

Minutes of IEEE 802.16e Ballot Resolution Committee Meeting

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group http://ieee802.org/16 >
Title	IEEE 802.16 TGe Ballot Resolution Committee Meeting Minutes
Date Submitted	2005-06-24
Source(s)	Brian Kiernan Voice:+ 1 (610) 878-5637 InterDigital Communications Corp. 781 Third Ave King of Prussia, PA 19406 USA Voice:+ 1 (610) 878-5637 Fax: +1 (610) 878-7843 [brian.kiernan@interdigital.com]
Re:	IEEE 802.16 TGe BRC Minutes (Schaumberg, IL, USA)
Abstract	Meeting minutes
Purpose	To record meeting discussions.
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html , including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair mailto:chair@wirelessman.org as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices .

2005-06-24 IEEE 802.16e-05/013

Schaumberg, IL, USA 14-16 June, 2005

Tuesday, June 14:

The meeting was called to order at 8:10 AM by Brian Kiernan, TGe Chair. Attendees are listed below. This meeting was held and the specific attendees were as authorized at 802.16 WG session #37.

Introductions were made and some administrative and logistic information provided. The Chair indicated his intent to move the BRC to complete resolution of the 733 comments (plus 6 late comments) received during Sponsor Ballot Recirculation, initiate creation of a new Draft, and initiate an additional recirculation. He then presented a draft Interim BRC Opening Report (802.16e-05/011).

The Chair then initiated a discussion of the term "super majority" as required for comment acceptance as had been briefly discussed in the prior 802.16 WG meeting. After some discussions, the group unanimously agreed to use the standard IEEE rule of 75% for purposes of accepting a comment. There was then a brief discussion regarding how the BRC would "divvy" up the work. It was decided that, with the exception of comments on security, all attendees would participate in all comment resolutions. Any comments dealing with security would be handled separately by a drafting group working off-line from the main BRC, with the drafting group's resolutions being brought back to the full BRC for final approval and resolution of any comments that the drafting group could not resolve. The security drafting group would start work the following day after the arrival of Jeff Mandin.

Having established the basic meeting ground rules, the group then initiated comment resolution. The TGe editor provided a subset of the comment database (PureEditorial.usr) that contained those comments marked editorial that he considered to be purely editorial (303 out of 426), indicated that he would make a motion the following day to accept these comments "en mass" and requested everyone to review the list for any comments that they considered to be non-editorial. Remaining editorial comments would be dealt with individually by the BRC. Resolutions are recorded in the comment database (IEEE 802.16-05/035r3).

Recessed @ 11:15 PM

Wednesday, June 15:

The session opened @ 8:20 AM.

With the arrival of Jeff Mandin, the security drafting group, consisting of Jeff, Jose Puthenkulam and Seokheon Cho, began work on all security related comments, both technical and editorial. The chair requested that, as far as possible, the security group complete their work by Thursday afternoon. Any remaining unresolved comments would be handled by the full BRC. The BRC then continued with comment resolution. In the afternoon, following some discussion, the editor made the following motion:

Motion: Ron Murias (editor); second, Vladimir Yanover;

2005-06-24 IEEE 802.16e-05/013

"To accept the comments listed in the file "Pure Editorial.usr", with the exception of comment #5672"

Passed: Unanimous

The BRC then continued with comment resolution. Resolutions are recorded in the comment database (IEEE 802.16-05/035r3)

Recessed @ 7:35 PM

Thursday, June 16:

The session opened @ 8:15 AM

The BRC continued to resolve other comments. Results are recorded in the comment database. With the exception of security, the BRC completed resolution of all on-time comments. During this time, Masoud Olfat accepted an action on comment #5765 to put the referenced code into a table and provide it to the editor for incorporation into the new draft. He also took an action on comment #5579 to provide definitions for "stream" and "layer".

The Security drafting group provided the results of their comment resolutions in a file (SecSummary.csv). The contents of this file and the associated comments were then reviewed by the BRC and where agreed to, the stated resolutions were incorporated directly into the editor's comment database. The BRC then discussed and resolved those comments not resolved by the Security drafting group.

All on-time comments were resolved as well as two late comments. However, due to lack of time, four late comments were not resolved. Final comment resolutions are recorded in the database (IEEE 802.16-05/035r3).

Having completed their task, the BRC meeting adjourned at 11:00 PM.

BRC Meeting Attendees:

Brian Kiernan (TGe Chair)
Ron Murias (TGe Editor)
Jiang Li
Panyuh Joo
Beon Joon Kim
Mo-han Fong
John Humbert
Mark Cudak
Sean Cai
Jose Puthenkulam
Vladimir Yanover
Masoud Olfat
Jeff Mandin (Wed & Thurs only)

2005-06-24 IEEE 802.16e-05/013

Seokheon Cho