

Project	<b>IEEE 802.20 Working Group on Mobile Broadband Wireless Access</b> < <a href="http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/20/">http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/20/</a> >	
Title	<b>Comments on the 802.20 Requirements</b>	
Date Submitted	<b>C802.20-04/31: 2004-03-01</b> <b>C802.20-04/31r1: 2004-03-16</b>	
Source(s)	Vincent D. Park 135 Route 202/206 South Bedminster, NJ 07921  Arnab Das 135 Route 202/206 South Bedminster, NJ 07921	Voice: 908-947-7084 Fax: 908-947-7090 Email: <a href="mailto:park@flarion.com">park@flarion.com</a>  Voice: 908-997-2003 Fax: 908-947-7090 Email: <a href="mailto:a.das@flarion.com">a.das@flarion.com</a>
Re:	MBWA Call for Contributions for IEEE 802.20 Session #7 in Orlando, Florida.	
Abstract	This contribution provides comments on the 802.20 Requirements Document—Rev. 11r.	
Purpose	To address open issues and suggest changes to facilitate progression of the document.	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE 802.20 Working Group. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.20.	
Patent Policy	The contributor is familiar with IEEE patent policy, as outlined in <a href="http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3">Section 6.3 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual</a> < <a href="http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3">http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3</a> > and in <i>Understanding Patent Issues During IEEE Standards Development</i> < <a href="http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/guide.html">http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/guide.html</a> >.	

# Where are we now?

- Too many different ideas on what 802.20 should be capable of
  - As a result, some aspects of the requirements document are contradictory
  - Additionally, some requirements are potentially counterproductive, e.g., they may actually result in bad technology choices and engineering tradeoffs
- The requirement document is specific to the point that it is actually mandating solutions
  - It is often tempting to make a design choice into a requirement

# A Way Forward

- Keep it simple
  - Provide guidance on scope of problem to be solved, without mandating specific solutions
  - Include requirements when there is clear consensus
  - When specific requirements are *difficult* or *impossible* to define, *provide rough guidance*
- Move on if consensus is not likely to be achieved

# Final Thought

- Do the right thing!
- If we don't know what the right thing is, we should at least ensure that we don't do the wrong thing.

