical

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved Change the first sentence to, "The end-to-end delay depends on an entire WCA Engineering Committee: End-to-end delay is not a subjective metric.

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /11 Number 49 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete the sentence starting with "The standard SHALL support.". WCA Engineering Committee: The word "planning" is typically

"network planning" which is outside the scope of the standard. If another

> meaning is meant for the word "planning", then it needs to be stated clearly so

as not to be misleading.

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /11 Number 50 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Meaningless sentence Delete sentence starting on this page as no standard can support careful planning

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /14 Number 51 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved WCA Engineering Committee: Based on the definition on page 5, lines Change the first sentence to "The delivered P-MP cell capacity varies

depending 10-12, each

base station corresponds to one sector. On the other hand, each P-MP cell

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /14 Number 52 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Deletion Paragraph's intent not clear so best constructive comment is to delete it as

Paragraph starting on this line requires clarification. What does Sector Capacity measure? How can it is intended to be used/or misused

An example of its use is needed.

Notes:

9/9/00 Name: Arefi Page/Line: 12 /16 Number 53 Date: Type: Technical Reza

Reason: Description: Resolution unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: An Insertion is needed to clarify the Purpose of terminology unclear

utility of the

terms Sector Capacity, Modulation Factor, and Sector-Bandwidth Factor,

perhaps a numerical example that further clarifies the utility of such

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /41 Number 54 Date: Demosthenes Type: Editorial 9/9/00 **Name:** Kostas

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Deletion of the paragraph starting on this line it states not any requirements

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /41 Number 55 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Delete the paragraph starting on line 41. WCA Engineering Committee: This paragraph is does not belong here. It

states

some facts, not functional requirements, neither does it provide basis for

Notes:

Page/Line: 13 /0 Number 56 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Type: Editorial Moshe

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved section 6.1

The argument cited in paragraph 6.1 is not within the WHAT part of

Deletion of two sentences: functional

"Full duplex operation is used in FDD to maximize the spectral requirements. The insertion is to make the requirements reasonable under

the

efficiency. In TDD, spectral efficiency is maximized with means to avoid colocation

problems and more complex interference scenarious."

Insertion of the following paragraph at the end of 6.1

.. under the previously mentioned [see sec 1.2] critical

parameters for serving the target markets."

Notes:

Page/Line: 13 /5 Number 57 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:**Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Key term undefined

Definition of Spectral Efficiency is needed

To make the paragraph 6.1 meaningful

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 13 /9 Number 58 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete the words "in TDD deployment" Both FDD and TDD have interference problems

Notes:

Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Page/Line: 15 /32 Number 59 Reza Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Add "802.16.3 protocols MUST comply with the above-mentioned WCA Engineering Committee: The section needs to take a position on

standards and compliance

6

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 15 /41 Number 60 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: Modify the last two sentences of the paragraph with the following. "The

1.. To provide consistency; MUST vs. SHALL as opposed to SHOULD. operator also MUST have the means to securely shut down a base station Automatic

shut down is an important feature.

2.. To require that the shut down must be done in a secure way so that

only

Notes:

Page/Line: 15 /42 Number 61 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved line should read "down a remote base station securely. The 8702.16.3 To explicit state the security and reliability requirements of those

protocol should also support a fail safe and reliable function that

automatically shuts down...

Notes:

Page/Line: 16 /6 Number 62 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Change the sentence to "An operator MUST be able to account for time-WCA Engineering Committee: QoS issues are still open and there are likely

bandwidth-utilization and various service features for each subscriber service

Notes:

Page/Line: 16 /7 Number 63 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

MUST is Replaced by should as at this time the Accounting aspects of the Change line to read SHOULD be able to account for each service time- and bandwidth-used

different services that are likely to be offered by service providers are service features and parameters(e.g., delay). Also recall from Section ??? not well understood(An access channel may offer a set of services to a customer), the group has as yet not defined QoS and Accounting subsystem

that a single Subscriber Station can give access to a number of users that

Notes: Page/Line: 16 /15 Number 64 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Implementation of previous discussion Insert after "key management"

service suspend/resume, relocation, anti-cloning

Notes:

Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Page/Line: 16 /17 Number 65 Reza Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Change the paragraph to "There are two levels of authentication for an WCA Engineering Committee: The term "network entry" is not clear

enough. Also. system. In the first level, a subscriber station MUST authenticate itself using the term "unauthorized" is preferred over "enemy". The original text

also the network every time it registers with the network. This authentication implies that periodic authentication is required. This may not necessarily

MUST

Notes:

Demosthenes Type: Editorial Page/Line: 16 /18 Number 66 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Change 2nd and 3rd lines to read To clarify the intent by eliminating vague and meaningless terms

Is when a subscriber station registers itself with the Base Station. This initial authentication MUST prevent "enemy"...

Page/Line: 16 /40 Number 67 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Operational requirement to avoid truck rolls to investigate potentially Insert to read faulty

...to shut down and reactivate a subscriber station...

...to shut down and reactivate a base station remotely.

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /1 Number 68 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Change the bullet to "Permission to request for a given service a specific WCA Engineering Committee: QoS profile is yet to be defined and there will be

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /1 Number 69 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

change line to read

improve wording and a meaningful listing of credentials is to exchange bullet 1 with bullet 2

Permission to access certain services...

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /3 Number 70 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

To correct use of undefined messages change line to read

Generic statement of requirements in order to avoid use of terms not as

Permission for a user to request for a given service a specific service feature and/or QoS parameter

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /3 Number 71 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description:
Replace "operate" with "access". Resolution Reason: unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: To be technically correct.

Notes:

9/9/00 Name:Kostas Page/Line: 17 /5 Number 72 Date: Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Change line to read

Enables each service provider to decide for a given service whether such

security features are required

The access system MUST be capable for each service offered to transact

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /12 Number 73 Date: 9/9/00 Name:Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

undefined term

Delete the adjective "strong"

Notes:

Unresolved Comments by Page #/Line#

Page/Line: 0 /0 Number 0 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Empty To correct use of undefined messages

Notes:

Page/Line: 1 /43 Number 1 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Sentence starting in this line should read: So, "functional requirements" Clarifies meaning

describes the functions of typical systems...

Page/Line: 1 /46 Number 2 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

requirements in broad terms: what the required functions are but not how Clarifies meaning

Notes:

Page/Line: 2 /2 Number 3 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

functions and procedures of the PHY and MAC protocols. improve sentence

Demosthenes Type: Editorial Page/Line: 2 /5 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Number 4

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

line should read not all service capabilities are transported support. These services have...

Notes:

Page/Line: 2 /8 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description:Delete the word "neatly" Reason: Resolution unresolved

undefined and unnecessary term

Notes:

Page/Line: 2 /26 Number 6 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Clarifies meaning Sentence should read, "Other medium access types are ...

Page/Line: 2 /28 Number7 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Replace the word "technologies" with either "services" or preferable terms

functionalities.

Notes:

Page/Line: 3 /23 Number8 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

End sentence after "forth" and delete the rest of the sentence To correct use of undefined messages

What follows are not 5 criteria

Notes:

Page/Line: 3/32 Number9 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution unresolved

Move item up one line and delete editorial comment Implementation of previously approved editorial change

Notes:

Demosthenes Type: Editorial Page/Line: 4 /3 Number 10 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Sentence should read; 802.16.3-based systems serve fixed location or To remove confusion

relocatable customer terminals, but not mobile terminals.

