

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.242 P31 L1 # 126  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.242 and all subclauses.  
 P28L15, change 45.2.1.242 to green as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.243 P32 L18 # 127  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.243 and all subclauses.  
 P28L16, change 45.2.1.243 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.245.1 P34 L51 # 125  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 The addition of L=8 exclusions is not consistent with the original text.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the text to the following.  
 -x- indicates to strikethrough "x"  
 \_y\_ indicates to underline "y"  
 The values of L=2\_ \_and- L=4\_ , and L=8\_ are not defined for 2.5GBASE-T1 PHYs, -and- the value\_s\_ of L=4 \_and L=8 are\_ -is- not defined for 5GBASE-T1 PHYs\_ , and the value of L=8 is not defined for 10GBASE-T1 PHYs.\_  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.247 P36 L35 # 128  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.247 and all subclauses.  
 P28L22, change 45.2.1.243 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.248 P37 L1 # 129  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.248 and all subclauses.  
 P28L23, change 45.2.1.243 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.249 P37 L23 # 130  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.249 and all subclauses.  
 P28L24, change 45.2.1.243 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.250 P37 L43 # 131  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.1.250 and all subclauses.  
 P28L25, change 45.2.1.243 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.83 P39 L1 # 132  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.3.83 and all subclauses.  
 P39L20, change 45.2.3.83 to green as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.84 P39 L21 # 114  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 As there are no changes in this subclause it can be removed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove 45.2.3.84 and all subclauses.  
 P39L21 change 45.2.3.84 to green (and remove the hyperlink) as the subsection it references is removed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.1.3.1 P72 L42 # 134  
 Tu, Mike Broadcom  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 On the lower left corner of Figure 165-2, it should be changed to "25 GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change from "25GMII GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE" to "25 GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change from  
 "25GMII GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE"  
 to  
 "25 GIGABIT MEDIA INDEPENDENT INTERFACE"

Cl 165 SC 165.1.3.2 P73 L5 # 135  
 Tu, Mike Broadcom  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 The baud rate is 14062.5 Mbd  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change from "14 0625.5 Mbd" to "14 062.5 Mbd"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.5 P101 L17 # 136  
 Tu, Mike Broadcom  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Add a "space" character between L = 8 and superframe.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change from "L = 8superframe" to "L = 8 superframe"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 165 SC 165.3.9 P118 L4 # 115

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9 and put the following text in 165.3.9:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 PCS level operations, administration, and maintenance (OAM) provides an optional mechanism useful for monitoring link operation such as exchanging PHY link health status and message exchange. When OAM is implemented, behavior shall conform to 143.9, including the state diagrams in Figure 149–24 and Figure 149–25. The OAM frame data is carried in the OAM 10-bit field described in 165.3.2.2.14 for the normal power data mode and 165.3.6.3 for low power mode.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9 and put the following text in 165.3.9:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 PCS level operations, administration, and maintenance (OAM) provides an optional mechanism useful for monitoring link operation such as exchanging PHY link health status and message exchange. When OAM is implemented, behavior is defined in 143.9, including the state diagrams in Figure 149–24 and Figure 149–25. The OAM frame data is carried in the OAM 10-bit field described in 165.3.2.2.14 for the normal power data mode and 165.3.6.3 for low power mode.

CI 165 SC 165.3.9.1 P118 L29 # 116

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9 and put the following text in 165.3.9.1:  
The definitions for OAM are as defined in 165.3.9.1 for OAM frame, OAM symbol, OAM message, and OAM status.  
OAM field: A 10-bit field in each PHY frame reserved for the OAM symbol as described in 165.3.2.2.14 or in each refresh cycle as described in 165.3.6.3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9 and put the following text in 165.3.9.1:  
The definitions for OAM are as defined in 165.3.9.1 for OAM frame, OAM symbol, OAM message, and OAM status.  
OAM field: A 10-bit field in each PHY frame reserved for the OAM symbol as described in 165.3.2.2.14 or in each refresh cycle as described in 165.3.6.3.

CI 165 SC 165.3.9.2 P118 L48 # 117

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.2, except 165.3.9.2.1 and put the following text in 165.3.9.2:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM shall function as defined in 149.3.9.2 except the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM frame structure as defined in 165.3.9.2.1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.2, except 165.3.9.2.1 and put the following text in 165.3.9.2:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM functions are defined in 149.3.9.2 except for the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM frame structure as defined in 165.3.9.2.1.

CI 165 SC 165.3.9.2.1 P118 L48 # 118

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.2.1 and put the following text in 165.3.9.2.1:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM frame structure shall follow 149.3.9.2.1 with the addition of the rule with 8x interleaving defined here:  
8x interleaving -- insert 0 to 7 dummy OAM symbols into the superframe for alignment before continuing.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.2.1 and put the following text in 165.3.9.2.1:  
The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM frame structure is defined in 149.3.9.2.1 with the addition of the rule with 8x interleaving defined here:  
8x interleaving -- insert 0 to 7 dummy OAM symbols into the superframe for alignment before continuing.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.2.1 P119 L8 # 138

Tu, Mike Broadcom

Comment Type T Comment Status D

Need to include the case for L=8 interleaving.

SuggestedRemedy

Change this paragraph to:

"When the PCS frame is operating in interleaved mode of 2x, 4x, or 8x, the first symbol (OAM<0>) shall be inserted in the first RS frame in the superframe so that the full OAM frame can be packed into eight superframes in the 2x interleaved mode, into four superframes in the 4x interleaved mode, and into two superframes in the 8x interleaved mode."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.2.1 P119 L27 # 137

Tu, Mike Broadcom

Comment Type T Comment Status D

Insert the case for "8x interleaving".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a new paragraph "8x interleaving == insert 0 to 7 dummy OAM symbols into the superframe for alignment before continuing."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.3 P124 L49 # 119

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.3 and put the following text in 165.3.9.3: The state diagram variable to OAM register mapping shall be as defined in 149.3.9.3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.3 and put the following text in 165.3.9.3: See 149.3.9.3.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.4.3 P126 L10 # 120

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.3 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.3: The MultiGBASE-T1 OAM variables shall be those defined in 149.3.9.4.3 except those defined below.

Keep rx\_boundary and tx\_boundary definitions as they currently are in D1.1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.3 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.3: See 149.3.9.4.3 except for the variables defined below.

Keep rx\_boundary and tx\_boundary definitions as they currently are in D1.1.

Cl 165 SC 165.3.9.4.4 P130 L23 # 121

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status D

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.4 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.4: The counters shall be as defined in 149.3.9.4.4.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.4 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.4: See 149.3.9.4.4.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.3.9.4.5**                      **P130**            **L41**            # **122**

Wienckowski, Natalie                      General Motors

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.5 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.5:  
The functions shall be as defined in 149.3.9.4.5.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.5 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.5:  
See 149.3.9.4.5.

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.3.9.4.6**                      **P131**            **L41**            # **123**

Wienckowski, Natalie                      General Motors

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.6 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.6:  
The state diagrams shall be as defined in 149.3.9.4.6.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete all the content in 165.3.9.4.6 and put the following text in 165.3.9.4.6:  
See 149.3.9.4.6.

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.4.2.4.9**                      **P138**            **L52**            # **139**

Tu, Mike    Broadcom

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

Copy from Table 149-13.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Cope from Table 149-13.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.4.2.4.9**                      **P139**            **L6**            # **140**

Tu, Mike    Broadcom

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

Copy from Table 149-14.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Copy from Table 149-14.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.4.2.4.10**                      **P139**            **L38**            # **141**

Tu, Mike    Broadcom

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

Copy the "Maximum time (ms)" column from Table 149-15, with " / S" removed.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Copy the "Maximum time (ms)" column from Table 149-15, with " / S" removed.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 165**    **SC 165.4.2.5**                              **P140**            **L5**            # **142**

Tu, Mike    Broadcom

**Comment Type**    **T**                      **Comment Status**    **D**

Copy the "Maximum time (ms)" column from Table 149-16, with " / S" removed.

**SuggestedRemedy**

Copy the "Maximum time (ms)" column from Table 149-16, with " / S" removed.

**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cy D1.1 10G+ Auto Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.7 P144 L7 # 143  
 Brett McClellan Marvell  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 I realize the EEE text has not been formally accepted yet, however this text on the refresh monitor makes reference to a specific time period and also a variable rate option ( "1.536/S ms" ) which might be missed when making updates to the EEE text. This period should be made TBD for now.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change "1.536/S" to "TBD"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165B SC 165B P193 L1 # 124  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 As the laning is being done in the RS, the MultiGBASE-T1 OAM defined in Clause 149 is used with a few changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Annex 165B as this is not needed as we are now referring to Clause 149 which refers to Annex 149B.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.7 P146 L52 # 144  
 Brett McClellan Marvell  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 I realize the EEE text has not been formally accepted yet, however this text on lpi\_refresh\_rx\_timer makes reference to a specific time period and also a variable rate option ( "1.536/S ms" ) which might be missed when making updates to the EEE text. This period should be made TBD for now.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change "1.536/S" to "TBD"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 165 SC 165.8.2.1 P169 L13 # 133  
 Gardner, Andrew Analog Devices  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 MDI RL mask (154-42) requires 20dB of loss between 10MHz and 280S. This requirement may be limiting for PoDL inductors that need to meet a more aggressive high frequency RL requirement.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the first line of the MDI return loss requirement (165-42) to be: 20-20\*log10(50/f)dB between 5<=f<50 where f is in MHz. Change the second line of the MDI return loss requirement (165-42) to be: 20dB between 50<=f<280S where f is in MHz. This change would allow the use of PoDL inductors with OCL>1uH.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.