

IEEE 802.16 TGm Minutes (DRAFT)
Session #52, Atlanta, GA

Avi Freedman

IEEE 802.16's Task Group m (TGm) held its fifth session during the IEEE 802.16 Session #52 in Hyatt Regency, Atlanta, GA, USA. The session was chaired by Brian Kiernan, with Vice Chair Carl Eklund and Avi Freedman as secretary. Approximately 300 people attended each meeting, about 30 new to TGm.

1) Monday, November 12, 2007

The Chair called the meeting to order at 16:50, and the officers and editors were introduced.

The five slides included within <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt> were shown and the patent policy information was provided to the task group.

The chair provided an opportunity for participant to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard;

- Dan Gal states that Alcatel Lucent believes it has IPR which is essential to the work of TGm, a letter of assurance is in process, as far as Dan Gal is aware of.
- Ayman Naguib stated that "Qualcomm may have IPR that would impact the practice of the standard and if we do, we will comply by the IEEE patent policy".

The minutes from Session 51, IEEE 802.16m-07/038, were presented. The chair asked for discussion and comments. There was no discussion or comments.

Minutes were approved with no objection

The chair presented the proposed agenda, as in document IEEE 802.16m-07/044 and proposed that the Monday meeting will recess in 7PM.

Motion: to approve the agenda (IEEE 802.16m-07/044) as modified
Hearing no objection the agenda was approved

Discussion continued with SRD change requests, as compiled in the database IEEE 802.16m-07/042. The reply comments received were introduced into IEEE 802.16m-07/042r1. Results of the comment resolutions are also recorded in IEEE 802.16m-07/042r1.

Recessed at 18:20 PM, till Tuesday 8:00 AM

2) Tuesday, November 13, 2007

The meeting was called to order at 8:05, the chair reminded the task group that it is still operating under the patent policy presented the previous day. The next item on the agenda is the evaluation methodology comment resolution. The updated commentary

database document is IEEE 802.16m-07/041r2. Comments were reviewed and resolved. Recessed for lunch at 12:05PM.

Meeting resumed on 1:15PM, continuing with the Evaluation Methodology Document (EMD).

Discussion on the EMD was not concluded. In accordance with the agenda, discussion began on the System Description Document (SDD) Table of Contents. Contributions proposing different ToC were briefly presented and captured by the SDD editor, Shkumbin Hamiti, who was tasked to prepare a consolidated TOC for review the following day.

Meeting recessed at 5:45PM.

3) Wednesday, November 14, 2007

The meeting resumed at 08:00AM. Discussion continued on the Evaluation Methodology comments, which include one comment not discussed on Tuesday and two late comments accommodated by the chair.

The proposed EMD editorial resolutions given in document, IEEE C802.16m-07/318 were accepted with no objections and incorporated into the final commentary database.

Motion: To adopt all the comment resolutions as recorded in IEEE C802.16m-07/41r3 and authorize the editor to generate a new version of the evaluation methodology document IEEE 802.16 037r2 in accordance with those resolutions.

Mover: Roshni Srinivasan

Second: Avi Freedman

Motion accepted with no objection

In accordance with the agenda, a discussion then ensued as to whether or not the Evaluation Methodology document was acceptable for adoption by the Task Group. There was general consensus that at least one more comment round was necessary. The chair agreed to issue a new limited call for comments for the next meeting.

Motion: to approve IEEE 802.16m-07/037r2 as a baseline evaluation methodology document

Mover: Sassan Ahmadi

Second: Hokyu Choi

Not accepted 54: 56

Discussion then continued on the SDD ToC, led by the editor, Shkumbin Hamiti, who presented document IEEE C802.16m-07/320, his proposed consolidated ToC. A straw poll indicated a slight majority desire to adopt document IEEE C802.2.6m-07/298r1 as a working document. Several members objected to this approach. At 10:20, the meeting recessed for a break.

Meeting resumed at 10:55AM. Discussion continued on the ToC.

Motion: The task group does not adopt any specific ToC at this meeting

Mover: Naftali Chayat

Second: Gadi Lahat

In favor: 36

Against: 77

Motion: to issue a call for comments till tomorrow morning on 298r1 (proposed changes shall not violate the SRD)

Mover: Jose Puthenkulam

Second: Belal Hamze

After a long discussion, the motion was withdrawn.

Procedure defined by the chair, to continue with the SDD editor's document IEEE C802.16m-07/320, and discuss the first level of the ToC only. Recessed for lunch at 12:05 PM.

Reconvened at 1:20 PM, with discussion continuing on the ToC.

Recess at 3:10PM. Meeting resumed at 3:30PM.

The editor's proposed TOC, document IEEE C802.16m-07/320 was discussed and modified. The new revision of this document, IEEE C802.16m-07/320r1, will be used as a guideline for call for contributions, call for comments and allocation of specific SDD contributions.

The contributions were grouped according to the subjects specified in the call for contributions, IEEE 802.16m-07/040. Contributions were then presented in numerical order within a subject area. The following numbers indicate the presentation of either an IEEE C802.16m-07/NNN type contribution or, if provided, a slide version, IEEE S802.16m-07/NNN, of a contribution. Reference models and protocol architecture; 259r1, 281, 282, 286r2, 297, 299r1, 301, 304, 302, 306, 240r3 (only self-organization architecture part) and 251r3 were presented. 287r2 was submitted late and not presented.

The meeting recessed at 5:45PM for the social. The chair indicated that it would reconvene at 8:00AM the following day, commencing with contributions on the frame structure.

4) Thursday, November 15, 2007

Meeting called for order at 8:05AM, carrying on with SDD presentations on frame structure. The contributions presented were: 215, 235, 242r1, 263, 249, 265, 295r1, 296, 308, 315, 260r2, 240r3, 246, 220 and late contribution 354.

Break for lunch at 12:05PM.

The meeting resumed at 1:30PM, starting with one MAC contribution, 248r2. The chair then thanked all the contributors for their efforts, however the remainder of the contributions, which were primarily PHY, were declared out of scope of the Call for

Contributions and hence their presentation would be delayed till after the other items in the agenda were completed.

Discussion then ensued on the next Call for Contributions, suggesting to focus on the subjects of Network Reference Model, Protocol Structure, State diagrams, frame structure, multiple access techniques and multi antenna techniques, but only with regards to issues relating to the frame structures.

The chair introduced a proposed rapporteur process, which should enable advancement of the work between meetings. The subject area rapporteurs will be appointed by the TG chair and will be tasked to create strawman SDD text, based on proposed contributions and discussions held in the dot16.org TGm forum <http://www.dot16.org/forum/>. These strawman documents are intended to be revised between meetings and ultimately voted on by the Task Group for incorporation into the SDD.

Recessed at 3:10PM.

The meeting continued at 3:40PM, with further discussions on the process going forward and the IMT-Advanced schedule. Although the ITU-R was restructured, as far as we know the call for proposals will still be in January 2008 with initial proposals to be submitted in October 2008. This schedule may change, however, depending on the ITU restructuring discussions planned for February 2008.

The SDD editor, Shkumbin Hamiti, took an action to update the work plan, based on TGm's current status and provide it at the next meeting.

The chair also noted that submitted contributions that were not presented at this session would be held over to following meetings, when the specific subject matter of the contribution was addressed.

The chair then asked if there was any new business. There was no response.

Motion: to amend the agenda and adjourn the meeting at 4:00PM.

Mover: Phil Barber

Second: Shawn Taylor

In favor: 42

Against: 2

The revised agenda document is IEEE 802.16m-07/044r1.

Motion to adjourn.

Mover: Phil Barber

Second: Shawn Taylor

No objection. Meeting adjourned.