IEEE 802®
8 July 2002
Angela Ortiz
Jennifer Longman
Mary Lynne Nielsen

Vancouver, BC, Canada
IEEE Standards Process Overview

- Imperative Principles
- Roles and Responsibilities of the Program Manager
- Project Approval (PAR)
- Editorial Processes
- Ballot Invitations
- Sponsor Ballot
- Approving the Standard
- Publishing the Standard
Imperative Principles of the Standards Process
Imperative Principles of the Standards Process

- Developing standards is a quasi-legal process
- Standards can become legal requirements
- It is possible to break the law inadvertently
- If you follow the rules, you will be covered by the IEEE umbrella of indemnification
Imperative Principles of the Legal Standards Process

- Due Process
- Openness
- Consensus
- Balance
- Right of Appeal
Due Process

Operational Definition

- Develop operating procedures
- Publish and make procedures available
- Follow procedures
Due Process (continued)

Hierarchy of Documents

- Not-for-Profit Corporation Law of the State of New York
- IEEE Certificate of Incorporation
- IEEE Constitution
- IEEE Bylaws
- IEEE Policies
- IEEE Board of Directors Resolutions
- IEEE-SA Board of Governors Resolutions
Due Process *(continued)*

*Hierarchy of Documents (cont.)*

- IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws
- IEEE Standards Style Manual
- IEEE Sponsor Operating Procedures
- Robert's Rules of Order
- IEEE Standards Companion
Openness

- Everyone has access to the process
- Make information and actions publicly available for examination
- Include all materially interested and affected parties
- Avoid antitrust situations/appearance of collusion
- Opportunity to participate does not necessarily mean membership or a vote
Consensus

- Agreement among the majority
- Not unanimity
- Defined in the IEEE Sponsor balloting rules as 75% of 75%
Consensus *(continued)*

**The Challenge**

- Approve and publish expeditiously
- Obligation to majority

**versus**

- Obligation to the minority
- Attempt to resolve comments
Balance

- Representation from all materially interested and affected parties
- Lack of dominance by any one category
- Common categories:
  - Producer, user, and general interest
- Ideal to maintain balance throughout development
- Encourage participation
- Mandatory for balloting
Right of Appeal

- The right to take steps to have a case heard
- Follow policies and procedures
- Bases of appeal can be:
  - Technical (within sponsor)
  - Procedural
Summary

- Due Process
- Openness
- Consensus
- Balance
- Right of Appeal
Roles and Responsibilities of the Program Manager
Roles and Responsibilities

Program Manager/Staff Liaison

- Answers questions about standards development procedures
  - Along with chair, ensures that procedures are followed
- Keeps you informed
  - New products
  - New services
  - Policy changes
- Brings your ideas and concerns to the IEEE-SA Standards Board and its committees
Project Approval (PAR)
Project Approval

Project Authorization Request (PAR)

- The PAR is a legal document
  - An approved PAR serves as the work authorization by the IEEE-SA Standards Board
  - IEEE extends the umbrella of indemnification to people working on an authorized standards project, if they follow the rules
- Copyright agreement
- The PAR is referred to when the standard is submitted to the IEEE-SA Standards Board for final approval
- Life of a PAR is four years
Role of New Standards Committee (NesCom)

- This committee is responsible for:
  - Ensuring that proposed standards projects are within the scope and purpose of the IEEE
  - Standards projects are assigned to the proper Society or other organizational body
- Examines PARs and makes recommendations to the IEEE-SA Standards Board regarding their approval
- All major standards-developing Societies are represented on NesCom
When do you need to submit a PAR?

- Every new project must have a PAR.
- When the time has come to revise the standard, a PAR must be submitted for the Revision of the Standard.
- Reaffirmations DO NOT need a PAR, they go straight to ballot.
Submitting the Signature Page

For all PARs submitted (whether a new project, a revised project, or a project to revise a standard), the signature page must be filled out in its entirety, signed by the working group chair and faxed to the NesCom Administrator at

+1 208 460 5300
When do you need to submit a revised PAR?

