IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document u	nder Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment #	1001	Comment submitted by:	John T.	Scott	Member	2005/06/15
Comment	туре Coordi	nation	Starting Page # G	en Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
This draft is approved by SCC14.						

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution No action required.	Recommendation: Accepted	Recommendation by						
Reason for Recommenda	Reason for Recommendation							
Resolution of Group	Decision of Group: Accepted							
No action required.								
Reason for Group's Deci	sion/Resolution							
Group's Notes								
Group's Action Items								
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions I) none needed							
Editor's Questions and C	Concerns							
Editor's Action Items								

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

2005/06/27	IEEE 802.16-05/036r4						
Document under Review: Comment # 1002			lot Number Turner	0001046	Memb	or	Comment Date 2005/06/15
	Comment submitted by:						2005/00/15
Comment Type Coord Separate electronic files of		Starting Page # TIFF format (unle		-	Fig/Table#	Section	
Suggested Remedy							
Proposed Resolution R No action required.	ecommendation: Accepted		Recomme	endation by			
Reason for Recommendation	n						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Grou	up: Accepted					
No action required.							
Reason for Group's Decisio	on/Resolution						

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions I) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Document u	nder Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballo	ot Number: 0001	1046			Comment Date
Comment # 1	1003	Comment submitted by:	Richard	van Leeuwen		Member		2005/06/15
Comment	туре Techn	ical, Non-binding	Starting Page #	3 Starting L	.ine #	Fig/Table#	Section 9	
	tion (9.3.3?) c	scription of the wmanDev on the wmanDevMIB (rela		.8802 structure,	integration, etc	c.). There needs to I	oe some justi	fication why
Suggested Rer	medy							
Proposed Reso see resolution		ecommendation: Accepted 1039L	-Modified	Recommendatio	n by			
Reason for Re	commendation							
Resolution of (Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted-Modi	fied				
see resolution	of comment	1039L						
Reason for Gr	oup's Decisio	n/Resolution						
Group's Notes Group's Action								
Editor's Notes		Editor's Actions k) done						
Editor's Questi	ons and Cond	cerns						
Editor's Action	Items							

0005/00/07

2005/06/27				IEEE 802.16-05	5/036r4	
Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment # 1004	Comment submitted by:	Richard	van Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
Comment Type Techr The description "this MIB. Replace "this MIB." By ".	nical, Non-binding ." is ambiguous, as this do .the wmanIfMib"(?)	Starting Page # 3 ocument specifies two	Starting Line # 16 MIBs now. Which one is r	Fig/Table# meant here?	Section 9	
Suggested Remedy						
Proposed Resolution R Replace " shall support this MIB." with " shall support wmanIfMil	ecommendation: Accepted	I-Modified R	ecommendation by			
Reason for Recommendation	n					
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Accepted-Modifie	d			
Replace " shall support this MIB." with " shall support wmanIfMil	b and wmanDevMib."					
Reason for Group's Decisio	on/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes The resolution of this com Editor's Questions and Com Editor's Action Items						

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4			Ballot N	umber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1005 Comment	submitted by: Rich	nard v	an Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	Type Editorial	Star	rting Page # <mark>4</mark>	Starting Line # 19	Fig/Table#	Section 2	
Reference to	RFC 1213 is incorrect ("	I" is missing). "ETF	FRFC 1213" shou	ld be "IETF RFC 1213".			

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Accepted	Recommendation by
Reference to RFC 1213	is incorrect ("I" is missing). "ETF RFC 1213" s	should be "IETF RFC 1213".

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Reference to RFC 1213 is incorrect ("I" is missing). "ETF RFC 1213" should be "IETF RFC 1213".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4		Ballot Num	_{lber:} 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1006	Comment submitted by:	Richard	var	Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	Type Editoria	al	Starting Pa	age # 15	Starting Line # 36	Fig/Table#	Section	13.1.2.1

wmanlfSsCps

Figure 8 shows wmanIfSsFecCounterTable as first object under wmanIfSsStatisticCounter. There is no wmanIfSSFecCounterTable in the MIB's ASN.1 Definitions.

Remove object wmanlfSsFecCounterTable from Figure 8.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: Accepted-ModifiedRecommendation byRemove wmanlfSsStatisticCounter and wmanlfSSFecCounterTable.Move wmanlfSsChannelMeasurementTable to wmanlfSsCps.Move wmanlfSsCps.

Remove wmanlfBsStatisticCounter. Move wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable to wmanlfBsCps.

update Fig 4, Fig 8, and the corresponding ASN.1 text.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Remove wmanIfSsStatisticCounter and wmanIfSSFecCounterTable. Move wmanIfSsChannelMeasurementTable to wmanIfSsCps.

Remove wmanlfBsStatisticCounter. Move wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable to wmanlfBsCps.

update Fig 4, Fig 8, and the corresponding ASN.1 text.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Document under Rev	view: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046		Comment Date		
Comment # 1007	Comment submitted by:	Li Li		Member	2005/06/15		
,,	echnical, Binding new section "13.2 wmanDevM	Starting Page # 19 (ib" was intoduced On	-		Section 13.2		
the device(such as BS software should de de	(i). And there should have som fined in the network manager which object instance genera	he way to upgrade the s ment system. On the othe	oftware that run in the er side, there are seve	e device. So a way that eral object instances in	upgrade the device's		
Suggested Remedy The remedy will be provided in the IEEE San Francisco meeting.							
Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Rejected	Rec	ommendation by				
Reason for Recommend No specific text provid							
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Rejected					
Reason for Group's De	ecision/Resolution						
No specific text provid	led.						
Group's Notes							
Group's Action Items							
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions I) none	needed					
Editor's Questions and	Concerns						
Editor's Action Items							

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4	4 Ballot Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1008 Comment submitted	by: Stephen Turner	Member	2005/06/15
Comment Type Editorial Extra left-paren before OID.	Starting Page # 19 Starting Line # 35	Fig/Table# Section	13.2
Suggested Remedy Replace "((" with "(".			
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accor Replace "((" with "(".	epted Recommendation by		
Reason for Recommendation			
Resolution of Group Decision or	f Group: Accepted		
Replace "((" with "(".			
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution			
Group's Notes			
Group's Action Items			
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done		
Editor's Questions and Concerns			
Editor's Action Items			

2005/06/27			IEEE 802.16-0	5/036r4	
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment # 1009 Comment submitted by:		mber: 0001046 an Leeuwen	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/15
Comment Type Editorial wanIfMib the sub-clause title should be "wmanIfMib"	Starting Page # 25	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	14.1
Suggested Remedy					
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Superce See resolution of comment 1010	eded Rec	ommendation by			
Reason for Recommendation					
Resolution of GroupDecision of GrSee resolution of comment 1010	roup: Superceded				
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) dor Editor's Questions and Concerns	ne				
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Rev	iew: IEEE P802.16f/D4	В	allot Nu	mber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1010	Comment submitted by:	Stephen	Τι	ırner	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	Туре 🗧	ditorial	Starting Page	# 25	Starting Line # 1	Fig/Table#	Section	14.1,14.2
[Pages 25 ar Subclause he	nd 226] eadings ai	re misspelled.						

