

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L # 34
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

SuggestedRemedy

Make all hyperlinks "live".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.16.b P29 L50 # 31
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 50GBASE-T21
 To: 50GBASE-T2

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.244 P34 L17 # 32
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Interleaving of 8 was approved

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 1 1: Reserved
 To: 1 1: L=8, RS-FEC interleaving factor eight, default for 25GBASE-T1, 50GBASE-T2, and 100GBASE-T1, undefined for 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1
 Make the same change on P35L41

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.244.1 P34 L45 # 33
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Need to modify the text for L = 8.

SuggestedRemedy

Add Editor's instruction: Change the text in 45.2.1.244.1 as shown below.
 Note, for this comment, text between - - should be in strikethrough. Text between __ should be in underline.
 Change: The values of L=2 and L=4 are not defined for 2.5GBASE-T1 PHYs, -and- the value of L=4 is not defined for 5GBASE-T1 PHYs_, and the value of L=8 is not defined for 2.5GBASE-T1 PHYs, 5GBASE-T1 PHYs, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs_.
 Make the same change on P36L20

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 80 SC 80.1.3 P53 L38 # 35
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D

SuggestedRemedy

Add a 100GBASE-T4 "column" in Figure 80-1 With PCS, FEC, PMA, AN^2.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 80 SC 80.1.5 P54 L38 # 36
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 used a symbol not defined

SuggestedRemedy

Change "_X_" to "_M_"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 80 SC 80.2.6 P54 L48 # 40
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 100GBASE-T4 does not use Clause 73 AN.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the change made in the first paragraph.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 P60 L11 # 37
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 SuggestedRemedy
 add Figure 105-1 and add 25GBASE-T1 to it
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 P61 L22 # 38
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 used a symbol not defined
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "_X_" to "_M_"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 105 SC 105.3.6 P61 L40 # 39
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 25GBASE-T1 does not use Clause 73 AN.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the change made in the first paragraph.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 131 SC 131.1.2 P64 L8 # 41
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 SuggestedRemedy
 add Figure 131-1 and add 50GBASE-T2 to it
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 131 SC 131.1.2 P64 L28 # 43
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 need to add 50GBASE-T2 to the list
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add: _f) The MDI as specified in Clause 165 for 50GBASE-T2 uses a two-lane data path...
 also add appropriate editor's instructions.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 131 SC 131.1.3 P64 L30 # 44
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 SuggestedRemedy
 Modify 2nd paragraph to add info on 50GBASE-T2
 50GBASE-R represents a family of Physical Layer devices using the Physical Coding
 Sublayer (PCS) for 50 Gb/s operation over multiple PCS lanes (see Clause 133).
 _50GBASE-T2 represents a device using the two-lane PCS defined in Clause 165...
 Physical Layer devices listed in Table 131-1 are defined for operation at 50 Gb/s.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 131 SC 131.1.3 P64 L30 # 45
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a row at the bottom of Table 131-1 with 50GBASE-T2:
 50GBASE-T2 | 50 Gb/s PHY using 50GBASE-T2 encoding over two-pair of shielded
 balanced copper cable, with reach up to at least 11 m (see Clause 165).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 131 SC 131.1.4 P64 L52 # 42
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 used a symbol not defined
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "_X_" to "_M_"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.1.3 P72 L37 # 46
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 4 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.1.3.1 P73 L30 # 47
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 5 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.1.3.1 P73 L39 # 48
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 6 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2 P87 L12 # 49
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 7 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2 P87 L18 # 50
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 The baud rate is 1000/14.0625 ps.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: "The baud rate is 1000/14.0625 ps."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2 P87 L38 # 51
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 9 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2 P87 L44 # 52
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 10 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2 P87 L51 # 53
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 11 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.13 P94 L15 # 77
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from "100 25GMII data transfers ..." to "260 25GMII data transfers ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.13 P94 L15 # 78
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from "It takes 1800 PMA_UNITDATA transfers ..." to "It takes 4680 PMA_UNITDATA transfers ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.14 P94 L29 # 58
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 16 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.15 P94 L46 # 59
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 17 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.17 P95 L39 # 62
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 20 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.17 P96 L1 # 64
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 22 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P100 L24 # 70
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 28 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.17 P96 L7 # 65
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 23 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P100 L48 # 76
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D
A partial frame is 1170 PAM2 symbols for 802.3cy.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "...every 450 PAM2 symbols..." to "every 1170 PAM2 symbols..."
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.17 P96 L18 # 66
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 24 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3.1 P101 L21 # 71
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 29 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.17 P96 L31 # 67
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Need to update FEC related parameters
SuggestedRemedy
See page 25 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.5 P103 L27 # 74
Tu, Mike Broadcom
Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
Indices in Equation 165-7 should be updated based on the 802.3cy FEC
SuggestedRemedy
See page 9 of tu_3cy_01_02_22_22.pdf
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.4.5 P132 L52 # 72
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 30 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P141 L21 # 80
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Scaling parameter "S" is not defined and it should be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from "... +0/-4 x S..." to "... +0/-4 ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4 P137 L31 # 79
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 The InfoField bit locations need to be updated.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from "... 16th partial PHY frame (bits 6750 to 6845)." to "...16th partial PHY frame (bits 17550 to 17645)."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.6.1 P143 L45 # 81
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 New values should be added for variable "force_phy_type"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add one more value above "10G-T1" as follows:
 "25G-T1: If Auto-Negotiation is disabled or not implemented and 25GBASE-T1 is selected."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P140 L8 # 75
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32 in order to align with L=8 FEC superframe boundary.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the two occurrences of "... multiple of 16" to "... multiple of 32".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.5.5.1 P158 L6 # 27
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D minimum frequency
 The applicable frequency range is missing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 After equation 165-17 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $n \leq f \leq 9000$
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 After equation 165-17 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $1 \leq f \leq 9000$

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.5.5.2 P158 L38 # 28
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D minimum frequency
 The applicable frequency range is missing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 After equation 165-18 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $n \leq f \leq 9000$
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 After equation 165-18 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $1 \leq f \leq 9000$

Cl 165 SC 165.5.5.3.1 P159 L35 # 29
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D minimum frequency
 The applicable frequency range is missing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 After equation 165-21 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $n \leq f \leq 9000$
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 After equation 165-21 add the following:
 where
 f is the frequency in MHz: $1 \leq f \leq 9000$

Cl 165 SC Equation 165-1 P95 L47 # 63
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 21 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-10 P96 L37 # 68
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 26 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-12 P103 L8 # 73
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Interleaving depth L=8 should be included in this figure.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "L=8 superframe" in Figure 165-12, as shown on page 8 of tu_3cy_01_02_22_22.pdf.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-6 P89 L9 # 54
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 12 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-6 P89 L17 # 55
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 13 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D0.5 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-7 P90 L8 # 56
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 14 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Table 165-2 P97 L37 # 69
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 FEC generator polynomial need to be updated
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 27 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-7 P90 L28 # 57
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 15 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165A SC 165A.2.1 P190 L29 # 30
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
 Comment Type T Comment Status D minimum frequency
 Change minimum frequency in the ragne
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 10 to n
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change 10 to 1

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-9 P95 L6 # 60
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 18 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC Figure 165-9 P95 L11 # 61
 Tu, Mike Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status D FEC related parameters
 Need to update FEC related parameters
 SuggestedRemedy
 See page 19 of tu_3cy_01_03_08_2022.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.