Rest of sentence should be deleted

Notes:

Page/Line: 4 /8 Number 11 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

The sentence starting on this line should read "The model identifies the main features... main features should not be left out of the model. So remove words some of

Moreover it does not describe but just identify

Notes:

Page/Line: 4 /14 Number 12 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

replace the word "transported" with "supported" Clearer description

Notes:

Page/Line: 4 /16 Number 13 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Its meaning is not clear. Perhaps because it states a partial truth that The sentence starting on this line should be deleted is obvious. LOS also may be possible if the span distance is appropriate Notes: Page/Line: 4 /19 Number 14 Date: 9/9/00 Name: van Waes Nico Type: Technical Reason: Resolution unresolved Replace figure 2-1 with provided figure and replace "Figure 2-1 depicts a More comprehensive example of system configuration. (figure reworked typical 802.16.3 system. from TR (Note: figure will be submitted directly to editor, as the reflector rejects atachments) with: Figure 2-1 shows an example deployment configuration including the optional use of a repeater Notes: Date: 9/9/00 Name: van Waes Type: Technical Page/Line: 4 /23 Number 15 Nico Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Add after line 23: Splitting the desired cell-sizes into tradional environments provides a better understanding However, cell-sizes as noted in Table 1 are envisioned as typical and of what TG3 envisions and promotes more thorough coverage modeling SHOULD (especially of urban and suburban scenarios, which form the largest market-shares) than merely generally be supportable by an 802.16.3 system with at least 95% cell-coverage. suggesting "up to 50 km". lenvironment | LOS (km) | NLOS (km) | lurban 7.5 2 2.5 lsuburban 10 15 4 lrural Table 1 Typical cell-sizes Delete page 12, line 29 "* radio range (up to 50 km)" Notes: Page/Line: 5 /7 Number 16 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved The line should read Removes confusing phrase To facilitate description, and 802.16.3 system consists... Notes: Page/Line: 5 /21 Number 17 Date: Demosthenes Type: Editorial 9/9/00 **Name:**Kostas Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved The line should start Figure 2.2 The text refers to Figure 2.2 on the next page and not Fig 2.1 on this page Notes: Page/Line: 6/3 Number 18 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved The sentence should end with "...to support UNI and CNI requirements. more meaningful sentence Page/Line: 6 /4 Number 19 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved To avoid confusion, especially that delay and capacity parameters exclude Insert the following text: voice For clarification, the performance characteristics of the 802.16.3 air interface SHALL apply at a hypothetical point within the SS and BS where the Notes: Page/Line: 6 /6 Number 20 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Figure 2-2... Correction Notes: Page/Line: 6 /10 Number 21 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Type: Technical Reza Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved The word "affect" is repeatedly used in this paragraph requires WCA Engineering Committee: Insertion of a technical definition of the word

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /11 Number 22 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution unresolved

Delete the sentence that starts on this line WCA Engineering Committee: Sentence is dictating how the repeater

"affect" is required to assure a common interpretation. For example, if the

to be implemented. TDD repeaters optimal implementation may require

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 6 /11 Number 23 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Deletion of Sentence starting on line 11 First the requirements document should not dictate how the repeater is to

Notes:

Type: Technical Page/Line: 6 /13 Number 24 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Delete sentence starting on this line

WCA Engineering Committee: Too rigid a requirement at this time.

Operations and Maintenance procedures required by network providers will likely require

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /15 Number 25 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Insert the following text: Clarification of intent.

Note: This does not preclude the use of other methods of providing

relay or remote antenna capabilities using non 802.16.3 standard

interfaces

Notes:

Page/Line: 6 /19 Number 26 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity" or "throughput" Technical accuracy.

Page/Line: 6 /30 Number 27 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

To correct use of undefined messages replace the word "meaning" with "resulting in"

Improve meaning

Notes:

Page/Line: 7 /42 Number 28 Date 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Delete sentence starting on this line Redundant sentence; improves the meaning w/o any loss

Page/Line: 8 /15 Number 29 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

To clarify meaning Replace word

Special with additional

Notes:

Page/Line: 8 /18 Number 30 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Replace the sentence that starts on this line with more appropriate wording

"The 802.16.3 protocols determine the interoperability of multiple

vendors'

