
Title: Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes

Date Submitted: 2005-03-29

Source(s): Jonathan Labs
Wavesat, Inc.
1375 Trans-Canada Hwy
Dorval, Qc  H9P 2W8
Canada
Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325
Fax: +1 514 684 0211
mailto:jlabs@wavesat.com

Re: Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes

Abstract: Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes

Purpose: Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes

Notice: This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Release: The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE’s name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE’s sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.

Patent Policy and Procedures: The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <mailto:chair@wirelessman.org> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>.
Maintenance Task Group Session #36 Minutes
Jonathan Labs
Wavesat, Inc.

Maintenance Corrigendum Task Group
Session #36, Atlanta, Georgia, USA

March 14, 2005
Opened the TG Maintenance meeting at 4:15 PM
Reviewed procedure for the week.
Reviewed agenda for the week.
Approved the minutes of session 35 by unanimous voice vote.

Started comment resolution on database 80216-05_015.USR.

Broke for dinner at 6:15 PM.

Resumed at 7:50 PM.

Generated 80216-05_015_temp1.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Monday evening session, and includes 13 late comments and 1 missed comment originally submitted on time. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Broke for the night at 9:58 PM.

March 15, 2005
Resumed at 8: AM.
Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_temp1.USR.

Broke for lunch at 12:10 AM.

Resumed at 1:20 PM.

Broke for dinner at 6:10 PM.

Resumed at 7:30 PM.

Generated 80216-05_015_Temp3.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Tuesday evening session. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Adjourned at 10:30 PM.

March 16, 2005
Started at 8:12 AM.
Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_Temp3.USR.

Comment 212 is ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair as it is seen as an optimization/enhancement.

Mark Cudak makes the motion: “To rule Comment 212 in scope.” Seconded by Ran Yaniv.

Vote on the motion:
In favor: 23
opposed: 3
abstain: 5
Motion passes.
Vote on the motion to accept comment 212:
In favor: 26
Opposed: 4
Abstain: 3
Motion passes.

Comment 173 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.
Motion to rule in scope: Tal Kaitz, seconded by Shlomo Ovadia
In favor: 12
Opposed: 28
Abstain: 1
Motion fails.

Comment 175 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.
Motion to rule in scope: Tal Kaitz, seconded by Ran Yaniv
In favor: 10
Opposed: 12
Abstain: 1
Motion fails.

Comment 179 ruled Out of Scope by TG Chair.
Motion to rule in scope: Ran Yaniv, Tal Kaitz seconds it.
In favor: 8
Opposed: 10
Abstain: 2
Motion fails.

Broke for lunch at 12:15 PM.

Resumed at 1:17 PM.

Comment 13 discussed.
Hostile motion to accept the text as modified in Resolution of the Group, forwarded by Itzik Kitroser, seconded Joël Demarty.
Chair asks for discussion, but no discussion follows.
6 in favor
4 opposed
1 abstain

Chair warns that 219 will be ruled out of scope
Discussion follows as to whether the group feels that 219 is in scope or out of scope.
Vote to call the question:
In favor: 39
Against: 0
Abstain: 1
Comment 219 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair
Motion to rule comment 219 as in scope: by Tal Kaitz, seconded by Hassan Yaghoobi
In favor: 42
Against: 38
Abstain: 1
Motion fails.

Comment 221 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.
Motion to rule the comment in scope by Ran Yaniv, seconded by Dov Adelman
In Favor: 34
Against: 38
Absain: 0
Motion fails.

Comment 147 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.
Motion to rule the comment in scope by Shlomo Ovadia, Pieter-Paul Giesberts
In favor: 6
Against: 9
Abstain: 0
Motion fails.

TG Chair reverses decision to rule out of scope, as discussion on comment 141 identifies an ambiguity.
Author requested to reject the comment on the grounds that the solution is not technically complete

Broke at 6:00 PM.

Resumed at 9:05 PM

Generated 80216-05_015_Temp6.USR which contains comment resolutions as of the end of the Wednesday evening session. Submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Broke at 11:35 PM

March 17, 2005
Resumed at 8:10 AM.

Continued comment resolution on database 80216-05_015_Temp6.USR.
Comment 280 is ruled out of scope by TG Chair.
Ambroise Popper makes motion to rule comment 280 in scope. Joël Demarty seconds the motion.
In favor: 6
Against: 4
Motion fails.

Late comment submitted by Ambroise Popper. Incorporated into the database to generate 80216-05_015_Temp7.USR, which also contains the comments resolutions up to Thursday noon.

Broke for lunch at 12:10 PM.
Resumed at 1:25 PM.
Incorporated 4 more late comments from Mike Geipel, and generated 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR. 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR submitted to the Maintenance upload server.

Continue comment resolutions on 80216-05_015_Temp8.USR.

Comment 311:
Straw poll on suggested remedy options:
1) Do nothing. In favor: 0
2) Explicitly define whether IP datagram encapsulation shall follow the Ethernet or the 802.3/LLC/SNAP format for SMC. In favor: 0
3) Specify that subscribers must support both for SMC. In favor 1
4) Restore IP CS as an option for SMC. In favor 11
See 80216-05_015r1.USR for the final remedy chosen by the group for comment 311.

Close database 80216-05_015_temp8.USR, generating 80216-05_015r1 containing all resolved comments.

Uploaded 80216-05_015r1 to the Maintenance upload directory. Final statistics on the comments are:
- Total: 319 Late: 20
- Accepted/Accepted-Modified: 188
- Rejected: 52
- Superceded: 44
- Withdrawn: 21
- Out-of-Scope: 14
- 1 voted in scope by the group reversing the TG chair’s ruling.

Started closing session for TG Maintenance at 5:40 PM.

Motion: To accept the database 80216-05/015r1 as the comment resolution for the comments from LB#17.
Forwarded by: Jose Puthenkulam
Seconded by: J.-Pierre Lamoureux
In favor: 30
Opposed: 0
Abstentions: 0
⇒ Motion passes.

Motion: To authorize the editor to modify the draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D1 according the resolutions in 80216-05/015r1 to generate draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D2.
Forwarded by: Frank Draper
Seconded: Gordon Antonello
In favor: 25
Opposed: 0
Abstentions: 0
⇒ Motion passes.

Discussed the schedule for the P802.16-2004/Cor1 project. The original schedule is at http://10.0.1.16/maint/schedule.html. It was agreed by the group that the original schedule is too aggressive to be realistic. A new schedule was discussed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resolve Letter ballot comments</td>
<td>3/14-3/17, 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2 draft of Corrigenda</td>
<td>4/4/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open recirc Letter ballot on D2 draft</td>
<td>4/4/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close recirc Letter ballot</td>
<td>4/22/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Call for reply comments on Letter ballot recirc comments</td>
<td>4/23/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close Call for reply comments on Letter ballot recirc comments</td>
<td>4/30/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resolve Letter ballot recirc comments</td>
<td>5/2-5/5, 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3 draft of Corrigendum</td>
<td>5/12/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditional approval by 802 EC to go to Sponsor Ballot</td>
<td>5/12/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open confirmation Letter Ballot on D3 draft</td>
<td>5/12/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close confirmation Letter Ballot</td>
<td>5/27/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Sponsor Ballot</td>
<td>5/29/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close Sponsor Ballot</td>
<td>6/28/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Call for reply comment on Sponsor Ballot comments</td>
<td>6/30/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close Call for reply comments on Sponsor Ballot comments</td>
<td>7/15/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resolve Sponsor Ballot Comments</td>
<td>July 18-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>802 EC conditional approval to forward to RevCom</td>
<td>7/22/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D4 draft of Corrigendum</td>
<td>7/29/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Sponsor Ballot Recirc</td>
<td>7/29/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RevCom Submittal</td>
<td>8/12/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close Sponsor Ballot Recirc</td>
<td>8/13/2005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was agreed by the group to present this schedule at the Closing Plenary to discuss with the Working Group.

Motion: To authorize the Chair to make the following motion at the Closing Plenary: “To accept draft P802.16-2004/Cor1/D1 as modified by the comment resolutions (80216-05/015r1) and open a Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot on that Draft (P802.16-2004/Cor1/D2)”

Forwarded by: Ollivier Mont-Reynaud
Seconded: Giulio Cavalli
In favor: 29
Opposed: 0
Abstentions: 0

Motion: To authorize the TG Chair to use the comment resolutions to comments 67, 68, 191, and 200 to draft, in collaboration with the WG Chair, a response to the Request for Interpretation to C. Ashok Kumar Reddy.
Forwarded by: Gordon Antonello
Seconded: Frank Draper
Approved by unanimous voice vote

Motion to adjourn forwarded by Raja Banerjea, and seconded by Gordon Antonello.
Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Adjourned TG Maintenance meeting at 6:10 PM.