Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group http://ieee802.org/16		
Title Comments to Draft Standard IEEE 802.16 — Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conf Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz			
Date Submitted	2005-4-22		
Source(s)	SHLOMO OVADIA HASSAN YAGHOOBI Voice: 408-765-1844, mailto: shlomo.ovadia@intel.com 408-765-1906, mailto: hassan.yaghoobi@intel.com		
	Intel Corporation SC12-512 2200 College Mission Blvd. Santa Clara, CA 95054		
Re:	Supporting document for call for contribution for IEEE 802.16C		
Abstract	Comments on the structure, organization, and technical content of IEEE P802.16/Conformance04/D1, April 2005 draft standard for conformance to IEEE Standard 802.16 — Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz.		
Purpose	Adoption of P802.16/Conformance04/D1		
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.		
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.		
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html , including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair mailto:chair@wirelessman.org as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices .		

Comments to Draft Standard IEEE 802.16 - Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz (DRAFT)

1		Overview
2		Comments
	2.1	High-level partition
		Partitioning based on functions
		Comprehensiveness
		Organization and structure of the IEEE PICS document to support testability
		Alignment of IEEE PICS statement format according to ISO/IEC 9646-7 guidelines (1995)
3		Annex A: Example of PICS Document Partitioning Based on Functions
		PICS Prioritization – MAC Layer
1		Deferences

2005-04-22

Overview

1 2

The purpose of this contribution is to provide comments on the structure, organization, and technical content of draft standard for conformance to IEEE Standard 802.16 — Part 4: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for Frequencies below 11 GHz.

2 Comments

9 2.1 High-level partition

High level partitioning of IEEE PICS according to PHY, MAC/PHY, and MAC layer, which is appropriate for RCT and TSS/TP development (based on discussion with test equipment vendor).

Rationale: Using this method of partitioning, the document will be user friendly, in a sense that TSS/TP and RCT development tasks can utilize the relevant sections (MAC and MAC/PHY for TSS/TP and PHY for RCT) more effectively and conveniently.

2.2 Partition based on Functions

Partition of the various test cases such that the specific PICS correlated by function and not by specific sections is desired. See Annex A for an example on partitioning of MAC section.

Rationale: The main reason for this recommendation is to make the document more friendly to the end user tasks, i.e. TSS/TP and RCT developments. As an example, it turns out that there is quite a bit of redundancy in the current OFDM PICS document (This applies to the MAC section of the current PICS), and there are quite a few items that are addressed in more than one table. This creates additional burden to all users of the PICS. The proposal for structuring the document based on functionality greatly helps with this regards.

2.3 Comprehensiveness

PICS document comprehensiveness should be targeted by including all the PICS requirements and conditions independent on the profiles. This means that the PICS document should be complete even if we do not consider any specific profile. The current base line document does not address this issue.

2.4 Organization and Structure of the IEEE PICS Document to Support Testability

Rationale: Since the Test Suite Structures and Test Plan (TSS/TP) are usually derived from the PICS document, it would be highly beneficial if the organization and structure of the PICS is aligned with the organization of the TSS/TP (e.g., if sections and sub-sections of the PICS are aligned with the sections and sub-sections of the Test Plan).

The use of the status term "Conditional" tends to cause confusion because there could be two kinds of "Conditional items" as follows: a) Conditional items that are derived from purely optional items b) Conditional items that are derived from "Qualified Optional" items (where the vendor must select to implement at least one of the items out of a selection list). It is important to maintain a distinction between these two kinds since, the former case ends up being optional, whereas in the latter case it is still mandatory to support one of the options (and all its associated derivations). So, it would be useful to define a new Status Type called "Qualified Conditional" to account for the latter type.

The set of optional and conditional PICS should be comprehensive in order to support a complete testing of all the mandatory, optional, and conditional PICS.

2.5 Alignment of IEEE PICS statement format according to ISO/IEC 9646-7 guidelines (1995)

For example:

5 Notation for conditional requirements:

 Conditional requirements, utilizing predicates if desired, may be specified in one of the following ways:

- a) Separate status and predicate columns;
- b) Merged status and predicate columns;
- c) Conditional expressions referenced from the status column;
- d) Conditions implied by nested item numbers;
- e) Predicates applying to a whole table.

The use of Separate status and predicate columns

A "c" is placed in the status column followed by a colon followed by one or more unconditional status indications on separate lines, each with a predicate, or the negation of a predicate in the predicate column.

Table 1.Use of status and predicate columns

Item #	Item Description	Reference	Status	Predicate	Support
1	Item A	[x]	C: m	P1	
			:0	– P1	
2	Item B	[x]	C: m	P2	

Table 1shows two examples of the use of separate status and predicate columns, with the following meaning:

a) Item A is mandatory if p1 is true, but optional if p1 is false.

 b) Item B is mandatory if p2 is true but, by convention, not-applicable if p2 is false: there shall be a statement elsewhere in the ICS Proforma clarifying this convention, if it is used.

For example:

Table A.1 — Roles

Item #	Item Description	Reference	Status	Predicate	Support
1	Subscriber Station (SS)	[1]	C1-01: m :o	P1 —P1	
2	Base Station (BS)	[1]	C1-02: m :o	P1 —P1	

C1-01: IF Table A.1/2 is not supported THEN m ELSE o

C1-02: IF Table A.1/1 is not supported THEN m ELSE o

Table A.12 — Major Receiving CS Functions (SS in PMP)

Item #	Item Description	Reference	Status	Predicate	Support
1	Receipt of the CS PDU	[1] 5.2	m		
2	Rebuilding of the suppressed payload header information (PHS function)		C12-01: m	P2	

C12-01: IF Table A.10/1 THEN m ELSE i

 1

3 Annex A: Example of PICS Document Partitioning Based on Functions

2 SS PICS Prioritization – MAC Layer

Test Group	Feature Sets Tested		
Network entry and Initialization	SS addressing and MPU construction		
(One BS and one SS, no contention resolution needed)	SS Network entry and Initialization		
	SS Downlink channel acquisition		
	SS Uplink channel acquisition		
	SS Initial Ranging		
	SS negotiate basic capabilities		
	SS Authentication and Authorization		
	SS Registration		
	SS headers and subheaders		
	SS global parameters		
	SS configuration file		
Service flow test (MAC CPS)	SS Uplink Scheduling Service		
	SS dynamic service flow control		
SS miscellaneous MAC test	SS MAC PDU construction		
	SS CRC		
	SS Map relevance		
	SS contention resolution		
	SS periodic ranging		
	SS		
	Multicast polling group		
SS convergence sub-layer test	SS convergence sublayer		

4 References

5 6 7

8

3

4

The following documents contain provisions, which, through reference in this text, constitute provisions of the present document. References are either specific (identified by date of publication, edition number, version number, etc.) or non-specific. For a specific reference, subsequent revisions do not apply. For a nonspecific reference, the latest version applies.

9 10 11

[1] IEEE Standard 802.16-2004: "Local and Metropolitan Area Networks – Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems"

12 13 14

[2] ISO/IEC 9646-1: "Information technology – Open Systems Interconnection – Conformance testing methodology and framework – Part 1: General concepts" 2004-10-08 IEEE 802.16Conf04-04/04

15 16

17 [3] ISO/IEC 9646-7: "Information technology – Open Systems Interconnection – Conformance testing methodology and framework – Part 7: Implementation Conformance Statements."