Suggested Remedy

Subclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: AcceptedRecommendation bySubclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Subclause 14.1: Replace "wanIfMib" with "wmanIfMib". Subclause 14.2: Replace "wanDevMib" with "wmanIfMib".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 000 46 05/026*4

2005/06/27 IEEE 802.16-05/036r4				
Document under Review: IEEE I Comment # 1011 Comme	P802.16f/D4 nt submitted by: Mike	Ballot Number: 0001046 Geipel	Member	Comment Date 2005/06/15
Comment Type Editorial "WmanIfEventSeverity" is not refer	Starting Page	# 27 Starting Line # 17	Fig/Table# Section	14.1
Suggested Remedy Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from	n the MIB. (Remove lines 17-3	31 on this page.)		
Proposed Resolution Recommer Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from	ndation: Accepted m the MIB. (Remove lines 17-3	Recommendation by 1 on this page.)		
Reason for Recommendation				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Group: Accepted			
Delete "WmanIfEventSeverity" from	n the MIB. (Remove lines 17-3	1 on this page.)		
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolu	tion			
Group's Notes Group's Action Items				
Editor's Notes Editor's	s Actions k) done			

Editor's Questions and Concerns

2005/06/27 IEEE 802.16-0				IEEE 802.16-05	/036r4
Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ball	ot Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1012	Comment submitted by:	Mike	Geipel	Member	2005/06/15
Comment Type Techr What is the purpose of "wn node.	ical, Binding nanIfBsConfiguration"? Th	Starting Page # ne SS and Comon		-	Section 14.2 e configuration table child
(For example: "wmanlfBsC "wmanlfSsConfiguration" (r		l of "wmanlfBsCor	figuration" but "wmanlfS	SsConfigurationTable" is n	ot a child node of
Suggested Remedy Treat all such config tables	the same.				
Proposed Resolution R See the resolution of comm	ecommendation: Superced nent 1033	led	Recommendation by		
Reason for Recommendation	1				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Superceded			
See the resolution of comm	nent 1033				
Reason for Group's Decisio	on/Resolution				
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Editor's Questions and Con	Editor's Actions k) done	9			
Editor's Action Items					

2005/06/27		IEEE 802.16-05/	/036r4
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D	4 Ballot Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1013 Comment submitted	by: Richard van Leeuwen	Member	2005/06/15
Comment Type Editorial ASN.1 Definitions (page 132, line 42), iten "tomer" should be "timer".	Starting Page # ¹³² Starting Line # n wmanlfBsOfdmaBandAMCAllocTimer	-	Section 14
Suggested Remedy			
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Acco ASN.1 Definitions (page 132, line 42), iten "tomer" should be "timer".			
Reason for Recommendation			
Resolution of Group Decision o	Group: Accepted		
ASN.1 Definitions (page 132, line 42), iten "tomer" should be "timer".	n wmanlfBsOfdmaBandAMCAllocTimer		
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution			
Group's Notes			
Group's Action Items			
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done		
Editor's Questions and Concerns			
Editor's Action Items			

2005/06/27			IEEE	E 802.16-05/0)36r4	
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot I	Number: 0001046				Comment Date
Comment # 1014 Comment submitted by: Ric	chard	van Leeuwen		Member		2005/06/15
Comment Type Editorial Sta	tarting Page # 142	2 Starting Line #	19 Fig	/Table#	Section 14	
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 19), item wn "Base Station" should be: "Subscriber Station".	manlfSsCps					
Suggested Remedy						
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted		ecommendation by				
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 19), item wn "Base Station" should be: "Subscriber Station".	manIfSsCps					
Reason for Recommendation						
Resolution of Group Decision of Group:	Accepted					
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 19), item wr "Base Station" should be: "Subscriber Station".	manlfSsCps					
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution						
Group's Notes						
Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done						
Editor's Questions and Concerns						
Editor's Action Items						

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Ballot Number: 0001046					Commer	nt Date			
Comment #	1015	Comment submitted by:	Richard van Leeuwen		Member	Member		06/15	
Comment	туре Tech	nical, Binding	Starting	Page # 142	Starting Line # 24	Fig/Table#	Section	14	
The SsConfig wmanIfMib.	gFileEncoding	e 142, line 24, through p g table is now in both wma objects from wmanlfMib (a	nlfMib ar	nd wmanDevMi	ib, and according to s	ection 13.1.2.1 should	be no long	ger in	

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted **Recommendation by** ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 24, through page 144, line 9), item wmanlfSsConfigFileEncodingTable The SsConfigFileEncoding table is now in both wmanlfMib and wmanDevMib, and according to section 13.1.2.1 should be no longer in wmanlfMib.

Remove this table and its objects from wmanlfMib (and renumber the remaining wmanlfSsCps objects accordingly).

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

ASN.1 Definitions (page 142, line 24, through page 144, line 9), item wmanlfSsConfigFileEncodingTable The SsConfigFileEncoding table is now in both wmanlfMib and wmanDevMib, and according to section 13.1.2.1 should be no longer in wmanlfMib.

Remove this table and its objects from wmanlfMib (and renumber the remaining wmanlfSsCps objects accordingly).

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review: IEEE P802.16	f/D4 e	Ballot Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment #	1016 Comment submi	tted by: Richard	van Leeuwen	Member	2005/06/15
Comment	туре Editorial	Starting Page	# 156 Starting Line # 7	Fig/Table# Section	14
1.1 "OLD" (COMMENTS FROM D3, ACCI	EPTED BUT NOT INC	CORPORATED IN D4:		

14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 156, line 7), item wmanlfSsPkmAuthInvalidErrorCode Editorial: "Authorization Invald message" should be "Authorization Invalid message". (Note: This used to be in 2 places; only one has been corrected.)

Suggested Remedy

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: AcceptedRecommendation by14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 156, line 7), item wmanlfSsPkmAuthInvalidErrorCodeEditorial: "Authorization Invald message" should be "Authorization Invalid message".(Note: This used to be in 2 places; only one has been corrected.)

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 156, line 7), item wmanlfSsPkmAuthInvalidErrorCode Editorial: "Authorization Invald message" should be "Authorization Invalid message". (Note: This used to be in 2 places; only one has been corrected.)

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

2005/06/27				IEEE 802.16-05	/036r4	
Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot N	lumber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment # 1017	Comment submitted by:	Richard	van Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
Comment Type Editoria ASN.1 Definitions (page "tomer" should be "timer".			⁾ Starting Line # 49 AMCAIIocTimer	Fig/Table#	Section 14	
Suggested Remedy						
Proposed Resolution Re ASN.1 Definitions (page "tomer" should be "timer".	commendation: Accepted 180, line 49), item wn		commendation by AMCAIIocTimer			
Reason for Recommendation						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted				
ASN.1 Definitions (page "tomer" should be "timer".	180, line 49), item wn	nanlfSsOfdmaBand	AMCAllocTimer			
Reason for Group's Decision	n/Resolution					
Group's Notes						
Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done	2				
Editor's Questions and Conc	erns					
Editor's Action Items						

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review: IEEE P802.16f/	D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment #	1018 Comment submitte	d by: Richard	d va	an Leeuwen	Member	2005/06/15
Comment	туре Editorial	Startir	g Page # 184	Starting Line # ⁸	Fig/Table#	Section ¹⁴
1.1 "OLD"	COMMENTS FROM D3, ACCEF	TED BUT N	OT INCORPOF	RATED IN D4:		

14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 184, line 8), item wmanlfSsOfdmaBsEIRP Editorial: The description ("Signed in units of 1 dBM.") is incomplete.

Editorial: The description ("Signed in units of 1 dBM.") is incomplete. Complete the description.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: Accepted-ModifiedRecommendation bywmanlfBsOfdmaBsEIRP and wmanlfBsOfdmBsEIRPAdd description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

wmanlfSsOfdmaBsEIRP and wmanlfSsOfdmBsEIRP

Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

wmanIfBsOfdmaBsEIRP and wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

wmanlfSsOfdmaBsEIRP and wmanlfSsOfdmBsEIRP

Add description "The EIRP is the equivalent isotropic radiated power of the base station, which is computed for a simple single-antenna transmitter"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

2005/06/27				IEEE 802.16-05	/036r4		
Document under Review: Comment # 1019	IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment submitted by:		Number: 0001046 van Leeuwen	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/15	
Comment Type Editori 1.1 "OLD" COMMENTS F	al	Starting Page # 19	2 Starting Line # 1	Fig/Table#	Section		
14. ASN.1 Definitions (page 192, line 1), item wmanlfCmnClassifierRulelpTosMask Editorial: "this value is used check range checking of" is no proper English; should be??.							
Suggested Remedy							
Proposed Resolution Ro Replace this value is used check ran with this value is used for the ran	0 0	I-Modified F	ecommendation by				
Reason for Recommendation	1						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Accepted-Modifie	d				
Replace this value is used check ran with this value is used for the ra	· · · ·						
Reason for Group's Decisio	n/Resolution						

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Document under Review:	Ballo	Ballot Number: 0001046				Comment Date	
Comment # 1020	Comment submitted by:	Richard	van Leeuwen		Member		2005/06/15
Comment Type Editor	ial	Starting Page # ¹	92 Starting Line	# 15	Fig/Table# ⁴⁹	Section	13.1.2.1.2
wmanlfSsStatisticsCou In the ASN.1 Definitions as Change "wmanlfSsStatistic	nter (page 15, lines 49 well as in Figure 8, this ob	and 51) ject is called wmar	IlfSsStatisticCounte	r (without	'S').		
Suggested Remedy							
Proposed Resolution R See resolution of commen	ecommendation: Superced t 1033	ed	Recommendation b	у			
Reason for Recommendatio	n						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Superceded					
See resolution of commen	t 1033						
Reason for Group's Decision	on/Resolution						
Group's Notes							
Group's Action Items							
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done						
Editor's Questions and Cor	ncerns						
Editor's Action Items							

Document under Review	: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	_{mber:} 0001046			Comment Date
Comment # 1021	Comment submitted by:	Richard va	in Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
71	nical, Non-binding e 207, line 26), item wn ate" is inappropriate here.	Starting Page # 207 nanlfCmnSfCsSpecif	-	Fig/Table#	Section	14
Suggested Remedy						
-	Recommendation: Accepted le 207, line 26), item wr ate" is inappropriate here.		ommendation by ication			
Reason for Recommendation	on					
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Accepted				
ASN.1 Definitions (pag MAX-ACCESS "read-creat Change to "read-only".	e 207, line 26), item wr ate" is inappropriate here.	nanlfCmnSfCsSpecifi	ication			
Reason for Group's Decisi	ion/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done	9				
Editor's Questions and Co	ncerns					
Editor's Action Items						

Document under Revie Comment # 1022	ew: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment submitted by:		nber: 0001046 n Leeuwen	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/15
Comment Type Ed wanDevMib the sub-clause title sho		Starting Page # 226	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	14.2
Suggested Remedy						
Proposed Resolution See resolution of comm	Recommendation: Superced nent 1010	ded Recc	ommendation by			
Reason for Recommenda	ition					
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Superceded				
See resolution of comm	nent 1010					
Reason for Group's Dec	ision/Resolution					
Group's Notes						
Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done	e				
Editor's Questions and	Concerns					
Editor's Action Items						

Document under Review: IEE	E P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1023 Cor	nment submitted by:	Mike Ge	ipel	Member	2005/06/15
CommentTypeTechnical, BwmanDevBsSnmpAgentResetBactionsResetBsvalue, instructs	Bs is defined as part	Starting Page # 227 of the WmanDevBsSn	•	-	tion 14.2 In is: "When set to
This is a control function that doe	es not have anything t	to do with the configurin	g the SnmpAgent. This is	s also not specific to the	basestation.
Suggested Remedy Rename wmanDevBsSnmpAge	entResetBs to wman	DevReset and make it	t common to both BS an	nd SS	
Proposed Resolution Recom see resolution of comment 1024	mendation: Accepted- 4	-Modified Reco	ommendation by		
Reason for Recommendation					
Resolution of Group	Decision of Grou	up: Accepted-Modified			
see resolution of comment 1024	4				
Reason for Group's Decision/Res	solution				
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Edi	itor's Actions k) done				
Editor's Questions and Concerns	:				
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document u	nder Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1024	Comment submitted by:	Mike Ge	eipel	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	туре Editoria	l	Starting Page # 228	Starting Line # 5	Fig/Table#	Section	14.2
Description for "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigIndex" is confusing: "An arbitrary index. Must have value of 1."							

(Why is this defined to be a table if there can only be one row?)

If there can only be exactly one row, and all columns in this 'table' are read-write, does there need to be a row-status column?

Suggested Remedy

Remove restriction on "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigIndex" (or remove "wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigRowStatus").

I would argue that being able to define multiple trap destinations would be desirable. You may define inactive rows (which are still being written to).

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified Recommendation by 1. Remove table wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable 2. Create table wmanDevCmnSnmpV1V2TrapDestTable and object wmanDevCmnResetDevice as follows:	
<pre>wmanDevCmnObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevMibObjects 3 } wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent contain objects related to the SNMP agent implemented by the device</pre>	
 wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevCmnObjects 1 } Bs SNMP agent trap destination table	
<pre> wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table contains the configuration objects for the device implementing SNMP agent." ::= { wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent 1 }</pre>	
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table is indexed by wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex." INDEX { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex } ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable 1 }	

WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry ::= SEQUENCE { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex INTEGER. wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrType InetAddressType, wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddr InetAddress. wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPort Integer32, wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatus RowStatus} wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (1..8) MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "The index identifies the trap destination. The number of rows is limited to eight." ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 1 } wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrType OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX InetAddressType MAX-ACCESS read-create STATUS current DESCRIPTION "The type of IP address used in the object wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestV1V2TrapDestIpAddr." ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 2 } wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddr OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX InetAddress MAX-ACCESS read-create STATUS current DESCRIPTION "IP address of SNMP manager configured as a trap destination for versions V1 and V2 of SNMP. If this object is not created or empty the traps are not sent." ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 3 } wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPort OBJECT-TYPE Integer32 (0..65535) SYNTAX MAX-ACCESS read-create STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Port number of SNMP manager configured as a trap destination for versions V1 and V2 of SNMP." REFERENCE "Section 11.13.19.3.4.6 in IEEE 802.16-2004" ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 4 } wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatus OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX RowStatus MAX-ACCESS read-create