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /3 Number 31 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

replace transport with support Improves meaning

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /8 Number 32 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Replace the sentence that starts on this line with Improve wording

Each of the protocols above the PHY and MAC support "convergence

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /17 Number 33 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: To assure that the standard-based protocols Add a bullet: Other Convergence sub-Layers as may be required by additional can be

Notes:

Page/Line: 9 /17 Number 34 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Date: Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

To identify flexibility for supporting higher layer requirements Insert

Other convergence sub-layers may be required by specific high layer

requirements

Notes:

Date: Demosthenes Type: Editorial Page/Line: 9 /18 Number 35 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

The sentence on this line should read The IEEE 802.16.3 PHY and MAC For clarity

Notes:

Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon Type: Technical Page/Line: 9 /24 Number 36 David

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity" Technical accuracy

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /0 Number 37 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:**Ran Type: Technical Moshe

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved section 5.2 lines 1,3 The reference design for the peak data rate should be at least 20Mbps. Change in section 5.2: 10 Mbps to 20 Mbps This design goal for PEAK performance is not too optimistic based on

6 MHz channels and 4 bits/symbol. In any case this PEAK number should

Notes:

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /16 Number 38 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Add sentence For clarity of objectives

This should not preclude a service provider from offering best effort

service performance

Page/Line: 10 /21 Number 39 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Goldhammer Type: Technical Marianna

Description: Resolution unresolved Introduce requirements to improve spectral efficiency.

Insert new paragraph 5.3 Spectral efficiency

The spectral efficiency is an important performance parameter of a wireless access system. The 802.16.3 system introduces specific

aspects that shall be taken into consideration.

5.3.1 Cell size

The large cell radius, up to 50km, will produce a large propagation delay difference between near and far CPE units. This difference can be as large as 150us. The PHY and MAC protocol SHOULD provide

for far CPEs propagation delay compensation.

5.3.2 Multirate support

In order to preserve the same link budget, the wireless systems may use different modulation schemes for far and near CPEs. In this way the data rate to/from relatively near CPE can be higher, increasing the overall system capacity. The PHY and MAC protocols SHALL provide

for multirate support.

5.3.4 Interference minimization

The inter-cell and intra-cell interference have a negative effect on system capacity. The burst transmission in the down-link minimizes the interference effects, as the necessity to lower the rates or to retransmit data packets. The PHY and MAC protocols SHALL support bursty transmission and SHALL NOT use the spectrum if there is no information to transmit.

5.3.5 Packetized voice traffic

The SoHo, Small business and multi-tenant units will support a number of simultaneously voice call. The voice and associated signaling are transmitted in small packets, that have an intrinsic overhead due to the associated MAC and PHY headers. In order to improve the spectral efficiency, the MAC and PHY protocol SHALL permit the concatenation

of the short packets, going to the same destination, into a single larger packet.

5.3.6 Support for VAD and IP header compression

The voice activity detection and silence suppression are widely used to reduce the number of the transmitted packets. The MAC protocols SHOULD permit to take advantage of the VAD benefits, while still providing for the same level of QoS.

The IP header, with IP v.4, is as large as 40bytes and will be much more with IP v.6. The IP header compression standard permits to reduce this overhead to 5 bytes. The 802.16.3 MAC protocols SHOULD permit to

advantage of the IP header compression benefits, while still providing for the same level of QoS.

5.3.7 Requests for bandwidth and retransmissions

To minimize the overhead associated with the ARQ process and the

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /23 Number 40 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Change "bandwidth" to "capacity" (multiple occurrences) Technical accuracy

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /32 Number 41 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Delete "better than" WCA Engineering Committee: Than standard should require better than required BER

Notes:

Page/Line: 10 /32 Number 42 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Delete the words better than Clarity

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /0 Number 43 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Type: Technical Moshe

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved It stated in section 3.2 that the system MUST directly transport section 5.5 line 3 variable length IP. So that section 5.5 must address packet error rate.

Delete the sentence that begins with: with the following exeption: the bit error rate ratio (BER) SHALL be

In addition it is necessary to define higher BER conditions, e.g.,

(in accordance with...) or better." QEF, for the headers of the packets.

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /6 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Number 44

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Add: To clarify meaning

"It should be noted that although outages of a link can be minimized by appropriate location of antennas resulting in LOS links, this may not always

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /9 Number 45 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Ran Moshe Type: Technical

Description: Resolution unresolved This sentence clearly states some guideline following the sentence: Add a sentence as follows:

The 802.16.3 MAC and PHY protocols SHALL be optimized to In a multicell environment, intercell interference can not be reasonable negelcted.

Interference environment under the previously mentioned [see sec 1.2]

critical

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /30 Number 46 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Change the first sentence of the paragraph so that it would become, WCA Engineering Committee: This paragraph is supposed to be about delay but it

"Delay and Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /34 Number 48 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial Date:

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Change sentence to read: Clarity

The end to end delay is a metric that depends on an entire

application-specific network often encompassing all 7 layers of the OSI model

Notes:

Page/Line: 11 /34 Number 47 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Change the first sentence to, "The end-to-end delay depends on an entire WCA Engineering Committee: End-to-end delay is not a subjective metric.

Page/Line: 12 /11 Number 49 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Delete the sentence starting with "The standard SHALL support.". WCA Engineering Committee: The word "planning" is typically

understood as

"network planning" which is outside the scope of the standard. If another

meaning is meant for the word "planning", then it needs to be stated

as not to be misleading.

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /11 Number 50 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Date: Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Meaningless sentence

Delete sentence starting on this page as no standard can support careful

planning Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /14 Number 51 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

Change the first sentence to "The delivered P-MP cell capacity varies WCA Engineering Committee: Based on the definition on page 5, lines depending 10-12, each base station corresponds to one sector. On the other hand, each P-MP cell

Demosthenes Type: Technical Page/Line: 12 /14 Number 52 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved Paragraph's intent not clear so best constructive comment is to delete it as Deletion

Paragraph starting on this line requires clarification. What does Sector Capacity measure? How can it is intended to be used/or misused An example of its use is needed.

Notes:

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /16 Number 53 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: An Insertion is needed to clarify the Purpose of terminology unclear utility of the

terms Sector Capacity, Modulation Factor, and Sector-Bandwidth Factor,

perhaps a numerical example that further clarifies the utility of such

Notes:

Page/Line: 12 /41 Number 54 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Deletion of the paragraph starting on this line it states not any requirements

Page/Line: 12 /41 Number 55 Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Type: Technical Reza

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: This paragraph is does not belong here. It Delete the paragraph starting on line 41. states

some facts, not functional requirements, neither does it provide basis for

Reza

Notes:

9/9/00 Name: Ran Page/Line: 13 /0 Number 56 Date: Type: Editorial Moshe

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved The argument cited in paragraph 6.1 is not within the WHAT part of section 6.1

Deletion of two sentences: functional

"Full duplex operation is used in FDD to maximize the spectral requirements. The insertion is to make the requirements reasonable under efficiency

In TDD, spectral efficiency is maximized with means to avoid colocation the

problems and more complex interference scenarious."

Insertion of the following paragraph at the end of 6.1 .. under the previously mentioned [see sec 1.2] critical parameters for serving the target markets.'

Notes:

Page/Line: 13 /5 Date: Demosthenes Type: Technical Number 57 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Key term undefined

Definition of Spectral Efficiency is needed To make the paragraph 6.1 meaningful

Notes:

Page/Line: 13 /9 Number 58 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description:Delete the words "in TDD deployment" Resolution Reason: unresolved

Both FDD and TDD have interference problems

Notes:

Date: 9/9/00 **Name:** Arefi Page/Line: 15 /32 Number 59 Reza Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved WCA Engineering Committee: The section needs to take a position on Add "802.16.3 protocols MUST comply with the above-mentioned

standards and compliance

Notes: Page/Line: 15 /41 Number 60 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical

Resolution unresolved

Modify the last two sentences of the paragraph with the following. "The WCA Engineering Committee:

operator also MUST have the means to securely shut down a base station 1.. To provide consistency; MUST vs. SHALL as opposed to SHOULD.

