

Plenary Meeting — March 2009 — Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada

Official IEEE P802.3at Task Force Meeting Minutes

Chair = Mike McCormack

Recording Secretary = D. Matthew Landry

Note: All times given in local Vancouver (UTC/GMT-7) time

Note: Please see the comment resolution database for a record of comment resolution events. Refer to <http://www.ieee802.org/3/at/comments/index.html> to find the latest comment database.

March 10, 2009

08:30 — Meeting called to order

Appointed recording secretary.

Introductions around the room — by name, employer, and affiliation. Sign up sheet circulated.

Agenda:

Tuesday

- Appoint recording secretary
- Introductions
- Patent Review, Rules
- Review and discuss agenda
- Liaison / Adhoc Reports
- Comment resolution

Wednesday/Thursday

- 10:00 Wednesday approve EZ Bucket(s)
- Patent Review, Rules
- Comment resolution

Motion to accept agenda by R. Rannow, seconded by A. Vetteth.

08:33 — Agenda approved by voice without opposition.

08:34 — Patent policy presented, reviewed, and read aloud by the Chair.

- Slide #1 of the patent policy read aloud
- Slide #2 read aloud, links provided

- Slide #3 read aloud, potentially essential patents
- Chair asks if any members want to identify any potentially essential patents. No responses.
- Slide #4 read aloud, other guidelines

Ground Rules:

Pretend your mother is seated behind you with a rolled up newspaper — just behave.

Present state of the draft:

- 365 comments
- 75% returns
- 85% approval
- 4% abstain
- 2.5 days to clear comments

Time limits

- Presentations
 - 45 minutes of presentation
 - 15 minutes of discussion
- Debate of motions
 - Number of terms to speak
 - 2 turns priority to first time speakers
 - Time limit of debate
 - 3 minutes per speaker
 - 30 minutes per motion
- Debate of Comments
 - Number of terms to speak
 - 2 turns, priority to first time speakers
 - Time limits of debate
 - 1 minutes per speaker
 - 5 minutes per comment

08:44 — Comment resolution started. Please see comment resolution database for a record of events.

10:10 — Meeting recessed for coffee break.

10:20 — Comment resolution resumed.

10:31 — Comment resolution stopped. Chair presented a refresher on how to submit a ballot on 802.3bc.

10:36 — Comment resolution resumed.

11:55 — Meeting recessed for lunch.

13:08 — Comment resolution resumed.

17:11 — Meeting recessed for break.

17:30 — Comment resolution resumed.

20:10 — Meeting recessed until 8:30am, Wednesday.

March 11, 2009

08:30 — Meeting called to order

Chair asked if anyone would like to review the patent policy, would like to identify new patents, or would like to submit a letter of assurance. No responses.

08:35 — Comment resolution resumed. Please see comment resolution database for a record of events.

10:00 — Comment resolution stopped.

Motion by C. Jones, seconded by C. Beia:

Move that the Task Force accepts the editors recommendations for those comments contained in the “ez” bucket and “tez” bucket as posted in [P802d3at_D4p0_premtg_EZ_bucket.pdf](#) and [P802d3at_D4p0_premtg_TEZ_bucket.pdf](#) with the exception of comments 35, 36, 67, 79, 124, 133, 137 and 247.

- Technical motion, all in room voting.

10:01 — Motion passes by voice without opposition.

10:02 — Meeting recessed for short break.

10:14 — Comment resolution resumed.

11:32 — Comment resolution stopped.

G. Thompson presented TIA TSB-184 draft comment that introduces potentially confusing text regarding the necessity of using new CAT-5e cabling.

C. DiMinico presented his recommendation for a TIA liaison topic, suggesting changing the language to point out that the CAT-5e requirement should be considered when "planning new installations."

Mssrs. Thompson and DiMinico kindly helped prepare text for a TIA TR-42 liaison letter.

11:55 — Meeting recessed for lunch.

13:10 — Comment resolution resumed.

15:02 — Meeting recessed until 08:30, Thursday.

March 12, 2009

08:30 — Meeting called to order

Chair asked if anyone would like to review the patent policy, would like to identify new patents, or would like to submit a letter of assurance. No responses.

08:31 — Comment resolution resumed. Please see comment database for a record of events.

09:35 — Comment resolution stopped.

Motion by G. Thompson, seconded by J. Heath:

Move that the chair prepare a liaison letter to the TIA using the text of http://www.ieee802.org/3/poep_study/email/msg00892.html and present the letter to the 802.3 Working Group at the closing plenary.

- Technical motion, all in room voting.
- Y: 14 N: 1 A: 1

09:38 — Motion passes.

Motion by Y. Darshan, seconded by M. Landry:

Move that the Task Force approve the minutes as recorded in http://www.ieee802.org/3/at/public/2008/11/minutes_0811.pdf and http://www.ieee802.org/3/at/public/2009/01/minutes_0901.pdf

- Procedural motion, all in room voting.

09:41 — Motion passes by voice without opposition.

09:46 — Meeting recessed for a short break.

10:36 — Meeting resumed.

W. Diab presented outcome of 802.3bc/maintenance meeting.

Motion by S. Carlson, seconded by D. Law:

Affirm that the IEEE 802.3at Task Force will use the containment model in IEEE P802.3bc D2.0 and authorize the editor to make changes.

- Technical motion, all in room voting.
- Y: 20 N: 0 A: 0

10:51 — Motion passes.

A. Vetteth presented proposed textual changes to D4.0's treatment of Clause 30 and LLDP to align D4.1 with P802.3bc.

- Vigorous debate on whether any management attributes need to remain in the PD Basic Package
- In general, LLDP can be implemented independent of SNMP management. However, some features, such as `aPDReducedOperationPowerValue`, seem to make SNMP mandatory when implementing LLDP.

Agreement to move the entire oPD object to the PDLLDP object, but generally people are not comfortable accepting the text without detailed review.

Motion by W. Diab, seconded by A. Vetteth:

Instruct the editor to move the entire current PD attributes to be the PD LLDP objects. Instruct the entire current LLDP related PSE attributes to be the PSE LLDP objects. Make other related editorial changes to coordinate with IEEE P802.3bc D2.0.

- Technical motion, all in room voting.
- Y: 9 N: 0 A: 8

11:45 — Motion passes.

11:46 — Comment resolution resumed.

11:47 — Comment resolution completed.

Motion by J. Heath, seconded by C. Jones:

Move that the P802.3at Task Force adopt the comment resolutions as recorded in the comment resolution database, instruct the editor to generate D4.1 and task the chair to perform the actions necessary to advance.

- Technical motion, all in room voting.
- Y: 13 N: 0 A: 1

11:48 — Motion passes.

11:53 — Meeting adjourned.