

Tentative Minutes of the IEEE P802.11

**Full Working Group
Plenary Meeting
Irvine, California
March 10-14, 1997**

Monday March 10, 1997

1.0 Opening Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes at 15:30. Agenda of 39th session of 802.11 is in doc.: IEEE P802.11 11-97/09. George Fishel, secretary¹⁾, is present and ready to take the notes.

Objectives for this meeting, all groups

- to resolve all comments on the Sponsor Ballot on D5.0
- to prepare documents for Sponsor Recirculation ballot
 - draft D5.3 / D6.1
 - unresolved no comments (if any)
- to prepare the documents for future work in the High Speed Study Group
- Conformance testing
- !!!!Prepare Vote on ISO/IEC 8802-11!!!!

1.1 Roll Call: People in the room were invited to introduce themselves.

¹⁾The officers of the Working Group are:

Mr. VICTOR HAYES
Chairman IEEE P802.11
Lucent Technologies
Phone: +31 30 609 7528
Fax: +31 30 609 7498
E-Mail: v.hayes@ieee.org

Mr. GEORGE FISHEL
Secretary IEEE P802.11
AMP Inc.
Phone: +1 717 592 6161
Fax: +1 717 592 6179
E-Mail: grfishel@amp.com

Mr. BOB O'HARA
Editor IEEE P802.11
Informed Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1212 645 4317
Fax: +1 212 645 6719
E-Mail: bob_ohara@informed-technologies.com

Mr. STUART KERRY
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11

Phone: +1 408 267 4680
Fax: +1 408 267 4680
E-Mail: kerrysj@aol.com

Mr. CHRIS ZEGELIN
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2667
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: chrisz@psd.symbol.com

Mr. GREG ENNIS
Editor IEEE P802.11

Phone: +1 408 358 5544
Fax: +1 408 358 5541
E-Mail: gennis@mindspring.com

Mr. DAVE BAGBY
Chair IEEE P802.11-MAC group
Advanced Micro Devices
Phone: +1 408 987 2423
Fax: +1 408 987 2800
E-Mail: david.bagby@amd.com

Mr. DEAN KAWAGUCHI
Chair IEEE P802.11-PHY group
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2629
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: deank@psd.symbol.com

1.2 Voting rights:

Participation in debates, moving and seconding is only permitted by voting members, in all 802.11 meetings (at all levels). The subgroup chairs may permit observers to participate in debates.

Voting at the working group level is by voting members only. Chair may permit observers to participate in debate. To become a voting member:

- participate in at least 2 out of 4 consecutive plenary meetings. Voting rights start at third meeting
- participation in at least 75% in meetings, in the room
- one interim may be exchanged for a plenary
- Voting members will get a token to be used at votes

Voting rights can be maintained:

- by participation in 2 plenary meetings within 4 consecutive plenary meetings
- one interim may be substituted for a plenary

Voting rights may be lost:

- after failing to pay the conference fee
- after missing two out of three consecutive letter ballots

Current state of member status:

- 63 - Voting members
- 26 - Aspiring voting members
- 6 - Nearly voting members

1.3 Attendance list, Registration: The attendance list was circulated, Al Petrick supervising - 75% attendance according to the attendance list is required to qualify for participating in the meeting as a whole, so make sure to sign the book. Copies of the attendance list are handed out before the end of each meeting.

- important for administration of voting rights that the attendance book is used properly.
- sign per meeting (morning, afternoon, evening). Do not sign ahead.
- place initials. Do not cross or underline.
- circle the letter corresponding to the meeting you attend when signing (F=full 802.11, P=PHY, M=MAC group).

Check e-mail addresses in the book:

- some addresses have been struck, or have a \$-sign added to the right - those received complaints from the reflector
- please strike your e-mail address if you do not use it
- if you do not disagree to receiving very long files, mark bulk e-mail with yes

1.4 Logistics: Document distribution is done using pigeon holes - you will find your copies and messages in the referenced location in the expanding file folders in the slot *in front of* your name.

Document distribution:

- sign in for a slot, remember the letter and number
- pigeon holes are file folders with a letter id on each folder and a number on each slot
- in each folder are numbered slots, each of which is 'owned' by a person
- each person owns slot in front of number

Conference fee to be paid through registration office.

Copying and collection of files is managed by Ken Clements, Al Patrick assists in the pigeonhole stuffing.

Coffee breaks at 10 AM and 3 PM. Noon to 1:00 PM lunch

1.5 IEEE Patent Policy Vic Hayes explained the IEEE Patent Policy as per Clause 5 of the IEEE Standards By-Laws and per Clause 6.3 of the IEEE Standards Operations Manual. He specifically asked for notification from members of patents applicable to the draft standard and that patent holders submit the requested statement.