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This object is used to ensure that the write operation to multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent." ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry 5 }

-- wmanDevCmnDeviceCofig contains common configuration objects for the device

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

1. Remove table wmanDevBsSnmpAgentConfigTable

2. Create table wmanDevCmnSnmpV1V2TrapDestTable and object wmanDevCmnResetDevice as follows:

```
wmanDevCmnObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevMibObjects 3 }
```

-- wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent contain objects related to the SNMP agent implemented by the device

```
wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanDevCmnObjects 1 }
```

```
-- Bs SNMP agent trap destination table
```

```
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
     "This table contains the configuration objects for the device
      implementing SNMP agent.
    ::= { wmanDevCmnSnmpAgent 1 }
wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS
            current
    DESCRIPTION
      "This table is indexed by wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex."
    INDEX { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex }
    ::= { wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestTable 1 }
```

```
WmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
```

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndexINTEGEK,wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrTypeInetAddressType,wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIpAddrInetAddress,wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestPortInteger32,wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestRowStatusRowStatus}

wmanDevCmnV1V2TrapDestIndex OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (1..8) MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "The index identifies the trap destination. The number of rows is limited to eight."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	_{mber:} 0001046		Comment Date		
Comment # 1025	Comment submitted by: Mike Geipel				2005/06/15		
Comment Type Techn The "wmanDevSsEventLo	ical, Binding gConfigTable" and "wmar	Starting Page # 233 DevBsEventLogConfig	-	0	Section 14.2 are mutually exclusive.		
Suggested Remedy Rename and combine "wmanDevSsEventLogConfigTable" and "wmanDevBsEventLogConfigTable" to "wmanDevEventLogConfigTable"; make this definition common to both SS & BS							
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted-Modified Recommendation by Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner							
Reason for Recommendation	n						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted-Modified					
Editor to apply methodolog	gy employed to resolve co	mment 1024 to resolve	this comment in similar	manner			
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution							
Group's Notes Group's Action Items							
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done						
Editor's Questions and Con	cerns						
Editor's Action Items							

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	_{mber:} 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1026	Comment submitted by:	Mike Ge	eipel	Member 200		
Comment	туре Techn	ical, Binding	Starting Page # 236	Starting Line # 14	Fig/Table#	Section 14.	2
The "wmanDevBsEventTable" and "wmanDevsEventTable" appear to be identical definitions that are mutually exclusive.							

Suggested Remedy

Rename and combine "wmanDevBsEventTable" and "wmanDevsEventTable" to a single "wmanDevEventTable"; make this definition common to both SS & BS

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: Accepted-ModifiedRecommendation byEditor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Editor to apply methodology employed to resolve comment 1024 to resolve this comment in similar manner

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4					llot Nui	_{mber:} 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1027	Comment s	submitted by:	Krzysztof	Du	dzinski	Membe	er	2005/06/15
Comment	туре Editori	al		Starting Page #	999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
In table wmanlfBsSsProvisionedForSfTable the description of the object wmanlfBsSsProvisionedForSfRowStatus is incorrect.									
Suggested Remedy "This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service flow multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"									
Proposed Res	olution Re	ecommendat	ion: Accepted	-Modified	Reco	ommendation by			

- Change p38, L42
- from

"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service flow is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent" to

"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Change

p38, L42 from

"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple service flow is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent" to

"This object is used to ensure that the write, create, delete operation to multiple columns is guaranteed to be treated as atomic operation by agent"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review:	IEEE	P802.16f/D4	Ва	llot Nu	mber: 00	01046			Comment Date
Comment # 1028	Comm	ent submitted by:	Krzysztof	Du	udzinski		Membe	er	2005/06/15
Comment Type Techr	nical, Sa	tisfied (was	Starting Page #	999	Starting	Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
Resolution of the comment Instructed to move trap obj should stay at the same pla	ects onl	y below TrapPrefix		s all tra	p objects	moved as ins	structed but also No	otificationObject	sTable, which
Suggested Remedy Move NotificationObjectsT	ables it	at the same level	as wmanlfBsTra	apPrefi	x (wmanlf	fSsTrapPrefix	a, wmanDevBsTrap	Prefix respectiv	/ely)
Proposed Resolution R	ecomme	endation: Accepted	-Modified	Rec	ommendat	ion by			
Replace:									
wmanIfBsSsNotificationOf SYNTAX SEQUE MAX-ACCESS not-a STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table contains reported by the tra ::= { wmanIfBsTrapPre	NCE OF accessil SS noti p."	⁻ WmanIfBsSsNo ble	tificationObjects	Entry					
With:									
wmanlfBsSsNotificationOf SYNTAX SEQUE MAX-ACCESS not-a STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table contains reported by the tra ::= { wmanlfBsTrapDe	NCE OF accessil SS noti p."	WmanIfBsSsNo ble fication objects that	tificationObjects	Entry					
Replace:									
wmanIfSsNotificationObje SYNTAX SEQUE MAX-ACCESS not-a STATUS current	NCE OF	WmanlfSsNotific	cationObjectsEnt	try					

STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

::= { wmanlfSsTrapPrefix 5 }

With:

wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
 SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry
 MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
 STATUS current
 DESCRIPTION
 "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
 reported by the trap."
 ::= { wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 1 }

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Replace:

```
wmanlfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanlfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
   "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
   ::= { wmanlfBsTrapPrefix 1 }
```

With:

```
wmanlfBsSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanlfBsSsNotificationObjectsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
   "This table contains SS notification objects that have been
   reported by the trap."
   ::= { wmanlfBsTrapDefinitions 1 }
```

Replace:

wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION

"This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap." ::= { wmanlfSsTrapPrefix 5 }

With:

wmanIfSsNotificationObjectsTable OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF WmanIfSsNotificationObjectsEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This table contains SS notification objects that have been reported by the trap."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1029	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof Du	udzinski	Member	2005/06/15
Comment Type Techr	nical, Satisfied (was	Starting Page # 999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
Comment #308 should als Split of binary codded valu wmanlfBsOfdmSubChRec	ues not done for SS objec	t wmanlfSsOfdmSubC	hReqRegionFull shou	ld follow example of	
Suggested Remedy					
Split object wmanlfSsOfdr	mSubChReqRegionFull in	to two objects in the sa	ame way the object wr	manIfBsOfdmSubChI	ReqRegionFull was split.
Proposed Resolution R	ecommendation: Accepted	I Rec	ommendation by		
Split object wmanlfSsOfdr	nSubChReqRegionFull in	to two objects in the sa	ame way the object wr	manlfBsOfdmSubChI	ReqRegionFull was split.
Reason for Recommendation	n				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted			
Split object wmanlfSsOfdr	mSubChReqRegionFull in	to two objects in the sa	ame way the object wr	manlfBsOfdmSubChI	ReqRegionFull was split.
Reason for Group's Decisio	on/Resolution				
Group's Notes					
Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done)			
Editor's Questions and Con	ncerns				
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review	IEEE P802.16f/D4	mber: 0001046		Comment Date	
Comment # 1030	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof Du	dzinski	Member	2005/06/15
Comment Type Edito	rial	Starting Page # 999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
Units and description sho wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfSsOfdmInitRngM wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfBsOfdmInitRngM and similar OFDMA object	axRSS	n objects:			
Suggested Remedy					
Change dbM to dBm in th wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfSsOfdmInitRngM wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfBsOfdmInitRngM and similar OFDMA object	axRSS				
Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Accepted	l Reco	ommendation by		
Change dbM to dBm in th wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfSsOfdmInitRngM wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfBsOfdmInitRngM and similar OFDMA object	axRSS				
Reason for Recommendation	on				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted			
Change dbM to dBm in th wmanIfSsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfSsOfdmInitRngM wmanIfBsOfdmBsEIRP wmanIfBsOfdmInitRngM and similar OFDMA object	axRSS				
Reason for Group's Decis	ion/Resolution				
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Luitor 5 Hotos

