

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	-------------------------	-----------------	-------------------	----------------	----------------------

Results of Ballot on Draft Standard D3.0

General comments, comments on first clauses and on Annexes and Resolutions

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
1.	?	maf	t	Y		Need an explicit statement that CF-POLL and other CF frame types shall not be used outside of the CF-period.	Statement added in D3.1 Accepted
2.	0	RM	T	Y	<p>At least one company has indicated that it holds specific patent claims for which licensing will be necessary to implement the standard. The revised IEEE patent policy detailed in document 96/14 requires that there be <i>Compelling Technical Justification</i> to include a patented feature. The required analysis to determine technical justification has not been performed for the patent claims indicated in document 96/5 the patents generally cited in 96/5a.</p> <p>Furthermore, the committee has an obligation to make a reasonable effort to determine what additional patents may be applicable to the draft standard, and make conscious decisions when to include patented technology or employ public domain, i.e., <i>royalty free</i>, alternatives. Otherwise we may burden the standard with commercially unacceptable royalties or limit the international acceptance of this standard.</p> <p>It appears that the intent, if not the letter, of the revised patent policy was correctly considered in the process used to include the WEP algorithm in the standard (a licensable trade secret rather than a patent). This same model must be used for other relevant intellectual</p>		Closed without action by plenary vote, since comment is not technical in nature. The group believes it has been addressing these issues with due diligence.

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					property as well.		
3.	A.1	db	E	Y	missing paren	a) By the user, or potential user, of the implementation, as a basis for initially checking the possibility of interworking with another implementation (note that, while interworking can never be guaranteed, failure to interwork can often be predicted from incompatible PICS proformas).	Accepted
4.	A.2.1	db	E	Y	missing reference = A.xxxxx	Correct or remove reference.	Accepted
5.	A.3.1	db	T	Y	The sentence was incorrect. Clause A.4.4 is the MAC and must always be present. Only one PHY is required, and also only one PHY may be present in a single instance of an implementation. The MAC does not handle multiple PHYs simultaneously within a single implementation instance.	The PICS proforma for a station consists of clauses A.4.1, thru A.4.2, A.4.3 and A.4.4 inclusive, and at least one of A.4.4 5 , A.4.5 6 , or and A.4.7 6 corresponding to the for each PHY implemented.	Accepted
6.	A.3.4	db	T	Y	The text in this section says "...where "<pred>" is a predicate as described below,...", but no def of <pred> is given that I can find. The missing definition must be provided or the annex can not be interpreted correctly.	provide missing information re <pred>	Accepted
7.	A.4	sb	T	n	PCF conformance statement incomplete (section 6.8), wrong numbering and reflects D2.1 protocol.	See paper on reformatting, corrected and completed PICS (SAB)	Accepted
8.	A.4.3 A.4.4 A.4.5 A.4.6 A.4.7	db	T	Y	The clause references are all incorrect. They need to be corrected.	Correct all section refs to make annex consistent with the Draft clauses.	Accepted

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
9.	A.4.3	db	T	Y	<p>This section needs major work - it is simply more incorrect than correct.</p> <p>Item 2: All implementations are STAs. All APs are STAs (See definition clauses). Therefore this capability is a mandatory requirement not an option. Change it's status to M.</p> <p>Item 3: This is dependant on item 1, the PCF is required to reside in an AP, so if impl can't do AP it can't do PCF - item is not shown as conditional.</p> <p>Item 4: this is not an option. No text in the draft makes it an option, all stations must be Cf aware I believe. Make status = M</p> <p>Item 5: this is propoerly an option, if wep is implemented then I believe shared key auth shall also be implemented, thus this is part of a set, but it is represnted as an independant item.</p> <p>Item 6: This is not an option - if a STA can be an AP and it supports the frame formats then it supprot WDS from the 802.11 point of view. Note that something more than 802.11 may be required to create a WDS, but that is not relevant to the 802.11 PICs.</p> <p>Item 7: throw this item away and start over. The correct question is: Does the impl support exactly one of the specified PHYs? If so, which one?</p>	<p>Correct the section to repair at least the errors noted at left.</p>	<p>Accepted New predicate clauses defined</p>
10.	A.4.4 1.2	db	T	Y	<p>w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.</p>	<p>Defines several physical layer (PHY) signaling techniques and interface functions that shall may be controlled by the</p>	<p>Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96</p>

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						802.11 MAC.	
