Cl **00**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **42**   # r01-1

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html has:
Physical Layer (always capped)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "physical layer" to "Physical Layer"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Also in the following locations:
Cl   Pg ln
FM   3   1
56.1.3   73 37
102.2.1 248 20
102.3.1 264 3

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **27**   *L* **16**   # r01-2

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Page 27 does not reflect the latest version of the 802.3 boilerplate.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Implementors" to "Implementers".

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.2.7**   *P* **29**   *L* **6**   # r01-3

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

(Page number from CMP version)
unusual editing instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "Insert 1.2.7 after 1.2.6 "Accuracy and resolution of numerical quantities".

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.3**   *P* **29**   *L* **17**   # r01-4

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

(Page number from CMP version)
In the editing instruction, "reference" should be "references"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "reference" to "references"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.144a**   *P* **29**   *L* **46**   # r01-5

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

(Page number from CMP version)
In the editing instruction, there is a spurious extra "("

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "Clocked Violation LO (CVL)"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.345a**   *P* **30**   *L* **45**   # r01-6

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

(Page number from CMP version)
Now that 1.4.345b has been removed, in the editing instruction, "definitions" should be "definition"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "definitions" to "definition"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **r01-6**   Page 1 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P* *L* # r01-7
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *Clause order*

The order of IEEE 802.3 amendments is to have all annexes after all clauses (as it was in D3.0), as shown in the 802.3 FrameMaker template. In D3.1, Annex A and Annex 31A are interleaved with the clauses. Why was this change made?

SuggestedRemedy

Move Annex A and Annex 31A to be after Clause 103

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
REVISED
per comment and modify Editor Instruction on Pg 81 line 1 to per Staff editors input read:
"Insert new clauses 100, 101, 102, and 103 as follows:"

At the beginning of Annex 100A insert Editor Instruction: "Insert new Annex 100A as follows:"

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* **38** *L* **17** # r01-8
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *Table 45-3*

(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3bw-2015 made changes to Table 45-3 which show 1.17 as Reserved.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.17 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
in the row for 1.17 add "Reserved" in strikethrough font and underline "EPoC PMA/PMD ability" in the "Register name" column, underline "45.2.1.14aa" and remove the row below.

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* **41** *L* **5** # r01-9
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** *Table 45-3*

(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3by-201x made changes to Table 45-3 which show the appropriate reserved row as "1.1809 through 1.2099"

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.1809 through 1.2099 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
in the first row change the strikethrough text to "2099"
in the last row change "1.1959 through 1.32767" to "1.1959 through 1.2099"

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1** *SC* **1.4.134** *P* **28** *L* **41** # r01-10
Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type **G** *Comment Status* **A**

The text '(For 10BROAD36,' should not be shown in underscore as this text was added by IEEE P802.3by.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
REVISED
Per comment but also don't show "sSee" in mark-up as "See" was changed to "see" by P802.3by also.
Final version:
1.4.134 channel: In 10BROAD36 <uline>and 10GPASS-XR, </uline>a band of frequencies dedicated to a certain service transmitted on the broadband medium. Otherwise, a defined path along which data in the form of an electrical or optical signal passes. (For 10BROAD36, see IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 11<uline>, for 10GPASS-XR see Clause 100, Clause 101, and Clause 102</uline>.)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **r01-10** Page 2 of 6
5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM

Cl **100** *SC* **100.3.1** *P* **88** *L* **21** # r01-11
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
The reference in the following statement should be 101.4.4.4.4.
"The CNU reports supported optional modulations to the CLT via US_ModAbility variable
see 101.4.3.4.5"

SuggestedRemedy
Change to 101.4.4.4.4

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **101** *SC* **101.3.2.5.4** *P* **151** *L* **13** # r01-12
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A** *Burst Markers*
Step 1) Add burst start marker and Step 9) Add burst end marker do not happen in FEC
encoding. They are part of PMA.

SuggestedRemedy
In Step 7) change "codeword and move to step 9" to "codeword, exit."
In Step 8) change "step 9 else go to step 2." to "exit else go to step 1."
Remove these steps and renumber.

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
REVISED
See Response (copied below) to comment r01-25

Bin is defined in step 2: "the number of available 65-bit blocks (Bin)". Change the number
step text to read as follows:

1) If the number of available 65-bit blocks (Bin) is sufficient to fill a long FEC codeword (BQ
= 220), create a long FEC codeword. If Bin >= 220 is true repeat step 1.
2) If 220 > Bin >=101, create a shortened long FEC codeword.
3) If 101 > Bin >= 76, create a medium FEC codeword.
4) If 76 > Bin >= 25, create a shortened medium FEC codeword.
5) If 25 > Bin >= 12, create a short FEC codeword. If Bin >= 12 is true repeat step 5.
6) If 12 > Bin >= 1, create a shortened short FEC codeword.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7a.5** *P* **66** *L* **41** # r01-13
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
extra period at end of line. "shown in Table 45-211f. ."

SuggestedRemedy
strike spare period.

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **13** *L* **42** # r01-14
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
Amendment number has been set by Mr. Law

SuggestedRemedy
Add "Amendment 5-"

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change to "Amendment 6-" per updated email from the WG Chair.
Add Amendment 5- regarding 802.3br

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P* **31** *L* **1** # r01-15
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A** *Clause order*
Clauses mis-ordered

SuggestedRemedy
Change to FM, 1, 30, 45, 56, 67, 76, 100, 101, 102, 103 Annex A, Annex 31A, Annex 100A.

