

Plenary Meeting – Sept 2008 – Seoul, Korea

Official Meeting Minutes

Chair = Mike McCormack

Recording Secretary = Bill Delveaux

Note: All times given in local Seoul (UTC/GMT+9) time

Note: Please see the comment resolution database for a record of comment resolution events. Refer to <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/comments/index.html> to find the latest comment database.

Note: All voting is taken by name and recorded. Please refer to http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/public/sep08/ballots_1_0809.pdf for the voter record spreadsheet.

September 16th, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:31am

Recording Secretary appointed – Bill Delveaux

Agenda:

Tuesday:

- Appoint Recording Secretary
- Review and discuss agenda
- Patent Review / Rules Review
- Introductions
- Liaison / Adhoc Reports (partial)
- Objectives / PAR updates
- Comment resolution

Wednesday and Thursday (Start at 8:30am)

- Patent Review
- Adhoc Reports (partial)
- Comment resolution

Friday (Start at 8:30am)

- Patent Review
- Adhoc Reports (balance)
- Comment resolution
- Housekeeping:

Motion to accept the agenda.

At 8:42am - Agenda passed without opposition (voice vote)

At 8:43am - Patent Policy read by Mike McCormack

- Slide #1 of the patent policy were read out loud by Mike McCormack
- Slide #2 read out loud by Mike McCormack – Links provided
- Slide #3 read out loud by Mike McCormack – Potentially Essential Patents

- Mike McCormack asks if any of the members want to identify any potentially essential patents – none
- Slide #4 read out loud by Mike McCormack – Other Guidelines

Ground Rules – mutual respect and consideration

- No cost, product pitches, etc
- All may speak and vote
- No restrictions on presentations or materials
- No prices in any currency, complexity is OK
- 802.3 rules apply

Rules – in general... behave

Rules – web sites presented for bylaws, operating rules, etc. presented

Electronic information

- Web address – <http://www.ieee802.org/3/at/index.html>
- eMail reflector – stds-802-3-poep@ieee.org
- Private Area – user name and password given (not recorded here)
- Next meeting – please monitor <http://www.ieee802.org/meeting/index.html>

Present state:

- 1 vote short for technical approval
- 244 comments, plus 17 late comments
- 3 days to clear comments

Attendance Tool

- For 802.3 membership
- <http://seabass.ieee.org/imat>

Introductions – went around the room

Sign in sheet sent around the room – enter name, employer, and affiliation

Started Comment resolution at 8:56am. Please see Comment Resolution database for a record of the events.

** Break at 10:00am

Back in Comment resolution at 10:19am

At 10:31am – a vote is taken on comment #194 regarding specifying the PSE and cable channel. Question was worded as “Vote yes to accept the resolution proposed, which is to reject the comment”.

All in room:

Yes: 14 No: 1 Abstain: 0

Technical Vote – passes

** Break for lunch at 11:47am

802.5at 5-Criteria and Housekeeping – Wael Diab – diab_1_0809.pdf

Started at 1:12pm

- Objectives and documents require some housekeeping
- 5 criteria – align to 24W as passed earlier
- Objectives – 4 proposed to change

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Anoop Vetteth :

Move to: :

Withdraw 802.3at Objective 5 (The enhanced standard will provide the maximum power to the PD as allowed within practical limits).

All in room:

Yes: 24 No: 0 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:32pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Fred Schindler :

Move to: :

Rewrite 802.3at Objective 9 from “Research potential extension of power classification to support PoEPlus modes” to “Extend power classification to support PoEPlus modes”

All in room:

Yes: 20 No: 2 Abstain: 2

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:35pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Yair Darshan :

Move to: :

Rewrite 802.3at Objective 10 from “PoE Plus will vigorously pursue supporting the operation of midspan PSEs for 1000BASE-T” to “Support the operation of midspan PSEs for 1000BASE-T”

All in room:

Yes: 20 No: 1 Abstain: 3

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:38pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Steve Carlson :

Move to: :

Withdraw 802.3at Objective 12 (That IEEE 802.3af power over the MDI isolation requirements be revisited as part of the PoEPlus work)

All in room:
Yes: 21 No: 0 Abstain: 3

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:42pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry :

Move to :
- *Replace 30W with 24W on the 802.3at 5-Criteria under Distinct Identity to match the objectives, draft and previous motions.*
- *Request that the 802.3 Working Group submit the updated 5 Criteria to the 802 Executive Committee for consideration at the November 2008 Plenary Session*

All in room:
Yes: 25 No: 0 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:44pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Jeff Heath :

Move to :
- *Task the 802.3at Task Force Chair to work with the Maintenance Chair and prepare an updated PAR to reflect the contingency with 802.3bc for consideration at the November plenary*
- *Task the 802.3at Task Force Chair to request the Working Group Chair to pre-submit the updated PAR to meet the 30-day deadline for 802.3 and EC consideration at the November plenary*

All in room:
Yes: 25 No: 0 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 1:59pm)

Back in Comment resolution at 2:01pm

** Break at 3:01pm

Back in Comment resolution at 3:15pm

At 4:25pm – a vote is taken on comment #152 regarding matching the state machine to the baseline comments. Question was worded as “Vote yes to accept the resolution proposed, which is to change the state machine”.

All in room:
Yes: 14 No: 1 Abstain: 0

Technical Vote – passes

** Meeting in recess at 5:20pm

September 17th, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:30am.

The chair reviewed the patent policy, moving forward on the slides as requested.

The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any letters of assurance. No one responded.

