

1
2
3 IEEE 802.20 Meeting Minutes
4 Plenary Session,
5 March 17-21, 2008,
6 Orlando, FL, USA
7

8 Chair: Arnie Greenspan
9 Vice-chair: Mark Klerer
10 Recording Secretary: Chirag Patel
11

12 **Day 1 – March 17, 2008**

13
14 PM1 session begins at 1:45 pm
15

16 The Chair noted that Mr. Gillies could no longer serve as recording secretary but that Mr.
17 Chirag Patel had volunteered to serve as recording Secretary. There were no objections to
18 Mr. Patel assuming the duties of recording secretary.
19

20 Chairman (Arnie Greenspan) reviews IEEE patents policy.
21

22 Member introduction and disclosure of their affiliations.
23

24 Chair's opening remarks
25

26 Chair gives week's agenda

- 27 • Two PARs,
- 28 • Comment Resolution,
- 29 • Election of Officers,
- 30 • Affirmation of Taiwan Accomplishments,
- 31 • Update of 802.20 P&P)
- 32

33 **Motion for Approval of Atlanta meeting minutes**

34 Mover: Jerry Upton
35 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi
36

37 *Atlanta minutes are approved unanimously by the voting members.*
38

39 **Motion for Approval of Taipei meeting minutes – revision R2.**

40 Mover: Jerry Upton
41 Second: Victor Hou
42

43 *Taiwan meeting minutes version R2 are approved unanimously by the voting members.*
44

45 Discusson on new 802.20 Technical development work plan
46 Two new PARs are discussed.

1 **Motion to approve the new technical development plan (Refer to doc: 802.20-PD-**
2 **07r5)**

3
4 Mover: Jim Tomcik
5 Second: Francis O'Brien

6
7 *The new technical development work plan approved unanimously by the voting members.*

8
9 **Motion to approve the meeting agenda**

10 Mover: Nancy Bravin
11 Second: Jim Ragsdale

12
13 Agenda corrected to show correct dates and also a note is added to indicate that if agenda
14 moves faster, then items for the later day will be moved ahead.

15
16 *Agenda approved unanimously by the voting members.*

17
18 **Discussion of P&P (C802.20-08/20)**

19
20 Draft P&P prepared by Jerry Upton
21 Update on the P&P proposal prepared in Taipei.
22 Jerry Upton goes over major points of the P&P document.

23
24 Chair comments on what voting procedure is needed for 802.20.
25 Change entity voting to block voting or something more appropriate in the document.

26
27 Victor Hou's comments:

28 Discussion on P&P C802.20-08-01.pdf

29 Discusses good points in the current P&P (e.g., four hour rule, standing committees)

30 Strongly stated that directly referencing IEEE 802 P&P is not the most suitable approach
31 because good information, procedure and practice will be lost.

32 | Victor Hou opposes removal of ~~the~~ some of the 802.20 P&P material (e.g. meeting
33 etiquette).

34
35 Arnie Greenspan suggests putting together a task group in this meeting to take a look at
36 current P&P.

37
38 Jerry Upton suggests to operate as per 802 procedures and include some items that are
39 good and may be kept.

40 Jim Ragsdale suggests having a procedure unified and consistent to 802

41 Jim Tomcik agrees with Jim Ragsdale's suggestions

42
43 Arnie Greenspan suggests adding Appendices to include relevant items.

44 Jim Ragsdale suggests deciding on an approach to make changes to P&P

45 Arnie Greenspan suggests discussing above two approaches

46

1 **Coffee Break (3:10 pm)**

2 Meeting re-convenes after the break (3:45 pm)

3

4 Discussion on PAR for Minimum Performance Requirements (C802.20-08/04).

5 **Motion to approve the MPR PAR.**

6 Mover: Jim Tomcik

7 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi

8

9 *The MPR PAR approved by the voting members by acclamation.*

10

11 Discussion on PICS PAR (802.20/08-03)

12 **Motion to approve the PICS PAR.**

13 Mover: Jerry Upton

14 Second: Nancy Bravin

15

16 *The PICS PAR approved by the voting members by acclamation.*

17 All 9 voters (including the chair) were present.

18

19 Discussion on Officer election process

20 (The document was mailed on the reflector)

21

22 Summary: There will be a survey of the WG members by roll-call or ballot followed by
23 voting by the voting members.

24

25 Continued discussion on P&P

26

27 Jim Ragsdale pointed to discussion in Taipei that 802 P&P will be adopted. (Page 5 of
28 Taipei approved minutes)

29

30 **Motion to affirm the decision taken in Taipei to follow the P&P adoption approach
31 suggested by Jerry Upton.**

32

33 Mover: Jim Ragsdale

34 Second: Jerry Upton

35

36 Voting:

37 5 Affirm, 1 Abstain, 1 NO, 2 did not vote (including the Chair)

38

39 *The motion is approved. We have a decision to move forward regarding the approach to
40 be followed for P&P changes.*

41 This will be formally voted on Friday.

42

43 Further discussion on the voting procedure to be specified in P&P

44 | Discussion ensued on incorporating the voting ~~of~~ procedure edited by ~~N~~Mr. Greenspan for
45 the March 2008 elections as Appendix A of the 802.20 P&P.

1 Victor Hou opposes the changing of the voting procedure in the 802.20 P&P to be the
2 one used for officer elections at the March 2008 meeting, edited by Arnie Greenspan, and
3 has said that any revisions of the voting procedure for the P&P should be based on edits
4 of the old Appendix A. He wants to retain only procedure for individual voting and not
5 include any special cases.

6 | **Jim Ragsdale** It was suggesteds to include all possible scenarios - block voting as well as
7 individual voting because it's not clear what the procedure will be in the future.

8
9 Jim Ragsdale summarizes it as - operating as agreed upon in Taipei.

10
11 Jerry Upton to update the P&P version 802.20/08-02 to reflect changes required based on
12 the discussion in the meeting.

13
14 Discussion on re-circulation ballot voting

15 153 eligible voters.

16 83% return, 77% approval.

17
18 Chair to discuss the voting results/patterns with the standards board.

19
20 **Session adjourned. To re-convene at 7.00 pm**

21
22 **Session re-convenes**

23
24 Discussion on officer election process

25
26 Chair provides paper ballot to WG members. This is an individual ballot. The votes serve
27 as a survey of the opinion of WG members.

28
29 **Mark Klerer (Affiliation: Qualcomm) is the only nominated person for Chair on the**
30 **individual ballot.**

31
32
33 | Results of secret-ballot survey of individual voting members, excluding an entity's
34 primary voter:

35 14 Affirmative, 1 Negative.

36
37 Formal voting: (entity voting)

38 Alcatel Lucent - approve

39 Broadcom - abstain

40 Qualcomm - approve

41 Kyocera - approve

42 Nokia Siemens - abstain

43 Steepest Ascent - approve

44 Ericsson - approve

45 AT&T - approve

46 NEC - approve

1 Niigata University - approve

2

3 8 - approve, 2 - abstain, chairman did not vote

4

5 *Mark Klerer elected the Chairman of 802.20 WG*

6

7 **Voting for procedural vice-chair:**

8 **Candidate: Radhakrishna Canchi (Affiliation: Kyocera)**

9

10

11 | Results of secret-ballot survey of individual voting members, excluding an entity's

12 primary voter: 14 approve, 1 abstain

13

14 Formal voting (entity based):

15 Alcatel Lucent - approve

16 Broadcom - disapprove

17 Qualcomm - approve

18 Kyocera - approve

19 Nokia Siemens - approve

20 Steepest Ascent - approve

21 Ericsson - approve

22 AT&T - approve

23 NEC - approve

24 Niigata University - approve

25

26 9 - approve, 1 - disapprove, chairman did not vote

27

28 *Radhakrishna Canchi elected vice-chair of 802.20 WG*

29

30

31 **Session adjourned. Re-convene tomorrow (18th march).**

32 **End of Day one.**

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

1 **Day 2 – March 18, 2008**

2
3 **AM1 session - Meeting re-convenes. (8:45am)**

4
5 Mark Klerer discusses recirculation ballot comments and the way to proceed in resolving
6 them. Mark provided a grouping of related comments to the meeting attendees to
7 facilitate discussion and resolution of comments. Around 80 comments had been
8 received.

9
10 **Comment resolution.**

11 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

12
13 **Coffee break (10:00 am)**

14
15 AM2 session re-convenes (10:30 am)

16
17 Comment resolution continued.

18 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

19
20 **Lunch break (12:30 pm).**

21 **PM1 - Meeting re-convenes (2:15 pm).**

22
23 Comment resolution continued.

24 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

25
26 **Coffee break (2:40 pm).**

27 **PM1 session - (3:05 pm).**

28
29 Comment resolution continued.

30 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

31
32 **Meeting adjourned (5:55 pm).**

33 **End of Day Two**

34
35
36 **Day 3 – March 19, 2008**

37 **AM1 session – 8:45 am**

38
39 Summary of ITU meeting (802.18) by Tom Wasilewski.

40 It was reported that 802.18 is going to evaluate different proposals from different WGs,
41 but that 802.18 will not get into technical content of the submitted proposals.

42 Jim Ragsdale – presented the schedule for IMT Advanced.

43
44 M. Klerer goes over the day's agenda

45
46 **Comment resolution continued from the previous day.**

1 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

2

3 **Coffee break (10:05 am)**

4 **AM2 session begins (11:05 am)**

5

6 **Comment resolution continued**

7

8 **Lunch break (12:40 am)**

9 **PM1 session - 2:15 pm**

10

11 Discussion on 802.20.3 PAR feedback

12

13 Discussion of comments related to the PICS PAR.

14

15 Discussion of comments on the Minimum Performance PAR.

16

17 Jim Tomcik and Jerry Upton agreed to draft the responses to comments and modify the
18 PAR text accordingly.

19

20 **Coffee break (2:50 pm)**

21 **PM2 session begins (3:15 am)**

22

23 Discussion on PAR feedback and modified PAR

24

25 PAR 802.20.2 (MP PAR)

26 Chair goes over the responses prepared by Jim T. (Qualcomm)

27

28 **Motion to approve the modified 802.20.2 (MP) PAR**

29 Moved: Jerry Upton

30 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi

31

32 6 members (excluding the chair) present

33

34 *The designated voting members approve the modified PAR with acclamation*

35

36 Discussion on PICS PAR

37

38 Members discuss the responses crafted to the comments on the PICS PAR.

39 Agree to fix minor typos.

40

41 **Motion to approve the modified PICS PAR**

42 Moved: Jerry Upton

43 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi

44

45 *The voting members unanimously approve the modified PAR.*

46 Typos, etc. fixed.

1 No objections from members on the modified PAR

2

3 **Comment resolution continued**

4

5 **Session adjourned** (5:50 pm)

6

6 **End of Day 3**

7

8

9

9 **Day 4– March 18, 2008**

10

10 AM1 session - Meeting re-convenes (8:40 am)

11

12 **Comment resolution continued.**

13

13 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.

14

15

15 Discussion on revised P&P

16

17

17 **Motion to approve revised P&P as reviewed in March 2008 (given in C802.20-02R1)**

18

18 The Working Group approves the revision of the 802.20 Policies and Procedures as

19

19 reviewed in the March 2008 opening and stated in Contribution C802.20-08/02R1 which

20

20 was based on C802.20-08/01.

21

22

23

23 Moved: Jerry Upton

24

24 Second: Jim Ragsdale

25

26

26 Request to continue discussion after coffee break

27

27 The motion discussion will be continued after the break

28

29

29 Voting:

30

30 Alcatel-Lucent - approve

31

31 Broadcom - disapprove

32

32 Qualcomm - approve

33

33 Kyocera - approve

34

34 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove

35

35 Steepest Ascent - approve

36

36 Ericsson - approve

37

37 AT&T - approve

38

38 NEC - approve

39

39 Niigata Univ. - approve

40

40 Miagi Univ. - approve

41

42

42 9 - approves, 2 - disapproves, chair did not vote

43

44

44 *The motion to approve revised P&P passed*

45

46

46 Victor Hou requested that this motion be sent out as a letter ballot to the voting members.

1 This request needs to be formally voted by the WG members before sending it.

2

3 **Motion to send out a letter ballot to affirm the vote on the revision of 802.20 P&P as**
4 **voted in March 08 closing plenary**

5

6 Moved: Victor Hou

7 Second: No second

8 However, the motion is not 2nded. So, *the above motion is not moved forward.*

9

10 **Continue with comment resolution.**

11

12 Chair discusses the usage of 3GPP2 material in the 802.20 standard, the procedure to be
13 followed and its implications. Modify comment response to identify the material from
14 3GPP2 with copyright permission from the publisher.

15

16 Members discuss the comment resolution reply to relevant comments on the topic.
17 Provide a reference to TIA documents. Members agree to refer to 3GPP2 related material
18 in as published by the TIA.

19

20 **Motion to approve comment resolution:**

21 The WG affirms the resolution of comments that occurred during the March 2008 session
22 for the recirculation of the sponsor ballot. (Approval of this motion does not mean
23 agreement on all resolutions).

24

25 Moved: Jerry Upton

26 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi.

27

28 Voting:

29 Alcatel-Lucent - approve

30 Broadcom - approve

31 Qualcomm - approve

32 Kyocera - approve

33 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove

34 Steepest Ascent - approve

35 Ericsson - approve

36 NEC - approve

37 Niigata Univ. - approve

38 Miagi Univ. - approve

39

40 9 approve, 1 disapprove, chairman did not vote

41 *Motion passes*

42

43 **Motion to take the P802.20 Draft 4.1m to RevCom:**

44 WG recommends and approves the 802.20 Chair requesting approval from the 802
45 Executive Committee to conditionally approve IEEE 802.20 Working Group P802.20
46 Draft 4.1m to go to RevCom.

1 The recirculation ballot will be a 15 day ballot.
2 Comment resolution will occur at the May interim.

3
4 Moved: Jerry Upton
5 Second: R. Canchi
6 Voting:
7 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
8 Broadcom - disapprove
9 Qualcomm - approve
10 Kyocera - approve
11 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove
12 Steepest Ascent - approve
13 Ericsson - approve
14 NEC - approve
15 Niigata Univ. - approve
16 Miagi Univ. - approve

17
18 8 approve, 2 disapprove, chairman did not vote

19
20 *Motion passes*

21
22 **Lunch break (12:55 pm)**

23
24 **AM2 session - Session reconvened (2:00 pm)**

25
26 Discussion on new MIB (Management Information Base) Enhancements and Corrigenda
27 items PAR (802.20.a)
28 Presented by Jim Tomcik.

29
30 **Motion to approve the above PAR:**
31 The WG approves the PAR for the development of a MIB enhancement

32
33 Moved: J. Tomcik
34 Second: R. Canchi

35
36 Floor open for discussion on the PAR.

37
38 Voting:
39 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
40 Broadcom - abstain
41 Qualcomm - approve
42 Kyocera - approve
43 Nokia-Siemens - abstain
44 Ericsson - approve
45 NEC - approve
46 Miagi Univ. - approve

- 1 6 approves, 2 abstains, chairman did not vote.
- 2
- 3 *The motion is approved.*
- 4
- 5 **Motion to adjourn the session**
- 6 Moved: Jerry Upton.
- 7 Second: Nancy Bravin
- 8
- 9 Meeting adjourned.
- 10 **Close of March 2008 plenary (2:25 pm).**

1

Attendees– March 2008				
Last Name	First Name	Affiliation	Member Status	Attendance Credit
Bravin	Nancy	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Budianu	Cristian	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Canchi	Radhakrishna	Kyocera	M	Y
Epstein	M	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Garcia-Alis	Daniel	Steepest Ascent Ltd.	M	Y
Gowaikar	Radhika	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Greenspan	Arnold	AROSCO INC.	M	Y
Hou	Victor	Broadcom	M	Y
Ishida	Kazuhito	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	NY
Ji	Tingfang	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	NY
Kadous	Tamer	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	NY
Karkhanechi	Haideh	HIFAR	O	N
Khatibi	Farrokh	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Klerer	S	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Kolze	Tom	Broadcom	M	N
Murakami	Kazuhiro	Kyocera	M	N
O'Brien	Francis	ALCATEL-LUCENT	M	Y
Oguma	Hiroshi	Insitute of Miyagi Prefecture	M	N
Patel	Chirag	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Pearson	Orlett	ALCATEL-LUCENT	M	Y
Pirhonen	Riku	Nokia Siemens Networks	M	Y
Ragsdale	James	Telefon AB LM Ericsson	M	Y
Sasaki	Shigenobu	Niigata University	M	N
Tomcik	James	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Upton	Jerry	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Wang	Michael	Qualcomm, Inc.	A	Y
Wasilewski	Tom	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Yallapragada	Subbarao	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Yang	Wen-Bin	NIST	O	N
Yuza	Masaaki	NEC Infrontia	M	Y
Zhang	Xin	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y

2 M=Member, A=Aspirant Member, O=Observer