1.6 Other announcements

1.6.1 General information available on diskette, Vic Hayes provided a set of diskettes with general information, during the meeting kept by George Fishel.

1.6.2 Volunteers needed for Thursday evening to prepare mailing Richard Payne, Roy Sebring and Tom Siep will help on Thursday night with paper work.

1.6.3 Manuel Betancor excused due to hospitalization

2. Approval of the minutes of previous meetings

2.1 Vancouver meeting doc.: 11-96/145. These minutes were approved without objection.

2.2 Palm Bay meeting doc.: 11-97/05. These minutes were approved without objection.

2.3 Matters arising from the minutes : None.

3. Reports

3.1 the Executive Committee ExCom meeting report made by Vic Hayes.

1. Treasurer resigned and looking for a new one.
2. New PAR for 802.11 higher speed PHY was approved at the Vancouver meeting.
3. In preparation of the ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 meeting, we need to prepare our position on the letter ballot for CD 8802-11. The item was added to the agenda.
4. Meeting places listed for 1998. Will be in pigeon holes tomorrow
5. Vic presented a time line on progress of the standard and the current status. Dave Bagby and Bob O'Hara objected with the review of the document by the working group. Jim Carlo happened to be in the room and explained the intent of the ExCom of the review by the working group. Jim explained the intent is to socialize the change and allow every member to see the document.

4. Review of document list by Vic H. the list was completed, see doc.: 11-97/23. The proposal from Nakamura from NTT was withdrawn but should be reviewed by FH group.

Vic will generate a maintenance PAR

5. Adoption of the Agenda 11-97/09. Modification to agenda to move 802.11 plenary from 13:00 on Wednesday to 16:00.

Motion #1 *to approve the agenda*

made by Johnny Zweig
second Tom Siep

Vote: 17-0-1

Motion #1 passes

6. Unfinished Business

6.1 Approval of the draft standard for submission to Sponsor Recirculation ballot this item was skipped due to the work still to be done.

6.2 Future work in the High Speed Study Group

The following seem to be the agenda items for the study group:

ATM

Ruggedized 802.11

10 Mbit/s DS

10 Mbit/s IR

Specification Presentation IEEE 802.11-97/20 was made by Oliver Edwards, Image Systems. Oliver proposed a study group to investigate the possibility of this fortified network. But at the end of the presentation, there was no motion to change the scope of the study group to support this subject or to start a new working group.

6.3 Conformance testing this item was skipped due to lack of submissions

7. New Business: there was none.

8. Meeting adjourned David Bagby said he would work on resolving comments on the MAC and Dean Kawugachi will resolve PHY problems. Naftali Chayat will be the chair of the High Speed Study Group.

Full IEEE P802.11 meeting Wednesday March-12, 1997 at 16:00 h.

9. Opening Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes

9.1 Officers The chair asked volunteers for the editors and vice-chair positions as the current officers do not have a sponsor anymore, or have personal business to attend.

9.2 Document list update, Ken Clements gave an update

9.3 Agenda adjustments Added the meeting location poll. Agenda was approved without any objection.

9.4 Announcements

9.4.1 Commercialism Vic showed a slide from Jim Carlo showing the guidelines for commercial sessions during plenaries. The request was to keep the announcements out of the area.

9.4.2 Treasurer Vic showed a slide with the tasks of the 802 treasurer, it asks about 4 manweeks of work.

9.4.3 Meeting locations in 1999 Vic conducted polls for 1999 meeting locations

11. Issues from the Study group

Naftali presented the results of the study group

- No presentation on a higher speed FH
- Carl Andren from Harris presented a 10 or 11Mbps DS
- Mr. Matsumoto from LTEL presented a 10Mbps IR (3-30m range)

- Not mature enough to be presented in the high speed PAR
- Does not interoperate with the 802.11 standard
- At the moment, the inclusion of the IR is turned down
- Richard Paine presented a proposal to develop a PAR for the 5.1GHz NII frequencies
 - 17-0-2 to present a PAR on the NII frequencies
 - Motion to present the PAR to the 802.11 plenary 15-0-1
- The Study Group developed a draft PAR
 - The question came from the MAC group about the intent of the motion from the SG about the input from the MAC group.
 - Referred to services of audio and video, not multimedia

10. Issues from the comment resolution group

Dave Bagby presented the results of the resolutions group

- Going to make a proposal tomorrow to go ahead for ballot
- Vic made the comment that the motion had to be to go forward to a recirculation ballot
- They will be working tonight to finish the state machines

Discussion lead by Naftali on the draft PAR:

The discussion led to comments on revised vs. reviewed in the text of the PAR. The “reviewed” replaced the revised comment.