LUILOI & AULIONS NY MONO

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Revie	w: IEEE P802.16f/D4	В	allot Nu	mber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1031	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof	Du	ıdzinski	Membe	er	2005/06/15
Comment	Туре Тес	hnical, Satisfied (was	Starting Page	# 999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
Comment #3	14 is not im	plemented. BS notification	group (wmanlfN	libBsNo	otificationGroup) mus	st be mandatory.		

Recommendation by

Suggested Remedy

Change the description of compliance statement from: GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION "This group is optional for Base Station."

to

GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION "This group is mandatory for Base Station."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Change the description of compliance statement from: GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION "This group is optional for Base Station."

to

GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION "This group is mandatory for Base Station."

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

RChange the description of compliance statement from: GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION "This group is optional for Base Station."

to

GROUP wmanlfMibBsNotificationGroup DESCRIPTION

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

A CONTRACT OF A CONTRACT.		y for Base Station."
"I bie group	ue mondator	v tor Raco Station "
	15 manoalor	

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution **Group's Notes** Group's Action Items Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done Editor's Questions and Concerns **Editor's Action Items** Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Ballot Number: 0001046 **Comment Date** Comment # 1032 Krzysztof Dudzinski Member 2005/06/15 Comment submitted by: Starting Page # 999 Type Technical, Satisfied (was Starting Line # Comment Fig/Table# Section Comments 5, 177-181 not applied properly. The instruction was to remove traps relateed to power, temperature, fan. The editor action was to move them to DEV-MIB. Suggested Remedy Remove from DEV-MIB the traps listed in the comment #005 **Proposed Resolution Recommendation:** Accepted-Modified Recommendation by Editor to move the trap object tables to an Informative Annex, marked as a recommended practice, and provide appropriate description. **Reason for Recommendation Resolution of Group** Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified Editor to move the trap object tables to an Informative Annex, marked as a recommended practice, and provide appropriate description. Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution **Group's Notes Group's Action Items** Editor's Actions k) done **Editor's Notes** Editor's Questions and Concerns Editor's Action Items

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Ballot	Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1033 Comment submitted by: Krzysztof	Dudzinski	Member	2005/06/15
CommentTypeTechnical, Non-bindingStartingPage9Single table in the "folder" doesn't make sense. This became an issue at The issue affects the following tables now: wmanlfBsConfigurationTable wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable wmanlfSsChannelMeasurementTable9		Fig/Table# per of tables.	Section

Suggested Remedy

Move objects: wmanlfBsConfigurationTable wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable wmanlfSsChannelMeasurementTable one level up and remove the "folders": wmanlfBsConfiguration wmanlfBsStatisticCounter wmanlfBsStatisticCounter

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Move objects: wmanlfBsConfigurationTable wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable wmanlfSsChannelMeasurementTable one level up and remove the "folders": wmanlfBsConfiguration wmanlfBsStatisticCounter wmanlfBsStatisticCounter Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted

Move objects: wmanlfBsConfigurationTable wmanlfBsChannelMeasurementTable wmanlfSsChannelMeasurementTable one level up

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

and remove the "folders": wmanlfBsConfiguration wmanlfBsStatisticCounter wmanlfBsStatisticCounter

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review: IEEE P802	2.16f/D4	Ballot Numb	er: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1034 Comment s	ubmitted by: Krzysztof	Dudzi	nski	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	Type Technical, Satisfied	(was Starting Pa	age # 999 s	tarting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
Index wman	lfBsOfdmaDiucIndex shou	Id have MAX-ACCESS	not-accessible				

Suggested Remedy

Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanlfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accesible

 Proposed Resolution
 Recommendation: Accepted
 Recommendation by

 Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanlfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accesible
 Second and a second accesible
 Second accesible

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Change MAX-ACCESS of wmanlfBsOfdmaDiucIndex to not-accesible

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	E	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1035	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof	Du	dzinski	Memb	er	2005/06/15
Comment	Type Techn	ical, Satisfied (was	Starting Page	# 999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
		not implemented properly		ar miha u	inder the come rest			

wman(16) should be just object identification to allow creation of other mibs under the same root.

Suggested Remedy

IS: iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16) { 1 0 8802 16 } SHOULD BE: iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDev(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }

Proposed	Resolution	Recommendation:	Accepted-Modified	Recommendation	by
page 226	6, line 59-60				
change					
iso(1).std	l(0).iso8802(88	02).wman(16) { 1	0 8802 16 }		
to					
iso(1).std	l(0).iso8802(88	02).wman(16).wm	nanDevMib(1) { 1	51}	

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

```
page 226, line 59-60
change
iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16) { 1 0 8802 16 }
to
iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDevMib(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }
```

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	В	allot Nur	nber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1036	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof	Du	dzinski	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	туре Techr	nical, Binding	Starting Page	# 999	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
iso8802 objec C:\JobNMS\	ct identity sho NG\MIBS\Sta	uld be imported - compilat andard\WMAN-D~1.MIB(4	tion warning: 47) : Warning 2	21 : Nod	le "isox0x8802" with C	DID "1.0.8802" create	ed	

Suggested Remedy

Import object identity iso8802 from relevant MIB module. Alternatively define it explicitely in our MIB.

Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Rejected	Recommendation by					
Reason for Recommendation							
Resolution of Group	Decision of Group: Rejected						
•	Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution Remedy is inadequate. Commenter agreed to provide more complete remedy during next recirculation.						
Group's Notes							
Group's Action Items							
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions I) none needed						
Editor's Questions and Co	oncerns						
Editor's Action Items							

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Revie	ew: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1037L	Comment submitted by:	Joey	Chou	Member		2005/06/16
Comment	туре Те	chnical, Non-binding	Starting Page # 1	Starting Line # 56	Fig/Table#	Section	1.1
Since wman[DevMib is a	added to this document, it sho	ould be reflected in t	he scope.			

Suggested Remedy

Change the text in section 1.1 from

"This document provides enhancements to IEEE Standard 802.16-2004 to define a management information base (MIB) for the MAC and PHY and associated management procedures." to

"This document provides enhancements to IEEE Standard 802.16-2004 to define a management information base (MIB) and associated management procedures for the MAC and PHY, as well as the 802.16 device."

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Rejected Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

The original text is transcribed from the 802.16f PAR, and is required to appear in the amendment document verbatim. The group does not have the authority to change the PAR through the commentary process.

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Rejected

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

The original text is transcribed from the 802.16f PAR, and is required to appear in the amendment document verbatim. The group does not have the authority to change the PAR through the commentary process.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions I) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document d		IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment submitted by:		lumber: 0001046 Chou	Member		omment Date 2005/06/16
Comment		nical, Non-binding	Starting Page # 4	Starting Line # 37	Fig/Table#	Section 9.32	.000/00/10
Change from				-	-		
"This subclau to	ise describes	the integration with MIB-II	under Interface Grou	p MIB defined in IETF RF	2286"		
	ise describes	the integration of wmanlf	Vib with MIB-II under	Interface Group MIB define	ed in IETF RFC286"		
Suggested Re	amedy						
Change from	-						
"This subclau to	ise describes	the integration with MIB-II	under Interface Grou	p MIB defined in IETF RF0	C2863"		
	ise describes	the integration of wmanlf	Mib with MIB-II under	Interface Group MIB define	ed in IETF RFC2863	3"	
Proposed Res	olution R	Recommendation: Accepted	l R	ecommendation by			
Change from							
		the integration with MIB-II	under Interface Grou	p MIB defined in IETF RFC	C286"		
	ise describes	the integration of wmanlf	Mib with MIB-II under	Interface Group MIB define	ed in IETF RFC286"		
Reason for R	aaammandatia	n					
	econnientatio						
Resolution of	Group	Decision of Gro	oup: Accepted				
		the integration with MIB-II	under Interface Grou	p MIB defined in IETF RF0	C2863"		
to "This subclau	ise describes	the integration of wmanlf	Mib with MIB-II under	Interface Group MIB define	ed in IETF RFC2863	3"	
Reason for G	roup's Decisio	on/Resolution					
Group's Notes	5						
Group's Action	n Items						
Editor's Notes	5	Editor's Actions k) done)				
Editor's Quest	tions and Cor	ncerns					
Editor's Action	n Items						

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballo	ot Number:	0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1039L	Comment submitted by:	Joey	Chou		Member		2005/06/16
Comment	туре Techn	ical, Non-binding	Starting Page #	6 Sta	rting Line # 26	Fig/Table#	Section 9	
wmanDevMil	b MIB subtree	location is missing.						

Suggested Remedy

Add the following subcaluse

9.3.3 wmanDevMib MIB Subtree

This subclause specifies that wmanDevMib shall be accessed through the following MIB tree.

iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16)"

Proposed	Resolution	Recommendation: Accepted-Modi	fied Recommendation	by
	existing text as: gement Informa			

The management information base for BS and SS is defined as two ASN.1 MIB modules: wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for all BSs. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for SSs, which are managed using SNMP protocol. An SS that implements the SNMP agent shall support this MIB.

The wmanIfMib MIB module (interface MIB) defines management objects relevant to 802.16 broadband wireless interface as defined in this standard.

The wmanDevMib MIB module (device MIB) defines management objects relevant to the device implementing 802.16 interface. The objects of this MIB module may refer explicitly to terms defined in the standard (e.g. configuration file encodings) but mainly provides the mandatory support required to implement, manage and test the equipment implementing 802.16 interface.

[Add new subclause:] 9.3.3 wmanDevMib MIB Subtree

This subclause specifies that wmanDevMib shall be accessed through the following MIB tree:

iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDevMib(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

[Change existing text as:] 9.3 Management Information Base

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

The management information base for BS and SS is defined as two ASN.1 MIB modules: wmanlfMib and wmanDevMib. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for all BSs. The implementation of both MIB modules is mandatory for SSs, which are managed using SNMP protocol. An SS that implements the SNMP agent shall support this MIB.

The wmanIfMib MIB module (interface MIB) defines management objects relevant to 802.16 broadband wireless interface as defined in this standard.

The wmanDevMib MIB module (device MIB) defines management objects relevant to the device implementing 802.16 interface. The objects of this MIB module may refer explicitly to terms defined in the standard (e.g. configuration file encodings) but mainly provides the mandatory support required to implement, manage and test the equipment implementing 802.16 interface.

[Add new subclause:] 9.3.3 wmanDevMib MIB Subtree

This subclause specifies that wmanDevMib shall be accessed through the following MIB tree:

<u>iso(1).std(0).iso8802(8802).wman(16).wmanDev(1) { 1 0 8802 16 1 }</u>

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Docume	nt under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4		Ballot Nu	ımber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment	# 1040L	Comment submitted by	r: Joey	CI	hou	Member		2005/06/16
Comment	Type Edito	rial	Starting	Page # 16	Starting Line # 3	³ Fig/Table#	Section	13.1.2.4.1.1
Suggested	Remedy							

Change from 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable This table contains OFDM UCD channel to 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable contains OFDM UCD channel

 Proposed Resolution
 Recommendation: Accepted
 Recommendation by

 Change from
 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanlfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanlfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable

 This table contains OFDM UCD channel
 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanlfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable
 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanlfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Change from 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable This table contains OFDM UCD channel to 13.1.2.4.1.1 wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable wmanIfSsOfdmUplinkChannelTable contains OFDM UCD channel

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Reviev	v: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	ımber: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1041L	Comment submitted by:	Joey C	hou	Member	2005/06/16
Comment Type Editor Inconsistent object name	orial	Starting Page # 20	Starting Line # 24	Fig/Table#	Section 13.2.1.2.1
Suggested Remedy Change from wmanDevBsTrapControl to wmanDevBsTrapControl					
Proposed Resolution Change from wmanDevBsTrapControl to wmanDevBsTrapControl	-	l Red	commendation by		
Reason for Recommendati	on				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted			
Change from wmanDevBsTrapControl to wmanDevBsTrapControl					
Reason for Group's Decis	ion/Resolution				
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done	•			
Editor's Questions and Co	oncerns				
Editor's Action Items					

2005/06/27	,				IEEE 802.16	-05/036r4	
Document u Comment #	inder Review: IEE 1042L Cor	E P802.16f/D4 nment submitted by:		Number: 0001046 Chou	Men	nber	Comment Date 2005/06/16
Comment	туре Editorial		Starting Page # 20	Starting Line #	24 Fig/Table#	Section	13.2.1.2.1
This table cont to 13.2.1.1.1 wr	nanDevBsSnmpA tains the configurat nanDevBsSnmpA	AgentConfigTable ion AgentConfigTable Table contains the co	onfiguration				
Proposed Reso see resolution	olution Recom	mendation: Accepted 1	-Modified	Recommendation by			
Editor to make	e name changes in	subclause 13 to mat	ch resolution of com	ment 1024			
Reason for Re	ecommendation						
Resolution of	Group	Decision of Gro	up: Accepted-Modifi	ed			
see resolution	of comment 1024	1					
Editor to make	e name changes in	subclause 13 to mat	ch resolution of com	ment 1024			

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

2003/00/21						
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Number: 0001046			Comment Date		
Comment # 1043L Comment submitted by:	Joey C	y Chou		ber	2005/06/16	
Comment Type Editorial	Starting Page # 21	Starting Line # 6	Fig/Table#	Section	13.2.2.1	
Inconsistent table name						
Suggested Remedy Change from "13.2.2.1 wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configura such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number to "13.2.2.1 wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains config such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number	, and software or firmwa	are revision." about the subscriber st				

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Recommendation by Change from

"13.2.2.1 wmanlfSsConfigFileEncodingTable

wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision."

to

"13.2.2.1 wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable

wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision."