Started Comment resolution at 8:33am

** Break at 10:00am

Back in Comment resolution at 10:17am

Motion by Chad Jones, Seconded by Mike McCormack:

Move that the Task Force accepts the editors recommendation for those comments contained in the "ez" bucket as posted in P802d3at_D3p1_premtg_bucket_EZ.pdf with the exception of comment 91

*** This vote was by voice and is not in the voter spreadsheet

Technical Motion – passes without opposition (at 10:22am)

Back in Comment resolution at 10:24am

** Break for lunch at 12:04pm

Back in Comment resolution at 1:32pm

** Break at 3:00pm

Back in Comment resolution at 3:17pm

Comment Resolution Section 33.6 – Anoop Vetteth – vetteth_1_0809.pdf

Started at 4:12pm

- Suggested Remedies for multiple comments
- Revolving around timing
- Will return tomorrow with improved proposal

Motion by Geoff Thompson, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry:

Move that the Task Force adopts the following text into the draft:

A link segment that includes a compliant Midspan PSE is not assured to support 10GBASE-T operation. The standard does not address the operation of 10GBASE-T. For 10GBASE-T operation, the channel model specified in the 10GBASE-T clause (number needs to go here) needs to be met without regard to DTE power via MDI presence or operation.

All in room:

Yes: 10 No: 6 Abstain: 4

Technical Motion – fails (at 5:50pm)

Back in Comment resolution at 5:52pm

** Meeting adjourned at 6:02pm

September 18th, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:31am.

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

The chair asked if there were any letters of assurance. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

Started Comment resolution at 8:33am

** Break at 9:55am

Back in Comment resolution at 10:10am

** Break for lunch at 12:02pm

Back in Comment resolution at 1:30pm

Motion by Chad Jones, Seconded by Jeff Heath:

Move that the Task Force incorporates Norm Finn's feedback into the comment database to use for generating D3.2

All in room:

Yes: 20 No: 1 Abstain: 1

Technical Motion – passes (at 2:37pm)

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by Anoop Vetteth:

Move that the Task Force considers a comment from Mr. Vetteth relating to the 30 second DLL timer.

All in room:

Yes: 16 No: 2 Abstain: 2

Technical Motion – passes (at 2:50pm)

Back in Comment resolution at 2:51pm

** Break at 3:00pm

Back in Comment resolution at 3:21pm

Note: Please see the comment resolution database for a record of comment resolution events.
Refer to <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/comments/index.html> to find the latest comment database.

L2 timing – Anoop Vetteth – vetteth_2_0809.pdf

Started at 4:31pm

- PDs should be given sufficient time for boot up
- Proposal made for each paragraph

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry:

Move that the Task Force adopt Vetteth_2_0809.pdf.

All in room:

Yes: 21 No: 0 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 5:18pm)

Motion by David Law, Seconded by Martin Patoka:

Move that the Task Force accept the text on slide 25 in response to comment #112 in schindler_1_0809.pdf.

All in room:

Yes: 17 No: 5 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 6:40pm)

** Meeting adjourned at 7:03pm

September 19th, 2008:

Meeting called to order at 8:33am.

The chair asked if there was a request to review the patent policy. No one requested this.

The chair showed and read slide #3 of the Patent Slide set. The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any letters of assurance. No one responded.

The chair asked if there were any new patents. No one responded.

Started Comment resolution at 8:33am

Motion by Anoop Vetteth, Seconded by Yair Darshan:

Move that the Task Force adopts the following text into the draft replacing the second sentence of 33.1.1 item c):

The standard does not address the operation of 10GBASE-T. For 10GBASE-T operation, the channel model specified in the 10GBASE-T clause (number needs to go here) needs to be met without regard to DTE power via MDI presence or operation.

Passed via voice vote without opposition (at 8:41am)

With regards to comment 198, a show of hands vote (straw poll) was taken.

How many people in the room are opposed to lowering the PD power to 22W?

20 raised hands

How many people are in favor of lowering the PD power to 22W?

0 raised hands

How many people are in favor of lowering the PD power to under 22W?

0 raised hands

** Break at 10:00am

Back in Comment resolution at 10:15am

IEEE802.3.at Draft 3.1 – Jeff Heath – heath_1_0809.pdf

Started at 11:49am

- Change in valid PD detection signature
- Two suggested solutions

** Break for lunch at 12:02pm

Back in Comment resolution at 2:21pm

Motion by Wael Diab, Seconded by D. Matthew Landry:

Move to consider the comment from Jeff Heath as contained in heath_1_0809.pdf.

All in room:

Yes: 20 No: 1 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 2:36pm)

Housekeeping items (at 5:03pm)

Motion by Chad Jones, Seconded by Anoop Vetteth:

Move that the 802.3at Task Force accept the resolutions in the comment database, authorize the editor to create D3.2 and instruct the chair to conduct a re-circulation ballot.

All in room:

Yes: 20 No: 0 Abstain: 0

Technical Motion – passes (at 5:09pm)

Motion by Bill Delveaux, Seconded by Chad Jones :

Move to accept the meeting minutes for June 2008 interim as recorded on the IEEE802.3at website.

Voice vote – passes unanimously

Procedural Motion – passes at 5:14pm

Motion by Bill Delveaux, Seconded by Wael Diab :

Move to accept the meeting minutes for July 2008 plenary as recorded on the IEEE802.3at website.

Voice vote – passes unanimously

Procedural Motion – passes at 5:16pm

Motion to adjourn by Chad Jones, seconded by Bill Delveaux, motion passes without opposition by voice.

** Meeting and session adjourned at 5:17pm

Ballot Spreadsheet can be found at:

http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/at/public/sep08/ballots_1_0809.pdf