11.	A.4.4 3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	ESS Basic Rate Set. The set of data transfer rates which all the stations in an ESS shall ^{must} be capable of using to receive frames from the WM.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
12.	A.4.4 3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Net Allocation Vector (NAV). An indicator, maintained by each station, of time periods when transmission onto the WM shall ^{may} not be initiated by the station whether or not the Station's CCA function senses the WM as being busy.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
13.	A.4.4 5.1.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Because of limitations on wireless PHY ranges, wireless LANs intended to cover reasonable geographic distances may ^{must} be built from basic coverage building blocks.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
14.	A.4.4 5.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	The association between a STA and a BSS is dynamic (STAs turn on, turn off, come within range and go out of range). To become a member of an infrastructure BSS a station shall ^{must} become "Associated".	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
15.	A.4.4 5.3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	802.11 has chosen to use the IEEE 802 48 bit address space (see clause 4). Thus 802.11 addresses shall ^{will} be compatible with, and unique within, the address space used by the 802 LAN family.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						The 802.11 choice of address space implies that for many instantiations of the 802.11 architecture, the wired LAN MAC address space and the 802.11 MAC address space may will be the same. In those	
16.	A.4.4 5.4.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Messages received from an integrated LAN (via a Portal) by the DS for an 802.11 STA shall will invoke the Integration Service before the message is distributed by the Distribution Service.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
17.	A.4.4 5.4.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	required for the Distribution Service to operate is provided by the Association services. Before a data message may can be handled by the Distribution service, a STA shall must be "Associated".	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
18.	A.4.4 5.4.2.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Before a STA is allowed to send a data message via an AP, it shall must first become associated with the AP. The act of becoming associated invokes the Association service which provides the STA to AP	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
19.	A.4.4 5.4.2.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The Disassociation Service is invoked whenever an existing Association is to must be terminated. Disassociation is a Distribution System Service. In an ESS this tells the DS to void existing association information. Attempts to send messages to a	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						<p>disassociated STA shall will be unsuccessful.</p> <p>The Disassociation Service may can be invoked by either party to an Association (STA or AP). Disassociation is a notification, not a request. Disassociation cannot be refused by either party to the association.</p> <p>APs may might need to disassociate STAs to enable the AP to be removed from a network for service or for other reasons.</p>	
20.	A.4.4 5.4.3.1.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	<p>use), the Authentication service may can be invoked independently of the Association service.</p> <p>Pre-authentication is typically done by a STA while it is already associated with an AP (which it previously authenticated with). 802.11 does not require that STAs pre-authenticate with APs. However, Authentication shall be required before an Association may can be established.</p> <p>If the Authentication is left until Reassociation time, this may impact the speed with which a STA may can Reassociate between APs, limiting BSS-transition mobility performance.</p> <p>The use of Pre-authentication</p>	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
21.	A.4.4 5.4.3.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was	The Deauthentication Service is invoked whenever an existing	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Authentication is to must be terminated.	
22.	A.4.4 5.4.3.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The Deauthentication Service may be invoked by either authenticated party (mobile STA or AP). Deauthentication is not a request, it is a notification. Deauthentication shall not be refused by either party.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
23.	A.4.4 5.4.3.3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The default privacy state for all 802.11 Stations is "in the clear". If the Privacy Service is not invoked, all messages shall will be sent unencrypted. If this default is not acceptable to one party or the other, Data frames shall will not be successfully communicated between the LLC entities. Unencrypted Data frames	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
24.	A.4.4 5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	As noted previously some services shall must be completed successfully before others may be invoked.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
25.	A.4.4 5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deauthentication Deauthentication notification when in state 2 changes the Station's state from 2 to 1. The Station shall must become Authenticated again prior to sending class 2 frames. 	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
26.	A.4.4 5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disassociation Disassociation notification changes a Stations state from 3 to 2. This Station shall must become Associated again if it wishes to utilize the DS. • Deauthentication Deauthentication notification when in state 3 implies Disassociation as well, changing the Station's state from 3 to 1. The station shall must become Authenticated again prior to another Association. 	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
27.	A.4.4 5.6	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	An independent BSS consists of STAs which are directly connected. Thus there is with (by definition) only be one BSS. Further, since there is no <u>physical</u> DS, there cannot be a Portal, an integrated wired LAN, or	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
28.	A.4.4 5.7	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Each Service is supported by one or more 802.11 messages. This clause specifies the information items which shall must be minimally present in the messages to support the service.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
29.	A.4.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically	When a Station wishes to send data to	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
	5.7.1				incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	another Station it sends a Data message. In an ESS the message shall will be handled by the Distribution Service. In an ad hoc case, the Data message is sent directly. The	
30.	A.4.4 5.7.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Information Items: IEEE address of the station which is being disassociated. This shall may be a broadcast address in the case of an AP disassociating with all Associated Stations.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
31.	A.4.4 6.1.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	This service provides peer LLC entities with the ability to exchange MAC Service Data Units. To support this service, the local MAC shall use the underlying PHY-level services to transport an MSDU to a peer MAC entity, where it may be delivered to the peer LLC. Such asynchronous MSDU transport is performed on a best-effort connectionless basis. There are no guarantees that the submitted MSDU shall be delivered successfully. Broadcast and multicast transport is part of the asynchronous data	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
32.	A.4.4 6.1.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	intentionally reorder MSDUs. However, since MSDUs may can transit a DS, and a DS may might reorder MSDUs, it is not possible for the MAC	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						to guarantee MSDU ordering.	
