P802.1CBec
Guidance for Sequence Recovery Function Parameter Configuration

Resolution of Comments on

Project Authorization Request (PAR) and Criteria for Standards Development (CSD)

2024-11-13

802.3 comments on the PAR and their resolution

- Comment:
  5.2.b: there is a statement "This amendment also includes technical and editorial corrections in the description of existing IEEE Std 802.1CB functionality." For clarification how is this scope different from the revision PAR at
  https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2024/cb-Hantel-draft-PAR-0924-v01.pdf
  Suggest to clarify the difference in the text.

- Response:
  There is overlap at the moment; however, we do not know the timeline of both projects and their relation. The P802.1CB revision may be done before P802.1CBec. In that case, we would like to have the possibility to address technical and editorial corrections in the description of existing IEEE Std 802.1CB functionality that are brought to the attention of the Working Group after the conclusion of the 802.1CB revision. Therefore, keep the sentence in the scope of the P802.1CBec project.
  The text in 5.2.b scope of the project is not a good place to capture this aspect.

802.3 comments on the CSD and their resolution

- Comment:
  In 1.2.3, it is our understanding that the base specification already "addresses the setting of parameters" and that this project would be adding an informative annex to provide information on setting the parameters.
  Suggest to change "addresses the setting of parameters" to "addresses the recommended setting of parameters"

- Response:
  The suggested change has been made.

- Comment:
  In 1.2.4, the first sentence of the response is unclear as to the expected output of the project. Is the output expected to be a process or flow to set parameter values or is it a recommended set of values to use for the parameters? Please clarify.

- Response:
  The expected output of the project is a recommended set of values to use for the parameters.
  Changed the first sentence to: "The informative annex provides formulas to determine a recommended set of values to use for existing parameters."

802.3 comments on the CSD and their resolution – cont'd

- Comment:
In 1.2.5, there is a similar lack of clarity on the output of the project as in 1.2.4. Please clarify if the output expected to be a process or flow to set parameter values or a recommended set of values to use for the parameters.

- Response:
The expected output of the project is a recommended set of values to use for the parameters.
Changed the text to:
"This project will not add new functionality, hence no impact on cost or complexity. The amendment does not imply additional hardware cost as it only provides formulas to determine a recommended set of values for setting existing parameters. The provided recommended set of values to use for the existing parameters and the provided guidelines could potentially lower implementation costs by reducing over-provisioning for memory (required for the sequence recovery function and buffering)."

802.11 comments on the PAR and their resolution

- Comment:
5.2.b: The Scope of the project is a long introductory sentence.
Suggest adding a comma "function parameters, and provides guidance".

- Response:
The suggested change has been made.

- Comment:
5.2.b: This amendment also includes technical and editorial corrections in the description of existing IEEE Std 802.1CB functionality." this overlaps the P802.1CB revision PAR and would not be needed as both PARs are in progress at the same time. The Revision Project should be able to address these corrections.
Consider if this statement is really needed.

- Response:
There is overlap at the moment; however, we do not know the timeline of both projects and their relation. The P802.1CB revision may be done before P802.1CBec. In that case, we would like to have the possibility to address technical and editorial corrections in the description of existing IEEE Std 802.1CB functionality that are brought to the attention of the Working Group after the conclusion of the 802.1CB revision. Therefore, keep the sentence in the scope of the P802.1CBec project.

802.11 comments on the CSD and their resolution

- No comments.

802.15 comments on the PAR and CSD and their resolution

- PAR
  - No comments.

- CSD
  - No comments.