

IEEE P802.3cn D1.0 50 Gb/s, 200 Gb/s, and 400 Gb/s over SMF 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 122 SC 122 P 36 L 1 # 3
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status D

General observaton - the large share of changes covers . creating more extensive list of supported PMDs. Rather than list all the PMP types in mltiple locations, when referecing *all* PMPs covered in this family, could we just use "Clause 122 PMDs" instead? List them once up front, and use a more generic text after that. This avoids all the touchups needed across this clause and others and makes it simpler to add new PMDs as needed in the future

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment
Similar comment applies to Clause 139 and 50G PMDs

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.
This style of listing the PMD types covered is consistent with the style used in many in-force Clauses, for instance 87, 88, 114 and 138.
Applying the suggested remedy would not improve the quality of the draft.

Cl 122 SC 122.1 P 36 L 14 # 1
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status D

"400GBASE-LR8, and the 400GBASE-ER8" - no need for "the" in the newly added text

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the underlined "the"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.
The word "the" is already present in the in-force version of Clause 122:
"and the 400GBASE-LR8 PMDs"
So it is not newly added text, but rather a word that has moved its position in the referenced sentence.
This style is consistent with the style used in many in-force Clauses, for instance 85, 86, 87, 88, 136, 137, and 139.

Cl 122 SC 122.1 P 36 L 15 # 2
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status D

"signals generated by these foursix PMD types" - since we already have a list of PMDs before, adding information on their count does not help at all, apart from adding yet one more place you need to touch every time a PMD is added

SuggestedRemedy

Strike "four" in baseline text, do not add anything
Similar issue on page 68, line 13

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.
[Editor's note: in the draft "four" is in strikethrough font and "six" is underlined]

The sentence:

"The optical signals generated by these PMD types are modulated using a 4-level pulse amplitude modulation (PAM4) format."
is somewhat less clear about what "PMD types" are being discussed than the version in the draft:

"The optical signals generated by these six PMD types are modulated using a 4-level pulse amplitude modulation (PAM4) format."

Applying the suggested remedy would not improve the quality of the draft.