- When you want to change the title, scope or purpose of an existing PAR
- Changing the Working Group Chair does not require a revised PAR
  - Use the Working Group Chair change form, as shown here and available at http://standards.ieee.org/guides/par/wgchg99.html
Editorial Processes
Overview of Editorial Process

1. **Idea!**
2. **Project Approval Process**
4. **Sponsor Ballot**
5. **IEEE-SA Standards Board Approval Process**
6. **Publish Standard**

Flow:
- Idea! to Project Approval Process
- Project Approval Process to Develop Draft Standard (in Working Group)
- Develop Draft Standard (in Working Group) to Sponsor Ballot
- Sponsor Ballot to IEEE-SA Standards Board Approval Process
- IEEE-SA Standards Board Approval Process to Publish Standard

Timeframes:
- Maximum of 4 years
- Maximum of 5 years

Additional Process:
- Reaffirm, revise, or withdraw standards
Overview

- Role of Project Editor
- Ingredients for successful standards development
- Importance of Editorial Coordination
Role of the IEEE Standards Project Editor

- Supplies style templates/electronic text and figures for revisions
- Offers editorial coordination and reviews, meeting support and advise
- Enables efficient pre-approval editing and swift post-approval publication
IEEE Project Editor

- Does the final copy edit of text
- Ensures that technical integrity of the document is maintained
- Formats electronic text into proofs
- Works with Working Group Chair and/or Technical Editor during review of final document
- Incorporates Chair’s corrections/comments into the document
- PUBLISHES NEW STANDARD!
Ingredients for successful standards development

- Use templates provided
  - Saves time and effort on both the Working Group and Editorial side
- Select a Technical Editor
  - Will ensure consistency, gather and incorporate all contributions and comments
  - Will work closely with an IEEE Project Editor to help speed the process to publication
- Assign writing among Working Group members
  - Divide up each topic or clause according to members’ expertise
Ingredients (continued)

- Avoid writing the draft during meetings
  - Working group meetings should only be used for reviewing important points in the draft and resolving areas of disagreement

- Use the *IEEE Style Manual*
  - Many groups make the mistake of ignoring the style manual, and avoidable errors occur
Ingredients (continued)

- Schedule regular editorial reviews
  - Include in project plan
- IEEE Standards Project Editor will review your drafts and offer comments to the Chair for consideration
  - Copyright statements, title, draft numbering, trademarks, references, definitions, bibliography, figures, tables, introduction, use of metrics, and more…
When the first draft is complete, utilize the resources of the IEEE Project Editor

- Carefully considering the comments of the IEEE Project Editor can save you time and hassle later on.
- RevCom considers whether the editorial suggestions have been implemented.
- Can help get your standard published quicker.
- Waiting for the editorial coordination during Sponsor ballot is not recommended.
The IEEE Standards Ballot Invitation Process
*Forming a Balloting Group*
Ballot Invitation

- A process used to form a Ballot Group
  - For a new standard under development
  - For the reaffirmation, revision, or withdrawal of an existing standard
- A single-page form or an email sent to members of an existing Balloting Pool asking if they would like to join an upcoming Ballot Group
  - Requests information about each person’s relationship to the standard (classification)
    - e.g., are they a user, producer, government, general interest
The Balloting Pool

- A database of persons grouped by an expressed, common interest in a specific area of standards activity as maintained by the IEEE balloting center
- Working group members are not automatically members of the balloting pool or group
- Anyone may request to join a Balloting Pool simply by signing up
  - Available on the IEEE Standards website
Signing Up for Balloting Pools

Request Form To Join an IEEE Balloting Pool

Sponsor Level Balloting Groups are generally formed from individuals in a Balloting Pool. You should use this form to request to become a member of these balloting pools.

As standards projects from within specific disciplines are nearing the Sponsor Ballot stage, individuals who belong to the relevant balloting pool will receive an “Invitation to Ballot”. Those who respond positively to these Invitations (and who are IEEE Standards Association members or pay a per-ballot fee) will then form the Balloting Group for that project.

All applicable information on this form must be filled in. You may use the tab key to move between fields. Please click the submit button at the bottom of the page when you are finished.

First Name: [ ]
Last Name: [ ]
Company: [ ]
Street Address: [ ]
PO Box/Mail Stop: [ ]
Signing Up for Balloting Pools

I understand that before I can actually participate in any IEEE Sponsor Ballot, I must be an active member of the IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) or pay a per-ballot fee. Note: Membership in the IEEE-SA is in addition to your IEEE membership. Details on joining the IEEE-SA are available here.

For further information on how signing up for balloting pools will assist you with IEEE Standards electronic balloting, go here.

---

**Balloting Pool Selection**

Please sign me up for the following Balloting Pool(s):

---

**ANTENNAS AND PROPAGATION (choose all that apply)**

- [ ] Antennas
- [ ] Propagation

You can sign up for as many balloting pools as you would like.
Signing Up for Balloting Pools

You can add any comments you would like concerning the balloting pool signup.

Optional Comments:

Please click on the **Submit** button to enroll yourself in the selected balloting pool(s), or click on **Clear Form** to clear the information and start over.

When complete, submit the form or clear it if necessary.
The Ballot Invitation Process

- The IEEE Standards Sponsor issues a call to begin formation of the *Ballot Group* when a specific IEEE standards project nears the Sponsor Ballot stage.
- The Ballot Invitation form is sent out to all appropriate persons comprising the Balloting Pool for that discipline.
- If a party is interested in participating in the Sponsor Ballot, the person simply fills out and returns the Ballot Invitation form.
  - Those responding comprise the Ballot Group:
    - Must be members of the IEEE-SA or pay a per-ballot fee.
    - Receive a confirmation email (if an electronic ballot).
The Ballot Invitation Process
(continued)

example:

Power Engineering/
Transformers
Balloting Pool

Ballot Invitations are sent out to the appropriate set of persons comprising the *Balloting Pool* for that discipline. Those who respond (and who are either IEEE-SA members or pay a per-ballot fee) comprise the *Ballot Group* for that specific standards project.

IEEE Standards
Balloting Center

PXX.XX
Ballot Group

Returned Invitations

Ballot Invitation
Answering a Ballot Invitation

IEEE Standards Association Balloting Center

Balloting Group Signup

You are requesting to be added to the following balloting group:

- **Group Number:** 0000297
- **Description:** 1361/D5

**Contact information for the Working Group Chair:**

- **Working Group Chair:** jaympac@acm.com
- **Sponsor:** Standards Coordinating Committee 21
- **Title:** Guide for the Selection, Test and Evaluation of Lead-Acid Batteries for Stand Alone Photovoltaic (PV) Systems
- **Purpose:** This guide is a tutorial on lead-acid battery technology, and how battery operating characteristics and PV system performance are interrelated. The guide provides the PV system designer with information on applicable lead-acid battery type designs. Electrical, physical, mechanical and environmental characteristics are discussed. PV system parameters and operating conditions are discussed in relation to battery characteristics and expected system performance. Parameters to optimize the system are suggested to help in the selection of a battery selection and system parameters is provided, included discussion on how to interpret test results. This guide is applicable to all stand-alone PV systems where PV is the only charging source. This guide does not include hybrid systems.
- **Invitation Response Deadline:** 2002-07-14

**The Sponsor of the standards activity**

- **The IEEE project number and the number of the draft being balloted**

**The deadline for signing up to ballot—you must respond to the invitation by midnight Eastern time of the date shown**
**Answering a Ballot Invitation**

You must be a current IEEE-SA member to ballot, or pay a per-ballot fee. To join the Standards Association, [Click here](#).

If you wish to proceed, please fill out and submit this form:

*(All fields are required)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Last Name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEEE-SA Number (All eight digits required)</td>
<td>This is the same as your IEEE number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Mail Address</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone Number (for contact if your e-mail address bounces)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Company</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Street Address</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State/Province</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZIP or postal code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interest categories are determined by the Sponsor. The four listed here are the default categories used by most Sponsor Working Groups. You need to identify yourself as one of the interest categories given, in relation to the subject of the project.
The Ballot Group

- The set of persons who ultimately vote on the proposed standard
  - Formed from those persons who have returned a Ballot Invitation
- By returning the Ballot Invitation, a person incurs and accepts certain obligations
Ballot Group Obligations

- First, they agree to pay the appropriate fees associated with balloting privileges.
- Secondly, they agree to review the document in question and to return their ballots and comments on the document by the specified deadline.
- Third, they agree to remain members of the Ballot Group for the life of the project.
Advantages of the Ballot Invitation Process

- Helps ensure an open process
- Ensures that only those who have actively expressed an interest in participating in the IEEE Standards Sponsor Ballot are actually involved
- Reduces probability of recirculations or failed ballots resulting from unreturned ballots by “disinterested” parties
- Ensures a balanced Ballot Group by collecting the proper classifications (producer, user, etc.)
- Provides the IEEE Standards Balloting Center with current contact information
Sponsor Balloting
Overview of Process

1. Idea!

2. Project Approval Process
   - Develop Draft Standard (in Working Group)
   - Sponsor Ballot
   - IEEE-SA Standards Board Approval Process
   - Publish Standard

3. Reaffirm, revise, or withdraw standards

Maximum of 4 years
Maximum of 5 years
Balloting

- The process through which consensus on a proposed standard is achieved
The Ballot Process

- Formation of the Balloting Group
- Issuing Ballots
- Review and Voting Period
- Closing
- Ballot Summary
- Recirculation Ballots
- Additional Resources
The Balloting Group

- The Balloting Group consists of those persons who review and vote on the document (along with coordination entities).
- The Balloting Group must be “balanced,” i.e., not dominated by any single interest group.
- Once formed, a Balloting Group cannot change until the close of the ballot (including any recirculations).
Issuing Ballots

- Ballots can be either electronic or paper
  - Electronic is preferred
- For an electronic ballot:
  - An email is sent from the IEEE Standards Balloting Center to the Balloting Group
    - Contains instructions on how to ballot
    - Includes URLs for voting, registering comments, and downloading the document and any comment resolution forms
Review and Voting Period

- A ballot will typically remain open for a 30-day period
- The ballot announcement will indicate a closing date, by which time the ballot must be returned to the IEEE offices for the vote to be recorded
- Because of the 75% return requirement, it is very important that ballots be returned
- Ballots with negative votes should contain comments explaining the negative vote, and a proposed resolution
Closing

- The ballot is closed at midnight Eastern time on the closing date indicated on the ballot form
  - If a 75% return has not been achieved, the ballot can be extended for up to 60 days
- Ballots received after the closing date will not have their votes recorded
The Ballot

IEEE Standards Ballot for P958/D7

This ballot closes at 2002-07-17, 11:59 PM Eastern Time.
You can also access the comment form and the draft being balloted directly from this page.

Balloter Information
IEEE Number: 
Name: 
E-mail: 
Phone: 
FAX: 
Co/Org: 

All contact information must be supplied

Vote: 

Do not select type 'Coordination' unless you are fulfilling official Coordination duties.

In accordance with 5.4.3.1 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual, balloters with negative votes are strongly encouraged to submit comments with specific reasons in sufficient detail so that exact wording of the changes that will cause the negative voter to change his or her vote to "approve" can readily be determined. In the absence of comments with a negative vote, the vote shall be counted in the total tally of negative votes, but the Sponsor is not required either to respond to or recirculate these negative votes.
IEEE Standards Ballot Comment for P958/D7

(This ballot closes at 2002-07-17, 11:59 PM Eastern Time.)
You can also access the ballot form and the draft being balloted directly from this page.

If you have a file of comments already prepared to submit in XML, please skip to the Submit Prepared XML Comments section.

If you have a Microsoft Word document or a file of graphics/binary data to submit, please skip to the Submit Graphics/Binary Data section.

Commenter Information
- IEEE Number:
- Name:
- E-mail:
- Phone:
- FAX:
- Co/Org:

Balloter supplies contact information. Do NOT fill this out here if you are going to submit multiple comments. Skip to the Submit Graphics/Binary Data section.
This part of the comments page is used to submit individual comments, one by one!

The Comments Page (part 1)

Comment
Page: (If your comment is not related to a specific page number, enter "general"
in this field.)
Line:
Subclause: (e.g. 40.4.2)
Comment
Type: Please select your comment type
Comment: Do not select type 'Coordination' unless you are fulfilling official Coordination duties.
Suggested Remedy:

When this is clicked, the individual comment is submitted.
The Comments Page (part 2)

Use this part of the page to submit an XML file that has already been prepared offline and that you're now ready to turn in. You should fill in the contact information on the top of the comments page (as shown previously)

Submit Prepared XML Comments

Please note: Comment files that are not in the specified XML format will be rejected, if you attempt to submit them via this XML upload interface.

Select an XML comment file to upload from your computer to the IEEE Standards Association Balloting Center:

Browse... Upload XML file now
Use this part of the page to submit comments in an Excel file, in a database format, as a Word file, or as a graphical file.

The Comments Page (part 3)

Submit Microsoft Word/Graphics/Binary Data as Comment

Please note: Graphics/binary data will not be processed in any meaningful way by IEEE Standards Association Balloting Center staff, but merely passed along to the working group along with any accompanying explanation that you enter here.

1. Select a file to upload from your computer to the IEEE Standards Association Balloting Center:

   Browse...