Automatic

Reason:

likely

shut down is an important feature.

2.. To require that the shut down must be done in a secure way so that only

Notes:

Page/Line: 15 /42 Number 61 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description:

line should read "down a remote base station securely. The 8702.16.3 protocol should also support a fail safe and reliable function that automatically shuts down...

Reason: Resolution unresolved To explicit state the security and reliability requirements of those functions

WCA Engineering Committee: QoS issues are still open and there are

different services that are likely to be offered by service providers are

not well understood(An access channel may offer a set of services to a

implies that periodic authentication is required. This may not necessarily

customer), the group has as yet not defined QoS and Accounting subsystem

Resolution

Resolution

unresolved

unresolved

Notes:

Page/Line: 16 /6 Number 62 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description: Change the sentence to "An operator MUST be able to account for time-

bandwidth-utilization and various service features for each subscriber service

Notes:

Page/Line: 16 /7 Demosthenes Type: Technical Number 63 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved Change line to read MUST is Replaced by should as at this time the Accounting aspects of the SHOULD be able to account for each service time- and bandwidth-used

and service features and parameters(e.g., delay). Also recall from Section ???

that a single Subscriber Station can give access to a number of users that

Page/Line: 16 /15 Number 64 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon Type: Technical Date: David

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved

Insert after "key management" Implementation of previous discussion

service suspend/resume, relocation, anti-cloning,

Notes:

Notes:

9/9/00 Name: Arefi Type: Technical Page/Line: 16 /17 Number 65 Date: Reza

Description: Reason: Change the paragraph to "There are two levels of authentication for an WCA Engineering Committee: The term "network entry" is not clear

enough. Also, system. In the first level, a subscriber station MUST authenticate itself using the term "unauthorized" is preferred over "enemy". The original text

the network every time it registers with the network. This authentication MUST

Page/Line: 16 /18 Number 66 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Resolution unresolved Change 2nd and 3rd lines to read To clarify the intent by eliminating vague and meaningless terms

Is when a subscriber station registers itself with the Base Station. This initial authentication MUST prevent "enemy"...

Notes:

Notes:

Page/Line: 16 /40 Number 67 Date: Type: Technical 9/9/00 Name: Trinkwon David

Description: Resolution Reason: unresolved Operational requirement to avoid truck rolls to investigate potentially

...to shut down and reactivate a subscriber station...

...to shut down and reactivate a base station remotely.

Notes:

Type: Technical Page/Line: 17 /1 Number 68 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza

Resolution unresolved WCA Engineering Committee: QoS profile is yet to be defined and there Change the bullet to "Permission to request for a given service a specific

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /1 Number 69 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved change line to read improve wording and a meaningful listing of credentials is to exchange bullet 1 with bullet 2

Permission to access certain services...

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /3 Number 70 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Description: Resolution unresolved

change line to read To correct use of undefined messages

Generic statement of requirements in order to avoid use of terms not as

Permission for a user to request for a given service a specific service feature and/or QoS parameter

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /3 Number 71 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Arefi Reza Type: Technical

Description:
Replace "operate" with "access". Resolution Reason: unresolved

WCA Engineering Committee: To be technically correct.

Notes:

Page/Line: 17 /5 Number 72 Date: 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Technical

Resolution Description: Reason: unresolved Change line to read

Enables each service provider to decide for a given service whether such

security features are required The access system MUST be capable for each service offered to transact

Notes:

Date: Page/Line: 17 /12 Number 73 9/9/00 Name: Kostas Demosthenes Type: Editorial

Description: Reason: Resolution unresolved

Deletion undefined term

Delete the adjective "strong"

Notes: