P802.3ch Draft 1.2 Closing Editor's Report

Natalie Wienckowski, General Motors

April, 2019

IEEE P802.3ch

Draft 1.2 Comment Review Summary

- 88 comments reviewed

- Move to instruct the Chief Editor to create D1.3 for Task Force recirculation from D1.2, from closed comments received on D1.2, and adopted baselines from passed motions; and pre-submit D1.3 to IEEE802.3 in anticipation of requesting WG Ballot in May 2019.

Draft 1.3 Proposed Timing

- All approved content required by Sunday, April 21, 2019
- PICS required by Wednesday, April 24, 2019
- D1.3 available by Friday, April 26, 2019
- Comments due on Saturday, May 11, 2019 (14 days)
- Proposed responses available by Wednesday, May 15, 2019

How to Comment

- Use the comment tool
- Use the comment spreadsheet
- Check each time to make sure you have the latest version!

Clause: ____
Please use "99" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause: ____
If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page: ____   Line: ____
Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: ○ E   ○ ER   ○ T   ○ TR
  E(ditorial)   E(ditorial) R(equired)   T(echnical)   T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Enter Another Comment   **Help Page (?)**   **FINISH**

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name	Surname	Affiliation	

Click on column headers for help

Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Backup

Comment file naming instructions

- Include your name (first, last, initials, etc.) in your filename. This ensures unique file names from each submitter.
- If you have additional comments after you submit a comment file, even if it is before the comment deadline, put your new comments in a new file. Use the same file name as before with _v2 (or appropriate #) added at the end of the file name.
- 1st comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW
- 2nd comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW_v2
- 3rd comment file - 802d3ch_D1p1_comments_NAW_v3
- Etc.

Comment withdraw instructions during TF ballotting

- Prior to comment deadline
  - Send an email to the editor and TF Chair with the comment to be withdrawn, provide the subclause, page, and line number you used in your comment file.
  - If comments created in Excel, also include the Excel line number in your file.

- After comment deadline
  - Find your comment in the published comment list (available the first working day after the comment deadline).
  - Send an email to the reflector requesting that comment #xx be withdrawn. Copy the editor and TF Chair.

Required Comments

- During TF review
  - We are not voting on the specification
  - Indicating your comment is "required" has no impact on the resolution of your comment
  - The required designation is ignored

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Do
  - Comment on any technical or Editorial error you find.
- Don't
  - Assume someone else will find the error and comment on it.

  We had a total of 4 commenters for D0p5. All found at least one typo that no other commenter found.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts (cont'd.)

- Do
  - Provide late comments if you see that something was missed.

- Don't
  - Put them in the main Excel table loaded to our website to submit them.

When you do this, I have to create a new file with only your comments and put them in the correct format. I'm not going to do this so they'll be sent back to you!

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J
1	Comment	CommenterName	CommenterCo	Clause	Subclause	Page	Line	Comment	Comment	SuggestedRemedy
2	57	Feyh, German	Broadcom		149 149.4.2.1	54	10	E	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"
3	58	Feyh, German	Broadcom		150 150.4.2.2	102	10	E	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G
1					Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form		
2	First name			Surname		Affiliation	
3	German			Feyh		Broadcom	
4					Click on column headers for help		
5	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied
6	Editorial	54	149.4.2.1	10	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"	
7	Editorial	102	150.4.2.2	10	PAM4 has four levels	change "three level" to "four level"	

Commenting Do's and Don'ts (cont'd.)

- Do
  - Provide presentations that explain your comments.

- Don't
  - Put generic statements in the implementation details like, "add a sentence to make the frequency "xxxxx MHz".

  When you do this, I have to write the text myself and hope what I put is what you're looking for. If you do this either they'll be sent back to you or you'll get an urgent email to ask you if what I have put matches your expectation.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts (cont'd.)

- Do
  - Keep your editor happy by writing clear, concise comments with clear and complete instructions for what you want done!

- Don't
  - Upset your editor by creating more work for her!

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Do
  - Complete all cells/boxes.
- Don't
  - Include only partial Information.

See examples of issues on next slides!

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Select the comment type
- A commenter did not select this
- Editor had to individually edit each comment to import them into the tool!

Clause: ▢
Please use "99" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause: ▢
If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page: ▢   Line: ▢
Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: ○E   ○ER   ○T   ○TR
E(ditorial)   E(ditorial) R(equired)   T(echnical)   T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Enter Another Comment   Help Page (?)   FINISH

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name	Surname	Affiliation

Click on column headers for help

Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Editorial
Technical

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Include Clause/Subclause

- A commenter left this blank

➢ Editor had to go to each page to determine this then enter it in the database. Without this information it is difficult to find like comments. Also, the comments don't sort correctly.