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Change from

"13.2.2.1 wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable

wmanIfSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision." to

"13.2.2.1 wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable

wmanDevSsConfigFileEncodingTable contains configuration file information about the subscriber station such as manufacturer, hardware model, serial number, and software or firmware revision."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done					
Editor's Questions and Conc	cerns					
Editor's Action Items						
Document under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment # 1044L	Comment submitted by:	Joey	Chou	Member		2005/06/16
Comment Type Editoria	al	Starting Page # 22	Starting Line # 33	Fig/Table#	Section	13.2.2.2.2
Change the font size of "wn	nanDevSsTrapDefinitions	group defines all th	ne traps reported by SS."	from 9 to 10.		
Suggested Remedy						
Change the font size of "wr	nanDevSsTrapDefinitions	s group defines all th	ne traps reported by SS."	from 9 to 10.		
Proposed Resolution Re	ecommendation: Accepted	F	Recommendation by			
Change the font size of "wn	nanDevSsTrapDefinitions	group defines all th	ne traps reported by SS."	from 9 to 10.		
Reason for Recommendation						
Resolution of Group	Decision of Grou	Jp: Accepted				
Change the font size of "wn	nanDevSsTrapDefinitions	group defines all th	ne traps reported by SS."	from 9 to 10.		
Reason for Group's Decision	n/Resolution					
Group's Notes						
Group's Action Items						
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions k) done					
Editor's Questions and Conc	cerns					
Editor's Action Items						

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document u	under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Nu	mber: 0001046			Comment Date		
Comment #	1045L Comment submitted by:	Joey Ch	nou	Member		2005/06/16		
Comment		Starting Page # 23	Starting Line # 5	Fig/Table#	Section	13.2.2.3.3		
"This is the Sy	"This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events." is redundant.							
Suggested Re	medy							

Delete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: AcceptedRecommendation byDelete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Delete the sentence of "This is the Syslog table that is used to store SS local events."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 000 46 05/026#4

2005/06/27		IEEE 802.16-05/036r4				
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment # 1046L Comment submitted by:		mber: 0001046	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/16	
Comment Type Editorial Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevMi	Starting Page # 25 b"	Starting Line # 1	Fig/Table#	Section	14.1	
Suggested Remedy Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevMi	b"					
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Superced See resolution of comment 1010	ed Rec	ommendation by				
Reason for Recommendation						
Resolution of GroupDecision of GroSee resolution of comment 1010	up: Superceded					
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution						
Group's Notes Group's Action Items						
Editor's NotesEditor's Actions k) doneEditor's Questions and ConcernsEditor's Action Items						

IEEE 000 46 05/026#4

2005/06/27			IEEE 802.16-05	/036r4	
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment # 1047L Comment submitted by:		nber: 0001046 ou	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/16
Comment Type Editorial Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevM	Starting Page # 226 ib"	Starting Line # 1	Fig/Table#	Section	14.2
Suggested Remedy Change the title from "wanDevMib" to "wmanDevM	ib"				
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Superceor See resolution of comment 1010	ded Reco	ommendation by			
Reason for Recommendation					
Resolution of GroupDecision of GroupSee resolution of comment 1033	oup: Superceded				
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done	e				
Editor's Questions and Concerns					
Editor's Action Items					

2005/06/27			IEEE 802.16-05	/036r4
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16 Comment # 1048L Comment submit		llot Number: 0001046 Barber	Member	Comment Date 2005/06/21
CommentTypeEditorialNew material is more properly part of a new	Starting Page # subclause within the 1.4		Fig/Table#	Section 1.4
Suggested Remedy [In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, me '1.4 Reference Models	odify text as:]			
[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]				
1.4.1 Management Reference Model				
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: A [In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, me '1.4 Reference Models		Recommendation by		
[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]				
1.4.1 Management Reference Model				
Reason for Recommendation				
Resolution of Group Decision	n of Group: Accepted			
[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 5, me '1.4 Reference Models	odify text as:]			
[Insert new subclause to subclause 1.4]				
1.4.1 Management Reference Model				
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution				
Group's Notes Group's Action Items				
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions	k) done			

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046		Comment Date		
Comment #	1049L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip	Barber	Member	2005/06/21		
Comment	Type Editori	al	Starting Page # 2	Starting Line # 12	Fig/Table#	Section 1.4		
Modify the la	Modify the language in the first paragraph to accompose the addition of the wman DevMib							

Modify the language in the first paragraph to accomodate the addition of the wmanDevMib

Suggested Remedy

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]

BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Recommendation by

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:] 'BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).'

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 12, modify text as:]

BS and SS managed nodes collect and store the managed objects in the format of wmanIfMib and wmanDevMib that are made available to NMSs via management protocols, such as SNMP (Simple Network Management Protocol).

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046		Comment Date		
Comment #	1050L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip	Barber	Member	2005/06/21		
Comment	туре Editoria	al	Starting Page # 2	Starting Line # 19	Fig/Table#	Section 1.4		
Spalling and word choice use for Secondary Management Connection need to be corrected								

Spelling and word choice use for Secondary Management Connection need to be corrected.

Suggested Remedy

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]

The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the <u>Ss</u>econdary <u>Mm</u>anagement <u>CID connection</u> for managed SS. If the <u>2ndsecondary</u> management <u>CID connection</u> does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted

Recommendation by

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]

The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the <u>Ss</u>econdary <u>Mmanagement</u> <u>CID connection</u> for managed SS. If the <u>2ndsecondary</u> management <u>CID connection</u> does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 1.4 Reference Models, page 2, line 19, modify text as:]

The management information between SS and BS will be carried over the <u>Ss</u>econdary <u>Mm</u>anagement <u>CID connection</u> for managed SS. If the 2nd secondary management <u>CID connection</u> does not exist, the SNMP messages shall go through another interface in the customer premise.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046			Comment Date	
Comment #	1051L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip	Barber	Member		2005/06/21	
Comment	туре Editoria	al	Starting Page # 4	Starting Line # 26	Fig/Table#	Section 9	0.3.1	
Fix some cap	Fix some capitilization and spacing consistency problems.							

Suggested Remedy

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP 2, but is backward compatible to SNMPv1 through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP-v3 is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMPv3, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMPv3: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP-v1, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMPv3 framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerbility.⁻

Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Recommendation by

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP $\sqrt{2}$, but is backward compatible to SNMPv1 through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP-v3 is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMPv3, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMPv3: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP-v1, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMPv3 framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerbility.⁻

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 9.3.1 SNMP, page 4, line 26, modify text as:]

The support of SNMP in this standard is compliant to SNMP $\sqrt{2}$, but is backward compatible to SNMPv1 through appropriate translation. The SNMP agent support for SNMP-v3 is optional. In case of an agent that implements SNMPv3, it is required to implement at least all the mandatory groups of the standard MIBs required for SNMPv3: RFC3410, RFC3411, RFC3412, RFC3413, RFC3414 and RFC3415 as well as the MIB defining coexistence between SNMP-v1, v2 and v3 in RFC 2576. The SNMPv3 framework may be considered as a mechanism to flexibly control access to this MIB module, and mitigate security vulnerbility.⁻

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot	Number: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1052L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip	Barber	Member		2005/06/21
Comment	туре Editoria	l	Starting Page # 4	Starting Line # 64	Fig/Table#	Section	9.3.2.1
Fix word cho	ice problem.						

Suggested Remedy

[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:] 'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanIfMib is temporarily located under enterprise via'

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: AcceptedRecommendation by[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:]'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanlfMib is temporarily located under enterprise via'

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

[In 9.3.2.1 MIB-2 integration, page 4, line 64, modify text as:] 'Before the approval of the IETF; however, wmanIfMib is temporar<u>ily</u> located under enterprise via'

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot M	Number: 0001046		Comment Date
Comment #	1053L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip	Barber	Member	2005/06/21
Comment	туре Techn	ical, Non-binding	Starting Page # 4	Starting Line # 19	Fig/Table#	Section 9.3
Need to clarif	y the 'mandate	ory' or 'optional' status of	SNMP support for BS	in a couple of places.		

Suggested Remedy

[In 9.3 Management Information Base, page 4, line 19, modify text as:] 'An SS <u>or BS</u> that implements the SNMP agent shall support this MIB.

9.3.1 SNMP

SNMP is a protocol to access the managed objects in BS and SS. The support of SNMP is optional for SS and mandatory for BS.'

Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Accepted-Modified	Recommendation by
see resolution of comme	ent 1039L	

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

see resolution of comment 1039L

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document under Review	w: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballot Number: 0	001046		Comment Date
Comment # 1054L	Comment submitted by:	Phillip Barber		Member	2005/06/21
All of the TLV items in se TLVs. How are we setting	g these values for BS? Do w	Starting Page # 7 Starting S and are transferred via the co e need to create language to s the security implications for 11.2	onfiguraiton file.	Fig/Table# They are not MAC m anism in the standar	Section 11.2.8 nanagement message rd, or just note that the
Suggested Remedy					
Proposed Resolution	Recommendation: Withdraw	n Recommend	ation by		
Reason for Recommendat	ion				
Resolution of Group	Decision of Gro	up: Withdrawn			
Reason for Group's Decis	sion/Resolution				
Group's Notes					
Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes	Editor's Actions I) none	needed			
Editor's Questions and C	oncerns				
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

Document	under Rev	view: IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ba	llot Nur	nber: 0001046			Comment Date
Comment #	1055L	Comment submitted by:	Richard	va	n Leeuwen	Member		2005/06/15
Comment	Туре Т	echnical, Non-binding	Starting Page #	26	Starting Line # 53	Fig/Table#	Section	14.1
	Alle al effice e	a a Mission If Classifier Diff Ian	بالمعالية والمؤجبا والالا	بمايرة محام	tione.			

The wmanIfMib defines a WmanIfClassifierBitMap with the following description:

'A bit of of this object is set to 1 if the parameter indicated by the comment was present in the classifier encoding, and 0 otherwise.

There are separate bits defined for all classification parameters, but they are not grouped like in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4. For example the are separate bits for ipTosLow(1), ipTosHigh(2), ipTosMask(3). However the associated TLV does not allow to encode these three values separately; either all 3 are defined or none. Futhermore having just one of the values would not be enough to do classification on the TOS field.'

Suggested Remedy

Change the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

```
SYNTAX BITS {priority(0),
ipTos(1),
ipProtocol(2),
ipAddrType(3),
ipMaskedSrcAddr(4),
ipMaskedDestAddr(5),
srcPort(6),
destPort(7),
destMacAddr(8),
srcMacAddr(9),
ethernetProtocol(10),
userPriority(11),
vlanId(12)}
```

Proposed ResolutionRecommendation: Accepted-ModifiedRecommendation byChange the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

SYNTAX BITS {priority(0), ipTos(1), ipProtocol(2), ipMaskedSrcAddr(3), ipMaskedDestAddr(4), srcPort(5), destPort(6), destMacAddr(7), srcMacAddr(8), ethernetProtocol(9), userPriority(10), vlanld(11)}

Editor to change 'Description' to include specific reference of TLV mappings to bit definitions

Laker to orlange Decomption to molade opeome reference of TEV mappings to bit dominations

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Change the definition of the bits using the same grouping as in sub-clause 11.13.19.3.4.

SYNTAX BITS {priority(0), ipTos(1), ipProtocol(2), ipMaskedSrcAddr(3), ipMaskedDestAddr(4), srcPort(5), destPort(6), destMacAddr(7), srcMacAddr(8), ethernetProtocol(9), userPriority(10), vlanId(11)}

Editor to change 'Description' to include specific reference of TLV mappings to bit definitions

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

2005/06/27			IEEE 802.16-05	5/036r4	
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment # 1056L Comment submitted by:		t Number: 0001046 Geipel	Member		Comment Date 2005/06/15
CommentTypeEditorialChange all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout	Starting Page # the document.	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
Suggested Remedy Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout	the document.				
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout		Recommendation by			
Reason for Recommendation					
Resolution of Group Decision of Grou	up: Accepted				
Change all instances of 'licence' to 'license' throughout	the document.				
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done					
Editor's Questions and Concerns					
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

2000/00/21				0/00014	
Document under Review: IEEE P802.16f/D4 Comment # 1057L Comment submitted by:		u <mark>mber: 0001046</mark> eipel	Membe	r	Comment Date 2005/06/15
Comment # 1057L Comment submitted by: Comment Type Editorial Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.	Starting Page # 71			Section	2003/00/13
Suggested Remedy Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.					
Proposed Resolution Recommendation: Accepted Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.	i Rec	commendation by			
Reason for Recommendation					
Resolution of Group Decision of Gro	oup: Accepted				
Change all instances of 'exampt' to 'exempt'.					
Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution					
Group's Notes Group's Action Items					
Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done	2				
Editor's Questions and Concerns					
Editor's Action Items					

IEEE 802.16-05/036r4

er Review:	IEEE P802.16f/D4	Ballo	ot Number: 00	001046			Comment Date
58L	Comment submitted by:	Krzysztof	Dudzinski		Memb	ber	2005/06/15
ype Editoria	l	Starting Page #	999 Starting	g Line #	Fig/Table#	Section	
ugh all objec	cts in tables to ensure pro	oper number sequ	encing.				
dy ugh all objec	cts in tables to ensure pro	oper number sequ	encing.				
tion Re	commendation: Accepted	I	Recommenda	ation by			
			encing.				
5 u d	58L /pe Editoria lgh all objec ly lgh all objec	ype Editorial ligh all objects in tables to ensure pro dy ligh all objects in tables to ensure pro	58L Comment submitted by: Krzysztof ype Editorial Starting Page # ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequences by ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequences Starting Page # Starting Page	58L Comment submitted by: Krzysztof Dudzinski ype Editorial Starting Page # 999 Starting ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing. dy ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.	58L Comment submitted by: Krzysztof Dudzinski /pe Editorial Starting Page # 999 Starting Line # ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing. dy ugh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.	58L Comment submitted by: Krzysztof Dudzinski Member /pe Editorial Starting Page # 999 Starting Line # Fig/Table# igh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing. Ay Igh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.	58L Comment submitted by: Krzysztof Dudzinski Member /pe Editorial Starting Page # 999 Starting Line # Fig/Table# Section igh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing. dy igh all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing. dy

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor to go through all objects in tables to ensure proper number sequencing.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns