

APPROVED

**IEEE
802.16 Session #28
10 – 13 November 2003
Albuquerque, NM**

Source: Task Group d (TGd) Chair

Title: TGd minutes

Date: 13 Nov 2003

Document for:

| | |
|-------------|----------|
| Approval | X |
| Discussion | |
| Information | X |

Agenda item: Minutes

| | |
|--|---|
| <i>Registered Contributions</i> | 2 |
| <i>Session #28 Schedule</i> | 2 |
| <i>Monday Nov 10, 2003</i> | 2 |
| Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1 | 3 |
| <i>Tuesday Nov 11, 2003</i> | 3 |
| Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1 | 3 |
| <i>Wednesday Nov 12, 2003</i> | 3 |
| Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1 | 3 |
| <i>Thursday Nov 13, 2003</i> | 4 |
| Joint TGe and TGd session | 4 |
| TGd session | 4 |

Registered Contributions

The following is a list of registered contributions to TGd as of the publication of these minutes.

- C80216d-03_54.pdf
- C80216d-03_66.pdf
- C80216d-03_67.pdf
- C80216d-03_68.pdf
- C80216d-03_69.pdf
- C80216d-03_70.pdf
- C80216d-03_71r2.pdf
- C80216d-03_72.pdf
- C80216d-03_73r1.pdf
- C80216d-03_74.pdf
- C80216d-03_75r1.pdf
- C80216d-03_76.pdf
- C80216d-03_77.pdf
- C80216d-03_78.pdf

Session #28 Schedule

All meetings are held in the Enchantment E & F.

| Subject (number of sessions) | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|------------------|-----------------|
| TGd sessions (10) | | 8:00-12:00 | 8:00-12:00 | 10:40-12:00 |
| | 17:00-18:00 | 13:15-18:00 | 13:30-18:00 | 13:00-20:00 |
| | 19:00-22:00 | 19:00-22:00 | 20:00-22:00 | |
| Joint TGd, TGe (1) | | | | 8:00-10:20 |
| 802.16 WG Plenary (2) | 13:30-16:45 | | | 20:00-23:00 |

Monday Nov 10, 2003

Session convened at 17:00 hr.

Commentary database 80216-03_51r1 formed the basis for coment resolution for recirculation Ballot #13.

Editorial comments plan defined

- All editorial comments identified in commentary database provided to TGd participants. Participants are to review and either accept or reject proposed resolution by the Thursday afternoon session.
- A majority of the editorial comments will be processed as a single block (scheduled for Thursday afternoon's session). Any of these editorial comments rejected will be processed by normal comment resolution process.
- Nineteen comments submitted by Barry Lewis will be processed in a single block as they are covered by a single contribution; C80216d-03_67.pdf. The comment list numbers are comments 322 – 340 inclusive, which will be discussed on Wednesday after the morning break.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1

Contribution C802.16d-03/54 was presented by a representative from IMEC and is related to comment 001. Comment was rejected; "Described issue is not clear. No specific text provided".

Monday session recessed at 22:00 hr.

Tuesday Nov 11, 2003

Session convened at 8:00 hr.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1

Comment 241 deferred so that modified text can be prepared.

Comment 407 – contribution C80216d-03_72 presented to group as suggested resolution. Comment was deferred to Wednesday am so text can be prepared.

Comment 320 – contribution C80216d-03_68 presented to group as suggested resolution. No consensus reached and a vote was held. Question: Those in favour of accepting the comment - 14, those in favour of rejecting the comment – 6, abstain – 0. Comment is rejected.

Comment 383. No concensus reached and a vote was held. Question: Those in favour of accepting the comment – 5, those against accepting the comment – 7. Comment is rejected.

Comment 386 deferred to allow Ken Stanwood find the source of the reference for RSA.

Comment 235 – no concensus reached and a vote was held. Question: Those in favour of accepting the comment – 9, those in favour of rejecting the comment – 6. Comment is rejected.

Comment 367 deferred, example of table entry to be provided.

Tuesday session recessed at 22:00 hr.

Wednesday Nov 12, 2003

Wednesday session convened at 8:00 hr.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r1

Comment 241 – text provided and comment resolved.

Comment 367 – table provided and comment resolved.

Contribution C802.16d-03/67 on Directed Mesh presented to the group. Contribution covers comments 322-340 and 49. Resolution deferred to Thursday pm.

Thursday session recessed at 22:00 hr.

Thursday Nov 13, 2003

Joint TGe and TGd session

Joint session convened at 8:00 hr.

Some comments are to be moved to TGd for resolution (in TGd comment database).

Joint session adjourned at 10:20 hr.

TGd session

TGd session convened at 10:40 hr.

Motion: Bob Nelson, Brian Eidson - "Move to accept all comments with Group Notes 'Include in editorial motion' in commentary database 802.16-03_51r1". No discussion.

Vote: In favour – 11, against – 0, abstain – 2. Motion passes.

Comments related to Directed Mesh, 322-340 and 49, are reviewed and resolved.

Comment 324- no consensus reached. Vote: to accept – 1, to reject – 7, abstain – 2. Comment rejected.

Comment 429 – no consensus reached. Vote: to accept – 4, to reject – 11, abstain – 5. Comment rejected.

Comment 403 – no consensus reached. Vote: to accept as modified – 9, to reject as modified – 7, abstain – 4. Comment rejected.

Comment resolution completed. All 485 comments resolved. Only two Technical binding comments remain without "satisfied" classification.

Marc Engels; rejected

Reason: due to no text provided.

Nico van Waes: rejected 4 to 11 with 5 abstain

Reason: there is no argument the performance is poor, but support for a connection even under severe conditions is better than no connection at all.

Proposal put forward to TGd; to submit the following motion to WG. "To accept IEEE 802.16-03/51r2 as the resolutions of Letter Ballot #13, developed Draft P802.16-REVd/D2 based on those resolutions, and initiate Recirculation #13a."

Those in favour: - 27, those against - 0, abstain – 2. By majority vote the motion will be submitted to the 802.16 WG.

Proposal put forward to TGd; to submit the following motion to WG. "To request conditional approval from the LMSC EC to forward P802.16-REVd/D2 for Sponsor Ballot."

Those in favour – 13, those against – 14, abstain – 0. By majority vote the motion will not be submitted to the 802.16 WG.

Motion: DJ, Ken Stanwood, "to accept the commentary database 802.16-03/51r2 as the resolution of Ballot #13.

Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.

Session recessed at 20:00 hr.