

# comments

CI 00 SC P2 L1 # 205

Thompson, Geoff

Nortel

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Add note to balloters to indicate that this material will be added by the publications editor

## SuggestedRemedy

Add note:

[Note to balloters to be removed before publication. ]

[The abstract will be added during the preparation for publication process.]

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC P2 L2 # 206

Thompson, Geoff

Nortel

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Add note to balloters to indicate that this material will be added by the publications editor

## SuggestedRemedy

Add note:

[Note to balloters to be removed before publication. ]

[The keywords will be added during the preparation for publication process.]

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
duplicate of 205

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 222

Diab, Wael

Broadcom

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez

Please make the page numbers at the bottom on the page (printed) and the pdf numbers the same. This will eliminate confusion in commenting.

## SuggestedRemedy

I would be happy to wokr with the Chief Editor to make this happen using Framemaker

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 Pi L22 # 2

LANDRY, MATTHEW

SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Mispelling: 'Equipement'

## SuggestedRemedy

Spell 'Equipment'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 Pv L # 3

LANDRY, MATTHEW

SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Header of symbols page, table of contents, list of tables, list of figures indicates D0.8.

## SuggestedRemedy

Correct header on future draft revisions.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 3.5.4a P44 L31 # 30

Patoka, Martin

TI

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"the transient current drawn by the PD shall not exceed 15 mA/is in either polarity."

This presumes a static PSE voltage

## SuggestedRemedy

change to:

"the transient current drawn

by the PD, with static PSE voltage, shall not exceed 15 mA/us in either polarity.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CE Note: comment type was blank, set to E by default.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 00  
SC 3.5.4a

Page 1 of 6  
9/10/2007 9:00:34

comments

Cl 33 SC P74 L # 220  
Diab, Wael Broadcom

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The line numbers appear on the wrong side of the page. This may be a problem with something else as it appears midstream in the clause

SuggestedRemedy

Please correct and watchout for on the next draft

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 33 SC P81 L # 21  
LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Header incorrect in all Annexes for draft version.

SuggestedRemedy

Update header for next draft.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 33 SC 2.1 P17 L51 # 158  
Law, David 3Com

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

The text states that 'Midspan PSEs shall use Alternative B when used in 10BASE-T or 100BASE-TX systems'. It then states that 'Midspan PSEs may support either Alternative A or B, or both when used in 1000BASE-T systems'. There is no definition of what a 10BASE-T, 100BASE-T or 1000BASE-T 'system' is, so in the following I will assume that simply it means that the link is operating with that type of PHY at each end.

Many ports these days are 10/100/1000BASE-T capable. Based on this, take the case of a 10/100/1000BASE-T non-PSE switch port that is connected to a Midspan. The Midspan connected to this port will have to be a 1000BASE-T capable Midspan or the link will never be able to operate at 1000BASE-T. The port however may not actually be operating at 1000BASE-T so this would seem to force the Midspan to be Alternative B to meet the mandatory requirement for 10BASE-T and 100BASE-T operation. In fact unless you can guarantee that the link the 1000BASE-T Midspan is connected in will only ever operate at 1000BASE-T, which I do not believe the Midspan has any way to force, the Midspan will have to be Alternative B.

The option of being able to build an Alternative A Midspan therefore seem unusable.

SuggestedRemedy

Either (i) mandate that all Midspans have to be Alternative B or (ii) allow 10BASE-T and 100BASE-T Midspans to be Alternative A as well as Alternative B. I suggest the second option on the basis that if it has been proved that 1000BASE-T Alternative A Midspans can be built while maintaining the link segment requirements they should be permitted for 10BASE-T and 100BASE-T operation as well. If this has not been proved then my first option has to be used.

Proposed Response Response Status O

see 207, 154

comments

Cl 33 SC 2.1 P6 L6 # 90  
Darshan, Yair Microsemi Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

Draft0.9  
Figure 33-4a:  
1. The data transformer in Midspan is one way to combine power with data.  
Other implementations are possible.

*SuggestedRemedy*

1. Replace the data transformer in the Midspan with a black box which indicates implementation independent data and power interface.  
See attached drawing.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CE recalls that this was agreed upon at the last meeting.

Cl 33 SC 2.2a P9 L25 # 5  
LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The NOTE does not appear to be set in the correct paragraph format.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Make sure the paragraph is set properly.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 33 SC 2.7.2 P18 L31 # 1  
LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Sentence structure in paragraph could be improved.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace first sentence with:

The Type 1 PSE shall provide to the PI VClass with a current limitation of IClass\_LIM, as defined in Table 33-4a. Polarity shall be the same as defined for VPort in 33.2.2 and timing specifications shall be as defined by Tpd in Table 33-5. The Type 1 PSE shall measure the resultant IClass and classify the PD based on the observed current according to Table 33-4. Measurement of IClass shall be taken after 1ms to ignore initial transients. If the measured IClass is greater than or equal to 51mA, the Type 1 PSE shall classify the PD as Class 0.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT. CE Note: comment had no associated comment type. Set as E by default.

