Cl **33**   *SC* **33.8.3.2**   *P* **24**   *L* **39**   # i-1

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communications

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

It is customary to start text in Value/Comment field with a capital.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "when" to "When"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.4.4**   *P* **18**   *L* **31**   # i-2

Anslow, Peter   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

There is an extraneous period "." after "(see Table 33-23)"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the period between "see Table 33-23)" and "that indicates"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.9.1.2**   *P* **19**   *L* **39**   # i-3

Anslow, Peter   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

In Equation (33-7a) there should be a space between the number and its unit.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "250ms" to "250 ms"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **0**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # i-4

Gibbons, Patrick

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

This draft meets all editorial requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.9.1.2**   *P* **19**   *L* **28**   # i-5

Rannow, R K   Myself

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**

Two instances of "shall consider ..." which appears ambiguous.

SuggestedRemedy

Perhaps something like:

A DC MPS component shall be present if IPort is greater than or equal to IHold max for a minimum of TMPS. A DC MPS component shall be absent if IPort is less than or equal to IHold min. A DC MPS component shall be either present or absent if IPort is in the range of Ihold

Response   *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

These "shall consider" statements set up definitions that are used in following shalls that mandate PSE behavior, such as "Power shall be removed from the PI when DC MPS has been absent for a duration greater than TMPDO."

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **16**   *L* **6**   # i-6

Kabra, Lokesh   Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Definition 1.4.294 is deleted by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018.
Hence MDI is now defined in 1.4.323

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the instruction to

Change 1.4.323 (re-numbered from 1.4.324 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows :

Modify the index number in line 8 to "1.4.323" accordingly.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "1.4.324" to "1.4.323".

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **i-6**   Page 1 of 2
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   9/24/2019 2:06:23 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **1**　　　*SC* **1.4.324**　　　　*P* **16**　　　*L* **10**　　　# i-7

Thompson, Geoff

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

As long as we are cracking open this definition and fiddling with the referenced clauses we should make the list complete.
To that end we need to include references to PoDL interfaces as well.
(It is open to interpretation whether this comment should go against this project or P802.3cg. P802.3cg is not altering this definition and is in a later state of balloting where the scope has narrowed to to exclude this topic. I believe that this comment (albeit a stretch) is within the scope of P802.3cq.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 and Clause 145)
To the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33, Clause 104 and Clause 145)

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change from the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 and Clause 145)
To the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33, Clause 104, and Clause 145)

Cl **1**　　　*SC* **1.4.502**　　　　*P* **22**　　　*L* **4**　　　# i-8

Anslow, Pete

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 deleted definitions for VPD (1.4.502) and VPSE (1.4.503). This leaves unresolved cross references to the definition for VPSE in 33.2.6 and 33.2.7.4 and to the definition for VPD in 33.3.3.3.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide replacement wording for "as defined in 1.4.515" in the explanation of VPSE in 33.2.6 and 33.2.7.4
Provide replacement wording for "as defined in 1.4.514" in the explanation of VPD in 33.3.3.3.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to replace references to VPSE and VPD defined in 1.4 by a reference to 33.1.4.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　*Comment ID* **i-8**　　Page 2 of 2
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　9/24/2019 2:06:23 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID