

This provides responses to comments ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 ballot of IEEE Std 802f-2023.

The voting results on IEEE Std 802f-2023 are in SC6 N18256:

- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 9/0/10
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS ballot? 8/0/11
- 1 comment with the China NB vote.

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606. This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to the comments by China NB on this ballot.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE Std 802f-2023:

For IEEE 802-2014 and its amendments, China has clearly suggested that the IEEE should use OID to unify the management of the resources involved in the IEEE 802 standard. Unfortunately, our suggestion has not been adopted, resulting in the lack of a feasible and effective way to manage the relevant network resources in the current IEEE 802.

With this resource management issue not properly addressed, we do not support IEEE 802f-2023 go forward FDIS as it's the amendment of IEEE 802-2014.

Proposed Change:

It is strongly suggested that IEEE use OID to unify the management of the resources involved in the IEEE 802 standard.

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE Std 802f-2023:

IEEE Std 802f-2023, IEEE Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Network: Overview and Architecture - Amendment 3: YANG Data Model for EtherTypes, is an amendment to IEEE Std 802-2014, Overview and Architecture (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-A:2015) as previously amended by IEEE Std 802d-2017 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-A:2015/Amd 1:2018) and IEEE Std 802c-2017 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-A:2015/Amd 2:2019). This amendment defines additional fields (e.g., friendly name, short description, reference) of the EtherType public listing, identifies a subset of well-known EtherTypes, and provides a YANG module representation of the subset.

This amendment does not change Clause 7.2.3, Managed object definitions, item c) that states: “An address that allows the management protocol to specifically communicate with the managed object in question. In IEEE 802 this is done with an object identifier (OID), as described in Clause 10” but enhances it by permitting use of a URN with the additional text “or a Uniform Resource Name (URN), as described in Clause 11.”

Furthermore, OID-based identifiers are supported and specified in Clause 10 of the base standard (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-A:2015). ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-A:2015 specifies construction of a protocol identifier as an extension of the 24-bit unique OUI assigned to an organization. The proposed amendment would provide for a 24-bit unique CID to be used as an alternative to the 24-bit unique OUI. The OUI and CID lie in non-overlapping regions of the same 24-bit number space, so the amendment supports additional organizational assignments.

Without technical substantiation of any related concerns, IEEE 802 cannot consider modification of the existing IEEE 802 or ISO standards.