

IEEE P802.15
Wireless Personal Area Networks

Project	IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)		
Title	IEEE P802.15 Working Group Letter Ballot Results		
Date Submitted	[10 January 2000]		
Source	[Ian Gifford] [M/A-COM, Inc.] [1011 Pawtucket Boulevard Lowell, MA USA 01853-3295]	Voice:	[+1 978 442 4650] Fax: [+1 978 442 5442] E-mail: [giffordi@ieee.org]
Re:	[P802-15/D0.6 Draft Standard.]		
Abstract	[IEEE P802.15 Working Group Letter Ballot Results.]		
Purpose	[Provide a Liaison on the formal results of the P802.15 Working Group Letter Ballot #1 results to the Bluetooth SIG and highlight mutual Next Steps.]		
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.		
Release	The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15.		

Standards Working Group IEEE P802.15

Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Homepage at <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15>



Jim Kardach
Intel Corporation
SC9-22 2200 Mission College Blvd
Santa Clara, CA 95052 USA

Mr. Ian C. Gifford
Member #40166079
M/A-COM, Inc.
1011 Pawtucket Boulevard
Lowell, MA 01853-3295 USA
TEL: +1 978 442 4650
FAX: +1 978 442 5442
E-Mail: giffordi@ieee.org

January 5, 2000

Subject: IEEE P802.15 Working Group Letter Ballot Results

Dear Jim,

As you now know we successfully conducted our first IEEE P802.15 Working Group Letter Ballot of the Bluetooth derived standard and we wanted to highlight a few items of interest as well as the next steps for Bluetooth and IEEE.

I. BALLOT SUMMARY

- Letter Ballot 1 MOTION: **To submit the contents of document IEEE P802-15/D0.6 to Sponsor Ballot [default recirculation ballot].**
- Letter Ballot 1 RESULT: **Motion failed with 18/15/2 or 43% (P802-15/D0.6)**

The following tables summarize the voting.

IEEE P802.15.1 LETTER BALLOT 1 DETAIL VOTE

VOTE CATEGORY	NUMBER	PERCENTAGE
Yea	18	43%
Nea	15	36%
Abstain	2	5%
Failed to vote	7	17%
Total	42	100%

IEEE P802.15.1 LETTER BALLOT 1 NET VOTE

VOTE CATEGORY	NUMBER	PERCENTAGE
Yea	18	55%
Nea	15	45%
Total	33	79%

IEEE P802.15.1 LETTER BALLOT 1 TOTAL VOTE

42 Total Voting Members
35 Total Votes (18/15/2)
7 Total Failed to vote (2 of 7 were incomplete NO's)

Note: Just so it is clear we wanted this Draft Standard to fail - it did. Therefore, the key votes are the "NO" (Nea) votes.

II. COMMENTS

Headquarters Office
1730 Massachusetts Avenue
Washington, D.C. 20036-1903 N.W.
(202) 371 0101
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compo
FAX: (202) 728 9614

Publications Office
10662 Los Vaqueros Circle
Los Alamitos CA 90720
Phone:(714) 821 8380
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compo
FAX: (714) 821 4010

Office European
13 Avenue de l'Aiglon (rez A)
1200-Brussels Belgium
Phone: +32 2 770 21 98
TWX: 25387 AVVALB
FAX: +32 3 660 30 14

Asian Office
Ooshima Building
2-19-1 Minami Aoyama
Minato-ku
Tokyo 107 Japan
Phone: +81 3 408 3118
FAX: +81 3 408 3553

Standards Working Group IEEE P802.15

Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Homepage at <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15>

In terms of Comments there were 732 total comments. Of these 732 Comments all 15 Nea voters provided comments and 4 of the Yea voters provided comments. The key comment, '...to update the IEEE Draft Standard with the latest Bluetooth v1.0 B Specification(s)...', was provided by numerous members and we plan to incorporate it into the next draft; which will be Draft 1.0.

Official resolution of these comments will start at our next meeting in Tel-Aviv, Israel (10-14Jan00). However, the more we can get done before the session is closed the more likely we will be able to address all the technical issues in a timely fashion - IEEE tends to be event driven vs. effort driven.

Each of the technical comments (in documents previously forwarded or found on our Web Site (see below)) [LB1_Comments_Technical.PDF or 99172r0aP802-15-TG1-LB1-Comments.doc] must be answered (resolved) in one of the following ways:

- The requested change is made to the Draft
- Another change is made to the Draft and the author of the comment is satisfied that it solves the problem
- Interaction with the author of the comment results in the author dropping the objection
- Requested change is not made and the author is issued a written explanation as to why the change will not be made

IEEE must resolve the technical comments as a body. We will also try to address as many of the editorial comments as possible to ensure speedy transition to Draft 1.0.

A quick analysis of the Bluetooth specific comments indicates that there are 61 Technical ("T" or "t") Comments that are to be focused on i.e., Clause 6 & 7 or Part A-D. They have been provided in the e-mail attachment in the form of an MS Excel workbook file [BTPart_A-D_Comments.xls]; includes cross reference between Bluetooth and IEEE documents as well as some additional information on the worksheets e.g., Map & Participants.

Note 1: Each comment has a "Type of comments" provided; this indicates whether the comment is minor editorial (e), major editorial (E), minor technical (t) or major technical (T).

Note 2: This spreadsheet has been provided to assist the Bluetooth SIG understand the technical comments.

III. IEEE P802.15 WEB SITE

To provide more efficient distribution of the ongoing IEEE information we have decided to provide the Bluetooth SIG access to the IEEE Web Site. Please refer to the official web site for the complete LB1 voter and comment archive as well as the future update archive for the Bluetooth derived Draft Standard. Point your browser here:

IEEE P802.15 Home Page:

<http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15/index.html>

IEEE P802.15.1 Task Group 1 HTML Page:

<http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15/pub/TG1.html>

IEEE P802.15.1 LETTER BALLOT #1 HTML Page (Password)

<http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15/private/LB1/LB1.html>

User Name: **XXX**

Password: **XXX**

Headquarters Office
1730 Massachusetts Avenue
Washington, D.C. 20036-1903 N.W.
(202) 371 0101
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compsco
FAX: (202) 728 9614

Publications Office
10662 Los Vaqueros Circle
Los Alamitos CA 90720
Phone:(714) 821 8380
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compsco
FAX: (714) 821 4010

Office European
13 Avenue de l'Aiglon (rez A)
1200-Brussels Belgium
Phone: +32 2 770 21 98
TWX: 25387 AVVALB
FAX: +32 3 660 30 14

Asian Office
Ooshima Building
2-19-1 Minami Aoyama
Minato-ku
Tokyo 107 Japan
Phone: +81 3 408 3118
FAX: +81 3 408 3553

Standards Working Group IEEE P802.15

Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs)

Homepage at <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15>

IV. NEXT STEPS

In summary we look forward to receiving the Bluetooth SIG Reply Comments, if any, on the IEEE Letter Ballot Comments on or before 17Jan00. The following are the next steps for the IEEE and Bluetooth SIG:

1. **IEEE ACTION:** 29Jan00 Send Comments to Bluetooth PM. ACTION: Tom Siep to coordinate distribution. STATUS: Done 29Jan00.
2. **IEEE ACTION:** 10-14Jan00 Interim Meeting in Tel-Aviv, Israel. ACTION: Ian Gifford to coordinate resolution of as many comments as possible; distribute preliminary results ~14Jan00. STATUS: Pending.
3. **BLUETOOTH ACTION:** 29Dec99 to 17Jan00 Response to Dispositioned Comments - Bluetooth internal review and generation of responses to comments registered by P802.15 voting members. Also, please update IEEE on the status of the TTCN test suites and the SDL Source. ACTION: Chatschik Bisdikian to coordinate Bluetooth response and JimK to help assign PM representative resources and assist with action item closure. STATUS: Pending.
4. **IEEE ACTION:** 21-27Jan00 IEEE P802.15.1 Produces Comment Resolution Summary e.g., Prepare Summary of Technical Issues Collection of all proposed changes to D0.6 and a description of the Action Items to be completed by specified individuals by a specified time. ACTION: Tom Siep to coordinate distribution. STATUS: Pending.
5. **IEEE ACTION:** 27Jan00 to 8Feb00 IEEE P802.15.1 revises IEEE (FM) Draft Standard from D0.6 to D1.0 and produces "Change Bar" version of D0.6 for Bluetooth Review/Approval
6. **BLUETOOTH ACTION:** 27Jan00 to 10Feb00 Approval of "IEEE Dispositioned" D0.6 Comments - Bluetooth internal review and generation of responses, if any, to proposed changes to the Draft. ACTION: Chatschik Bisdikian to coordinate Bluetooth response and JimK to help assign PM representative resources and assist with action item closure. STATUS: Pending.
7. **IEEE ACTION:** 11-17Feb00 IEEE P802.15.1 Applies approved changes and generates a final copy of the IEEE Draft Standard D1.0. ACTION: Tom Siep to coordinate distribution. STATUS: Pending.
8. **IEEE ACTION:** 6-10Mar00 Plenary Meeting in Albuquerque, NM. ACTION: Ian Gifford to coordinate during this meeting the next step with the Draft Standard e.g., IEEE P802.15 WG Recirculation Letter Ballot or IEEE Sponsor Letter Ballot.. STATUS: Pending.

etc.

If you have any questions please feel free to call me +1 978 442 4650, Mr. Tom Siep +1 214 480 6786, and/or Dr. Chatschik Bisdikian +1 914 784 7439.

Yours sincerely,

Ian Gifford
Chairman, IEEE P802.15.1 Task Group 1

cc: IEEE Liaison File

Enclosures: BTPart_A-D_Comments.xls

Headquarters Office
1730 Massachusetts Avenue
Washington, D.C. 20036-1903 N.W.
(202) 371 0101
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compso
FAX: (202) 728 9614

Publications Office
10662 Los Vaqueros Circle
Los Alamitos CA 90720
Phone:(714) 821 8380
TWX: 7108250437 IEEE Compso
FAX: (714) 821 4010

Office European
13 Avenue de l'Aiglon (rez A)
1200-Brussels Belgium
Phone: +32 2 770 21 98
TWX: 25387 AVVALB
FAX: +32 3 660 30 14

Asian Office
Ooshima Building
2-19-1 Minami Aoyama
Minato-ku
Tokyo 107 Japan
Phone: +81 3 408 3118
FAX: +81 3 408 3553