2. Fill in the form fields below, then click "Upload file now".

   File Description

   File type (examples: Microsoft Word, TIFF, PNG, or MPEG-2)

   Accompanying explanation

Choose the file from your computer

You must fill this part in

If you'd like to add a note, perhaps the number of comments included within the file, put it here
The Comments Page (part 3)

Commenter Information
- IEEE Number:
- Name:
- E-mail:
- Phone:
- FAX:
- Co/Org:

Comment
- Page:
- Line:
- Subclause: (e.g., 40.4.2)
- Comment Type:

Once you have selected your file and entered your comment and information, click here to upload the file.

Fill in your information here if you intend to submit an attached file as your comments.

Fill in if this applies to the draft.

Do not select type 'Coordination' unless you are fulfilling official Coordination duties.
The Ballot Summary

- The Ballot Summary contains
  - A tally of the voting, along with a calculation of return rate and abstention rate percentages
  - A roster of all votes, and whether any comments were submitted
  - Copies of all comments that were received
  - Copies of coordination comments
Recirculation Ballots

- The results of the initial ballot may require a recirculation ballot if
  - Comments from the Balloting Group were received that result in the Working Group making technical changes to the draft
  - Unresolved or rejected negative votes or comments remain
Recirculation Ballots (continued)

- Recirculation Ballots are conducted like the initial ballot, except
  - Voters may only comment/vote on changed areas of the draft
  - The review period is typically reduced to 10 days (plus any necessary distribution time)
  - There is no obligation to return the ballot unless voters wish to change their original vote
- The results of a Recirculation Ballot may produce additional recirculations for the same reasons as an initial ballot
Additional Resources

- Balloting Center Reports
  (http://standards.ieee.org/db/balloting)

- FAQs - Balloting Service
  (http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/ballotserv.html)

- FAQs - Ballot Formation
  (http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/ballotform.html)

- FAQs - Coordination
  (http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/coor.html)

- FAQs - Balloting
  (http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/ballot.html)
Additional Resources (continued)

- The IEEE Standards Companion
  (http://standards.ieee.org/guides/companion/index.html)
  (http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/index.html)
- Standards Process-at-a-Glance
  (http://standards.ieee.org/resources/glance.html)
Approving the Standard
The Review Committee (RevCom)

- Review Committee (RevCom) recommends approval or disapproval of the project to the Standards Board
- Submittal must match information on PAR
- Standards Board meets in March, June, September, December
- All major standards-developing Societies are represented on RevCom
  - FYI: Howard Frazier is Chair of RevCom
  - FYI: Jim Carlo is Chair of Standards Board
Before submitting the draft to RevCom, be sure to review the following!

- Copyright notices
- Structure, completeness, and clarity
- References vs. Bibliography
- (Normative vs. Informative)
- Copyright/trademark issues
- Use of *shall*, *should*, *may*, *must*, *can*, *warning*, *caution*, *etc.*
- Use metric units
- Track draft numbering
Pitfalls

- Inappropriate and/or inadequate negative comment resolution during Sponsor ballot
- Inadequate tracking of comment resolution (seek advice from 802® veterans)
- Not addressing all negative comments during Sponsor ballot
Pitfalls (continued)

- Submitting a draft for approval by RevCom that does not match the Scope and Purpose of the PAR
- Submitting a draft for approval by RevCom without proper title, draft number, draft dates
- Submitting a draft for approval by RevCom without addressing IEEE Staff comments recommended in Editorial Review
- Changing the approved draft after it is approved by RevCom-----DON’T DO IT!
Publishing the Standard
Overview of Process

Idea!


Reaffirm, revise, or withdraw standards

Maximum of 4 years

Maximum of 5 years
Publication scheduling

- After Standards Board approval, set aside time to review the edited standard before publication
  - Electronic files of document are turned over to IEEE Staff
  - IEEE Project Editor will contact the Working Group Chair to discuss publication schedule
Publication (continued)

- IEEE Project Editor edits the approved standard
  - Document is thoroughly edited for consistency and style, however, no technical changes are made
- All changes are marked and submitted to Chair for review
- 2 to 3 weeks are given for final comments
- Chair’s comments are incorporated into the document and the standard is published
Maintenance and revisions

- Amendments include both editorial and technical changes to a standard
- Corrigendum contain technical changes only
- Both amendments and corrigendum require new PARs
- Development and approval process are the same as for a new standard
Questions?
Contacts

Angela Ortiz – Program Manager
a.ortiz@ieee.org/732-562-3809

Jennifer Longman –
Managing Editor, Standards Information
and Industry Publishing
j.longman@ieee.org/732-562-6355
Thank you for your participation in the IEEE Standards Development Process.