33.	A.4.4 6.2.1.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	When Generated This primitive is generated by the LLC sublayer entity whenever a MSDU is to must be transferred to a peer LLC sublayer entity or entities.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
34.	A.4.4 6.2.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The source_address parameter shall must be an individual address as specified by the SA field of the incoming frame.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
35.	A.4.4 7.1.3.1. 7	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	particular STA within a frame sequence defined in clause 4.4. The value shall indicate the mode in which the station shall will be after the completion of the frame sequence. A value of '1' shall indicate that the STA shall will be in Power Save Mode. A value of '0' shall indicate that the STA shall will be in Active Mode. This field shall always be set to '0' in frames transmitted by an AP.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
36.	A.4.4 7.1.3.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	that has been processed by the WEP algorithm. The WEP field shall may only be set to '1' within frames of Type Data and frames of Type Management, Subtype Authentication. The WEP field shall be set to '0' in	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
37.	A.4.4 7.1.3.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	source address, destination address, transmitting station address and receiving station address. The usage of the four address fields in each frame type is will be indicated by the abbreviations BSSID, DA, SA, RA, TA indicating BSS Identifier, Destination Address, Source Address, Receiver Address and Transmitter Address, respectively. Some frames may not contain omit some of the address fields.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
38.	A.4.4 7.2.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	A station shall use the contents of Address 1 field to perform address matching for receive decisions. In cases where the Address 1 field contains a group address, the BSSID shall must also be validated to ensure that the broadcast, or multicast originated in the same BSS.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
39.	A.4.4 7.3.1.6	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The Listen Interval field shall be used to indicate to the AP how often an STA shall will wake to listen to Beacon Management Frames. The value of this parameter shall be the STA's aListen_Interval MIB	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
40.	A.4.4 7.3.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The DTIM Count field shall indicate how many Beacons (including the current frame) shall will appear before the next DTIM. A DTIM Count of 0 shall indicate that the current TIM is a DTIM. The DTIM	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
41.	A.4.4 7.3.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey	in the bitmap are all 0. In this case, the Bitmap Offset subfield value shall will contain the number N1, and the Length	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					operational requirements.	field shall will be set to $(N2 - N1 + 4)$.	
42.	A.4.4 7.3.2.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	The Supported Rates element shall specify all the rates which this station is capable of receiving. The information field is encoded as 1 to 8 octets where each octet describes a single supported rate in units of 100 kbit/s (e.g. a 1 Mbps rate shall will be encoded as 0x0A).	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
43.	A.4.4 7.3.2.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	CFP_Count shall indicate how many DTIMs (including the current frame) shall will appear before the next CFP start. A CFP_Count of 0 shall indicate that the current DTIM marks the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
44.	A.4.4 8.1.2.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	what it believes to be the shared WEP key. It shall then compare the challenge text recovered to that sent in frame 2 of the sequence. If they are the same then the two stations must have the same shared key. This	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
45.	A.4.4 8.3.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	this section. All MIB variables that hold WEP keys are externally read-only - the contents shall may not be read via MAC management SAPs. See Clause 8 for the formal MIB variable definitions.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
46.	A.4.4 9.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	of the distributed coordination function. This access method uses a point coordinator, which shall must operate at the access point of the BSS, to determine which station currently has the right to transmit. The	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
47.	A.4.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically	When a frame is received from the LLC	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
	9.1.4				incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	with a MSDU size greater than aFragmentation_Threshold, the frame shall must be fragmented. The MSDU is divided into MPDUs. Each MPDU is a fragment with a	
48.	A.4.4 9.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	frame and the returning ACK frame. All stations within the reception range of either the originating station (which transmits the RTS) or the destination station (which transmits the CTS) shall will learn of the medium reservation. Thus a station may can be "hidden" from the originating station and still know about the impending use of the medium to transmit a data frame.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
49.	A.4.4 9.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The RTS/CTS mechanism shall can not be used for broadcast and multicast frames because there are multiple destinations. This mechanism need not be used for every data frame transmission. Because the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
50.	A.4.4 9.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	A STA configured not to initiate the RTS/CTS mechanism shall must still update its Virtual Carrier Sense mechanism with the duration information contained in an RTS or CTS frame, and shall must always respond to an RTS addressed to it with a CTS.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
51.	A.4.4 9.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The medium access protocol allows for stations to support different sets of data rates. All STAs shall must receive all the Basic Rate Set and transmit at one or more of the Basic Rate Set data	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						rates. To support the proper operation of the RTS/CTS and the Virtual Carrier Sense mechanism, all STAs shall <u>must</u> be able to detect the RTS and CTS frames. For this reason the RTS and CTS frames shall <u>must</u> be transmitted at one of these mandatory rates.	
