

Interim Meeting – May 2008 – Munich GERMANY

Official Meeting Minutes

Chair = Mike McCormack

Recording Secretary = Bill Delveaux

Note: All times given in local Munich (GMT+1) time

Note: See Comment Resolution database for a record of those events

Note: All voting is taken by name and recorded. Please refer to

http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/public/may08/ballots_1_0508.pdf

for the voter record spreadsheet.

May 13, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:52am

Introductions – went around the room

Sign in sheet sent around the room – enter name, employer, and affiliation

Recording Secretary appointed – Bill Delveaux

Agenda:

Tuesday:

- Appoint Recording Secretary
- Introductions
- Review and discuss agenda
- Patent Review / Rules Review
- Liaison / Subcommittee Reports (subject to availability of officers)
- Chair's comments
- Review of Objectives/PAR
- Comment resolution

Wednesday / Thursday

- Patent Review
- Ad hoc reports (Wednesday)
- Review Objectives/PAR (if needed)
- Comment resolution
- Approve minutes of November/January/March meetings (Thursday)
- Plan next meeting (Thursday)

At 9:00am - Agenda passed without opposition (voice vote)

At 9:01am - Patent Policy read by Mike McCormack

- Patent Policy has been updated since last meeting
- Links provided
- Slide #1 of the patent policy were read out loud by Mike McCormack

- Slide #2 read out loud by Mike McCormack – Links provided
- Slide #3 read out loud by Mike McCormack – Potentially Essential Patents
- Mike McCormack asks if any of the members wants to identify any potentially essential patents – none
- Slide #4 read out loud by Mike McCormack – other guidelines

Ground Rules – mutual respect and consideration

- No cost, product pitches, etc
- All may speak and vote
- No restrictions on presentations or materials
- No prices in any currency, complexity is OK
- 802.3 rules apply

Rules – in general... behave

Rules – web sites presented for bylaws, operating rules, etc. presented

Electronic information

- Web address – <http://www.ieee802.org/3/at/index.html>
- eMail reflector – stds-802-3-poep@ieee.org
- Private Area – user name and password given (not recorded here)
- Next meeting – please monitor www.ieee802.org/meeting/index.html

Present state:

- 30 disapproval voters, 2 votes short for technical approval
- 521 comments
- 3 days to clear comments

Time Limit review:

Presentations:

- 45 min max
- 15 min discussion max

Debate of Motions:

- 2 turns to speak, priority to first time speakers
- 3 minutes per speaker max
- 30 min per motion max

Debate of comments

- 2 turns to speak, priority to first time speakers
- 1 min per speaker max
- 5 min per comment max

Started Comment resolution at 9:18am. Please see Comment Resolution database for a record of the events.

** Break at 10:24am

At 10:46am - Resume comment resolution

At 10:54am Adam Healey introduces the attendance books

- Initial the day you are attending in the blue book (previous attendees)

- New attendees use the red book, include a business card if possible
- Must initial your affiliation in the book. If you do not initial, you do not get credit for attending the meeting

At 11:07am – a vote is taken on comment #356 regarding using an equation (aka Icable * Vport). Question was worded as “Vote yes to use an equation in table 33-6, vote no to use the number value”.

All in room:

Yes: 13 No: 13 Abstain: 4

Technical Motion – fails

Please note: All voting is taken by name. Please refer to

http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/public/may08/ballots_1_0508.pdf for the voter record spreadsheet.

** Break for lunch at 12:01pm

At 1:34pm - Resume comment resolution

At 2:18pm – Brief discussion on ad hoc WiFi networks from Mike McCormack. Multiple peer-to-peer networks disrupting the actual WiFi connection.

** Break at 2:47pm

At 3:05pm - Resume comment resolution

** Meeting adjourned at 5:45pm

May 14, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:49am. Bill Delveaux temporary chair due to Mike being delayed this morning.

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any letters of assurance. No one responded.

Started Comment resolution at 8:53am

At 9:44am – Mike McCormack back in as Chair. Steve Carlson stood up and made an announcement regarding the September interim in Chengdu China. The meeting will not happen in China due to the 7.9 magnitude earthquake in the area. More information will be available when new plans are made.

** Break at 10:03am

At 10:33am - Resume comment resolution

Yair announces the Midspan ad hoc at 5:30pm tonight for one hour

** Break for lunch at 12:00pm

At 1:33pm - Resume comment resolution

At 1:53pm – Motion to accept ez bucket comments

Motion by Geoff Thompson, Seconded by Yair Darshan:

Move that the task force accepts the editor's recommendation for those comments contained in the "ez" bucket as posted in P802d3at_D3p0_midmtg_bucket_EZ.pdf with the exception of comments 107, 234, and 365. .

Motion Passes via voice without opposition

Technical Motion – passes at 1:57pm

** Break at 2:58pm

At 3:15pm - Resume comment resolution

At 3:47pm – a vote is taken on comment #431 regarding low power mode (aka Hugh's). Question was worded as "Vote yes to accept this comment, vote no to not accept this comment".

All in room:

Yes: 2 No: 15 Abstain: 9

Technical Motion – fails

At 4:09pm – a vote is taken on comment #531 regarding Trise (aka 531). Question was worded as "Vote yes to accept this comment, vote no to not accept this comment".

All in room:

Yes: 14 No: 6 Abstain: 7

Technical Motion – fails

** Meeting adjourned at 5:32pm

May 15, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:46am.

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any letters of assurance. No one responded.

Mike discusses the schedule and where we are at with regards to comment resolution. The group will add an additional interim to work through the comments. The group will meet the week of June 23rd in the Boston area, four day meeting June 24th through June 27th. Additional information will be available when the specific location is decided.

Mike continues with a discussion on the July plenary. We will discuss comment resolution, new feature discussion, and recirculation ballot.

Midspan Adhoc report – Yair Darshan – darshan_2_0508.pdf and darshan_3_0508.pdf

Started at 9:01am

- Presentation on Midspan adhoc meeting
- BER test sensitivity analysis
- Test setup for compliance
- Significant digits discussion and adjustment

Transformer and Channel Adhoc report – Fred Schindler – schindler_1_0508.pdf

Started at 9:48am

- Presentation on Transformer and Channel adhoc meeting
- Current and Heat affects inductance – curves
- PHY Baseline Wander Correction

** Break at 10:14am

At 10:35am resume Fred's presentation

- Statistical Model
- Questions – discussion around baseline wander correction and the probability of packet loss under PoE plus power.

Straw poll – Chicago rules – Which option do you prefer?

1. Accept IEEE 802.3at D3.0 values
2. Determine an OCL value for economically feasible magnetics using the same or smaller form factor as legacy solutions. Then have PHY vendors confirm whether recent baseline wander correct methods will ensure interoperation at all required data rates.
3. Use statistics to determine the likelihood that the transformer OCL is 350uH and if that value is below ??? consider the system interoperable at the parameter levels selected.

4. Alternative A Midspan PSEs continue to be out of scope.

All in room:

Option 1: 13
Option 2: 18
Option 3: 16
Option 4: 2

Straw poll – Chicago rules – Which option are you absolutely against?

All in room:

Option 1: 7
Option 2: 2
Option 3: 2
Option 4: 13

Motion by Bill Delveaux, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry :

Move to accept the meeting minutes for November 2007 plenary and January 2008 interim as recorded on the IEEE802.3at website.

Voice vote – passes unanimously

Procedural Motion – passes at 12:18pm

Motion by Christian Beia, Seconded by Yair Darshan :

Move to accept the meeting minutes for March 2008 plenary as recorded in the files mccormack_1_0308.pdf as minutes_0308.pdf and as distributed during the meeting.

Voice vote – passes unanimously

Procedural Motion – passes at 12:19pm

** Break for lunch at 12:22pm

Started Comment resolution at 2:03pm

At 4:36pm

A motion is made by Wael Diab, Seconded by Mike McCormack:

“Move that the P802.3at Task Force chair send out an informal communiqué to 802.1 indicating our intentions of including LLDP TLVs in 802.3at, requesting a range of code points within the IEEE Std 802.1AB “IEEE 802.3 subtype” (IEEE 802.3 organizationally specific TLV) from IEEE802.1 and further to indicate that we intend to manage the definition of the code points and relevant TLVs.”

All in room:

Yes: 24 No: 1 Abstain: 1

Procedural Motion – passes

Motion by Yair Darshan, Seconded by David Law:

Move that the 802.3at Task Force adopt darshan_2_0508.pdf, slides 6, 7, 9-16, 21-22, 26-38, 41, 49-52 as a base line for:

- a) The System Channel Model Transfer Function at frequencies from 100KHz to 1MHz.
- b) The Alternative A Midspan PSE transfer function at frequencies from 100KHz to 1MHz.

All in room:

Yes: 14 No: 2 Abstain: 10

Technical Motion – passes at 6:13pm

Motion to adjourn by Chad Jones, seconded by Bill Delveaux, motion passes without opposition by voice.

** Meeting and session adjourned at 6:14pm

Ballot Spreadsheet can be found at:

http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/public/may08/ballots_1_0508.pdf