

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.1b D3.0 MIB Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 0 SC 0 P4 L5 # [REDACTED]
 McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 typo 'OAMPUD'
 SuggestedRemedy
 change OAMPUD to OAMPDU
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 0 SC 0 P9 L62 # [REDACTED]
 McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 typo
 SuggestedRemedy
 change McClellan to McClellan
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1 P17 L1 # [REDACTED]
 Rolfe, Benjamin Blind Creek Associates
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D EZ
 The editor's note should have been removed prior to balloting this draft. The scope clause has been updated to align with the PAR in this draft.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please remove obsolete note prior to recirculation ballots to avoid confusion.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.7 P19 L49 # [REDACTED]
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 URL "https://linux.die.net/man/1/smlin" should preferably be a hyperlink. This way it will be easier to check that it is correct.
 Similarly for several other URLs. Some are hyperlinks and some are not.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Create hyperlinks for all URLs in body text (not in the MIB content).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P20 L16 # [REDACTED]
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 A normative reference is no longer used in the draft and should be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the following entries
 ETSI TS1 101 270
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P20 L64 # [REDACTED]
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "Tthe"
 I assume strikethrough and underline should not appear in a revision.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "The" in normal character format.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.1b D3.0 MIB Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 3 SC 3 P22 L14 # I-12
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Per https://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html, "implementer" should be used rather than "implementor".
 There are 7 instances of "implementor".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances to "implementer".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3 P22 L22 # I-5
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Unnecessary formatting for the word "See" in "Loss of Codegroup Delineation"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 4 SC 4 P24 L3 # I-14
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 The abbreviations ACK, Atn, and NMS never appear in the standard text (Atn and ACK appear as substrings of some labels, but that does not require listing them as abbreviations on their own).
 In addition, LCD appears only as the string LCD-P so the acronym should probably include the suffix P.
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete the unused abbreviations from the list.
 Change LCD to LCD-P (Loss of Codegroup Delination - Path).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 4 SC 4 P24 L4 # I-6
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 A few abbreviations are no longer used in the draft and should be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the following abbreviations: ACK, Atn
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 4 SC 4 P24 L14 # I-25
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ
 Both CID and OUI are missing from the abbreviation list.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add abbreviations for Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) and Company ID (CID).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.4 P30 L12 # I-15
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type G Comment Status D EZ
 "should any discrepancy between the DESCRIPTION text and the corresponding definition in 5.2 through 5.3 of this clause occur, the definitions in 5.2 through 5.3 shall take precedence."
 The word "shall" (meaning "is required to") is not appropriate here.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "should any discrepancy between the DESCRIPTION text and the corresponding definition in 5.2 through 5.3 of this clause occur, the definitions in 5.2 through 5.3 prevail."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.1b D3.0 MIB Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.6.2 P96 L25 # I-22
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ
 Based on dot3OamPeerVendorOui (p 101 line 46), the "EightOTwoOui" syntax can include a CID as well as an OUI.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change first sentence of paragrah to "24-bit Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) or Company ID (CID)."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.6.2 P96 L26 # I-21
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ
 The reference is out of date. Moreover, a better reference is the one that IEEE Std 802 cites: Bibiography entry [B2] in the current revision draft P802/D2.0.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change second sentence of paragrah to "Information on OUIs and CIDs can be found in [B*]", where [B*] is a new entry in Annex A. Add as [B3]: IEEE Registration Authority Tutorial, "Guidelines for Use of Extended Unique Identifier (EUI), Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) and Company ID (CID)", with a footnote to "The tutorial is available at <https://standards.ieee.org/regauth>. Follow the tutorial link and search for the tutorial title."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.6.2 P101 L54 # I-23
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D EZ
 "OUI" needs to be corrected, since line 52 allows for CID as well.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "OUI" to "OUI or CID".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 9 SC 9.1.2 P201 L49 # I-4
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type G Comment Status D EZ
 There are multiple editorial notes to mark changes caused by the maintenance request 1383: https://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/requests/maint_1383.pdf. They have been in the draft for a long time now.
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove all editorial notes pointing to MR 1383
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 9 SC 9.1.2 P202 L27 # I-3
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 XGMII is not defined
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add entry for "XGMII = 10 GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 12A SC 12A P445 L1 # I-18
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Annex 12A title appears separately from the label "Annex 12A" in the bookmarks table. Similarly for Annex A and Annex B and their contents.
 Additionally, Annex 12A appears before annexes A and B. In 802.3 the letter-annexes appear first.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use the Annex format from the 802.3 template, which has the annex number and description in the same paragraph.
 Consider reordering the annexes so that 12A follows B.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Used the Annex format from the 802.3 template, which has the annex number and description in the same paragraph.
 Moved Annex 12A after Annex B.

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.1b D3.0 MIB Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 13 SC 13.2.2.1 P402 L28 # [redacted]
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "NOT"
 This is not an acronym; capitalization may be misleading (no need to shout).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "not".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl A SC A P446 L10 # [redacted]
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Many items in the bibliography have footnotes with URLs. This is unnecessarily cumbersome.
 The 2021 style manual (19.4.6) says "For articles or sources that were consulted online, the URL should be listed along with the source's title and date accessed to create a more stable reference". The example provided in the style manual has the URL as part of the entry rather than a footnote.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Where appropriate, include the URL as part of the bibliographic entry rather than in a footnote.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

The current format is consistent with the bibliography format used in IEEE Std 802.3-2022.

Cl A SC A P446 L16 # [redacted]
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 [B3] is not used in the draft anywhere
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove entry [B3] – the same applies to [B4], [B8] through [B20], [B22] through [B26], [B33], [B34], [B40] through [B47]
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl A SC A P446 L37 # [redacted]
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE Std 802.9 is no longer referenced as informative
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove entry [B7]
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl B SC B P449 L12 # [redacted]
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "supercede"
 Although this is listed in M-W dictionary as a variant spelling, it is inconsistent with the spelling "superseded" used twice in the front matter. 802.3 consistently uses "supersede".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "supersede".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.