52.	A.4.4 9.2.3.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The SIFS timing shall <u>will</u> be achieved when the transmission of the subsequent frame is started at the Tx_SIFS Slot boundary as specified in clause Error! Reference source not found.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
53.	A.4.4 9.2.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	<u>deliver an MPDU.</u> The CW shall <u>will</u> remain at a value of aCWmax for the remaining retries. This	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
54.	A.4.4 9.2.5.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	A STA in backoff shall <u>must</u> monitor the medium for carrier activity during backoff slots. If no carrier	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
55.	A.4.4 9.2.5.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	the backoff timer shall not be decrement for that slot; The medium shall <u>must</u> be sensed as idle for the duration of a DIFS period before the backoff procedure is allowed to resume. Transmission shall	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
56.	A.4.4 9.2.5.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The effect of this procedure is that when multiple stations are deferring and go into random backoff, then the station selecting the lowest delay through the random function shall <u>will</u> win the contention. The advantage of	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						this approach is that stations that lost contention shall <u>will</u> defer again until after the next medium busy event, and will then likely have a shorter backoff delay than new stations entering the	
57.	A.4.4 9.2.5.3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	required to transmit the ACK frame plus a SIFS . Since this pending transmission is a retransmission attempt the CW shall <u>will</u> be increased (per the backoff rules). This process shall continue until the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
58.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	MSDU have been sent, an acknowledgment is not received, or the station is <u>restricted from</u> can not sending any additional fragments due to a dwell time boundary. Should the sending of the fragments be	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
59.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	When the source station releases the channel following its fragment, it shall <u>will</u> immediately monitor the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
60.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	fragment and receive an acknowledgment due to an impending dwell boundary, it shall <u>will</u> contend for	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
61.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	If the source station does not receive an acknowledgment frame, it shall <u>will</u> attempt to retransmit according to the backoff algorithm. When the time arrives to retransmit the fragment, the source station shall <u>will</u> contend for access in the contention window.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
62.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey	After a station contends for the channel to retransmit a fragment of a MSDU, it shall <u>will</u> start with the last fragment that	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					operational requirements.	<p>was not acknowledged. The destination station willreceives the fragments in order (since the source sends them one at a time, in order). It is possible however, that the destination station may receive duplicate fragments. It shall be the responsibility of the receiving station to discard duplicate fragments. This maywill occur if the destination station sends an acknowledgment and the source does not receive it. The source shallwill retransmit the same fragment after executing the backoff algorithm and contending for the channel.</p> <p>A station shallwill transmit after the SIFS only under the following conditions during a fragment burst:</p>	
63.	A.4.4 9.2.5.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	If a multiple fragment MSDU does not require an acknowledgment (for example, a broadcast/multicast packet transmitted by the Access Point), the source station shall will transmit all fragments of the MSDU without releasing the channel, as long as there is enough time left in the dwell time. If there is not, the station shall will transmit as many fragments as possible and recontend for the channel during the next dwell time. The spacing between fragments of a broadcast/multicast frame shall be equal to the SIFS	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
64.	A.4.4 9.2.5.6	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was	The following is a description of using RTS/CTS for the first fragment of a	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	fragmented MSDU. RTS/CTS may will also be used for retransmitted fragments if their size warrants it. The RTS/CTS frames define the	
65.	A.4.4 9.2.5.6	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	<p>Each frame contains information that defines the duration of the next transmission. The RTS shallwill update the NAV to indicate busy until the end of ACK 1. The CTS shallwill also update the NAV to indicate busy until the end of ACK 1. Both Fragment 1 and ACK 1 shallwill update the NAV to indicate busy until the end of ACK 2. This is done by using the duration field in the DATA and ACK frames. This shallwill continue until the last Fragment which has a duration of one ACK time plus one SIFS time and its ACK which shallwill have the duration set to zero. Each Fragment and ACK acts as a virtual RTS and CTS, therefore no RTS/CTS frame needs to be generated even though subsequent fragments are larger the aRTS_Threshold.</p> <p>In the case where an acknowledgment is not received by the source station, the NAV shallwill be marked busy for next frame exchange. This is the worst case situation. This is shown in Error! Reference source not found. If the acknowledgment is not sent by the destination station, stations that maycan only hear the destination station shallwill not update their NAV and be free to access the channel. All stations that hear the source shallwill be free to</p>	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						access the channel after the NAV from Frame 1 has expired.	
66.	A.4.4 9.2.7	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	the MPDU is directed to the AP. The Broadcast/Multicast message shall <u>will</u> be distributed into the BSS. The station originating the message shall <u>will</u> receive the message as a Broadcast/Multicast message. Therefore all stations shall <u>must</u> filter out Broadcast/Multicast messages which contain their address as the source address.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
67.	A.4.4 9.2.9	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	sequence number and fragment number) field within Data and Management frames. MPDUs which are part of the same MSDU shall have the same sequence number, and different MSDUs shall <u>will</u> (with a high probability) have a different sequence number.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
68.	A.4.4 9.2.9	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	There is the small possibility that a frame may <u>will</u> be improperly rejected due to such a match; however, this occurrence would be rare and will <u>will</u> simply results in a lost frame (similar to an FCS error in Ethernet).	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
69.	A.4.4 9.2.10	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	and the different MAC Slot Boundaries Tx_SIFS, Tx_PIFS and Tx_DIFS. These Slot Boundaries define when the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						transmitter shall be turned on by the MAC to meet the different IFS timings on the medium,	
70.	A.4.4 9.2.10	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The tolerances are specified in the MIB, and shall will only apply to the SIFS specification, so that tolerances shall will not accumulate.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
71.	A.4.4 9.3.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	delay. In the case of a busy medium due to DCF traffic, the beacon shall will be delayed for the time required to complete the current DCF frame exchange. The longest delay will occurs when if the current frame exchange is an MSDU which is larger than both aRTS_Threshold and aFragment_Threshold. In	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
72.	A.4.4 9.3.3.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	A CF-Poll bit in the Subtype field of these frames shall will allow the stations to send their data frames if any. Stations shall respond to the CF-Poll immediately when a frame is queued, by sending this frame	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
73.	A.4.4 9.3.3.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	addressed to a different station than the one being acknowledged. This shall can only occur if the acknowledged frame/fragment was marked as last fragment in the frame control. CF-Aware stations that	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
74.	A.4.4 9.3.3.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	A CF-Aware station shall must respond to a CF-Poll. If the station has no frame to send when polled, the response shall be a Null frame. If the station has no frame to send when polled, but an acknowledgment is	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
75.	A.4.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically	is invoked for the MPDU... If WEP is	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
	9.4				incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	active for the MPDU, then the MPDU shall will be expanded by IV and ICV (see clause Error! Reference source not found.), this may can result in a fragment larger than aFragmentation_Threshold.	
76.	A.4.4 9.4	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Since the control of the channel is will be lost at a dwell time boundary and the station shall will have to contend for the channel after the dwell boundary, it is required that the acknowledgment of a fragment be	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
77.	A.4.4 9.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	MSDU. Only the last or sole fragment of the MSDU shall will have this bit set to zero. All other fragments of the MSDU shall will have this bit set to one.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
78.	A.4.4 9.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The destination station shall can reconstruct the MSDU by combining the fragments in order of Fragment Number portion of the Sequence Control Field. If WEP has been applied to the fragment it shall be	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
79.	A.4.4 9.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	not yet complete. As soon as the station receives the fragment with the More Fragments bit set to zero, the station knows that no more fragments may will be received for the MSDU.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
80.	A.4.4 9.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was	To properly reassemble MPDUs into an MSDU, a destination station shall must	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	discard any duplicated fragments received. If a station receives a fragment with the same Source, Destination, and Sequence Control Field as a previous fragment, then the station shall must discard the duplicate fragment. However an acknowledge shall must be sent in response to a duplicate fragment of a directed MSDU.	
81.	A.4.4 9.6	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The following set of rules shall must be followed by all the stations to ensure coexistence and interoperability on Multirate Capable PHYs. All Control Frames are transmitted at the aBSS_Basic_Rate_Set (which as specified before belongs to the ESS_BASIC_RATE) so they shall will be understood by all the stations in the ESS.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
82.	A.4.4 10.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	This shall will be used to initialize the management entities, the MIBs and the datapath entities. It may include a list of parameters for items to be initialized to non-default values. The .confirm shall will indicate success or failure of the request.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
83.	A.4.4 11.1.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	Beacons and Probe Responses carry a TSF time element. A station receiving such a frame from another station in an IBSS with the same ESS ID shall will	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						compare the TSF time with its own TSF time. If the	
84.	A.4.4 11.1.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Beacons shall will be scheduled at the nominal beacon interval. This is shown in Error! Reference source not found.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
85.	A.4.4 11.1.2.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	The Beacon transmission shall will always occur during the Awake Period of stations that are operating in a low power mode. This is described in more detail in ??8-2.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
86.	A.4.4 11.1.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Stations shall use their TSF timer to time the aCurrent_Dwell_Time. The aCurrent_Dwell_Time is the length of time that stations shall will stay on each frequency in their hopping sequence. Once stations are synchronized, they have the same TSF timer value.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
87.	A.4.4 11.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	(PS) shall transmit a short PS-Poll frame to the AP, which shall will respond with the corresponding	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
88.	A.4.4 11.2.1.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Power Save or PS Station listens to selected Beacons (based upon its aListen_Interval) and sends PS-Poll frames to the AP if the TIM element in the most recent Beacon indicates a directed MSDU buffered for that station. The AP shall will transmit buffered directed MSDUs to a PS	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						station only in response to a PS-Poll from that station, or during the contention free period in the case of a CF-Aware PS station. In PS Mode, a station shall will be in the Doze state and shall will enter the Awake state to receive selected Beacons, to received broadcast and multicast transmissions...	
89.	A.4.4 11.2.1.2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	The TIM shall will identify the stations for which traffic is pending and buffered in the AP. This	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
90.	A.4.4 11.2.1.5	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	SID of CF-Aware stations. A CF-Aware station for which the TIM element of the most recent Beacon indicated buffered MSDUs or management frames shall must be in the Awake state at least until the receipt of a directed frame from the AP in which the Frame	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
91.	A.4.4 11.2.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	stations are awake. The announcement is done via an Ad Hoc Traffic Indication Message (ATIM). A power conserving station listens for these announcements to determine if its receiver shall must be left on. When a MSDU is to be transmitted to a destination station that is in a Power Save (PS) mode, the transmitting station first transmits an ATIM frame during the ATIM Window, in which all the stations including those operating in a Power Save (PS) mode are awake. The ATIM Window is defined as a specific period of time following a beacon during which only ATIM	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						<p>frames may be transmitted. ATIMs are randomized after the beacon using the backoff procedure. ATIMs are acknowledged. If a station receives an ATIM frame during the ATIM Window, it shall acknowledge the ATIM and stay awake for the entire Beacon Interval waiting for the announced MSDU(s) to be received. If a Station does not receive an ATIM, it may go back to PS Mode after the end of the ATIM Window. MSDUs announced by ATIMs are randomized after the ATIM Window using the backoff procedure. If a station transmitting the ATIM does not receive an acknowledgment, the station shall execute the backoff procedure for retransmission of the ATIM.</p> <p>It is possible that an ATIM may be received from more than one station and that a station that receives an ATIM may receive more than a single MSDU from the transmitting station. ATIM frames are only</p>	
92.	A.4.4 11.2.2.1	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	An ATIM shall have a destination address of broadcast/multicast for broadcast/multicast MSDUs. All stations shall remain awake if they receive an ATIM with a broadcast/multicast destination address.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
93.	A.4.4 11.4.4.1 .20	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute defines the maximum time, in microseconds, that a station shall remain on a single channel during a passive scan of that channel.	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
						The default value of this attribute shall be	
94.	A.4.4 11.4.4.1 .27	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute defines the period of time, in microseconds, after a target beacon transmission time in an IBSS during which stations buffering frames for Power Save mode stations <u>shall</u> attempt to notify those stations by transmitting an ATIM frame. The ATIM window begins at the	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
95.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"A set of MAC_Addresses identifying the multicast addresses for which this station <u>may</u> receive frames. The default value of this attribute shall be null."	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
96.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .24	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute indicates the number of bytes in an MPDU, below which an RTS/CTS handshake <u>shall</u> not be performed. An RTS/CTS handshake shall be performed for all frames where the length of the MPDU is equal to or larger than this threshold. Setting this attribute to be larger than the maximum MSDU size <u>shall</u> have the effect of turning off the RTS/CTS handshake for frames transmitted by this station. Setting this attribute to zero <u>shall</u> have the effect of turning on the RTS/CTS handshake for all MPDUs for frames transmitted by this station. The default value of this	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
97.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .30	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute specifies the length of time, in microseconds, in which an ACK frame <u>may</u> be received in response to transmission of a frame which requires acknowledgment, timed from receipt	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
98.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .31	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute indicates the maximum number of transmission attempts of a frame, the length of which is less than or equal to aFragmentation_Threshold, that shall will be made before a failure condition is indicated. The default value of this attribute shall be 5.";	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
99.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .32	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute indicates the maximum number of transmission attempts of a frame, the length of which is greater than aFragmentation_Threshold, that shall will be made before a failure condition is indicated. The default value of this attribute shall be 7.";	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
100.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .33	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute specifies the maximum MSDU length that shall will be accepted for transmission. The value of this attribute shall be 2304 octets.";	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
101.	A.4.4 11.4.4.2 .34	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"This attribute specifies the current maximum size, in octets, of the MPDU that may will be delivered to the PHY. An MSDU shall will be broken into fragments if its size exceeds the value of this attribute after adding MAC headers and trailers. The default value for this attribute shall be equal to	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
102.	A.4.4 11.4.5.2 .2	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not corectly convey operational requirements.	"The Add_Group_Address action shall add the specified group address to the list of group addresses that shall will be accepted by the station.";	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
103.	A.4.4 11.4.5.2 .3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	"The Delete_Group_Address action shall remove the specified group address from the list of group addresses that shall will be accepted by the station.";	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
104.	A.4.4	db	T	Y	The MAC pics section is missing huge pieces, in particular it has no references to any of clauses 5 or 6.	Fill out MAC pics section to include contents of clauses 5 and 6.	Accepted
105.	A.4.4 5.1.1.3	db	T	Y	w/o the requested change the Draft is technically incorrect - since approved "standard" language was not used the draft does not correctly convey operational requirements.	Another aspect of mobile stations is that they may will often be battery powered and hence power management is an important consideration. For example, it cannot be presumed that a station's receiver	Plenary Motion 8 Mar 96
106.	A.4.4	db	T	Y	The MAC Pics is not consistent with the rest of the draft. Many of my LB comments are the result of cross checking and correcting the use of "must", "will" etc to "shall" - this means that the pics annex is missing required information.	Correct A.4.4 to include all examples of missing "shall" and "shall not" noted in my other LB comments. Cross check all clauses for use of "shall" against the pics section - every shall in a draft clause must be reflected in a line of the pics.	Accepted
107.	All	vh	E		The document is not consistent in the unit of the data rate. Although IEEE still uses the unit Mbps, ISO and the ITU consistently use Mbit/s (and I agree with this unit). As we want to have the ISO adopt our standard, IEEE agrees with the use of the unit Mbit/s	Use throughout the document the unit Mbit/s instead of Mbps (clause 14.3.3.1.1). Mb/s (clause 14.7.2) , Mbit/sec (table 40)	Accepted
108.	All	vz	E		Use the x for multiplication rather than an asterisk. See page 250.		Accepted
109.	Annex	vz	E		Please add an informative annex titled "Bibliography" and include all items such as the book by Bruce Schneier mentioned in the footnote on page 62. Also include any other documents mentioned in the text that do not appear in the references clause, such as Document FCC 15.247, ETS 300-328 (from page 217), ANSI C95.1-1991 (from page 202), IEC 825-1 and ANSI Z136.1 on page 252, etc.		Accepted
110.	Annex	vz	E		Tables and figures that appear in annexes use their own numbering scheme, for example, figure B.1, figure B.2,		Accepted

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
					figure C.1, etc.		
111.	Annex A	vz	E		Add the following footnote to the PICS proforma in annex A: Copyright release for PICS proformas: Users of this standard may freely reproduce the PICS proforma in this annex so that it can be used for its intended purpose and may further publish the completed PICS.		Accepted
112.	Annex A	mif	t	Y	The MAC PICS Proforma has inadequate coverage of the point coordination function, and certain other aspects of the MAC frame exchange sequences. This needs to be corrected to reduce the probability of non-interoperable, but allegedly conformant implementations.	A list of items needing coverage will be brought to the March meeting. In keeping with the Email from Simon Black which acknowledged some of the shortcomings of the D3.0 MAC PICS Proforma, and the statement that he would bring an updated version to the meeting, specific text changes are not included here. I will be available to participate in the update of the MAC PICS Proforma to improve PCF and frame sequence coverage during the March meeting.	Accepted
113.	Annex C	mif	t	Y	The MAC State Machines are inconsistent with the recent updates to the MAC, and had some errors and omissions at the time of their insertion. Document 96/002 contains an update that the author believes is consistent with the D3.0 text and takes D2.1 LB comments on the state machines into account to the extent they are still relevant with other changes leading to D3.0.	Replace Annex C with the material from document 96/002.	Accepted intent, with different text, by plenary vote to adopt the machines as they were on Thursday 9 May 1996. We conscripted a volunteer (commentor) to fix this.
114.	Artwork	vz	E		Attempt to use the same font size in your artwork. The preferred font and size is Helvetica 8 pt. Smaller font sizes may become illegible when copied. For example, figure 66 on page 182 is unacceptable. Also, figure 68 on page 185, and figure 71 on page 188. Figure 74 on page 201 is much too large and bold. Use shading carefully--figure 85 has an illegible block of text due to the shading (see page 232). Figure 90 on page 249 is too large and bold. Font size on figure 92, page 260, is too small.		Accepted

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
115.	Foreword	RM	e		The list of present and past voting members seems short. At one time, voting membership exceeded 100?		Accepted
116.	Foreword	BO	T	Y	No credit is given to subgroup chairs. These folks did a tremendous amount of work and deserve credit.	Add Dave Bagby, Dean Kawaguchi, Larry Van Der Jaqt	Resolved by Plenary action Monday Mar '96 mtg.
117.	Foreword	BO	T	Y	If the editors of the individual PHY clauses deserve an "*", each of the clause editors for the remainder of the document deserve credit.	Add "*" to Tom Baumgartner, Dave Bagby, Carolyn Heide, Simon Black, Tom Siep or remove "*" from Dean Kawaguchi, Ed Geiger, Jim Renfro, Mike Trompower	Resolved by Plenary action Monday Mar '96 mtg.
118.	Foreword	vh	E		The title of the voters-list does not match, the title explains that old voters were in the list, which was not true, further details of activities is needed	Keep the list as of the time the draft is approved for submission to Sponsor ballot and announce that in the title. Start list with current 802.11 chair, MAC group chair and Phy group chair, followed by the names of the two main editors. Mark in the list with voters, the subgroup chairs and subgroup editors at the time of submission to Sponsor Ballot.	Resolved by Plenary action Monday Mar '96 mtg.
119.	General	jyc			There many mistakes and omissions in this draft as it stands. Without going through all, but to cite a few examples:- 1. Simon Black indicated 3 items in the MAC PICs 2. Naftali Chayat indicated Hop sequence formula errors 3. Bob Ohara has submitted a number of editorial changes.		No action taken - none requested in comment and the comment was not marked for category, assumed editorial and the general examples cited have been improved during Mar 96 mtg. Author is requested to be more specific with future reviews as this would make it much easier to understand what is desired.
120.	General 14.6.13, 14.6.14. 5	vh	E		Scrutinize the whole document on units. In 14.6.13, I found usec in stead of μ s and in 14.5.14.5 Khz in stead of kHz		Accepted
121.	General	cr	?	y	See comment on previous ballot	see comment previous ballot	Declined by unanimous plenary vote. Intention of commenter not clear

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
							from comment (which comment?), and text not provided (did not follow ballot instructions)
122.	General	vh	T	y	<p>The PAR requires:</p> <p>A minimally conformant IEEE P802.11 network will meet all of the P802 requirements except that 5.6.1 will be met at least 99.9 % of the time on a daily basis, in 99.9 % of the total geography of the service area.</p> <p>IEEE P802.11 will define approaches to allow a minimally conformant network to achieve full conformance over the total geography of the service area.</p> <p>I have not found anywhere in the standard a place where the minimally conformant network has been defined.</p>	<p>1. A minimally conformant network consist of a set of two stations, separated by 20 m(eter) in an environment that shows a delay spread of (@@ to be defined) and having interference from another station, using the same PHY and the same frequency/sequence, placed 25 m from both stations (this station to transmit with the same power as the other two stations) and an interferer that generates a 1 kHz signal in the middle of the band with an equivalent distance/power density so that the receiving station receives a signal of (@@ to be defined).</p> <p>2. To achieve full conformance, an implementation needs to add additional antennas at @@ cm or a dual station implementation with the antennas separated by @@ cm.</p>	<p>Minimally conformant network defined in defs as two IEEE802.11 STAs in a BSA.</p> <p>Accepted</p>
123.	General	vh	T	y	<p>The Wireless MAC shall support both connectionless service as defined in the MAC Service definition at rates between 1 and 20 Mbit/s as well as a service supporting packetized voice.</p>		<p>Standard as specified supports packetized voice. No action requested.</p> <p>Accepted</p>
124.	General 3.x 4.x	db	T	Y	<p>In my D1 LB comments I wrote up the history and politics that lead to the current broken multi-rate mechanism. Those comments are hereby included in these D3 letter ballot comments by explicit reference.</p>	<p>Either correct ALL known and/or acknowledged deficiencies associated with the D3 multirate mechanism or remove the flawed multi-rate</p>	<p>Fixed through adoption of multirate provisions in submission 96/79r1 as amended</p>

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
	5.x 7.x 9.x 11.x prob others.				<p>In my D2 LB comments I wrote up more of the problems associated with the multi-rate mechanism. I hereby include those comments in these D3 letter ballot comments by explicit reference.</p> <p>During the January 1996 802.11 meeting it was acknowledged by the 802.11 plenary session that there are known problems with the multi-rate mechanism: only two people voted in a straw poll that there were no problems (reference official minutes of the mtg), further a motion was placed in front of the group asking them to either correct the problems or remove the deficient mechanism from the draft (motion #1) - the 802.11 group has declined to do either on a vote of 5 approving, 16 opposing, 2 abstaining.</p> <p>This is clearly a vote to leave the mechanism broken.</p> <p>This is unacceptable, unprofessional behavior in the opinion of this 802.11 voting member.</p> <p>Until the group resolves this issue in a manner satisfactory to this reviewer, my vote on forwarding the Draft to sponsor ballot shall remain "NO". Unless some resolution is reached, I anticipate carrying this issue to both the executive committee and to the sponsor ballot group (as part of the NO votes that must be presented along with the sponsor ballot if the draft is forwarded with any unresolved No votes).</p>	"feature" from the draft entirely.	
125.	Global	vz	E		Do not use boldface for emphasis within the text. Use quotation marks or italics, as necessary, but do not overuse.		Accepted
126.	global	maf	E	Y		CFP-Rate should be changed to CFP-interval	Accepted
127.	global	maf	t	Y	k = x 1000 K = x 1024	all references that use "k" for meaning multiply by 1024 should be	Accept Fixed Up

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	----------------------	-----------------	-------------------	----------------	----------------------

						changed to "K" (case is VERY important here)	
128.	title	vz	E		On the title page and on the header that appears on each page, header is incorrect	Put the full title, "IEEE P802.11, Draft Standard for Wireless LAN Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specification"	Accepted

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Comment/Rationale	Corrected Text	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	----------------------	-----------------	-------------------	----------------	----------------------