P802.3ck D1.4
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Huawei, 802.3ck Editor-in-Chief
802.3ck Editorial Team

Introduction

- This slide package provides the initial comment agenda for the Draft 1.4 comment resolution.
- This agenda is subject to change as we progress.

IEEE P802.3ck Task Force, January 2021

We are here...

154 comments received
33 in bucket #1
4 withdrawn
117 comments to address

There are many repeat comments with ~59 responses referring to other comments.

We are recommending that 14 comments be deferred to Working Group ballot.

Stats_by_Clause

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
120	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
120F	0	0	6	2	0	3	11	0	11
120G	3	0	27	2	0	33	65	0	65
136	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
162	5	0	12	0	0	10	27	0	27
162A	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
162B	0	0	6	2	0	12	20	0	20
162C	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
162D	1	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	2
163	3	0	4	0	0	3	10	0	10
163A	1	0	0	0	0	3	4	0	4
163B	0	0	2	0	0	3	5	0	5
Total	14	0	61	6	0	73	154	0	154

Comment agenda

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ This agenda is subject to change on a weekly basis.

➢ Any changes will be communicated ahead of the next week's meeting.

❖ During comment resolution, we may choose to defer some comments to a later meeting to allow consensus building and/or detailed proposals.

❖ Meetings 1 to 8 are intended for resolving all 154 comments.

➢ Given the number of comments, 6 meetings should suffice.

➢ Draft 1.5 will be implemented based on these resolved comments.

❖ Meetings 9 and 10 are reserved to address any open technical completeness gaps identified by the editors while implementing the resolved comments.

➢ An updated draft (e.g., Draft 1.6) will be implemented based on changes approved at meetings 9 and 10.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
#1, January 26	Open D1.4 comment resolution series.
#2, January 27	Announce Bucket #1 CC: CM noise, RLDC, RLCC 120G part 1
#3, February 2	Clause 162, Annex 162B Clause 163, Annex 163A/B, Annex 120F 120G Part 2 Comments deferred from previous meetings Comments recommended for deferral to WG Ballot
#4, February 3	
#5, February 9	
#6, February 10	
#7/8, February 16/17	If necessary.
#9/10, March 3/10	Address remaining technical completeness gaps identified by editorial team, if necessary.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

CC: Common-Mode

Clause	Topic	Comments
162	RX RLCD	[119, 24]
162	TX RLCD	[118, 23]
162	CA RLCC	102, champion_01
162	CA RLCD	101, champion_02
163	RX RLCD	[121, 26]
163	channel ILCD	[122, 27]
163/120F	channel RLCD (CC)	139
120G	TP4 AC CM noise	[126, 35]
120G	TP4a/TP4/TP1 RLCD	138
120G	TP1a CM noise, PP voltage, RLCC (editor's note)	32

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Annex 120G, part 1 (matt)

Clause	Topic	Comments
120G	TP1/TP1a/TP4/TP4a EH/VEC	[40, 5, 61, 72, 75, 76, 77, 78, 80, 81, 88, 145] brown_01, wu_01, mellitz_01, ghiasi_01
120G	TP1a/TP4 transition time	83, 85, brown_01, wu_01, ghiasi_01
120G	TP1a EH/VEC XTALK	[14, 33, 62, 68, 84, 124] brown_02
120G	TP4 EH/VEC XTALK	[17, 36, 63, 69, 86, 127] brown_02
120G	TP4a SIT XTALK	[19, 37, 64, 70, 87, 128] brown_02
120G	TP1 SIT XTALK	[20, 39, 65, 71, 89, 129] brown_02
120G	EO method	154
120G	TP4a SIT	18, 67
120G	TP1/TP4 ERL	[125, 38, 34, 79]
120G	TP4 modes	[74, 148, 73], 146, 147, 149, 150, 151, 152

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 162, 162B (Chris)

Clause	Topic	Comments
162	CA ERL	[<u>103</u>, 25, 94, 113, 120]
162B	MTF ERL	[<u>112</u>, 8, 42, 98, 105, 106, 131]
162B	MTF ERL Tfx	99
162B	MTF FOMILD	[<u>111</u>, 41, 97, 104, 107, 130]
162B	MTF IL	96
162B	MTF RL mask	114

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 163, 163A, 163B, 120F (Phil, Howard, Matt)

Clause	Topic	Comments
163	channel IL	144
163B	TP0v/TP5v example	[132, 44, 45], 82
120F	measurement BW	136
120F	channel IL and RIT IL	[135, 29, 30]
120F	TX EQ	[134, 28, 108]
120F	channel ERL	[123, 31]

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Annex 120G, part 2 (Matt)

Clause	Topic	Comments
120G	TP4 modes	[74, 148, 73], 146, 147, 149, 150, 151, 152

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Recommended for deferral to WG Ballot

Clause	Topic	Comments
162/163/120F	CA COM Cp (CC)	115, 116, 117
162	asymmetric hosts	140
162	LF resolution	51
162	PRBS9Q	109, 110
162	pulse peak	141
162	RX RLCC	143
163A	TP0v/TP5v method	[1, 2, 3 ghiasi_02]
120G	TP1a/TP4 gDC	153, 90

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1

Clause	Comments
1	50
136	48, 52, 53
120	54, 55, 56
120F	47
120G	4, 13, 15, 16, 21, 138
162	46, 49, 59, 60, 95, 142
162A	57, 58
162B	6, 7, 22, 100
162C	43
162D	9, 10
163	66, 137
163A	11
163B	12

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Withdrawn

Clause	Comments
162	91, 92, 93
163	133

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation