

IEEE P802.3 (IEEE 802.3bx) Revision to IEEE Std 802.3-2012 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comment

Cl 80 SC 80.1.2 P 79 L 45 # 2
 Lingle, Robert OFS

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

The stated reach of "up to at least 100 m" fails to acknowledge the 150 m capability of 100GBASE-SR10 on OM4 cabling. Although considered officially an "engineered solution" due to a reduction in allowed connection insertion loss from 1.5 dB to 1.0 dB, this type of special restriction did not impose limiting the stated reach of 40GBASE-ER4 or 100GBASE-ER4 which are rated to 30 km without special engineering, but are stated in this table to support 40 km.

SuggestedRemedy

There are two choices for removing the inequitable handling of stated reaches in this table. The first is preferred.
 1. change 100 m to 150 m on line 45.
 2. change 40 km to 30 km on lines 27 and 53.

Response Response Status U

REJECT.

This is a restatement of unsatisfied negative comment #45 received during initial Working Group ballot (Draft 2.0). The response to comment #45 follows.

"This topic was discussed in the P802.3ba project after the change was made to increase the reach of 100GBASE-SR10 over OM4 to 150 m. The consensus decision made at that time was to keep the reach in the description of 100GBASE-SR10 at 100 m. Making a change in the description of 100GBASE-SR10 or 100GBASE-ER4 now when there has been no change in the specifications would cause confusion and be counter to the consensus decision of the Task Force and Working Group when the standard was approved."

The response to the Draft 2.0 comment #45 indicates that the topic was discussed by the P802.3ba Task Force and that the consensus of that group is reflected in the content of Table 80-1. No new information has been provided to justify reconsideration of that decision.

The comparison to the treatment of 100GBASE-ER4 may not be appropriate since the model for deployment of inter-office (or similar applications where engineered links are more common) is different from structured cabling within an enterprise or data center.

Cl 80 SC 80.1.2 P 79 L 19 # 3
 Lingle, Robert OFS

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

The stated reach of "up to at least 100 m" fails to acknowledge the 150 m capability of this PHY on OM4 cabling. Although considered officially an "engineered solution" due to a reduction in allowed connection insertion loss from 1.5 dB to 1.0 dB, this type of special restriction did not impose limiting the stated reach of 40GBASE-ER4 or 100GBASE-ER4 which are rated to 30km without special engineering, but are stated in this table to support 40 km.

SuggestedRemedy

There are two choices for removing the inequitable handling of stated reaches in this table. The first is preferred.
 1. Change 100 m to 150 m on line 19.
 2. Change 40 km to 30 km on lines 27 and 53.

Response Response Status U

REJECT.

This is a restatement of unsatisfied negative comment #44 received during initial Working Group ballot (Draft 2.0). The response to comment #44 follows.

"This topic was discussed in the P802.3ba project after the change was made to increase the reach of 40GBASE-SR4 over OM4 to 150 m. The consensus decision made at that time was to keep the reach in the description of 40GBASE-SR4 at 100 m. Making a change in the description of 40GBASE-SR4 or 100GBASE-ER4 now when there has been no change in the specifications would cause confusion and be counter to the consensus decision of the Task Force and Working Group when the standard was approved."

The response to the Draft 2.0 comment #44 indicates that the topic was discussed by the P802.3ba Task Force and that the consensus of that group is reflected in the content of Table 80-1. No new information has been provided to justify reconsideration of that decision.

The comparison to the treatment of 100GBASE-ER4 may not be appropriate since the model for deployment of inter-office (or similar applications where engineered links are more common) is different from structured cabling within an enterprise or data center.

IEEE P802.3 (IEEE 802.3bx) Revision to IEEE Std 802.3-2012 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comment

Cl 80 SC 80.1.2 P 79 L 19 # 20044
 Kolesar, Paul CommScope

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

The stated reach of "up to at least 100 m" fails to acknowledge the 150 m capability of this PHY on OM4 cabling. Although considered officially an "engineered solution" due to a reduction in allowed connection insertion loss from 1.5 dB to 1.0 dB, this type of special restriction did not impose limiting the stated reach of 40GBASE-ER4 or 100GBASE-ER4 which are rated to 30 km without special engineering, but are stated in this table to support 40 km.

SuggestedRemedy

There are two choices to removing the inequitable handling of stated reaches in this table. The first is preferred.
 1. Change 100 m to 150 m on line 19.
 2. Change 40 km to 30 km on lines 27 and 53.

Response Response Status U

REJECT.

This topic was discussed in the P802.3ba project after the change was made to increase the reach of 40GBASE-SR4 over OM4 to 150 m. The consensus decision made at that time was to keep the reach in the description of 40GBASE-SR4 at 100 m. Making a change in the description of 40GBASE-SR4 or 100GBASE-ER4 now when there has been no change in the specifications would cause confusion and be counter to the consensus decision of the Task Force and Working Group when the standard was approved.

See also comment #45.

Cl 80 SC 80.1.2 P 79 L 45 # 20045
 Kolesar, Paul CommScope

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

The stated reach of "up to at least 100 m" fails to acknowledge the 150 m capability of 100GBASE-SR10 on OM4 cabling. Although considered officially an "engineered solution" due to a reduction in allowed connection insertion loss from 1.5 dB to 1.0 dB, this type of special restriction did not impose limiting the stated reach of 40GBASE-ER4 or 100GBASE-ER4 which are rated to 30 km without special engineering, but are stated in this table to support 40 km.

SuggestedRemedy

There are two choices to removing the inequitable handling of stated reaches in this table. The first is preferred.
 1. Change 100 m to 150 m on line 45.
 2. Change 40 km to 30 km on lines 27 and 53.

Response Response Status U

REJECT.

This topic was discussed in the P802.3ba project after the change was made to increase the reach of 100GBASE-SR10 over OM4 to 150 m. The consensus decision made at that time was to keep the reach in the description of 100GBASE-SR10 at 100 m. Making a change in the description of 100GBASE-SR10 or 100GBASE-ER4 now when there has been no change in the specifications would cause confusion and be counter to the consensus decision of the Task Force and Working Group when the standard was approved.

See also comment #44.