Cl **FM**	*SC* **FM**	*P* **1**	*L* **28**	#	R1-14

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

This list is not correct. It also lists five previous amendments yet P802.3cx is identified as Amendment 5.

SuggestedRemedy

If new amendment numbers are assigned for the gaggle of amendments currently assumed to be hitting RevCom in September, obviously use that order. If amendment numbers remain unchanged from the last amendment number assignment, delete P802.3de from this list, and sort in amendment number order.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align this list with the current amendment order as determined by the Working Group Chair.

Cl **FM**	*SC* **FM**	*P* **11**	*L* **17**	#	R1-15

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

This paragraph is inconsistent with the current front matter as found in P802.3/D3.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Update for consistency with P802.3/D3.2.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align this paragraph with latest 802.3 FrameMaker template.

Cl **FM**	*SC* **FM**	*P* **12**	*L* **39**	#	R1-16

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

The description of Section Nine has changed during balloting of P802.3.

SuggestedRemedy

Update to be consistent with P802.3/D3.2.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Align this paragraph with latest 802.3 FrameMaker template.

Cl **FM**	*SC* **FM**	*P* **24**	*L* **44**	#	R1-27

Healey, Adam   Broadcom Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

In the table of contents, annex headings break across multiple lines.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the structure of annex headings per the most recent IEEE 802.3 FrameMaker draft template.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **0**	*SC* **0**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	#	R1-5

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

Keep this draft in line with the new revision (802.3dc) and any amendments that precede 802.3ck.

SuggestedRemedy

Align the next draft with the latest versions of the new revision (802.3df) and any preceding amendments.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **120**	*SC* **120.5.11.2.a**	*P* **110**	*L* **30**	#	R1-37

Ran, Adee   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *(bucket1)*

Some separation between the text and the sequence would be nice.

SuggestedRemedy

Add an empty paragraph before the sequence.

Consider moving the sequence and the text referring to it after equation 120-1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This comment does not apply to the substantive changes between IEEE P802.3ck D3.0 and D3.1 or the unsatisfied negative comments from previous drafts. Hence it is not within the scope of the recirculation ballot.
However, adding a vertical space prior to the sequence would be helpful. The sequence is part of the paragraph, so it should not be moved to be after the equation. There is no obvious formatting mechanism to reference text in this form.
Add a vertical space between the sequence and the rest of the paragraph above.
This is a not a substantive change to the draft.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **120**
SC **120.5.11.2.a**

Page 1 of 4
2022-04-05 5:41:52 PM

Cl **120F**　　*SC* **120F.3.1.2**　　　　*P* **241**　　*L* **4**　　　# R1-59

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　(bucket1)

"with the exception the high-frequency peak-to-peak AC common-mode voltage is defined in 120F.3.1.1"

Missing "that".

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "with the exception that the high-frequency peak-to-peak AC common-mode voltage is defined in 120F.3.1.1".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
There is another grammar error in this sentence: "are" should be "is".
Change: "Signal to AC common-mode noise ratio are defined by the method specified in 163.9.2.8 with the exception the high-frequency peak-to-peak AC common-mode voltage is defined in 120F.3.1.1."
To: "Signal to AC common-mode noise ratio is defined by the method specified in 163.9.2.8 with the exception that the high-frequency peak-to-peak AC common-mode voltage is defined in 120F.3.1.1."
This is not a substantive change to the draft.

Cl **120G**　　*SC* **120G.4.1**　　　　*P* **273**　　*L* **18**　　　# R1-38

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　(bucket1)

120G.4 has only a single subclause 120G.4.1 and no other content. The extra hierarchy level is unnecessary.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the 120G.4 paragraph and promote 120G.4.1 to second-level.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
The IEEE SA Standards Style Manual subclause 13.1 states: "Clauses and subclauses should be divided into further subclauses only when there is more than one subclause. For example, Clause 1 should not have a 1.1 unless there is also a 1.2." This further supports this comment.
Delete subclause heading "120G.4 Channel characteristics"
Change subclause heading "120G.4.1 Channel insertion loss (recommended)" to "120G.4 Channel insertion loss (recommended)"
Implement with editorial license.
This is not a substantive change to the draft.

Cl **120G**　　*SC* **120G.5.1**　　　　*P* **274**　　*L* **12**　　　# R1-60

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　HO/MO V_CMPP (bucket1)

..."is defined as the AC common-mode voltage range measured at TP0v that includes"...

TP0v is not defined for C2M; the output measurement points are TP1a and TP4.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "is defined as the AC common-mode voltage range measured at TP1a or TP4 that includes"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **C**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **162**　　*SC* **162.1**　　　　*P* **153**　　*L* **46**　　　# R1-8

Brown, Matthew　　　　　　Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　style (bucket1)

Footnote a in Table 162-1, Table 162-2, and Table 162-3 includes the word must, which is deprecated according the SA Standards Style Manual.

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 162-1, Table 162-2, and Table 162-3 ...
Change: "a conforming implementation must behave functionally"
To: "a conforming implementation behaves functionally"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This comment does not apply to the substantive changes between IEEE P802.3ck D3.0 and D3.1 or the unsatisfied negative comments from previous drafts. Hence it is not within the scope of the recirculation ballot.
However, eliminating the use of "must" is necessary in order to bring the draft into conformance with the SA Standards Style Manual.
Implement the suggested remedy.

Cl **162**　　*SC* **162.8.11**　　　　*P* **164**　　*L* **35**　　　# R1-2

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　training (bucket1)

"The of use_quiet_in_training (see 136.8.11.7.1) is TRUE"

The word "value" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The value of use_quiet_in_training (see 136.8.11.7.1) is TRUE".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　*Cl* **162**　　　Page 2 of 4
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　*SC* **162.8.11**　　　2022-04-05 5:41:52 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **162**   *SC* **162.8.11**   *P* **164**   *L* **35**   # R1-24

Lusted, Kent   Intel Corporation

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *training (bucket1)*

Implementation issue associated with comment i-48 against D3.0 (see
https://www.ieee802.org/3/ck/comments/draft3p0/8023ck_D3p0_final_closedcomments_sortedByNumber.pdf). The text as written for item h of 162.8.11 (page 164) is "The of
use_quiet_in_training (see 136.8.11.7.1) is TRUE."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The value of use_quiet_in_training (see 136.8.11.7.1) is TRUE." to align with
the Accepted response to comment i-48 on Draft 3.0.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **162**   *SC* **162.8.11**   *P* **165**   *L* **24**   # R1-10

Lusted, Kent   Intel Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *training (bucket1)*

In Table 162-9, the coefficient select field has the entry values of "1 0 0= Reserved and "0
1 x = Reserved" underlined. The underlining is not necessary.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the underlining for the entry values of "1 0 0" Reserved and "0 1 x = Reserved".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **162A**   *SC* **162A**   *P* **283**   *L* **15**   # R1-56

Dawe, Piers J G   NVIDIA

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *style (bucket1)*

"TP0 and TP5 that might not be testable": see style guide and D3.0 comment 214
(accepted for here)

SuggestedRemedy

TP0 and TP5, which might not be testable. Also in 162.8.1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
The IEEE Standards Style Manual subclause 10.2 states "The words that and which are
commonly misused; they are not interchangeable. That is best reserved in essential (or
restrictive) clauses, which is appropriate in nonessential (or nonrestrictive) parenthetical
clauses. Simply stated, if a comma can be inserted before the word that or which, the word
should be which. If a comma would not be used, the word to use is that."
The sentence should therefore be changed as proposed in the suggested remedy.
In 162A.1 (page 283 line 15) and 162.8.1 (page 161 line 37)...
Change: "TP0 and TP5 that might not be testable"
To: "TP0 and TP5, which might not be testable"
[Editor's note: Changed page number from 284 to 283.]
[Editor's note: CC: 162, 162A]

Cl **163**   *SC* **163.1**   *P* **197**   *L* **48**   # R1-9

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *style (bucket1)*

Footnote a in Table 163-1, Table 163-2, and Table 163-3 includes the word must, which is
deprecated according the SA Standards Style Manual.

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 163-1, Table 163-2, and Table 163-3 ...
Change: "a conforming implementation must behave functionally"
To: "a conforming implementation behaves functionally"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This comment does not apply to the substantive changes between IEEE P802.3ck D3.0
and D3.1 or the unsatisfied negative comments from previous drafts. Hence it is not within
the scope of the recirculation ballot.
However, eliminating the use of "must" is necessary in order to bring the draft into
conformance with the SA Standards Style Manual.
Implement the suggested remedy.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **163**
SC **163.1**

Page 3 of 4
2022-04-05 5:41:52 PM

Cl **163A**   *SC* **163A.3.1.1**   *P* **319**   *L* **11**   # R1-25

Healey, Adam   Broadcom Inc.

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *SSV/PP reference (bucket1)*

Equation (52-2) is an expression in terms of an intermediate variable y. Equation (52-3) is needed to map f_r to "y".

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Equation (52-2)" to "Equation (52-2) and Equation (52-3)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Equation 52-3 follows a "where" statement immediately following Equation 52-2; so it is obvious that Equation 52-2 depends on Equation 52-3 without explicit reference elsewhere.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **163A**   Page 4 of 4
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **163A.3.1.1**   2022-04-05 5:41:52 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line