Clause:

Please use "99" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause:

If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page:

Line:

Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: ◯ E   ◯ ER   ◯ T   ◯ TR

E(ditorial)   E(ditorial) R(equired)   T(echnical)   T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Enter Another Comment   **Help Page (?)**   **FINISH**

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name	Surname	Affiliation

Click on column headers for help

Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Include correct page/line#

- A commenter made up numbers (?)

➢ Make sure numbers are from correct version. Your editor had to correct these! Without this information it is difficult to find like comments. Also, the comments don't sort correctly.

Clause: ☐
Please use "99" for comments on the front matter and "00" for comments on the entire draft.

Subclause: ☐
If referencing a Figure or Table, please enter the table or figure number in Comment.

Page: ☐ Line: ☐
Enter Page and Line number of the first occurrence. For multiple occurrences, list in Comment.

Comment:

Comment Type: ○ E   ○ ER   ○ T   ○ TR
E(ditorial)   E(ditorial) R(equired)   T(echnical)   T(echnical) R(equired)

Suggested Remedy:

Enter Another Comment   **Help Page (?)**   **FINISH**

Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form

First name		Surname		Affiliation	

Click on column headers for help

Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Do
  - Write comments that are clear and concise.
- Don't
  - Include only partial Information or write ambiguous comments.

See examples of issues on next slides!

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Purpose of Comment Box
  - Explain what the issue is. This may be one word, e.g. "typo", or may be a few sentences explaining what you think is wrong.
- Purpose of SuggestedRemedy Box
  - Clearly indicate the text you have an issue with and to what it should be changed. This may be a reference to a presentation. If this is the case, the presentation should be sent to the Chief Editor by the comment deadline to be used during creation of Responses to the comments.
  - The SuggestedRemedy should not be a question. This should be a statement of what you want changed.
  - The SuggestedRemedy should not include a justification for the change. This belongs in the Comment box.

Commenting Do's and Don't's

- Don't put the incorrect text in the "Comment" box and the corrected text in the "SuggestedRemedy" box.

- Do put "typo (grammar, etc.)" in the "Comment" box and put in the "SuggestedRemedy" box
  - Change: incorrect text
  - To: correct text

- This makes it clear to all what you are asking to have changed and how.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy	
of1000 Mb/s	of 1000 Mb/s	Obvious
64B/65B PCS	RS-FEC PCS (consistency with 10GBASE-T1)	Not so obvious
typo	change "of1000" to "of 1000"	Excellent!

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Don't use the comment process to ask questions about why something is the way it is in the spec.

- Do
  - Send an email to the reflector with your question.
  - Send an email to someone who is more knowledgeable about the spec or whoever contributed the content to the spec and ask your question.
  - Create a contribution related to your question with information that supports your point of view.
  - Review the contributions that were provided in other meetings related to this topic.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
Does a reset time of 0.5sec make sense given that the link start-up time should be within 100ms	Does 0.5s make sense? I would have expected a maximum value of 50ms rather than 500ms.
"The data path of the MultiGBASE-T1 PMA, depending on type and temperature, may take many seconds to run at optimum error ratio after exiting from reset or lowpower mode."	Is that really acceptable? I would expect a more tightly defined start-up time, like 100ms

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Don't leave the SuggestedRemedy blank.
  - If you don't provide a SuggestedRemedy the Editor is not going to create one for you. Editor's don't read minds! These comments will be Rejected!
  - If you are pointing out an issue and there are multiple acceptable solutions, list the possible solutions that would satisfy you. The Task Force can then discuss the possible solutions and select one.

Commenting Do's and Don't

- Don't leave the Comment blank unless the SuggestedRemedy clearly indicates the issue and the solution.
  - The issue is clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	Remove 8 from the list of possible interleave options

  - The issue is not clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	The PMA Transmit function in the PHY then sends an alert message to the link partner. The Alert signal is a low frequency PAM2 signal. The Alert signal is then followed by a number of Wake frames. After this short recovery time the normal operational mode is resumed.

Submitting Late Comments

- Submit comments no later than the deadline for removing comments from the buckets.
- Start with an empty comment file or database. I won't edit the file to remove comments already submitted to prevent duplicate comments.
- Complete all necessary information for your comments: First name, Surname, Affiliation for the file; and Category (Editorial or Technical), Sub-Clause, Page, Line, Comment, and Proposed change for each comment.
- Check the published comment list to see if someone has already submitted a comment for your issue. If they have, don't submit another comment. If you don't agree with the "proposed response" you can bring this up during the discussion of that comment. Late comments can't be put into "EZ" or "Editorial" buckets. This means we have to look at them individually even if they are a duplicate comment to add a missing space.

THANK YOU