

P802.3ck D1.4 Comment Resolution Agenda Meeting 3 & 4

Matt Brown, Huawei, 802.3ck Editor-in-Chief
802.3ck Editorial Team

Introduction

- This slide package provides the updated comment agenda for the Draft 1.4 comment resolution.
- This agenda is subject to change as we progress.

We are here...

154 comments received
20 closed
33 in bucket #1 (9 removed)
110 to address

For the open comments, there are many repeat comments with ~50 responses referring to other comments.

We are recommending that 14 comments be deferred to Working Group ballot.

Stats_by_Clause									
Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
120	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
120F	0	0	6	2	0	3	11	0	11
120G	3	0	27	2	0	33	61	4	65
136	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
162	5	0	12	0	0	10	18	9	27
162A	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
162B	0	0	6	2	0	12	20	0	20
162C	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
162D	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	2
163	3	0	4	0	0	3	4	6	10
163A	1	0	0	0	0	3	4	0	4
163B	0	0	2	0	0	3	5	0	5
Total	14	0	61	6	0	73	134	20	154

Comment agenda

- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ This agenda is subject to change on a weekly basis.
 - Any changes will be communicated ahead of the next week's meeting.
- ❖ During comment resolution, we may choose to defer some comments to a later meeting to allow consensus building and/or detailed proposals.
- ❖ Meetings 1 to 8 are intended for resolving all 154 comments.
 - Given the number of comments, 6 meetings should suffice.
 - Draft 1.5 will be implemented based on these resolved comments.
- ❖ Meetings 9 and 10 are reserved to address any open technical completeness gaps identified by the editors while implementing the resolved comments.
 - An updated draft (e.g., Draft 1.6) will be implemented based on changes approved at meetings 9 and 10.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
#1/#2, January 26/27	Open D1.4 comment resolution series: Announce Bucket #1 CC: CM noise, RLDC, RLGG 120G part 1 (started)
#3/#4, February 2/3	Bucket #1 motion Clause 162, Annex 162B 120G part 1 (continued)
#5/6, February 9/10	Clause 163, Annex 163A/B, Annex 120F 120G Part 2 Comments deferred from previous meetings Comments recommended for deferral to WG Ballot
#7/8, February 16/17	If necessary.
#9/10, March 3/10	Address remaining technical completeness gaps identified by editorial team, if necessary.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

CC: Common-Mode *** done ***

Clause	Topic	Comments
162	RX RLCD	[119, 24]
162	TX RLCD	[118, 23]
162	CA RLCC	102, champion_01
162	CA RLCD	101, champion_02
163	RX RLCD	[121, 26]
163	channel ILCD	[122, 27]
163/120F	channel RLCD (CC)	139
120G	TP4 AC CM noise	[126, 35]
120G	TP4a/TP4/TP1 RLDC	138
120G	TP1a CM noise, PP voltage, RLCC (editor's note)	32

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 162, 162B (Chris)

Clause	Topic	Comments
162	CA ERL	[<u>103</u> , 25, 94, 113, 120], diminico_02, champion_03
162B	MTF ERL	[<u>112</u> , 8, 42, 98, 105, 106, 131], diminico_01
162B	MTF ERL T_fx	99, diminico_01
162B	MTF IL	96
162B	MTF RL mask	114, diminico_01
162B	MTF FOMILD	[<u>111</u> , 41, 97, 104, 107, 130], diminico_01

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Annex 120G, part 1 (Matt)

Clause	Topic ¹	Comments
120G	TP1a/TP4 transition time	83, 85, brown_02, wu_01, ghiasi_01, dudek_01
120G	TP1/TP1a/TP4/TP4a EH/VEC	146, [40, 5, 61, 72, 75, 76, 77, 78, 80, 81, 88, 145] brown_01, wu_01, mellitz_01
120G	TP1a EH/VEC XTALK	[14, 33, 62, 68, 84, 124] brown_02
120G	TP4 EH/VEC XTALK	[17, 36, 63, 69, 86, 127] brown_02
120G	TP4a SIT XTALK	[19, 37, 64, 70, 87, 128] brown_02
120G	TP1 SIT XTALK	[20, 39, 65, 71, 89, 129] brown_02
120G	EO method	154, brown_04
120G	TP4a SIT	18, 67, brown_04
120G	TP1/TP4 ERL	[125, 38, 34, 79], brown_04

Note 1: In the topic column, TP1 refers to module input, TP1a refers to host output, TP4 refers to module output, and TP4a refers to host input.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Clause 163, 163B, 120F (Phil, Matt)

Clause	Topic	Comments
163	channel IL	144
163B	TP0v/TP5v example	[<u>132</u> , 44, 45], 82
120F	measurement BW	136
120F	channel IL and RIT IL	[<u>135</u> , 29, 30]
120F	TX EQ	[<u>134</u> , 28, 108]
120F	channel ERL	[<u>123</u> , 31]

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Annex 120G, part 2 (Matt)

Clause	Topic	Comments
120G	TP4 (module output) modes	[<u>74</u> , <u>148</u> , 73], 147, 149, 150, 151, 152

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Recommended for deferral to WG Ballot

Clause	Topic	Comments
162/163/120F	CA COM Cp (CC)	115, 116, 117
162	asymmetric hosts	140
162	LF resolution	51
162	PRBS9Q	109, 110
162	pulse peak	141
162	RX RLCC	143
163A	TP0v/TP5v method	[1, 2, 3, ghiasi_02]
120G	TP1a/TP4 gDC	153, 90

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1b

Clause	Comments
1	50
136	48, 52 (pulled), 53
120	54 (pulled), 55, 56 (modified page #)
120F	47 (pulled)
120G	4 (pulled), 13, 15, 16 (pulled), 21, 43 (closed on the floor already)
162	46, 49, 59, 60, 95, 142
162A	57, 58
162B	6, 7, 22 (pulled), 100 (pulled)
162C	43 (pulled)
162D	9, 10
163	66, 137
163A	11
163B	12
Proposed responses for the bucket comments are here: https://www.ieee802.org/3/ck/comments/draft1p4/8023ck_D1p4_comments_proposed_bucket1b.pdf	

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Withdrawn

Clause	Comments
162	91, 92, 93
163	133

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation