

## Comments Received

## IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P13 L7 # **R2-13**

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

P802.3de is not assigned Amendment 3 (it is assigned Amendment 6).

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete Amendment 3 description. (The commenter believes this comment is non-substantive and qualified to be passed to the Publication editor for consideration during publication preparation.)

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

CI **0** SC **0** P L # **R2-25**

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **GR** Comment Status **X**

Base text needs to be verified by other reviewers. The number and substance of existing differences needs to be remedied to avoid reintroducing what is now modified content from the current revision project.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Check and update base text per specific comments and from any other differences found during review.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

CI **1** SC **1.4.543c** P21 L52 # **R2-14**

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

Apparently this D3.0 comment somehow got dropped (or I failed to properly submit the second comment file.) Wrong insert point, should be 197a.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Create editing instruction to insert after 1.4.197 arbitration (move definition to proper subclause number). Renumber as 1.4.197a.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

CI **30** SC **30.3.2.1.2** P23 L12 # **R2-15**

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X**

P802.3 sort order for aPhyType was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #i-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphabetically coming before the "B" of BASE).

*SuggestedRemedy*

The correct order would be 10/1GBASE-PRS (P802.3/D3.2), 10/2.5GBASE-SP (P802.3cs), 10GBASE-PR (P802.3/D3.2), 10GBASE-SP (P802.3cs). This requires changing the order in the draft and adding a second editing instruction.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

CI **30** SC **30.3.2.1.2** P23 L20 # **R2-16**

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X**

P802.3 sort order for aPhyTypeList was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #i-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphabetically coming before the "B" of BASE).

*SuggestedRemedy*

The correct order would be 10/1GBASE-PRS (P802.3/D3.2), 10/2.5GBASE-SP (P802.3cs), 10GBASE-PR (P802.3/D3.2), 10GBASE-SP (P802.3cs). This requires changing the order in the draft and adding a second editing instruction.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

## Comments Received

## IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P24 L19 # R2-17

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

P802.3 sort order for aMAUTypeList was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #i-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphabetically coming before the "B" of BASE).

## SuggestedRemedy

10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Dx and 10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Uxy should be inserted after 10/1GBASE-PRX-U4. A new editing instruction then needs to be created to insert 10GBASE-SP1-Dx and 10GBASE-SP1-Uxy after 10GBASE-R.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 45 SC 45.2 P25 L5 # R2-18

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Base text error.

## SuggestedRemedy

P802.3/D3.2 has this as "MDI Interface registers"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27.2 P25 L51 # R2-19

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Base text error.

## SuggestedRemedy

P802.3/D3.2 has lower case registers ("(registers 1.1000...").

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.42 P32 L23 # R2-20

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Unmarked change that probably should have been fixed in P802.3. Both Registers 3.78 and 3.79 are listed as "lower" in P802.3/D3.2.

## SuggestedRemedy

Register 3.79.15:0 under name should have a strikethrough "lower" and "upper" in underscore.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P32 L45 # R2-21

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Base text error, the word "timer" (Name column) does not appear in P802.3/D3.2.

## SuggestedRemedy

Delete strikethrough "timer" in Name column.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 56 SC 56.1 P36 L5 # R2-22

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Base text error. The proposed change is now to the third paragraph of P802.3/D3.2, 56.1.

## SuggestedRemedy

Change instruction third paragraph and update base text (delete the first sentence as it is now a stand alone paragraph 2).

Proposed Response Response Status O

## Comments Received

## IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

---

CI 56	SC 56.1.2.1	P36	L50	# R2-23
-------	-------------	-----	-----	---------

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

Base text error. "Figure 56-2" does not appear in P802.3/D3.2, "and Figure 56-7" is in P802.3/D3.2 but not in the base text in this draft. Strikethrough "and" also appears with Figure 56-7 rather than where it is here as base text.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Correct base text and change mark appropriately.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

---

---

CI 56	SC 56.1.3	P38	L18	# R2-24
-------	-----------	-----	-----	---------

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X**

It is not clear if the new paragraph is to be inserted before or after the lettered list.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Clarify insert point.

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

---