

Plenary Meeting – November 2007 – Atlanta, GA USA

Official Meeting Minutes

Chair = Mike McCormack

Recording Secretary = Bill Delveaux

Note: All times given in local Atlanta (EST) time

Note: See Comment Resolution database for a record of those events

November 13, 2007:

Meeting called to order at 9:07am

At 9:09am:

Agenda:

Tue:

- Intro
- Appoint Recording Secretary
- Patent Review
- Rule
- Liaison
- Subcommittee Reports

Wed:

- Patent Review
- Approve minutes of October meeting
- Subcommittee Reports
- Comment Resolution

Thur:

- Patent Review
- Approve minutes of October meeting (if not done on Wed)
- Subcommittee Reports
- Comment resolution

Agenda passed without opposition (voice vote)

Discussing the books:

Must initial your affiliation in the book

If you do not initial, you do not get credit for attending the meeting

At 9:10am - Patent Policy read by Mike McCormack

- Links provided
- 5 Slides pertaining to the patent policy were presented. Chair asks if any of the members wants to identify any patent claim / patent applications that affects the standards.
- Requested any letters to submit – none

Ground Rules – mutual respect and consideration

- No cost, product pitches, etc
- All may speak and vote
- No restrictions on presentations or materials
- No prices in any currency, complexity is OK
- 802.3 rules apply

Rules – in general... behave

Rules – web sites presented for bylaws, operating rules, etc presented.

Electronic information

- Web address – www.ieee802.org/3/at/index.html
- eMail reflector – stds-802-3-poep@ieee.org
- Private Area
- Next meeting – monitor www.ieee802.org/meeting/index.html

Time Limit review:

Presentations:

- 45 min max
- 15 min discussion max

Debate of Motions:

- 2 turns to speak, priority to first time speakers
- 3 minutes per speaker max
- 30 min per vote max

Debate of comments

- 2 turns to speak, priority to first time speakers
- 1 min per speaker max
- 5 min per comment max

Liaison Report from Val Rybinski – verbal, no slides

AdHoc Report from 802.3at 350uH – David Law – law_1_1107.pdf

Started at 9:23am

- Recap of issue
 - PoE causes more imbalance
- Proposal 1 – Rx based
 - PoE will indicate base line wander correction on Receiver
 - Alternative A with mid-span has problems
- Proposal 2 – Tx based
- Next meeting 9am PST 11/20/07 conference call (See email reflector)

Books explained and sent around

AdHoc Report from Transformer and Channel – Fred Schindler – schindler_1_1107.pdf

Started at 10:10am

- Channel Model
- Current Balance

- Ad hoc recommendations
- Next steps
 - Review parameters for legacy PoE
 - Is worst-case probable?
 - Select parameters for PoE plus

** Break at 10:43am

Comment Editor Report – Chad Jones

- Please review “New Comments in Easy Bucket” at http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/comments/D1.0/P802d3at_D1p0_premtg_bucket_ez.pdf
- These comments need to be reviewed before tomorrow. The plan is to vote on each of these back to back

Started Comment resolution at 11:08am

** Lunch Break at 12:05pm

Started Comment resolution at 1:40pm

** Break at 3:00pm

** Meeting adjourned at 6:00pm

November 14, 2007:

Meeting called to order at 9:00am

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

Discussion about improving comments to the comment editor – must have page, line number. Paste the exact text into the comment. Provide a specific remedy with text.

Discussion about adding another interim meeting in February. Three days minimum, looking at week of Feb 11th.

Discussion about changing the objective on cable type to 25 ohms.

Chair asked if anyone had any patent letters to submit, no one requested to submit.

Started Comment resolution at 9:13am

At 10:07am, the books arrived. Continuing comment resolution

** Break at 10:30am

At 10:45am the group returned to comment resolution.

Discussion about the Layer-2 ad hoc over the lunch break.

** Lunch Break at 11:47am

At 1:36pm, we returned to comment resolution.

** Break at 2:45pm

At 3:05pm the group returned to comment resolution.

** Meeting adjourned at 5:35pm

November 15, 2007:

Meeting called to order at 8:37am

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

The chair asked if anyone had any patent letters to submit, no one requested to submit.

Chair asked to approve the minutes. The group did a voice vote.

Passed by voice without opposition (at 8:39am)

Discussion about changing the objective for cable infrastructure. The objective was re-written.

- Motion by Bill Delveaux, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry
 - Move that the IEEE802.3at Task Force approve the new objective. "The target infrastructure for PoEPlus will be 25 ohm or lower loop resistance systems (e.g., category 5e, class D or higher systems). Further, we will not cause a safety issue for a legacy installation conformant to ISO/IEC 60950."

- All in room

For: 27 Against: 1 Abstain: 0

- .3 voters only

For: 22 Against: 1 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion

Motion Passes (at 9:11am)

Discussion about an additional interim the week of Feb 11th. The group was asked for a host for this meeting, multiple people acknowledged that they were trying to host. Additional information will be announced via the email reflector.

Chicago rules question asked:

How many people prefer a Tue, Wed, Thur meeting - 22

How many people oppose a Tue, Wed, Thur meeting - 2

How many people prefer a Mon, Tue, Wed meeting - 6

How many people oppose a Mon, Tue, Wed meeting - 2

How many people prefer a Wed, Thur, Fri meeting - 0

Started Comment resolution at 9:22am

** Break at 10:45am

AdHoc Report from Liaison Meeting – Wael Diab – diab_1_1107.pdf

Started at 11:06am

- Cable adhoc and Layer 2 adhoc
 - Comments and decisions reviewed

 - Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Anoop Vetteth
 - “Accept the comment resolution to the Layer 2 comments assigned to the ad-hoc per the resolution agreed upon in the ad-hoc.”
 - All in room
For: 22 Against: 0 Abstain: 3
 - .3 voters only
For: 17 Against: 0 Abstain: 3
- Technical Motion
Motion Passes (at 11:17am)

Discussion about where we are at. We have closed 147 comments, 14 are ready for signoff, 14 more from the L2 ad-hoc. The editor will incorporate these into the next draft.

- Motion by Dan Dove, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry
 - “The 802.3at Task Force believes that the objectives can be met with a two-pair solution and that we should focus our future effort on completing a two-pair powering solution.”
- Discussion around two previous motions from January 2006 and July 2006 that affirms a 2-pair solution and directs the group to work on a 2-pair solution.
- Motion was withdrawn

Back to a discussion about drafts and what steps to take next as a group.

Chicago rules question asked:

Keep the same draft, make a draft 1.1 that you cannot comment on, continue with the current comment database - 24

Make a new draft, allow comments on it, dump old comments, people resubmit comments, new comment database - 4

Discussion about the possible February meeting. Suggestion that we extend the January meeting by a day.

- Motion by Dan Dove, Seconded by Steve Sedio
 - "The 802.3at Task Force believes that our objectives can be met with a two-pair solution and that we should remove midspan PSE alternative A and not expend further effort to inserting power into the data pairs used by 10/100BASE-T."
 - All in room
For: 8 Against: 14 Abstain: 7
 - .3 voters only
For: 5 Against: 7 Abstain: 6
- Technical Motion
Motion Fails (at 12:10pm)

** Meeting and session adjourned at 12:10pm

Next meeting will be announced via the email reflector.