11 Adjourn for subgroups

Meeting adjourned at 5:55pm.

Final Plenary of 802.11 Thursday March 13, 1997 at 13:10.

14. Opening Vic called the meeting to order at 13:30 1:00 PM

14.1 Announcements there were no announcements

14.2 Document list update Ken gave an update and reminded the members to first ask a document number before going to copy, that way we can keep the system under control

14.3 Agenda adjustments there were no changes and the agenda was approved without objection

15. Reports

15.1 Resolution group Dave Bagby reported on the progress of the comments resolution committee:

- It's Done
 - all sponsor ballot comments processed
 - all 802.11 review comments handled
 - all editing complete

15.1.1 Forwarding the draft

Motion #2 *that 802.11 Draft 5.3 be moved forward with sponsor ballot*

made by Dave Bagby
second Johnny Zweig

Vote: 21-0-0

Motion #2 passes

One "NO" vote will go with the document as it could not be resolved .

Vic modified the time line to reflect progression of the document.

Vic asked the question: "Do we need a full meeting or not?"

David Bagby offered his facility in Sunnyvale for a meeting location that could be canceled in a short period of time if needed.

Proposed meeting dates are 1 April will be the teleconference and the potential meeting will be May 7 to 9 .

Draft will be on the server on March 17.

Vic will inform sponsor ballot people that the draft will be on the server.

15.1.2 Forwarding new draft to ISO

Motion #3 *to submit doc. -97/32 to the US TAG for SC6 for adoption as the US vote on CD 8802-11*

made by Wayne Moyers
second Keith Amundsen

Vote: 19-0-0

Motion #3 passes

15.2 Study group

Naftali Chayat reported on progress on high speed PAR. Changes are reflected in current PAR Draft 97/31R1

Changes to PAR Scope.

Changes to Purpose.

Changes to Coordination requirements.

Changes to market Potential.

Changes to Compatibility with 802

Changes to Distinct Identity. Some questions were asked about this topic asking about the meaning of this topic.

Changes to the Technical Feasibility.

Major changes from yesterday:

- 25 Mb/s to 20 Mb/s
- Not specific to GII
- Authority to correspond with regulatory bodies
- CCA independent of MAC
- Use of 802.11 MAC as is
- Quality of Services Mentioned
- Reduced Liaison (No Reg, No Forums)

Motion #4 *to continue the study group on High speed PHYs till the July Meeting and to forward the draft PAR 97/31R2 to SEC.*

made by Naftali Chayat
second Wayne Moyers

Motion discussion: Dave Bagby suggested a friendly amendment by removing the first two sentences of the last paragraph in 97/31 R2 "Compatibility with 802.11 MAC" section

Friendly amendment was accepted, so the motion now reads:

New Motion #4 *to continue the study group on High speed PHYs till the July Meeting and to forward the draft PAR 97/31R2 to SEC for information and to prepare an editorially improved version before the 30 day curfew and to move the approval at the opening meeting of SEC in July.*

Vote: 17-0-1

Motion #4 passes

Question from the floor was to propose a PAR for Higher Speed at 2.4 GHz application without a modulation technique. What is the plan in going forward with the higher speed 2.4 GHz PAR?

Naftali proposed providing information for the high speed 2.4 GHz PAR and that go forward when completed and the work will be for the 2.4 GHz high speed PAR at the next meeting.

15.3 Conformance testing group; no meeting was held

16. Unfinished business

16.1 Output Documents in other agenda items we approved the forwarding of the draft to sponsor recirculation, to submit a negative vote on CD 8802-11 and to send the draft Par to SEC for information with approval at the July SEC meeting. No other output is required.

16.2 Next meeting

Objectives for next meeting (July meeting in Lahaina):

- To continue the work of the study group
- Start looking at technical proposals for a 5.2 GHz PHY
- To prepare a maintenance PAR
 - ⇒ Conformance testing

At this time Dave Bagby wondered whether there was a need to package all study group proposals and he moved to reconsider motion #4

Motion #5 *to reconsider motion #4*

made by Dave Bagby
second Simon Black

Discussion followed. The discussion suggested preparing a high speed PAR for 2.4 GHz to be presented at the same time as the 5.2 GHz PAR to the ExCom at this meeting.

Dave Bagby called for the question, Simon Black seconded, question was called with 18-1-1.

Vote: 12-7-1

Motion #5 passes, motion #4 back on the floor

Again Motion #4 *to continue the study group on High speed PHYs till the July Meeting and to forward the draft PAR 97/31R2 to SEC for information and to prepare an editorially improved version before the 30 day curfew and to move the approval at the opening meeting of SEC in July.*

After a long discussion Tom Siep called for the question seconded by Johnny Zweig 8-8-0 Question is not called needs 2/3 vote

Discussion continued with:

Motion #6 *to amend motion 4 by striking “Meeting and to forward the draft PAR 97/31R2 to SEC for information and to prepare an editorially improved version before the 30 day curfew and to move the approval at the opening meeting of SEC in July”*

made by Dave Bagby
second Simon Black

After a long discussion Michael Rothenberg called for the question, seconded by Wayne Moyers; the question was called with 19-0-0.

Vote: 1-15-0

Motion #6 fails

Back on the full Motion #4

Vote: 19-0-1

Motion #4 passes in second round

Mailing deadline: March 20 1997.

16.3 Other interim meetings required?

A conference call is required to discuss the result of the working group review. April 1, tele-conference, hosted by Vic Hayes, Lucent Technologies for April 1, 1997, 15:00 UTC.

A LMSC comment resolution meeting is required to decide on the progress. Dave Bagby volunteered to host a meeting on AMD premises, so it could be canceled on short notice without damages. This meeting is scheduled for May 7-9, 197 in Sunnyvale, CA.

17. New Business

Naftali requests input for the 5Ghz applications

18. Closure

Tentative meeting schedule

Date	Month	Year	Place	Type	Location	Host
1	April	1997	Teleconference	Resolution	Worldwide, start 15:00 UTC	Lucent Technologies
7-9	May	1997	Sunnyvale, CA	Resolution	AMD facility	AMD
7-11	July	1997	Lahaina, HI	Plenary	Hyatt Regency Maui	
10-14	Nov	1997	Montreal, PQ	Plenary	Queen Elizabeth	
9-13	Mar	1998	Irvine, CA	Plenary	Hyatt Regency	
6-10	Jul	1998	La Jolla, CA	Plenary	Hyatt Regency	
9-13	Nov	1998	Albuquerque, NM	Plenary	Hyatt Regency	

Appendix 1

Attendance list

Mr. Keith B.	Amundsen	voter	Raytheon Company keith_b_amundsen@raytheon.com	+1 508 470 9483
Mr. Carl F.	Andren	voter	HARRIS Corporation candren@harris.com	+1 407 724 7535
Mr. Kazuhiro	Aoyagi		Showa Electric Wire & Cable Co. Ltd. k860822@snt1.swcc.co.jp	+81 427 73 7211
Mr. Ludger	Arnoldi	voter	Philips GmbH arnoldi.philips@t-online.de/arnoldi@dac.de	+49 911 526 6843
Mr. David	Bagby	voter	Advanced Micro Devices david.bagby@amd.com	+1 408 749 5425
Mr. Phil	Belanger	voter	Aironet pbela@aironet.com	+1 330 665 7953
Mr. John	Biddick	voter	Intermec Corporation jbiddick@intermec.com	+1 206 348 2600 X6647
Mr. Simon	Black	voter	Intalk simonblack@intalk.com	+44 1223 421250
Mr. Jan	Boer	voter	Lucent Technologies WCND janboer@lucent.com	+31 30 609 7483
Mr. Dean S.K.	Chang		Proxim Inc. dean@proxim.com	+1 415 526 3689
Mr. Terry	Charbonneau		ITT Cannon	
Mr. Naftali	Chayat	voter	BreezeCom naftalic@breezecom.co.il	+972 3 645 8423
Mr. Kwang-Cheng	Chen		Hewlett Packard Laboratories chenkc@wavelet.hpl.hp.com	+1 415 857 8576
Mr. Ken	Clements	voter	Innovation on Demand Ken@InnovationOnDmnd.com	+1 408 353 5027
Mr. Dave	Crawford		Standard Microsystems Corporation dave.crawford@smc.com	+1 714 707
Mr. Oliver J.	Edwards		Image Systems Inc. imagesys33@aol.com	+1 415 366 7788
Mr. John	Fakatselis	voter	HARRIS Corporation jfakat01@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com	+1 407 729 4733
Mr. Matthew	Fischer	voter	Advanced Micro Devices ablmatt@brahms.amd.com	+1 408 749 5403
Mr. Michael	Fischer	voter	Digital Ocean Inc. mfischer@child.com	+1 210 614 4096
Mr. George	Fishel	voter	AMP Inc. grfishel@amp.com	+1 717 592 6161