Cl 33 SC 2.8.6 P27 L17 # 7  
LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Extra space between paragraph and equation unnecessary. More space needed after list of variables.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove space before equation. Add space after variable list.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 33 SC 2.8.8 P28 L35 # 8  
LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Editorial directive (Insert Figure) should appear above the appropriate figure.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Move "Insert Figure" above Figure 33-9a.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

comments

CI 33 SC 4.3 P48 L23 # 18  
 LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 Equations on lines 23, 27, 33 not set in accordance with 2007 style manual.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-set equations to meet 2007 style manual guidelines.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 4.8.1.1 P54 L22 # 19  
 LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 Equations on lines 22 and 32 are not set according to 2007 style manual.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-set equations to meet 2007 style manual guidelines.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 5.5 P56 L1 # 20  
 LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 Equation is not set according to 2007 style manual.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-set equation to meet 2007 style manual guidelines.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 6.2.2 P61 L47 # 212  
 Thompson, Geoff Nortel  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez  
 The material regarding TLVs is all new. There is nothing about even the concept of TLVs in 802.3af  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Correctly mark all new material using 802.3af as the baseline  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 see 22

CI 33 SC 6.2.2 P61 L47 # 22  
 LANDRY, MATTHEW SILICON LABORATO  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 Text is new, but not marked as an insertion.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Mark text as a D0.9 insertion.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 7.3.2 P69 L30 # 46  
 Patoka, Martin TI  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 new PSE requirements need to be added.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 PSE25: Type 1 PSE assign to class 0 ...  
 PSE25a: Type 2 PSE recognize class4 as a T2 PD  
 PSE25b: T2 PSE provide either T2 physical layer, T2 LLDP, or both classification  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The CE assumes that PICS will be generated after the text is completed, so while I agree with the comment no changes to the text will be made.

CI 99 SC P L # 219  
 Diab, Wael Broadcom  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez  
 Some pages are missing line numbers  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please add line numbers  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

# comments

CI 99 SC P1 L1 # 153  
Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

While the front matter is not within scope of any ballot please consider the following comments.

[1] Please change the text 'Amendment to IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2005' to read 'Amendment to IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-200X' since this will be an amendment to the IEEE 802.3 revision currently under development, not IEEE Std 802.3-2005.

[2] Please remove the TM symbol related to the IEEE P802.3at Task Force, a document can be trademarked, a Task Force can't.

[12] While the style manual states that lower case roman numerals should be used for the front matter please change to arabic numerals so that the page number match the pdf page number.

## SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 99 SC P11 L1 # 151  
Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

We do not provide Table of Figures or Table of Tables in IEEE 802.3 standards. I don't have any problem with them being included in the draft however a editors note should be provided to state that they will be removed during publication.

## SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 99 SC P2 L31 # 152  
Law, David 3Com

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez

The text 'Balloted positive votes implicitly apply to the draft amendment as published for review—including any future changes to such provisional technical specifications.' seems to be in conflict to IEEE balloting procedure. When a voter casts an approve ballot on one draft they have the right to cast a disapprove ballot on the next draft based on any changes made between the two drafts.

## SuggestedRemedy

Delete the text 'Balloted positive votes implicitly apply to the draft amendment as published for review—including any future changes to such provisional technical specifications.'.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 99 SC P3 L55 # 208  
Thompson, Geoff Nortel

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez

Please do not number the front matter pages with alpha characters. This leads to confusion during comment generation as to whether to use PDF page numbers or printed pages numbers.

## SuggestedRemedy

Make printed pages number match PDF page numbers

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 99 SC P5 L1 # 149  
Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Please update the list of special symbols to the latest version that can be obtained from URL:[ <http://www.ieee802.org/3/tools/index.html> ].

## SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

<b>CI 99</b>	<b>SC</b>	<b>P7</b>	<b>L1</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>150</b>
Law, David		3Com			
<b>Comment Type</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>Comment Status</b>	<b>D</b>	<b>ez</b>	
Please use TOC reference page from the attached FrameMaker file for generating the index. This will fix the spacing issues and will also cope better with multi-line titles as well as Annex titles which are current missing the Annex title text.					
<b>SuggestedRemedy</b>					
See comment.					
<b>Proposed Response</b>		<b>Response Status W</b>			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.					

<b>CI 99</b>	<b>SC</b>	<b>Pii</b>	<b>L 24</b>	<b>#</b> 230
Diab, Wael		Broadcom		
<b>Comment Type</b>	<b>ER</b>	<b>Comment Status</b>	<b>D</b>	<b>ez</b>
Please note that it will require 75% to adopt final number				
<b>SuggestedRemedy</b>				
Please note that it will require 75% to adopt final number				
<b>Proposed Response</b>		<b>Response Status</b>	<b>W</b>	
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				

<b>Cl 99</b>	<b>SC</b>	<b>Piii</b>	<b>L 2</b>	<b># 229</b>
Diab, Wael		Broadcom		
<b>Comment Type</b>	<b>ER</b>	<b>Comment Status</b>	<b>D</b>	<b>ez</b>
Im assuming the box on this page is an editor's note				
<b>SuggestedRemedy</b>				
Please mark accordingly. Add 'NOTE -' in front of 'This'				
<b>Proposed Response</b>		<b>Response Status</b>	<b>W</b>	
PROPOSED ACCEPT.				