

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group
Title	Summary report of results from on-line comment resolution, September-October 1999.
Date Submitted	1999-10-08
Source	<p>Brian Petry 3Com 12230 World Trade Dr. San Diego, CA 92128</p> <p>Voice: 858-674-8533 Fax: E-mail: brian_petry@3com.com</p>
Re:	Editor's summary report of on-line ballot results. Note that the full report, which includes voter names and reasons for their votes, is 802.16sc-99/35, access to which is restricted to 802.16 voting members.
Abstract	A summary of on-line comment resolution results, including vote tallies for each comment.
Purpose	To inform the System Requirements Task Group of the results.
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.
Release	The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by 802.16.
IEEE Patent Policy	<p>The contributor is familiar with the IEEE Patent Policy, which is set forth in the IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws <http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws> and includes the statement:</p> <p>“IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, if there is technical justification in the opinion of the standards-developing committee and provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder that it will license applicants under reasonable terms and conditions for the purpose of implementing the standard.”</p>

1. Summary

This is the summary editor's report of the results from the 802.16 System Requirements Task Group's on-line comment resolution period, 1999-09-17 through 1999-10-6 (please refer to 802.16sc-99/34).

38 people voted and deserve 802.16's thanks for spending their valuable time to fill-out and return their ballots.

Here is a summary of the results:

144 comments total
 94 accepted
 31 majority accepted, but not 75%
 1 tie
 18 rejected by a majority of the voters

All of the comments marked Editorial were accepted.

For each comment, one of four votes was possible:

(A) Accept

(M) Would accept, but only if modified.

Note that (M) was not counted an accept. It has the same effect on the results as an abstain.

(B) Abstain

(R) Reject

The (M), (B) and (R) votes specified a reason for their vote choice.

Note that the full report, which includes voter's names and their vote "reasons" is 802.16sc-99/35. The full report may be used by commentators to find out why their comment was not accepted and possibly seek to revise their comment given reasons for the non-accept votes.

Tally of results:

Item#	Type	Acc	Rej	Mod	aBs	Result
114:	E	35	2	1	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
115:	T	29	8	1	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
116:	T	27	9	1	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
117:	T	36	1	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
118:	E	23	11	3	1	Accepted by >= 50% majority.
119:	E	29	8	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
120:	T	30	4	2	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
121:	T	17	15	4	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 11.
122:	E	34	2	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
123:	T	30	5	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
124:	E	34	1	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
125:	T	33	1	3	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
126:	E	28	7	1	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
127:	E	32	0	0	6	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
128:	T	25	10	2	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 3.
129:	T	25	10	2	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 3.
130:	T	31	5	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
131:	E	35	1	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
132:	T	24	12	1	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 4.
133:	T	26	9	0	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 2.
134:	T	30	6	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
135:	T	28	5	1	4	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
136:	T	31	4	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
137:	T	31	4	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.

138:	T	32	4	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
139:	E	36	1	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
140:	E	29	7	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
141:	E	33	4	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
142:	E	33	4	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
143:	T	20	12	3	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 8.
144:	E	19	16	1	2	Accepted by simple majority.
145:	E	37	0	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
146:	T	19	13	5	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
147:	T	30	4	3	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
148:	T	35	0	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
149:	E	33	0	3	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
150:	E	32	3	1	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
151:	E	32	3	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
152:	E	36	0	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
153:	E	34	0	1	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
154:	E	34	0	0	4	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
155:	T	29	2	4	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
156:	T	31	4	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
157:	T	28	6	1	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
158:	T	32	4	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
159:	T	31	3	0	4	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
160:	E	31	5	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
161:	E	32	5	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
162:	T	29	6	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
163:	T	31	5	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
164:	T	14	17	0	7	Rejected by simple majority.
165:	T	30	3	1	4	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
166:	T	9	22	2	5	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
167:	T	11	21	3	3	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
168:	E	34	2	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
169:	T	15	17	5	1	Rejected by simple majority.
170:	T	19	19	0	0	Failed to achieve majority (tie).
171:	T	34	2	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
172:	E	33	4	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
173:	E	35	2	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
174:	E	26	2	9	1	Accepted by >= 50% majority.
175:	E	32	0	6	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
176:	E	38	0	0	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
177:	T	30	1	6	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
178:	T	29	9	0	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
179:	T	20	18	0	0	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 8.
180:	T	17	20	0	1	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
181:	E	33	3	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
182:	E	35	1	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
183:	T	19	13	3	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
184:	T	12	18	6	2	Rejected by simple majority.
185:	T	32	4	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
186:	T	26	10	1	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 2.
187:	T	33	4	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
188:	T	23	12	1	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 5.
189:	T	29	6	2	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
190:	T	31	4	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
191:	T	32	4	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
192:	T	27	4	4	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
193:	T	34	2	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
194:	T	19	15	0	4	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
195:	E	35	1	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
196:	E	30	7	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
197:	T	31	2	1	4	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
198:	T	31	3	2	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.

199:	T	18	16	3	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 10.
200:	T	18	17	0	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 10.
201:	T	17	18	1	2	Rejected by simple majority.
202:	T	17	18	1	2	Rejected by simple majority.
203:	E	38	0	0	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
204:	E	33	2	1	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
205:	E	36	1	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
206:	E	32	3	1	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
207:	E	36	0	2	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
208:	E	35	1	2	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
209:	E	33	1	2	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
210:	T	10	22	4	2	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
211:	E	23	12	1	2	Accepted by >= 50% majority.
212:	T	19	14	3	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
213:	T	10	23	1	4	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
214:	T	18	16	1	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 10.
215:	E	36	2	0	0	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
216:	T	23	9	1	5	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 5.
217:	E	36	1	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
218:	T	32	4	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
219:	E	34	2	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
220:	E	36	1	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
221:	T	35	2	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
222:	T	15	21	0	2	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
223:	T	23	12	0	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 5.
224:	T	29	7	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
225:	T	13	22	0	3	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
226:	T	13	24	0	1	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
227:	T	30	6	1	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
228:	T	13	23	0	2	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
229:	E	28	4	4	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
230:	T	32	4	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
231:	E	21	14	1	2	Accepted by >= 50% majority.
232:	T	6	28	0	4	Rejected by >= 75% majority.
233:	T	27	10	0	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
234:	T	14	20	0	4	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
235:	T	23	13	0	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 5.
236:	E	35	1	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
237:	T	27	9	1	1	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
238:	T	19	7	8	4	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
239:	T	24	6	0	8	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 4.
240:	T	31	3	1	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
241:	T	32	2	1	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
242:	E	30	5	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
243:	T	27	8	1	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
244:	E	34	2	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
245:	E	31	5	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
246:	E	24	8	4	2	Accepted by >= 50% majority.
247:	T	13	20	0	5	Rejected by >= 50% majority.
248:	E	31	5	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
249:	T	23	12	0	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 5.
250:	E	35	1	0	2	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
251:	T	27	0	7	4	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 1.
252:	T	35	0	0	3	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
253:	T	26	9	3	0	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 2.
254:	T	34	3	0	1	Accepted by >= 75% majority.
255:	T	19	15	1	3	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 9.
256:	T	24	6	6	2	Failed to achieve 75% accept votes by 4.
257:	T	10	25	0	3	Rejected by >= 50% majority.