Appendix 1

Attendance list

Mr. David	Fisher		3Com Corporation david-fisher@3mail.3com.com	+1 408 764 7200
Mr. Raj	Gawera	voter	Symbionics rsg@symbionics.co.uk	+44 1223 421025
Mr. Tim	Godfrey		Digital Ocean Inc. tgodfrey@digocean.com	+1 913 888 3380
Mr. Howard J.	Hall	voter	Newfound Networks hhall@ultranet.com	+1 508 256 1347
Mr. Victor	Hayes	voter	Lucent Technologies WCND vichayes@lucent.com	+31 30 609 7528
Mr. Robert	Heile		BBN Corp bheile@bbn.com	+1 617 873 4835
Mr. Masanori	Hiragama		LTEL Corp masachan@ppp01.infopepper.or.jp	+81 48 660 1771
Mr. Tohru	Iwama		ITT Cannon tohru@ittdeere.cannon.itt.com	+1 714 757 8459
Mr. Dean M.	Kawaguchi	voter	Symbol Technologies Inc. deank@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2629
Mr. Hideki	Matsumoto		Showa Electric Wire & Cable Co. Ltd. k820359@snt1.swcc.co.jp	+81 427 74 8230
Dr. Akira	Miura	voter	Panasonic Technologies Inc. miura@tadw.research.panasonic.com	+1 415 858 1000
Mr. Tets	Morita		LTEL Corp morita@ltel.co.jp	+81 48 660 1771
Mr. Wayne D.	Moyers	voter	+1 408 338 7562 wdm119@idt.liberty.com \$	
Mr. Bob	O'Hara	voter	Informed Technology Inc. bob@informed-technology.com	+1 212 463 7937
Mr. Tomoki	Ohsawa		NEC Corporation ohsawa@nwk.cl.nec.co.jp	+81 44 856 2255
Mr. Yuki	Ohta		LTEL Corp yuki.ohta@ppp01.infopepper.or.jp	+81 48 660 1771
Mr. Mitsuji	Okada	voter	NEC Electronics Inc. mokada@asic.mtv.nec.com	+1 408 588 6549
Mr. Richard H.	Paine	voter	The Boeing Company richard.h.paine@boeing.com	+1 206 865 4921
Mr. Al	Petrick	voter	HARRIS Semiconductor apetrick@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com	+1 407 729 4944
Ms. Victoria M.	Poncini		The Boeing Company victoria.poncini@pss.boeing.com	+1 206 865 5342

Appendix 1

Attendance list

Mr. Kent G.	Rollins		HARRIS Corporation krollins@harris.com	+1 407 729 5133
Mr. Oren	Rosenfeld		Eldat Communication Ltd. orenr@eldat.com	+972 3 6182299 X102
Mr. Michael	Rothenberg	voter	BreezeCom mrot@madge.com	+972 3 6458423
Mr. Chandos	Rypinski	voter	LACE Inc. rypinski@microweb.com	+1 415 389 6659
Mr. Roy	Sebring	voter	Intermec Corporation rsebring@intermec.com	+1 206 356 1740
Mr. Mike	Shiba		Symbol Technologies Inc. mikes@symbol.com	+1 408 369 2695
Mr. Yosuke	Shimozuru		Showa Electric Wire & Cable Co. Ltd. k820448@snt1.swcc.co.jp	+81 3 3437 7325
Mr. Thomas	Siep	voter	Texas Instruments siep@ti.com	+1 214 997 6479
Mr. David	Smith		National Security Agency drsmit5@alpha.ncsc.mil	+1 301 688 0271
Mr. Doug	Smith		Aironet Canada Ltd. dsmit@aironet.com	+1 905 475 7171
Mr. Craig	Sparks		Digital Ocean Inc. csparks@digoocean.com	+1 913 888 3380
Ms Cherry	Tom		AT&T Laboratories ctom@attmail.com	+1 201 386 4192
Mr. Ikuo	Tomoda		NTT Co. tomoda.ikuo@nsc.cae.ntt.co.jp	81 43 211 3137
Mr. Joe	Trainor		ITT Cannon trainorj@aol.com	+1 508 875 5042
Mr. Mike	Trompower	voter	Aironet Wireless Communications Inc. mtrom@aironet.com	+1 330 664 7920
Mr. Sarosh	Vesuna	voter	Symbol Technologies Inc. saroshv@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2657
Mr. Timothy M.	Zimmerman	voter	Norand Corporation zimmermt@norand.com	+1 319 369 3471
Mr. Johnny	Zweig	voter	Netwave Technologies Inc. zweig@netwave-wireless.com	+1 510 737 1600