Response *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **r01-15**

Page 3 of 6
5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.3.1**   *P* **91**   *L* **23**   # r01-16

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Change "product" to "accumulation"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.4.3**   *P* **105**   *L* **49**   # r01-17

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

The second xref in first sentence should point to Table 100-8

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.4.3**   *P* **105**   *L* **51**   # r01-18

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

The first xref second/last sentence should point to Table 100-9

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.6**   *P* **109**   *L* **42**   # r01-19

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

In Table 100-11, change g.e. sign to "to" to match subclause text.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
REVISED
Per comment.
NOTE: Range is 7.4 MHz to 204 MHz. The xref provides additional information.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.6**   *P* **109**   *L* **53**   # r01-20

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Insert "up to" before "65"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.4.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **48**   # r01-21

Laubach, Mark   Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type   **GR**   *Comment Status*   **A**

"MD1" should be "MDI"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **r01-21**   Page 4 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **101**　　　*SC* **101.3.2.5.4**　　　　　*P* **151**　　　　*L* **13**　　　　# r01-22
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　*Burst Markers*

Layer violation. Insertion of the start/stop burst markers is performed by the symbol mapper in the PMA.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove steps 1) and 12)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.5.3.1**　　　　*P* **113**　　　　*L* **33**　　　　# r01-23
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Change "uses" to "can use". CLT needs to ensure that it meets a desired confidence interval provided by the manufacture. For example, the statement as written would permit the CLT to use only one upstream probe symbol, which would not create confidence.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.6.1**　　　　　*P* **114**　　　　*L* **38**　　　　# r01-24
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Change ": <newline> For" to "and for" remove newline. Add a colon to the end of the sentence. Adjust row/line aligments.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **101**　　　*SC* **101.3.2.5.4**　　　　　*P* **151**　　　　*L* **13**　　　　# r01-25
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**　　　　*Burst Markers*

Bin is not defined. Looping may not be correct as drafted, i.e., should continue looping until not enough for a long codeword, move to next tests, etc. The text here should not be confused with the state machine / pseudo code used in 101.3.2.5.7, and should remain in its prior descriptive format.

SuggestedRemedy

Revert to previous text, lines 13 through 39.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
REVISED
Bin is defined in step 2: "the number of available 65-bit blocks (Bin)". Change the number step text to read as follows:

1) If the number of available 65-bit blocks (Bin) is sufficient to fill a long FEC codeword (BQ = 220), create a long FEC codeword. If Bin >= 220 is true repeat step 1.
2) If 220 > Bin >=101, create a shortened long FEC codeword.
3) If 101 > Bin >= 76, create a medium FEC codeword.
4) If 76 > Bin >= 25, create a shortened medium FEC codeword.
5) If 25 > Bin >= 12, create a short FEC codeword. If Bin >= 12 is true repeat step 5.
6) If 12 > Bin >= 1, create a shortened short FEC codeword.

Cl **1**　　　*SC* **1.4.331**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　# r01-26
Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Format problem?

SuggestedRemedy

There does not appear to be a space after subclause number, make style the same as other definitions.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　　　　　*Comment ID* **r01-26**　　　Page 5 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　　　　　　5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **17**   # r01-27
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   Table 45-3
    Incorrect base text for Table 45-3. IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 has 1.17 listed as a single
    reserved row because 802.3bw defined 1.18. No need to change reserved rows except
    1.17. The new reserved row in this draft also conflicts with definition of 1.19 in P802.3by.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change editorial instruction to simply read, Change the 1.17 row of Table 45-3 (as modified
    by IEEE Std 802.3bw) as shown below. Only show 1.17 row in Table 45-3 changes with
    Reserved in strikethrough and new register name and subclause underscore.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
    REVISED
    See suggested remedy (copied below) to accepted comment r01-8.

    Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.17 in Table 45-3 (as
    inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
    in the row for 1.17 add "Reserved" in strikethrough font and underline "EPoC PMA/PMD
    ability" in the "Register name" column, underline "45.2.1.14aa" and remove the row below.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **1**   # r01-28
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   Table 45-3
    Incorrect base text for Table 45-3. IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 has changed the reserved row
    in 802.3-2015 (what is includede in the current draft) to define registers starting at 1.2100.

SuggestedRemedy
    The 32767 should be 2099 in first (strikethrough text) and last (plain text) row of the
    changes. Add ("as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw)" to the editing instruction to indicate
    where the correct base text is found.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
    REVISED
    See suggested remedy (copied below) to accepted comment r01-09.

    Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.1809 through 1.2099 in
    Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not
    shown):"
    in the first row change the strikethrough text to "2099"
    in the last row change "1.1959 through 1.32767" to "1.1959 through 1.2099"

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.21.131b6**   *P* **61**   *L* **49**   # r01-29
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Sections jump from 45.2.1.130z5 for register 1.1948 to 45.2.1.1301b6 for register 1.1949.
    Table numbers jump from 45-98az5 to 45-99a01.

SuggestedRemedy
    Fix to be consecutive with the reqired convoluted numbering.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **Z**
    REJECT.

    This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45**   *P*   *L*   # r01-30
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**
    Verify the remainder of the numbering.

SuggestedRemedy
    Per comment

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    REJECT.
    Standards are professionally edited by IEEE editors prior to publication.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # r01-31
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **G**   *Comment Status* **A**
    You may mark all my D3.0 comments as satisfied as remaining errors are covered by
    comments on D3.1

SuggestedRemedy

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
    REVISED
    Thank you for this input.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **r01-31**   Page 6 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/26/2016 10:21:48 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID