IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/FM SC FM	P1	L	# 447	C/FM SC FM	P11	L10	# 660
Carlson, Steve	HSD, Bosch,	Ethernovia		Murty, Ramana	Broadcom		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
The FrameMaker te	emplate has been updated to Ve	rsion 5.1 by Pet	e Anslow.	Text in Amendment 3	5		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
	e to Ver. 5.1 per Anslow			There is no abbreviat	ion (PHY) in 802.3db. Add a co	omma after "two	o" on line 11.
·	.org/3/tools/framemaker/index.ht	tml		Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
				C/FM SC FM	P11	L10	# 396
C/FM SC FM	P <b>7</b>	L17	# 372	Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslu	ting		Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			The description of db	doesn't match D3.2 of P802.3	db. PHY is not	the correct abbreviatio
WG ballot group is	now known.			as it means "Physica	Layer device". Also, two oxfo	rd commas are	missing.
0 1	now known.			as it means "Physica SuggestedRemedy	I Layer device". Also, two oxfo	rd commas are	missing.
0 1				SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La	ver (PHY) specifications and m	anagement para	ameters for 100, 200
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La		anagement para	ameters for 100, 200
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou	Jp.			SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over or signaling. To: Physical Layer s	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management	anagement para node fiber based	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical <sup>•</sup> 100, 200, and 400 Gb/
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou	Jp.	L3	# 395	SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over or signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base	anagement para node fiber based	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical <sup>•</sup> 100, 200, and 400 Gb/
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou Proposed Response	up. Response Status <b>O</b>	•	# 395	SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over or signaling. To: Physical Layer s	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management	anagement para node fiber based	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical <sup>•</sup> 100, 200, and 400 Gb.
C/ FM SC FM Nienckowski, Natalie	up. Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>11</b>	•	# 395	SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Lat and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	anagement para ode fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb, optical signaling.
Cl FM SC FM Nienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	up. <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11	L 22	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical <sup>•</sup> 100, 200, and 400 Gb.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou Proposed Response CI FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for F	up. Response Status <b>0</b> P11 General Moto Comment Status <b>X</b>	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Lat and 400 Gb/s over or signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto	L 22	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb optical signaling.
Cl FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for F SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical M	up. Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>11</b> General Moto Comment Status <b>X</b> PMA is physical medium attachn Media Attachment (PMA)	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical Lat and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	anagement para node fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb optical signaling.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for F SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical M To: Physical Mediu	up. Response Status O P11 General Moto Comment Status X PMA is physical medium attachm Media Attachment (PMA) um Attachment (PMA)	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The description of de	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto	anagement para node fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb optical signaling.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for F SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical M To: Physical Mediu	up. Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>11</b> General Moto Comment Status <b>X</b> PMA is physical medium attachn Media Attachment (PMA)	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response CI FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The description of de SuggestedRemedy	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	anagement para node fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb optical signaling.
SuggestedRemedy Add WG ballot grou Proposed Response CI FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The expansion for F SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical M	up. Response Status O P11 General Moto Comment Status X PMA is physical medium attachm Media Attachment (PMA) um Attachment (PMA)	ors		SuggestedRemedy Change: Physical La and 400 Gb/s over of signaling. To: Physical Layer s over one, two, and fo Proposed Response C/ FM SC FM Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E The description of de	ver (PHY) specifications and m ne, two and four pairs of multim pecifications and management ur pairs of multimode fiber base <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 11 General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	anagement para node fiber based parameters for ed on 100 Gb/s	ameters for 100, 200 d on 100 Gb/s optical 100, 200, and 400 Gb optical signaling.

C/ FM SC FM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	<b>B</b> · · ·			<u> </u>				
C/FM SC FM	P11	L <b>30</b>	# 398	C/ 00	SC O	Р <b>0</b>	L <b>0</b>	# 346
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Motors	6		Brown, M		Huawei		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	21	Comment Status X	· · · · ·	
	doesn't match D3.0 of P802.3cx	ί.			errors in editorial	I instructions throughout this d one by one.	raft. These are	a mess and rather
SuggestedRemedy				Suggeste	dRemedv			
Change: transmit and To: transmit and rece				00		rial instructions and ensure the	at that are consi	istent with the rules
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			802.3		nsult editorial instructions para , for examples. Most have bee		
C/FM SC FM	P 20	L 48	# 449	Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
Carlson, Steve	HSD, Bosch, Et	thernovia						
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			C/ 1	SC 1.4.128a	P 21	L <b>8</b>	# 373
	lly out of date. Example projects	are a decade	old: (e.g., IEEE	Grow, Ro	bert	RMG Consluti	ng	
P802.3bj and IEEE P SuggestedRemedy	302.3DK)			Comment	Type TR	Comment Status X		
Change to (e.g., IEEE P802.3cz) Proposed Response	P802.3cx and IEEE Response Status <b>O</b>			Ether links. P802 descr	net network may i This error is simi .3/D3.2, but shoul	not full duplex, though it may include multiple data rates in f ilar to some of the PHY Type Id not be replicated. 1.4.14 10 work"; but 1.4.82 10GBASE-Tr ing an error)	the collective se definitions that e 000BASE-T1 do	et of its physical layer exist in approved bes not include a
		LO	"	Suggeste	· ·			
~ <u>00</u> SC 0	Dn							
	P <b>0</b> Futurowei LIS 9	-	# <u>455</u>		-	ayer specification for a 25 Gb/	s Ethernet link u	using a single twisted-
D'Ambrosia, John	Futurewei, US	-		IEEE	-	ayer specification for a 25 Gb/	/s Ethernet link ເ	using a single twisted
D'Ambrosia, John	Futurewei, US Comment Status X	-		IEEE pair c	802.3 Physical La	ayer specification for a 25 Gb/ Response Status <b>0</b>	/s Ethernet link u	using a single twisted
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla	Futurewei, US Comment Status X	-		IEEE pair c	802.3 Physical La opper cable.		's Ethernet link u	using a single twisted-
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy	Futurewei, US Comment Status X	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c	802.3 Physical La opper cable.		<i>L</i> 11	using a single twisted
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy Consult with IEEE SA	Futurewei, US S Comment Status X ve should be avoided.	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c Proposed	802.3 Physical La opper cable. <i>Response</i> SC <b>1.4.407</b>	Response Status <b>O</b>		
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy Consult with IEEE SA	Futurewei, US S Comment Status X ve should be avoided.	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c Proposed C/ 1	802.3 Physical La opper cable. <i>Response</i> SC <b>1.4.407</b> att	Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>21</b>		
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy Consult with IEEE SA	Futurewei, US S Comment Status X ve should be avoided.	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c Proposed C/ 1 Brown, M Comment	802.3 Physical La opper cable. <i>I Response</i> SC 1.4.407 att <i>Type</i> E	Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>21</b> Huawei	L11	# <u>343</u>
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy Consult with IEEE SA	Futurewei, US S Comment Status X ve should be avoided.	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c Proposed C/ 1 Brown, M Comment	802.3 Physical La opper cable. I Response SC 1.4.407 att Type E rial instruction is s	Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>21</b> Huawei Comment Status <b>X</b>	L11	# [343
D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type E The terms master/sla SuggestedRemedy	Futurewei, US S Comment Status X ve should be avoided.	Subsidiary of H		IEEE pair c Proposed Cl 1 Brown, M Comment Editor Suggeste	802.3 Physical La opper cable. I Response SC 1.4.407 att Type E rial instruction is s	Response Status O P21 Huawei Comment Status X superfluous as changes are ev	L11	# [343

C/ 1 SC **1.4.407** 

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 1 SC 1.4	473 P 21	L16	# 383	C/ 1	SC	1.5.3	P37	L 25	# 30	69
Marris, Arthur	Cadence De	sign Systems		Grow, Ro	obert		RMG C	consluting	-	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Commen	t Type	TR	Comment Status	<b>(</b>		
No editing intruct	on for 1.4.473						ves its own protocol sta			
SuggestedRemedy							relevant 105.3.x subcla WG ballot as the draft			
Add "Change 1.4	.473 as follows:"						no associated changes			
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Suggeste			-			
							in the TF are much bet			
C/1 SC 1.4	473 P21	L17	# 475				T1 protocol stack relev SE-T1 protocol stack.			
						bclauses.	•			
Zimmerman, George	Comment Status X	lling/APL Gp, Cisc	o, CommScope, Marve	Proposed	d Respoi	nse	Response Status	C		
Comment Type E	change 'twisted pair' to 'conducto	r nair' hara wa na	ad to also abango the							
	he matching definition of PoDL P		ed to also change the	C/ 30	SC	30.3.2.1.	2 P15	L15	# 39	90
SuggestedRemedy				Wiencko				al Motors		
	L PD to the draft, changing "twiste			Commen	- , -	E	Comment Status			
1.4.472 PoDL PL consisting of a	: A Powered Device that is intend	led to receive pow	er from a link section			_	o be moved right and th	-	be space before t	he
	tedconductor p	air. (See IEEE Sto	1 802.3, Clause 104.)		ription.					
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Suggeste	dReme	dy				
				Add :	spaces i	n "25GBA	SE-T1 Clause 165 25	Gb/s PAM4" to r	match 802.3-2022	spacing.
C/ 1 SC 1.4	473 P 21	L17	# 344	Proposed	d Respoi	nse	Response Status	C		
Brown, Matt	Huawei									
Comment Type E	R Comment Status X			C/ 30	SC	30.3.2.1.	3 P 15	L <b>21</b>	# 40	00
No editorial instru	iction.			Wiencko	wski, Na	atalie	Genera	al Motors	-	
SuggestedRemedy				Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status	<b>(</b>		
	ruction here and in various other le	ocations in this dra	aft including 105.1.1.		PHY type ription.	e needs to	o be moved right and th	nen there should	be space before t	he
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Suggeste	dReme	dv				
				00		•	SE-T1 Clause 165 25	Gb/s PAM4" to r	match 802.3-2022	spacing.
				Proposed	•		Response Status			. 0
								-		

C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.1.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 30 SC 30.	5.1.1.2	P 15	L 35	# 401	C/ <b>43</b>	SC 43.3	P 28	L <b>2</b>	# 335
Wienckowski, Natalie	9	General Moto	ors		Maguire,	Valerie	Copperopolis		
Comment Type E	Comm	nent Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
	eds to be move	ed right and then the	ere should be sp	ace before the	Interfa	ace is capitalized	d when appearing after "MDIO	" (see clause 4	5 header).
description.					Suggeste	dRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy			<pre>//</pre>				ut (MDIO) interface" with "Inpu	t/Output (MDIO	) Interface" (this may
Add spaces in "2 Clause 165" to m		ngle balanced pair o	of conductors PF	HY as specified in		to be a mainten	ance rquest)		
Proposed Response		nse Status <b>O</b>			Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
					C/ 43	SC 43.3	P 28	L6	# 336
C/ 30 SC 30.	6.1.1.5	P15	L <b>49</b>	# 402	Maguire,		Copperopolis	-	
Vienckowski, Natalie	9	General Moto	ors		Comment		Comment Status X		
					Comment	туре Е			
Comment Type E	Comm	nent Status X			Interf	ace is canitalized	d when appearing after "MDIO	" (see clause 4	5 header)
		nent Status X ed right and then the	ere should be sp	ace before the		•	d when appearing after "MDIO	" (see clause 4	5 header).
			ere should be sp	ace before the	Suggeste	dRemedy		,	,
The PHY type ne			ere should be sp	ace before the	Suggeste Repla	dRemedy ace, "MDIO inter	d when appearing after "MDIO face" with "MDIO Interface" (th	,	,
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy	eds to be move	ed right and then the		ace before the 802.3-2022 spacing.	Suggester Repla rques	d <i>Remedy</i> ace, "MDIO inter t)	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th	,	,
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy	eds to be move	ed right and then the			Suggester Repla rques	dRemedy ace, "MDIO inter		,	,
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respor</i>	ed right and then the	e 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing.	Suggester Repla rques	d <i>Remedy</i> ace, "MDIO inter t)	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th	,	,
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respor</i>	ed right and then the specified in Clause nse Status <b>O</b> P28	2 165" to match 8		Suggester Repla rques Proposed	dRemedy ace, "MDIO interf t) Response SC <b>45.2.1</b>	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th Response Status <b>O</b>	his may need to	be a maintenance
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response C/ 43 SC 43. Maguire, Valerie	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respor</i> 3	ed right and then the specified in Clause nse Status <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 28 Copperopolis	2 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing.	Suggeste Repla rques Proposed Cl <b>45</b>	dRemedy ace, "MDIO interf t) Response SC <b>45.2.1</b> bert	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>23</b>	his may need to	be a maintenance
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response Cl 43 SC 43. Maguire, Valerie Comment Type E	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respon</i> 3 <i>Comm</i>	P 28 Copperopolis nent Status X	2 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing.	Suggester Repla rques Proposed CI 45 Grow, Ro Comment I find	dRemedy ace, "MDIO interf t) <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1</b> bert <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> no changes or ir	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th Response Status <b>O</b> P23 RMG Conslut Comment Status <b>X</b> nserts in the partial content co	L <b>7</b>	be a maintenance # <u>374</u> .3/D3.2. (Nor an editor
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response C/ 43 SC 43. Maguire, Valerie	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respon</i> 3 <i>Comm</i>	P 28 Copperopolis nent Status X	2 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing.	Suggester Repla rques Proposed Cl 45 Grow, Ro Comment I find note e	dRemedy ace, "MDIO interf t) <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1</b> bert <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> no changes or ir explaining why th	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th Response Status <b>0</b> P23 RMG Conslut Comment Status <b>X</b>	L <b>7</b>	be a maintenance # <u>374</u> .3/D3.2. (Nor an editor
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response 27 43 SC 43. Maguire, Valerie Comment Type E The PICS subcla SuggestedRemedy	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respon</i> 3 <i>Comm</i> use for clause 4	P28 Copperopolis nent Status X 45 is 45.5.	e 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing. # <u>334</u>	Suggester Repla rques Proposed CI 45 Grow, Ro Comment I find note e public	dRemedy ace, "MDIO intert t) <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1</b> bert <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> no changes or ir explaining why the cation.)	face" with "MDIO Interface" (th Response Status <b>O</b> P23 RMG Conslut Comment Status <b>X</b> nserts in the partial content co	L <b>7</b>	be a maintenance # <u>374</u> .3/D3.2. (Nor an editor
The PHY type ne description. SuggestedRemedy Add spaces in "2 Proposed Response Cl 43 SC 43. Maguire, Valerie Comment Type E The PICS subcla SuggestedRemedy	eds to be move 5GBASE-T1 as <i>Respon</i> 3 <i>Comm</i> use for clause 4	P 28 Copperopolis nent Status X	e 165" to match 8	802.3-2022 spacing. # <u>334</u>	Suggester Repla rques Proposed CI 45 Grow, Ro Comment I find note e public Suggester	dRemedy ace, "MDIO intert t) <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1</b> bert <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> no changes or ir explaining why the cation.)	face" with "MDIO Interface" (the Response Status <b>0</b> P23 RMG Conslut Comment Status <b>X</b> neserts in the partial content content content content to the content is in the draft and the	L <b>7</b>	be a maintenance # <u>374</u> .3/D3.2. (Nor an editor

C/ **45** SC **45.2.1** 

Comments Rece	eived IEE	E P802.3cy D	2.0 10G+ Auto Task F	orce Initial V	Vorking Group b	allot comments		
C/ 45 SC 45.2	.1 P23	L <b>7</b>	# 492	C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.7.4	P 23	L <b>34</b>	# 375
Huber, Thomas	Nokia			Grow, Ro	bert	RMG Conslutin	g	
no change being	Comment Status X Table 45-3 and the text that intro nade.	oduces it are inclu	uded here, since there is		t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ted text should be ur <i>dRemedy</i>	Comment Status X nderlined.		
SuggestedRemedy	g between the heading 45.2.1 a	nd the booding 44	- 0 4 7	Unde	rline line 34.			
	0	nd the heading 4:	0.2.1.7	Proposed	l Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed Response	Response Status O							
				C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.7.5	P <b>23</b>	L <b>51</b>	# 376
CI 45 SC 45.2		L8	# 386	Grow, Ro	bert	RMG Conslutin	g	
Marris, Arthur Comment Type EF		esign Systems		Comment Inser	t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ted text should be ur	Comment Status X nderlined.		
SuggestedRemedy Delete Table 45–	Ĵ	<i></i>		Unde	dRemedy rline line 51.			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed	l Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 45 SC 45.2	.1 <i>P</i> 23	L <b>9</b>	# 476	C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.16	P24	L <b>3</b>	# 404
Zimmerman, George	CME Consu	Ilting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve		wski, Natalie	General Motors	•	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	<b>3</b>		Comment	t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> 1 new row is being a	Comment Status X		
table are not show standard and also	s to Table 45-3 or 45.2.1, and tex vn. These should not be in the d contain no edits.		•	Suggeste Chan	dRemedy ge: insert new rows			
SuggestedRemedy Delete 45.2.1 text	(but not the section header) and	I Table 45-3 from	the draft.	Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O							

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.16 Page 5 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:58 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.24	P 26	L 35	# 516	C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.2	44	P <b>25</b>	L 19	# 654
Ran, Adee	Cisco			McClellan	, Brett		Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment	Status X		
There is no editorial instr its subclauses.	ruction nor any indication of	changes in the to	ext in 45.2.1.246 and		number doesn't	match the edit	or instruction		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested					
•• •	ugh 45.2.1.246.4 from the di	raft		chang	e Table 45-179	to 45-206			
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Proposed	Response	Response S	Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.214	P24	L 30	# 403	C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.2	44	P <b>25</b>	L19	# 387
			# 403	Marris, Ar	thur		Cadence Des	sign Systems	
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	ſS		Comment	Type E	Comment	Status X		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Table	number should	be 45-206			
	doesn't reference the new ro	w added.		Suggested Chang	-	9" to "Table 45	–206". Similar	issue for Table 4	5-207 on page 26
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir	as follows (unch	0	Chang	-	9" to "Table 45 <i>Response</i> S		issue for Table 4	5-207 on page 26
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows (	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir (unchanged rows not shown	as follows (unch	0	Chang	ge "Table 45–17	Response S		issue for Table 4	5-207 on page 26 # 649
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows (	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir	as follows (unch	0	Chang Proposed	ge "Table 45–17 <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1.2</b>	Response S	Status <b>O</b>		
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir (unchanged rows not shown <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	as follows (unch	0	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment	ge "Table 45–17 <i>Response</i> SC <b>45.2.1.2</b> , Brett	Response S 44.1 Comment s	Status <b>O</b> P <b>25</b> Marvell		
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir (unchanged rows not shown <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	as follows (unch nsert a new row ): <i>L</i> 11	immediately below the	Chang Proposed Cl <b>45</b> McClellan Comment missir	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to	Response S 44.1 Comment s	Status <b>O</b> P <b>25</b> Marvell		
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214. Grow, Robert Comment Type TR	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and ir (unchanged rows not shown) <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .2 <i>P</i> 25 RMG Consluti <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	as follows (unch nsert a new row ): <i>L</i> <b>11</b> ng	# 377	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment missir Suggested	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to	Response S 44.1 Comment - Clause 165	Status <b>0</b> P <b>25</b> Marvell Status <b>X</b>		
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214. Grow, Robert Comment Type TR When looking to see if th	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and in (unchanged rows not shown) <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .2 <i>P</i> <b>25</b> RMG Consluti	as follows (unchinsert a new row b): <i>L</i> 11 ng ed for the chang	# 377	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment missir Suggested chang descri	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to dRemedy le "Reed-Solomo	Response S 44.1 Comment Clause 165 on interleaving 2.15. This is cor	Status <b>O</b> P <b>25</b> Marvell Status <b>X</b> is		# 649
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214. Grow, Robert Comment Type TR When looking to see if th couldn't find a PICS item	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and in (unchanged rows not shown) <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .2 <i>P</i> 25 RMG Consluti <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> ne PICS needed to be update	as follows (unchinsert a new row b): <i>L</i> 11 ng ed for the chang	# 377	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment missir Suggested chang descri specif to "Re	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to dRemedy e "Reed-Solomod bed in 149.3.2.2 ied in 149.4.2.4. ed-Solomon interest	Response S 44.1 Comment - Clause 165 on interleaving 1 2.15. This is cor .5." erleaving is	Status O P25 Marvell Status X is mmunicated to	L 43	# <u>649</u>
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214. Grow, Robert Comment Type TR When looking to see if th couldn't find a PICS item SuggestedRemedy	entified row in Table 45-178 ed row in Table 45-178 and in (unchanged rows not shown) <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .2 <i>P</i> 25 RMG Consluti <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> ne PICS needed to be update	as follows (unch nsert a new row ): <i>L</i> 11 ng ed for the chang ng shall.	# 377	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment missir Suggested chang descri specif to "Re descri	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to dRemedy le "Reed-Solomod bed in 149.3.2.2 ied in 149.3.2.2 ied in 149.3.2.2	Response S 44.1 Comment S Clause 165 on interleaving 1 2.15. This is cor 5." erleaving is 2.15 for MultiGE	Status <b>O</b> P25 Marvell Status <b>X</b> is mmunicated to BASE-T1 and a	L 43 the link partner v and 165.3.2.2.15	# <u>649</u> via Infofields as for 25GBASE-T1. Th
SuggestedRemedy Change: Change the ide shown): To: Change the identifie changed row as follows ( Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.214. Grow, Robert Comment Type TR When looking to see if th couldn't find a PICS item SuggestedRemedy	entified row in Table 45-178 and ir (unchanged rows not shown <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .2 <i>P</i> <b>25</b> RMG Consluti <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> ne PICS needed to be update a corresponding to this existing	as follows (unch nsert a new row ): <i>L</i> 11 ng ed for the chang ng shall.	# 377	Chang Proposed Cl 45 McClellan Comment missir Suggested chang descri specif to "Re descri is com MultiG	ge "Table 45–17 Response SC 45.2.1.2 , Brett Type E ng references to dRemedy le "Reed-Solomod bed in 149.3.2.2 ied in 149.3.2.2 ied in 149.3.2.2	Response S 44.1 Comment - Clause 165 on interleaving 1 2.15. This is cor 5." erleaving is 2.15 for MultiGE he link partner v and 165.4.2.4.5	Status <b>O</b> P 25 Marvell Status <b>X</b> is mmunicated to BASE-T1 and a via Infofields as 5 for 25GBASE	L 43 the link partner v and 165.3.2.2.15 s specified in 149.	# 649

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.244.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 45 SC 45.	2.1.245	P <b>26</b>	L <b>1</b>	# 655	C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.2	<b>46</b> F	26	L35	# 600
McClellan, Brett		Marvell			McClellar	n, Brett	Ma	rvell		
Comment Type E	Comn	nent Status X			Comment	tType E	Comment Statu	is X		
Table number do	esn't match the	editor instruction					1.246 (including tab			I to the base 802.3-
SuggestedRemedy					2022	standard except	that the table numb	er should	be 45-208	
change Table 45	-180 to 45-207				Suggeste	dRemedy				
Proposed Response	Respo	nse Status <b>O</b>			remov	ve all of subclaus	se 45.2.1.246 or at l	east char	ige Table 45-181	to Table 45-208
					Proposed	Response	Response Statu	s <b>O</b>		
C/ 45 SC 45.	2.1.245	P 26	L1	# 378						
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslu	ting		C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.2		26	L 35	# 478
Comment Type E	Comn	nent Status X				ian, George			ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve
Table number er	ror, it is Table 4	5-207 in P802.3/D3	3.2.		Comment	<i>, , , , , , , , , ,</i>	Comment Statu			
SuggestedRemedy							PICS in clause 45 re editing instructions.	equired in	the draft - i.e., se	ection 45.3 (or
Correct table nu	nber per comm	ent.			Suggeste	dRemedy				
Proposed Response	Respo	nse Status <b>O</b>			Delete	e 45.3 and subcl	auses, including he	aders, fro	m the draft	
					Proposed	l Response	Response Statu	s <b>O</b>		
CI 45 SC 45	2.1.245.1	P 26	L 29	# 379						
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslu	ting		C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.2.1.2	<b>46</b> F	26	L35	# 477
Comment Type E		nent Status X			Zimmerm	ian, George	CM	E Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve
I don't find it in the preceded by an		, but I believe the p	reference is that	"and" should be	Comment	t Type E	Comment Statu	is X		
, ,							Section 45.2.1.246	or subcla	uses) in the draft	and no editing
SuggestedRemedy	-8" (retaining u	nderscore and strik	ethrough)			ctions.				
	, J		cunougn).		Suggeste					
Proposed Response	Kespo	nse Status <b>O</b>			Delete	e 45.2.1.246 and	d subclauses, includ	ing heade	ers, from the draft	
, ,										

C/ **45** SC **45.2.1.246** 

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

ou					<b>D</b>		
C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.2		L 35	# 493	C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246.1	P 26	L <b>43</b>	# 650
Huber, Thomas	Nokia			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X				Comment Status X		
Subclause 45.2.1.246 amendment	and its 4 subclauses do not a	appear to be char	nged by this	missing references to Clau	ıse 165		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Remove 45.2.1.246 a	nd its subclauses			change "Transmitter test n 149.5.1 and Table149–17.		by bits 1.2313.15	:13, are described in
Proposed Response	Response Status O			to "Transmitter test mode and Table 149–17 for Mult			
				Proposed Response F	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.2		L 35	# 380				
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslu	ting		C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246.2	P 26	L <b>51</b>	# 651
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Text with no changes. it should be removed	(Nor editorial note to explain	why the content	is in the draft and that	Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
				missing references to Clau	ise 165		
SuggestedRemedy	5 through page 27, line 43			SuggestedRemedy			
	0 1 0			change "149.3.2.2.20."			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			to "149.3.2.2.20 for MultiG make the same correction		20 25GBASE-T1.	
C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.2	46 P 26	L 35	# 388	Proposed Response F	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Marris, Arthur	Cadence Des	sign Systems					
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246.4	P <b>27</b>	L <b>42</b>	# 652
Why is 45.2.1.246 inc	luded if nothing has been cha	nged?		McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
SuggestedRemedy				Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Delete 45.2.1.246				missing references to Clau	ise 165		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			SuggestedRemedy			
				change "See 149.5.2.3.1 a			
				to "See 149.5.2.3.1, 149.5	.2.3.2, 165.5.2.3.1 and 1	65.5.2.3.2 for mo	re information."

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.246.4

C/ 45 SC 45.2.24	6 P <b>26</b>	L 35	# 407	C/ 45	SC 45.3	P 28	L1	# 494
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors		Huber, Tho	omas	Nokia		
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
Unchanged register of	definitions don't need to be incl	uded in the spec	2.			s subclauses) are shown in t		
SuggestedRemedy				clause 802.3-2		ished 802.3, and in any case	e there are no ch	anges compared to
Remove this Subclau	use and 45.2.1.246.x as no cha	anges have been	made from the base		-			
standard.				Suggested		4 and its subclauses		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0							
				Proposed I	Response	Response Status O		
C/ 45 SC 45.3	P <b>28</b>	L1	# 601					
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			C/ <b>45</b>	SC 45.3	P <b>28</b>	<i>L</i> 1	# 517
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
				Ran, Auco		0.000		
51	e 802.3-2022 base standard is	45.5		Comment		Comment Status X		
Clause 45 PICs in the		45.5		Comment There	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is no editorial ins	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o		
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy	e 802.3-2022 base standard is	45.5		Comment There i There i The dra	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is no editorial ins aft includes the	Comment Status X		
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses	45.5		Comment There i There i The dra the PIC	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is no editorial ins aft includes the o CS.	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o		
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy	e 802.3-2022 base standard is	45.5		Comment There i The dra the PIC Suggested	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. <i>IRemedy</i>	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho	ut any changes)	
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>		# [002]	Comment There i The dra the PIC Suggested	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. IRemedy e are no changes	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o	ut any changes)	
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b>	45.5 <i>L</i> 1	# 603	Comment There i There i The dra the PIC Suggested If there	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. IRemedy e are no changes	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho	ut any changes)	
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell		# 603	Comment There The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed P	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. Remedy are no changes Response	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 fr Response Status O	ut any changes) rom the draft.	but omits the rest
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	L1		Comment There i The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. IRemedy e are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 ft Response Status <b>0</b> P28	ut any changes)	
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E I see no differences to	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell	L1		Comment There i The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45 McClellan,	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the CS. IRemedy are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2 Brett	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 fr Response Status O P28 Marvell	ut any changes) rom the draft.	but omits the rest
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E I see no differences the SuggestedRemedy	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> between this subclause and the	L <b>1</b> e base 802.3-202	22	Comment There i The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45 McClellan, Comment	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the o CS. IRemedy a are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2 Brett Type E	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 ft Response Status O P28 Marvell Comment Status X	ut any changes) rom the draft.	but omits the rest
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E I see no differences to SuggestedRemedy remove all of subclau	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> between this subclause and the use 45.3 if no changes are mad	L <b>1</b> e base 802.3-202	22	Comment There is The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45 McClellan, Comment T	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the o CS. /Remedy e are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2 Brett Type E Std 802.3-2022 is	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 fr Response Status O P28 Marvell	ut any changes) rom the draft.	but omits the rest
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E I see no differences the SuggestedRemedy	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> between this subclause and the	L <b>1</b> e base 802.3-202	22	Comment There is The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45 McClellan, Comment T IEEE S Suggested	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the o CS. IRemedy a are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2 Brett Type E Std 802.3-2022 is IRemedy	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 ft Response Status O P28 Marvell Comment Status X s the new base document	ut any changes) rom the draft.	# 602
Clause 45 PICs in the SuggestedRemedy change 45.3 to 45.5 a Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E I see no differences to SuggestedRemedy remove all of subclau	e 802.3-2022 base standard is and associated subclauses <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>28</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> between this subclause and the use 45.3 if no changes are mad	L <b>1</b> e base 802.3-202	22	Comment There is The dra the PIC Suggested If there Proposed I CI 45 McClellan, Comment T IEEE S Suggested	Type E is no editorial ins aft includes the o CS. IRemedy a are no changes Response SC 45.3.2.2 Brett Type E Std 802.3-2022 is IRemedy e multiple referen	Comment Status X struction nor any indication o content up to 45.3.2.3 (witho s to the PICS, remove 45.3 ft Response Status O P28 Marvell Comment Status X	ut any changes) rom the draft.	# 602

C/ **45** SC **45.3.2.2**  Page 9 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:58 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 78	SC 78.1.4	P 30	L <b>8</b>	# 345	CI 78	SC 78.3	P 30	L <b>43</b>	# 518
Brown, M	att	Huawei			Ran, Ade	е	Cisco		
comment	Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	Type E	Comment Status X		
	ial instruction no dRemedy	t correct. Row in table is inse	rted not change	d.			on here is "insert", so the text : preferable to unclude the whole		
00		ows not shown" to "some row	a not chown"		Suggeste	dRemedy			
	e for 78.2.		3 1101 3110 111 .		Includ	e the whole pa	ragraph and use the "change"	editorial instructi	on.
Proposed	Response	Response Status 0			Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
CI 78	SC 78.2	P 30	L <b>22</b>	# 604	CI 78	SC 78.3	P30	L 49	# 480
/IcClellar	n, Brett	Marvell			Zimmerm	an, George	CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marv
comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X			Comment	Type E	Comment Status X		
		appear before 25GBASE-T in	Table 78-2, per	pattern set in the	Missir	ng period at the	end of the sentence to be edit	ed.	
basel					Suggeste	dRemedy			
00	dRemedy				Add a	period after "A	uto-Negotiation"		
chang 78–2	ge editor instructi	on to: Insert a row for 25GBA	SE-T1 before 28	5GBASE-T in Table	Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>							
, op oo ou					CI 78	SC 78.3	P30	L <b>49</b>	# 605
					McClellan		F 30 Marvell	L 49	# 005
78	SC 78.3	P <b>30</b>	L <b>43</b>	# 479	Comment		Comment Status X		
Limmerm Comment	an, George <i>Tvpe</i> <b>T</b>	CME Consult Comment Status X	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve		ng period			
	51	r 25GBASE-T1 shall be adve	ertised during link	k training according to	Suggeste	dRemedy			
		problems. First, the advertis			chang	e to: Auto-Neg	otiation.		
165.4 The s 165.4 respe settin	.2.4.5 (you could econd problem is .2.4.5: "EEEen a ctively. The PHY g the correspond	ing is, but not the advertisem say 165.4.2.4 because it cor s that this is a duplicate shall nd OAMen indicate EEE and shall indicate the support of ing capability bits." also problems with the entries	ntains the full info with the advertis 25GBASE-T1 C these two option	ofield function) ement shall in clause DAM capability enable, nal capabilities by	Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
	dRemedy								
00	ge "shall be adve	ertised" to "is advertised" on P	230 L43, and cha	ange 165.4.2.4.10 to					
Proposed	Response	Response Status 0							

C/ 78 SC 78.3

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI <b>78</b>	00 <b>70 5</b>								
	SC 78.5	P 30	L 54	# 481	C/ 78	SC 78.5	P 31	L <b>5</b>	# 495
Zimmerm	nan, George	CME Consulti	ng/APL Gp, Cise	co, CommScope, Marve	Huber, Th	iomas	Nokia		
Comment	tType E	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
		his paragraph is already in the			The cl	hanges indica	ated for the text of the 10th para	agraph are alread	ly present in 802.3-2
		BASE-T1 set is the same as C the MultiGBASE-T1 set is the			Suggested	dRemedy			
	e." so the edit is u						instruction to modify the 10th	paragraph.and a	ssociated text of the
Suggested	dRemedy					aragraph.			
	rough 7 for the e	ion "Modify the 10th paragraph dit to the text. Retain header f			Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed	l Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			CI 78	SC 78.5	P <b>31</b>	L <b>5</b>	# 607
					McClellan	, Brett	Marvell		
	00 <b>-0 -</b>	544		"	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
CI 78	SC 78.5	P31	L <b>1</b>	# 519	the 80	)2.3-2022 bas	e document uses 'link partner'	not 'Link Partner	
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Suggested	dRemedy			
Comment	51	Comment Status X			remov	ve the editor i	nstruction and text		
The e	editorial instructio	on says "Modify the 10th parag	raph of 78.5 as f	follows:"	Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
					•	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Howe	ever, the text in th	ne draft is not the tenth paragra	aph (which addre	esses MultiGBASE-T1)					
		ne draft is not the tenth paragra paragraph (which addresses M		esses MultiGBASE-T1)		00 -0 -			"
but fro	om the seventh p	paragraph (which addresses M	ultiGBASE-T).		C/ 78	SC 78.5	P31	L 9	# 520
but fro The te this ar	om the seventh p enth paragraph in mendment (they		ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee	e	Cisco	L 9	# 520
but fro The te	om the seventh p enth paragraph in mendment (they	paragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee Comment	e Type E	Cisco Comment Status X	-	
but fro The te this ar require	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red.	paragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee <i>Comment</i> "Sumr	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L	Cisco	-	
but fro The te this ar require Suggestee	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red. <i>dRemedy</i>	paragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3.	Cisco Comment Status X	-	
but fro The te this ar require Suggested Remo	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red. <i>dRemedy</i>	baragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1)	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggested	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. d <i>Remedy</i>	Cisco Comment Status X	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-4
but fro The te this ar require Suggested Remo Proposed	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red. dRemedy ove the editorial i	baragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1) nstruciotn and the change to th	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n	e final two sentences in o change to the text is	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggestee Chang	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. d <i>Remedy</i>	Cisco Comment Status X PI timing parameters for suppo	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-
but fro The te this ar require Suggested Remo Proposed	om the seventh p enth paragraph in mendment (they red. d <i>Remedy</i> ove the editorial i <i>I Response</i> SC <b>78.5</b>	baragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1) nstruciotn and the change to th <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n ne text.	e final two sentences in	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggestee Chang	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. <i>dRemedy</i> ge the numbe	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X PI timing parameters for suppo	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-4
but fro The te this ar require Suggested Remo Proposed CI 78 McClellan Comment	om the seventh p enth paragraph in mendment (they red. d <i>Remedy</i> ove the editorial i <i>I Response</i> SC <b>78.5</b> h, Brett t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b>	baragraph (which addresses M in the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1) instruciotn and the change to the <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>31</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n ne text.	e final two sentences in o change to the text is	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggestee Chang	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. <i>dRemedy</i> ge the numbe	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X PI timing parameters for suppo	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-
but fro The te this ar require Suggested Remo Proposed Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red. <i>dRemedy</i> ove the editorial i <i>I Response</i> SC <b>78.5</b> h, Brett t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> 02.3-2022 base of	baragraph (which addresses M n the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1) nstruciotn and the change to th <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>31</b> Marvell	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n ne text.	e final two sentences in o change to the text is	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggestee Chang	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. <i>dRemedy</i> ge the numbe	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X PI timing parameters for suppo	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-
but fro The te this ar requir Suggested Remo Proposed Cl 78 McClellan Comment the 80 Suggested	om the seventh p enth paragraph ir mendment (they red. <i>dRemedy</i> ove the editorial i <i>l Response</i> SC <b>78.5</b> h, Brett t <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> 02.3-2022 base of <i>dRemedy</i>	baragraph (which addresses M in the 802.3-2022 standard alre are defined for 10GBASE-T1) instruciotn and the change to the <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>31</b> Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	ultiGBASE-T). ady includes the ; it seems that n ne text. <i>L</i> 2 ot 'Link Partner'	e final two sentences in o change to the text is	Ran, Adee Comment "Sumr not Ta Suggestee Chang	e <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> mary of the L able 78-3. <i>dRemedy</i> ge the numbe	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X PI timing parameters for suppo	rted PHYs or inte	erfaces" is Table 78-

CI 78 SC 78.5 Page 11 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 78	SC 78.5	P 31	L <b>9</b>	# 482	C/ 78	SC 78.6	P 32	L1	# 610
Zimmerm	an, George	CME Consult	ng/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	McClellan	, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Table	51	Comment Status <b>X</b> t is 78-4 in 802.3-2022			Comment	51	Comment Status X between this subclause and th	ne base 802.3-20	22
S <i>uggested</i> Renur	-	as 78-4 in both editing instruct	ion and title		Suggestee remov	-	use 78.6 if no changes are ma	de to this subcla	use
	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>				Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
CI 78	SC 78.5	P31	L <b>14</b>	# 608	C/ 78	SC 78.6	P32	L1	# 496
McClellan	, Brett	Marvell			Huber, Th	iomas	Nokia		
Comment	Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
Suggestee chang	<i>dRemedy</i> je Table 78-3 to	document shows this as Table Table 78-4 on lines 9 and 14	78-4		78.6.3 is the <i>Suggestee</i>	Where clause same as 802. ARemedy		lause. There are nged to 78.5; igr	places in 78.6.2.2 and noring those, the content
Proposed	Response	Response Status O			Remo	ve subclause	78.6 (and its subclauses)		
					Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
CI <b>78</b>	SC 78.5	P <b>31</b>	L <b>22</b>	# 521					
Ran, Ade	e	Cisco			C/ 78	SC 78.6	P <b>32</b>	L <b>1</b>	# 483
Comment		Comment Status X			Zimmerm	an, George	CME Consu	Iting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marv
		ble 78-3 are given with precision the two integer digits, this resu			Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status X		
			-	-	There	are no chang	es to clause 78 PICS in this dra	aft	
		git indicates that this level of portion of portion of portion of portion of the second s			Suggestee Delete	-	oclauses (P32 L1 - P33 L35)		
resolu cases	ition) with a sing	the table (in 802.3-2022) are to le exception of 25GBASE-T w SE-T1 the number of significa	hich has three (	1 ns resolution). In all	Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
lt seer resolu		to specify and impractical to r	measure LPI tim	ning delays with a 10 ps					
Suggestee	dRemedy								
		s to four digits of significance ( bers above 10). Omit rightmos							
below									

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 78 SC 78.6 Page 12 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI <b>78</b>	SC 78.6	P 32	L1	# 522	C/ 104 SC 104	P 35	L1	# 473
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Zimmerman, George	CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Ty	ype E	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
There is	no editorial ins	struction nor any indication of	changes in the	text in 78.6 (PICS).	According to the object	ives, the project is to suppor	rt clause 104 ove	er appropriate media.
SuggestedR		s to the PICS, remove 78.6 fr	om the draft			ent in the draft, and the curre o use the same parameters a		
	0				SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed R	esponse	Response Status <b>O</b>			change the final senter	04.1.3 PoDL system types to ice of the second paragraph GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, a	from "A Type F	PSE and Type F PD
CI 78	SC 78.6	P 32	L 6	# 609	PSE and Type F PD ar	e compatible with 2.5GBAS	E-T1, 5GBASE- <sup>-</sup>	T1, 10GBASE-T1, and
McClellan, E	Brett	Marvell			25GBASE-T1 PHYs."	(editor to put in strikeouts, u	nderlines, etc as	needed)
Comment Ty	ype E	Comment Status X			, 0	eferences to Clause 104 (in	1.4.473 and 1.4	.472 (if added)) to cross
multiple	reference to 78	8.5 in this subclause do not n	natch 802.3-202	2	references.			
SuggestedR	Remedy				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
change	all occurences	of 78.5 to 78.4 in subclause	78.6					
Proposed R	esponse	Response Status 0			C/ 105 SC 105	P35	L1	# 381
					Grow, Robert	RMG Conslu	Iting	
C/ 98	SC 98.5.1	P34	L <b>8</b>	# 524	Comment Type ER	Comment Status X		
Ran. Adee	00 00.0.1	Cisco	20			7) currently specifies includ		
Comment Ty	vpe E	Comment Status X			this project currently ta inserts, replaces and c	rgeted to be Amendment 9, hanges in P802.3/D2.2.	base text should	I include proposed
The text	is modified an	d new text is indicated with u e (see page 20).	nderline. Therefo	ore, the instruction	SuggestedRemedy	D2.3cz/D2.2. Individual com	ments will be ma	ade on items noticed
SuggestedR	Remedy				Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Change	the editorial in	struction to "Change the text	in 98.5.1 as follo	ows".	r roposeu nesponse			
Proposed R	esponse	Response Status 0						
					C/ 105 SC 105	P 39	L1	# 663
2/ 98B	SC 98B.4	P147	L31	# 626	Murty, Ramana	Broadcom		
McClellan, E		Marvell	201	# 020	Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Comment Ty		Comment Status X			Blank page			
	sary line adde				SuggestedRemedy			
unneces	,				Remove blank page.			
					Proposed Response	Response Status O		
SuggestedR	extra line '-'							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 105 SC 105 Page 13 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

			2.0 10G+ Auto Task F					
C/ 105 SC 105.1	P 35	L <b>7</b>	# 384	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P35	L <b>7</b>	# 360
Marris, Arthur	Cadence Des	sign Systems		Grow, Rober	t	RMG Consluti	ng	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Ty	pe ER	Comment Status X		
Missing editing instruc	tions			P802.3cz	z (Amendmen	t 7) currently specifies remove	al of the list in th	iis paragraph.
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRe	emedy			
Add editing instruction not an editorial note.	s for 105.1.1 and 105.1.3. Co	rrect editing inst	ruction for 105.7. It is			02.3cz/D2.2 or work with P802 that keep reappearing in Std 8		ee on a commor
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status O		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.1	P34	L <b>6</b>	# 523	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P35	L <b>7</b>	# 408
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Wienckowsk	i, Natalie	General Motor	rs	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Ty	pe T	Comment Status X		
Editorial instruction is	missing for 105.1.1					EEE Std 802.3cz removed the	e list of PHYs so	o no change is r
SuggestedRemedy				for IEEE	Std 802.3cy.			
Add "Change" instruct	ion.			SuggestedRe	,			
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Delete 10	05.1.1.			
	, -			Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.1	P35	L <b>4</b>	# 382	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P35	L10	# 497
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslut	ting		Huber, Thom		Nokia	2.0	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Ty		Comment Status X		
Missing editorial instru	iction.				an editing inst			
SuggestedRemedy				Ũ	U			
Change first paragrapl	h (as modified by P802.3cz/D	2.2) as follows:		SuggestedRe	2	ion to modify the first paragrap	oh of 105 1 1 ac	shown
Proposed Response	Response Status 0				0	, , , ,	511 01 105.1.1 de	5110111.
				Proposed Re	sponse	Response Status O		

C/ 105 SC 105.1.1 Page 14 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.1	P35	L10	# 525	C/ 105	SC 105.1.1	P 35	L12	# 526	
Ran, Adee Ci	SCO			Ran, Adee		Cisco			
Comment Type E Comment Stat	us X			Comment	Гуре Е	Comment Status X			
Although it is preceded by "such as" whick keeps growing.	ch suggests it o	only includes ex	amples, the list			in 105.1.2 does not include thout going to the base doc		makes the new text	
The list of PHYs has no merit here. Table	e 105–1 contai	ns the same inf	ormation and can be	Also, "I	Update Figure 1	31-1" - should be 105-1.			
referenced.				Suggested	Remedy				
SuggestedRemedy Delete the list of PHYs and refer to Table	e 105–1 instea	d.				uctions, the first for the figu her the second paragraph o			
Proposed Response Response Stat	us <b>O</b>			Include excepti		xceptions or use "insert a ne	ew item at the en	d of the list of	
	P35	L12	# 347	Proposed F	Response	Response Status O			
	Jawei								
Brown, Matt Hu Comment Type ER Comment Stat				C/ 105	SC 105.1.2	P35	L11	# 361	
,	us X			C/ <b>105</b> Grow, Rob		P <b>35</b> RMG Consl		# 361	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f	us X				ert			# 361	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for	orm.		ΓΕ 2) as follows:"	Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria	ert <i>Type</i> <b>ER</b> al instruction sho to two to point a	RMG Consl	uting le line. Editorial i	nstruction should be	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo	orm. and one for figu 25GBASE-T1	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested	ert Type ER al instruction sho o two to point at tion. Remedy	RMG Consl Comment Status X buld follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e.	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and	nstruction should be d use correct editing	1
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either:	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 29Ve the underlin ole list, with new	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Repla	ert Type ER al instruction sho o two to point a tion. Remedy editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1	RMG Consl <i>Comment Status</i> X buld follow the subclause tit	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and instruction at this le D3.2) with the bel	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 29Ve the underlin ole list, with new	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Repla	ert Type ER al instruction sho two to point at tion. Remedy editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI	RMG Consl Comment Status X buld follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/E	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and instruction at this le D3.2) with the bel	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 29Ve the underlin ole list, with new	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Replay protoco	ert Type ER al instruction sho two to point at tion. Remedy editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI	RMG Consi <i>Comment Status</i> X puld follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/E BASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and instruction at this le D3.2) with the bel	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 2ve the underlin	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Repla protoco Proposed F	ert <i>Type</i> <b>ER</b> al instruction sho to two to point at tion. <i>Remedy</i> editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI <i>Response</i> SC <b>105.1.2</b>	RMG Consi <i>Comment Status</i> X build follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/I BASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2 <i>Response Status</i> O	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and nstruction at this le D3.2) with the bel 2."	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be ow which adds a	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 2ve the underlin	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Replay protocc Proposed F C/ 105	ert <i>Type</i> <b>ER</b> al instruction sho to two to point at tion. <i>Remedy</i> editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI <i>Response</i> SC <b>105.1.2</b> omas	RMG Consl <i>Comment Status</i> X build follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/D BASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2 <i>Response Status</i> O P35	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and nstruction at this le D3.2) with the bel 2."	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be ow which adds a	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 2ve the underlin	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Replay protoco Proposed F C/ 105 Huber, Tho Comment T	ert <i>Type</i> <b>ER</b> al instruction sho to two to point at tion. <i>Remedy</i> editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI <i>Response</i> SC <b>105.1.2</b> omas <i>Type</i> <b>E</b>	RMG Consl <i>Comment Status</i> X build follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/E BASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2 <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 35 Nokia	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and hstruction at this le 03.2) with the bel 2."	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be ow which adds a	
Comment Type ER Comment State Instruction is not consistent with proper f SuggestedRemedy Break into two instructions, one for text a Figure instructions should be "Replace Figure 131-1 (adding stack for Then either: "Insert new bullet e as shown:" and remo "Change list as follows:" and include who	and one for figu 25GBASE-T1 2ve the underlin	and adding NOT ne, or		Grow, Rob Comment T Editoria split int instruct Suggested Move e "Replay protocc Proposed F C/ 105 Huber, The Comment T The ed Suggested	ert <i>Type</i> <b>ER</b> al instruction sho to two to point at tion. <i>Remedy</i> editorial instructi ce Figure 105-1 ol stack for 25GI <i>Response</i> SC <b>105.1.2</b> omas <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> iting instruction	RMG Consi <i>Comment Status</i> X build follow the subclause tit t appropriate documents (e. on below subclause title. In (as modified by P802.3cz/D BASE-T1 and adds NOTE-2 <i>Response Status</i> O P35 Nokia <i>Comment Status</i> X refers to figure 131-1 instea	uting le line. Editorial i g., P802.3cz) and hstruction at this le 03.2) with the bel 2."	nstruction should be d use correct editing ocation should be ow which adds a	

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	2 P 35	L12	# 357	C/ 105	SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 27	# 362
Lewis, Jon	Dell Technolo	gies		Grow, Rob	ert	RMG Conslut	ting	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	ype TR	Comment Status X		
In the editing instruc	ctions for 105.1.2 it indicates that	t Figure 131-1 is	being modified.	The PC	S type should b	be specified.		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
0 0	uctions to read: "Change 105.1	0		25GBA	SE-T1 PCS			
below. Update Figure below"	e 105-1 adding stack for 25GBA	SE T1 and addi	ng NOTE 2 as shown	Proposed F	Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0							
				C/ 105	SC 105.1.2	P35	L 27	# 456
C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	2 P 35	L12	# 409	He, Xiang		Huawei		
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Moto			Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status X		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X ial instruction for Figure 131-1 of		EEE Std 802 307	FEC as	a separate sub	BASE-T1, FEC is part of PC blayer in this figure. Please re		
Ū.			EEE 310 002.302.	two exa Suggested	•			
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found bel	ng: Replace Fig	ure 131-1 (as modified	Suggestedl Recom	Remedy	e the "PCS" box as "25GBAS e the FEC box.	E-T1 PCS" (pref	erred) or "64B/65B R
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e	editorial note and add the followin	ng: Replace Fig	ure 131-1 (as modified	Suggestedl Recom	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove		E-T1 PCS" (pref	erred) or "64B/65B R
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response	editorial note and add the followi z-202x) with the figure found bel <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	ng: Replace Fig	ure 131-1 (as modified	Suggested Recom FEC P0	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove	e the FEC box.	E-T1 PCS" (pref	erred) or "64B/65B R
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response	editorial note and add the followi z-202x) with the figure found bel <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds	jure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1.	Suggested Recom FEC PO Proposed F	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2	e the FEC box. Response Status <b>O</b>	Ň	
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 Nienckowski, Natalie	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found below <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>2 P35</b>	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds	jure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1.	Suggestedi Recom FEC PC Proposed F C/ 105	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2 Brett	e the FEC box. <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b>	Ň	
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 Vienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found below <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>2</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> General Moto	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds <i>L</i> 16 rs	jure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1.	Suggestedi Recom FEC PC Proposed F Cl 105 McClellan, Comment T	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2 Brett Type E	e the FEC box. <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> Marvell	L 27	# [611
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 Nienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial note fo	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found below <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>2</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds <i>L</i> 16 rs	jure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1.	Suggestedi Recom FEC PC Proposed F Cl 105 McClellan, Comment T	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2 Brett Type E S in the 25GBA	e the FEC box. Response Status O P 35 Marvell Comment Status X	L 27	# [611
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 Nienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial note fo	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found belowing <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>2</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> or the text and put the text before	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds <i>L</i> 16 rs	jure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1.	Suggested Recom FEC PC Proposed F Cl 105 McClellan, Comment T the PC Suggested	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2 Brett Type E S in the 25GBA	e the FEC box. Response Status O P 35 Marvell Comment Status X SE-T1 stack should be identif	L 27	# [611
SuggestedRemedy Delete the existing e by IEEE Std 802.3cz Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial note fo SuggestedRemedy _x_ means underline Change 105.1.2 add	editorial note and add the followin z-202x) with the figure found belowing <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>2</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> General Moto <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> or the text and put the text before	ng: Replace Fig ow, which adds <i>L</i> 16 rs the Figure.	ure 131-1 (as modified 25GBASE-T1. # 411	Suggested Recom FEC PC Proposed F Cl 105 McClellan, Comment T the PC Suggested	Remedy mend to change CS" and remove Response SC 105.1.2 Brett Type E S in the 25GBA Remedy 25GBASE-T1' b	e the FEC box. Response Status O P 35 Marvell Comment Status X SE-T1 stack should be identif	L 27	# [611

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P 35	L 28	# 612	C/ 105 SC 1	05.1.2	P 35	L <b>45</b>	# 410
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Wienckowski, Nata	lie	General Moto	ors	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type	T Co	omment Status X		
the FEC in the 25GBAS	E-T1 stack is not a separate	e entity from the	PCS	Need to change	e Figure 105-	1 to also include 25GB	ASE-AU.	
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy				
delete 'FEC' and insert	'RS-FEC' before PCS					de 4 PHYS, similar to 1	25-1, adding the	25GBASE-AU stack
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			from 802.3cz D				
				Proposed Respons	e Res	sponse Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.2	P35	L37	# 453	<u></u>				
D'Ambrosia, John	Futurewei, US	S Subsidiary of H	Huawei	C/ 105 SC 10	05.1.2	P 35	L <b>45</b>	# 363
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X	-		Grow, Robert		RMG Conslu	ting	
					ER Co	omment Status X		
As previously comment	ed the stacks in Figs 105-1 a	and 165-1 do no	t match, but it is	Comment Type	EK UU			
noticed additionally that	ed the stacks in Figs 105-1 a these diagrams treat FEC d	lifferently. In 10	5-1 FEC is in a	Comment Type P802.3cz also				
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS	these diagrams treat FEC d 5, while in 165-1 it is combine	lifferently. In 108 and with the PCS.	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2	51	adds a stack f			
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI	these diagrams treat FEC d	lifferently. In 10 ed with the PCS. I there is no sucl	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy	adds a stack i		nodification. Th	e 25GBASE-T1 stack
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s	these diagrams treat FEC d b, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and	lifferently. In 10 ed with the PCS. I there is no sucl	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2	P802.3cz also SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left c	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack.		
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy	these diagrams treat FEC of while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure of	lifferently. In 10 ed with the PCS. I there is no sucl ut.	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx	P802.3cz also SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte narrowed to ac	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left o commodate 4	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks.		
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC	these diagrams treat FEC d b, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such ut. y, the title of the	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be	P802.3cz also SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left o commodate 4	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack.		
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure of derstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously,	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such ut. y, the title of the	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be	P802.3cz also SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte narrowed to ac	adds a stack f i-1 from P802 ed to the left o commodate 4 e Res	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks.		
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure of lerstanding the draft correctly hatch the stack in Fig 165-1.	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such ut. y, the title of the	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte narrowed to acc Proposed Respons	adds a stack f i-1 from P802 ed to the left o commodate 4 e Res	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>O</b>	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure of lerstanding the draft correctly hatch the stack in Fig 165-1.	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such ut. y, the title of the	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserted narrowed to acc Proposed Respons Cl 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert	adds a stack f i-1 from P802 ed to the left of commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>0</b> P35	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure ou derstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously, hatch the stack in Fig 165-1. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b>	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such ut. y, the title of the the stack of 250	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1 # 452	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserted narrowed to acc Proposed Respons Cl 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left c commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2 ER Co	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>O</b> P35 RMG Conslu	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure ou derstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously, hatch the stack in Fig 165-1. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b>	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such t. y, the title of the the stack of 250	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1 # 452	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserte narrowed to acc Proposed Respons CI 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert Comment Type	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left c commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2 ER Co editorial instruct	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>O</b> P35 RMG Conslu	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type TR	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure ou derstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously, hatch the stack in Fig 165-1. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> Futurewei, US	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such at. y, the title of the the stack of 250 <i>L</i> <b>37</b> S Subsidiary of H	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1 # 452	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserted narrowed to acc Proposed Respons CI 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert Comment Type Insert second e	adds a stack f i-1 from P802 ed to the left of commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2 ER Co editorial instruc	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>0</b> P <b>35</b> RMG Conslu comment Status <b>X</b> ction.	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type TR The stack for 25GBASE	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure ou erstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously, hatch the stack in Fig 165-1. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> Futurewei, US <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such at. y, the title of the the stack of 250 <i>L</i> <b>37</b> S Subsidiary of H	5-1 FEC is in a . Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1 # 452	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserted narrowed to acc Proposed Respons CI 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert Comment Type Insert second e SuggestedRemedy	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left of commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2 ER Co editorial instruc- at bottom of	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status <b>0</b> P <b>35</b> RMG Conslu comment Status <b>X</b> ction.	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be
noticed additionally that sublayer under the PCS seem to indicate that FI PCS function. This is s SuggestedRemedy If the commenter is und 25GBASE-T1 PCS/FEC should be modified to m Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.2 D'Ambrosia, John Comment Type TR The stack for 25GBASE SuggestedRemedy	these diagrams treat FEC of s, while in 165-1 it is combine EC is a TX PCS function and omewhat difficult to figure ou erstanding the draft correctly C/PMA. As noted previously, hatch the stack in Fig 165-1. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>35</b> Futurewei, US <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	lifferently. In 109 ed with the PCS. I there is no such t. y, the title of the the stack of 250 <i>L</i> 37 S Subsidiary of H atch the stack sh	5-1 FEC is in a Clause 165.3.2.2.2 h subclause in the Rx 165 column should be GBASE-T1 in Fig 105-1 # 452 Huawei hown in Fig 165-1.	P802.3cz also a SuggestedRemedy Use Figure 105 could be inserted narrowed to acc Proposed Respons CI 105 SC 10 Grow, Robert Comment Type Insert second e SuggestedRemedy Insert new item	adds a stack f -1 from P802 ed to the left of commodate 4 e Res 05.1.2 ER Co editorial instruc- at bottom of	for BASE-AU. .3cz/D2.2 as base for r of the BASE-AU stack. different stacks. sponse Status O P 35 RMG Conslu omment Status X ction. lettered list.	Stack widths wil	I probably have to be

C/ 105 SC 105.1.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L13	# 358	C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L 51	# 365
Lewis, Jon	Dell Technolo	gies		Grow, Robert	RMG Conslu	ting	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type ER	Comment Status X		
Are editing instruction	s needed for Table 105-1?				uction. Unchanged text is incl	uded in draft wit	hout including all o
SuggestedRemedy				105.1.3.			
Please add the appro	priate editing instructions			SuggestedRemedy			We are at the second billing
Proposed Response	Response Status 0				2 through page 36, line 4. Ecore paragraph inserted by P80		a "Insert new third
				Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 35	L <b>50</b>	# 613				
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P <b>35</b>	L <b>52</b>	# 527
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Ran, Adee	Cisco		
this subclause is miss	sing editor's instructions for sub	olclause 105.1.3	and Table 105-1	Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				Editorial instruction is			
add editor's instruction	n as needed			The first paragraph in	the amendment is the third of	ne in the base s	tandard.
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			SuggestedRemedy			
				Add a "Change" instru	iction and bring in the missing	two paragraphs	3.
					and the falles do a second second		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P35	L51	# 412	Alternatively, use "Ins	ert the following paragraph af	ter the third para	agraph of 105.1.3".
	P <b>35</b> General Moto		# 412	Alternatively, use "Ins Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>	ter the third para	agraph of 105.1.3".
Wienckowski, Natalie			# 412			er the third para	agraph of 105.1.3".
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto Comment Status X		# 412	Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instructio	General Moto Comment Status X		# 412	Proposed Response	Response Status 0	L6	# 414
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instructio SuggestedRemedy	General Moto Comment Status X on.	rs	- <b></b>	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie	Response Status O P36 General Moto	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instructio SuggestedRemedy	General Moto Comment Status X	rs	- <b></b>	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x.	General Moto Comment Status X on.	rs	- <b></b>	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need	Response Status O P36 General Moto	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x.	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the	rs	- <b></b>	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the	rs	- <b></b>	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy Remove underlining f	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instructio SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the Response Status O	rs e new paragraph <i>L</i> <b>51</b>	inserted by IEEE Std	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the Response Status O P35	rs e new paragraph <i>L</i> <b>51</b>	inserted by IEEE Std	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy Remove underlining f	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the Response Status O P35 General Moto	rs e new paragraph <i>L</i> <b>51</b>	inserted by IEEE Std	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy Remove underlining f	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response CI 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the Response Status O P35 General Moto	rs e new paragraph <i>L</i> <b>51</b>	inserted by IEEE Std	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy Remove underlining f	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Add editorial instruction SuggestedRemedy Insert new fifth paragr 802.3cz-202x. Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E SuggestedRemedy	General Moto Comment Status X on. raph for 25GBASE-T1 after the Response Status O P35 General Moto	rs e new paragraph <i>L</i> <b>51</b>	inserted by IEEE Std	Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.1.3 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E Underline is not need SuggestedRemedy Remove underlining f	Response Status O P36 General Moto Comment Status X ed with an "insert" instruction.	L6	

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Page 18 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P 36	L6	# 484	C/ 105 S	C 105.1.3	P 36	L13	# 415
Zimmerman, George	CME Consulti	ng/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Wienckowski,	Natalie	General Motors	S	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type	e E	Comment Status X		
There is no correspon 105.1.3 is not shown.	ding editing instruction for this	edit to 105.1.3	and the full text of	Add editor	ial instruction			
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRen				
Add editing instruction Insert new fourth para	at P35 L49 (by header): graph to 105.1.3 as shown:	<b>-</b>		modified b	y IEEE Std 8	BASE-T1 before the row for 2 02.3cz-202x) as follows (unch w, a row needs to be added th	anged rows no	ot shown):
Remove underline from Replace "Physical Lay	agraph beginning "25GBASE- n new paragraph at P36 L6 - F rer devices at 25Gb/s" on P3 I of Table 105-1 as shown: (un	P36 L10 6 L11 with new	editing instruction,	Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>0</b>	changed rows i	lot showing	C/ 105 S	SC 105.1.3	P 36	L13	# 529
				Ran, Adee		Cisco		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P36	L <b>7</b>	# 528	Comment Type Editorial in		Comment Status X		
	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> b/s Ethernet" - and also receivi aph for 25GBASE-T has "for d		tion at 25 Gb/s" instead.	SuggestedRen Add an ap Proposed Res	propriate inst	ruction. Response Status <b>O</b>		
SuggestedRemedy				C/ 105 S	C 105.1.3	P36	L <b>21</b>	# 485
Use "for data commur	nication at 25 Gb/s" as in the p	revious paragra	iph.	Zimmerman, Q				sco, CommScope, Marve
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Comment Type	e E	Comment Status X		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P36	L12	# 366	SuggestedRen	nedy			
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti	ng		suppress h	hyphenation of	on "single balanced pair of cor	nductors"	
Comment Type ER Missing editorial instru	Comment Status X			Proposed Res	oonse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
SuggestedRemedy	ble 105-1 for 25GBASE-T1 aft	er 25GBASF-T	<u>.</u>					
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>0</b>							

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3 Page 19 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.1.3							
J 105 3C 105.1.3	P 36	L <b>50</b>	# 614	C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L <b>2</b>	# 417
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	rs	
Comment Type E description should co	Comment Status X onform to existing baseline text			Comment Type E Need to have merged	Comment Status X d rows before and after new row	w that is in the r	niddle of the table.
SuggestedRemedy change 'Physical Coo	ding Sublayers' to 'physical codi	ng sublaver'		SuggestedRemedy Change the row befo	re 25GBASE-T1 to a merged re	ow with an elips	es. Add a row after
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>	goddiagol			merged and includes an elipse		
	Response Status			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 105 SC 105.1.3	P36	L <b>50</b>	# 499	C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L <b>2</b>	# 367
Huber, Thomas	Nokia			Grow, Robert	RMG Conslut		# 307
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X	ing	
Missing an editing ins	struction			Missing editorial instr			
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Add an editing instrue modify Table 105-1 a	ction to insert a new paragraph as shown.	after the 3rd par	agraph as shown and	Insert a row for 25GE	ASE-T1 after 25GBASE-T and een clause 114 and clause 166		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status <b>0</b>	5 (Inserted by F	002.302/D2.2.
				r roposed nesponse	Response Status U		
C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L <b>1</b>	# 500	C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37	L <b>2</b>	# 416
Huber, Thomas	Nokia			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto		# 10
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Missing an editing ins	struction to modify Table 105-2			Add editorial instructi			
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
-	ction to insert a new row at the e	end of Table 10	5-2 as shown.		GBASE-T1 before the row for	25GBASE-T in	Table 105-2 and
Proposed Response	Response Status O				8 and Clause 165 (as modified		
	027	L1	# 615	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 105 SC 105.2	P37						
	P37 Marvell						
McClellan, Brett Comment Type E		lclause 105.2 a					
McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	Marvell Comment Status X sing editor's instructions for sub	llclause 105.2 a					

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 105 SC 105.2 Page 20 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L6 # 451
D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, US Subsidiary of Huawei
Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Table 105-2 appears incomplete -
Clause 78 EEE optional support not indicated
Clause 106 mandatory use of RS and 25GMII not indicated Clause 165 is noted as PMD, not PCS / PMA as noted by the title of the agenda
SuggestedRemedy
For 25GBASE-T1 entry in Table 105-2, make the following:
Clause 78 EEE - Optional
Clause 106 - Mandatory
Change title of 165 column to "25GBASE-T1 PCS/PMA "
Proposed Response Response Status O
Cl 105 SC 105.2 P37 L6 # 348
Brown, Matt Huawei
Comment Type E Comment Status X
Table too wide.
SuggestedRemedy
Reduce table with by adjust column widths.
Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L6 # 368
Grow, Robert RMG Consluting
Comment Type TR Comment Status X
As amendment 9, the table from P802.3cz should be used as base.
SuggestedRemedy
Include clause 166 column from P802.3cz/D2.2.

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

Page 21 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

#### Comments Received IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L8 # 531 C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L17 # 486 Ran, Adee Cisco Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Marve Comment Type Comment Status X Comment Type **T** Comment Status X Е In Table 105-2: "25GBASE-T1 PMD" - 25GBASE-T1 is a PCS/PMA not a PMD. SuggestedRemedy The column for clause 165 should be labeled "25GBASE-T1 PCS and PMA". Change "25GBASE-T1 PMD" to "25GBASE-T1 PCS/PMA" EEE should be marked "O", RS and 25GMII should be "M" and "O". Proposed Response Response Status **O** Several of the clauses are included in this draft and the heading numbers should be made active links. C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L 20 # 616 The columns can be narrowed to make the table fit within the margins. McClellan, Brett Marvell SuggestedRemedy Comment Type TR Comment Status X Per comment missing EEE, RS, 25GMII in table Proposed Response Response Status 0 SuggestedRemedy insert 'O' in the EEE column, 'M' in RS, and 'O' in 25GMII Proposed Response Response Status 0 SC 105.2 # 617 C/ 105 P37 L11 McClellan. Brett Marvell Comment Type E Comment Status X SC 105.2 C/ 105 P37 L 20 # 461 25GBASE-T1 has a PCS/PMA not a PMD Lusted, Kent Intel Corporation SuggestedRemedy Comment Type TR Comment Status X change PMD to PCS/PMA in the 165 column Table 105-2 entry "25GBASE-T1" does not include a row entry for Reconciliation Sublaver RS. The RS is necessary because the RS adapts the bit serial protocols of the MAC to the Proposed Response Response Status O parallel format of the PCS service interface. SuggestedRemedy C/ 105 SC 105.2 P37 L11 # 462 Mark the appropriate box for RS with "M" for Mandatory Lusted, Kent Intel Corporation Proposed Response Response Status 0 Comment Type TR Comment Status X Table 105-2 entry "25GBASE-T1" has a column for Clause 165 denoted as "25GBASE-T1 PMD". This name is misleading because Clause 165 contains a PCS and a PMA. Note that PMD is not used at all in the title of Clause 165 on page 40. Furthermore, the Table 44-1 in IEEE Std 802.3-2022 (page 1716) provides a column name of "RS-FE PCS and 1pair PMA" which is inconsistent with the existing text in 3cy D2.0 Table 105-2. SuggestedRemedy Change the column title from "25GBASE-T1 PMD" to "25GBASE-T1 PCS/PMA" Proposed Response Response Status 0

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 105 SC 105.2 Page 22 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	2 P37	L 20	# 463	C/ 105 SC 105.3	P37	L 26	# 618
Lusted, Kent	Intel Corpora			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type TR Table 105-2 entry should be an optio referenced in Cl 16 SuggestedRemedy		a row entry for 2 al Layer type. N	lote that 25GMII is	Comment Type E it isn't necessary to SuggestedRemedy delete section head Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.3	Comment Status X show section headers for 105. lers for 105.3.1 through 105.3.5 Response Status O P37	Ū	3.5 # [ <u>349</u>
SuggestedRemedy	Futurewei, US	L 24 S Subsidiary of no changes. Is		SuggestedRemedy	Huawei Comment Status X 3.1 through 105.3.5" • 105.3.1 through 105.3.5. Response Status O		
	B P 37 Cisco Comment Status X boclause headings listed? ext should not be underlined.	L 25	# 532	Cl 105 SC 105.3 Marris, Arthur Comment Type E Unneeded sublclau SuggestedRemedy Delete 105.3.1 to 1 Proposed Response	Cadence De <i>Comment Status</i> X se headings	L 26 esign Systems	# <mark>385</mark>
Remove the unner Remove the under Proposed Response	eessary ones before 105.3.6 line format. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>			SuggestedRemedy		sary	# [ <u>488</u> sco, CommScope, Marv

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/
 105

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC
 105.3

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC
 105.3
 SC
 105.3

Page 23 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105	SC 105.3	P 37	L <b>40</b>	# 619	C/ 105	SC 105.3.6		P 37	L <b>40</b>	# 350
McClellan, E	Brett	Marvell			Brown, Mat	t	Hu	uawei		
Comment Ty this text		Comment Status X y and redundant			Comment T When u		Comment Stat struction, no under		ed.	
SuggestedR delete 'C is perfor	Remedy Clause 98 Auto rmed upon link	-Negotiation may be used by		0	SuggestedF	Remedy e underline.	Response State	·		
Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status 0								
					C/ 105	SC 105.3.6		P <b>37</b>	L <b>40</b>	# 489
C/ 105	SC 105.3.2	P <b>37</b>	L 28	# 621	Zimmermar	n, George	C	ME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marv
McClellan, E	Brett	Marvell			Comment T		Comment Stat			
Comment Ty add a de		Comment Status X			(note th	at clause 126 v	where 802.3ch edit	ited had a v	ery different style	nding text in this clause e). Also, the second "may be used". The
SuggestedR insert "2	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P	e 10GBASE-T1 PCS HYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6			text car SuggestedF	be rephrased Remedy	in the same style a	as the rest	of the clause and	d much simpler.
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from	HYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d	65B RS_FEC coo nd performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and	text car <i>SuggestedF</i> Change Replace	be rephrased Remedy editing instruc 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be		as the rest of paragraph owith: BASE-T1 P	of the clause an at the end of 10	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:"
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instructio	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed	HYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d	65B RS_FEC coo nd performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause	be rephrased Remedy editing instruc 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be	in the same style a ction to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI	as the rest of paragraph owith: BASE-T1 P	of the clause an at the end of 10	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:"
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instructio	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed	HYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d	65B RS_FEC coo nd performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R  C/ 105	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC <b>105.5</b>	in the same style a ction to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i>	as the rest of paragraph owith: BASE-T1 P	of the clause an at the end of 10	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:"
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instructio Proposed Re	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed	HYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d	65B RS_FEC coo nd performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC <b>105.5</b>	in the same style a stion to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i>	as the rest of paragraph of with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b>	of the clause an at the end of 10 HY, but is not re	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired."
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instruction Proposed Re	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of o tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed response SC 105.3.4	HYs use the PCS specified in Jata from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	65B RS_FEC coond performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and he 25GMII." add editor	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R C/ 105 McClellan, I Comment T	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC 105.5 Brett ype E	in the same style a ction to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i> Ma <i>Comment State</i>	as the rest of paragraph with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b> P37 arvell tus <b>X</b>	of the clause and at the end of 10 HY, but is not re <i>L</i> <b>45</b>	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired." # <u>620</u>
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instructio Proposed Re C/ 105 McClellan, E	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed response SC 105.3.4 Brett	PHYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 37	65B RS_FEC coond performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and he 25GMII." add editor	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R Cl 105 McClellan, I Comment T this sub	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC 105.5 Brett type E sclause is missi	in the same style a ction to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i>	as the rest of paragraph with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b> P37 arvell tus <b>X</b>	of the clause and at the end of 10 HY, but is not re <i>L</i> <b>45</b>	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired." # <u>620</u>
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instructio Proposed Re C/ 105 McClellan, E Comment Ty	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of c tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed response SC 105.3.4 Brett ype E	PHYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 37 Marvell	65B RS_FEC coond performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and he 25GMII." add editor	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R C/ 105 McClellan, I Comment T this sub SuggestedF	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC 105.5 Brett Sype E Iclause is missi Remedy	in the same style a extion to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i>	as the rest of paragraph with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b> P37 arvell tus <b>X</b>	of the clause and at the end of 10 HY, but is not re <i>L</i> <b>45</b>	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired." # <u>620</u>
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instruction Proposed Re Cl 105 McClellan, E Comment Ty add a de	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of o tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed response SC 105.3.4 Brett ype E escription of the	PHYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 37 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	65B RS_FEC coond performs erro	de blocks and PAM4 r correction and he 25GMII." add editor	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R Cl 105 McClellan, I Comment T this sub SuggestedF add edi	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC 105.5 Brett Sype E clause is missi Remedy tor's instruction	in the same style a ction to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i> <i>Comment Stat</i> ing editor's instruct	as the rest of paragraph with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b> P37 arvell tus <b>X</b> tions for sul	of the clause and at the end of 10 HY, but is not re <i>L</i> <b>45</b>	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired." # <u>620</u>
SuggestedR insert "2 performs modulati decoding of PAM4 instruction Proposed Re C/ 105 McClellan, E Comment Ty add a de SuggestedR insert "2 full duple	Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P s encoding of o tion and transfe g 4 symbols from ons as needed response SC 105.3.4 Brett type E escription of the Remedy 25GBASE-T1 P	PHYs use the PCS specified in data from the 25GMII to 64B/6 ers the symbols to the PMA and the PMA and transfers the d <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 37 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> e 10GBASE-T1 PMA PHYs use the PMA specified in tions over a single balanced p	65B RS_FEC coo nd performs erro ecoded data to th <i>L</i> 28 n Clause 165. TT	the blocks and PAM4 r correction and the 25GMII." add editor # 622	text car SuggestedF Change Replace "Clause Proposed R C/ 105 McClellan, I Comment T this sub SuggestedF	be rephrased Remedy e editing instruc e 2 paragraph e 98 AN may be response SC 105.5 Brett Sype E clause is missi Remedy tor's instruction	in the same style a extion to "Insert new edit at P37 L40-43 e used by the 25GI <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i> <i>Response State</i>	as the rest of paragraph with: BASE-T1 P tus <b>O</b> P37 arvell tus <b>X</b> tions for sul	of the clause and at the end of 10 HY, but is not re <i>L</i> <b>45</b>	d much simpler. 95.3.6 as follows:" equired." # <u>620</u>

C/ 105 SC 105.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105	5.5 P37	L <b>46</b>	# 351	C/ 105	SC 105.5	P 37	L <b>49</b>	# 533
Brown, Matt	Huawei			Ran, Adee	•	Cisco		
Comment Type El	R Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
Editorial instruction	on complete wrong. This is not	and editorial note.		The ed	ditorial note see	ms to be an instruction, and to	o point to the wro	ong place.
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	IRemedy			
Change instructic	on to "Insert new row at the en	d of Table 105-3 as	follows."			e: Change 105.7 as shown be	elow" to "Change	Table 105-3 as show
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			below"				
				Proposed I	Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 105 SC 105	5.5 P37	L <b>49</b>	# 490					
Zimmerman, George	e CME Co	nsulting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve	C/ 105	SC 105.5	P 37	L <b>49</b>	# 418
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	0 11		Wienckows	ski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Editing instructior	n is incorrect, position of edit n	eeds to be after 250	GBASE-T, which would	Comment	51	Comment Status X		
have rows following	ing the edit.			Editoria	al insturction is	not correct.		
	ing the edit.			Editoria Suggested		not correct.		
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown):'	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows ."			Suggested Replac	<i>IRemedy</i> ce the current E 105-3 (as modif	not correct. ditorial Note with: Insert a nev ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202:		
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown):' Add row after t	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows ." the changed row in the table.			Suggested Replac Table 2	<i>IRemedy</i> ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ):	ditorial Note with: Insert a new		
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown): Add row after t	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows :" the changed row in the table.			Suggested Replac Table shown)	<i>IRemedy</i> ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ):	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202		
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown): Add row after t Proposed Response	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table shown)	<i>IRemedy</i> ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ):	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202		
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown):" Add row after t Proposed Response	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> 5.5 <i>P</i> 37	for 25GBASE-T1 as		Suggested Replac Table shown Proposed I	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC <b>105.5</b>	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b>	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b>	changed rows not
Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown): Add row after t Proposed Response (7 105 SC 105 .ewis, Jon	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> 0 5.5 <i>P</i> 37 Dell Tech	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table shown Proposed I Cl 105	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC 105.5 pert	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b>	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b>	changed rows not
uggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown): Add row after t roposed Response 1 105 SC 105 ewis, Jon romment Type E	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> 0 5.5 <i>P</i> 37 Dell Tech Comment Status X	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table shown) Proposed I Cl 105 Grow, Rob Comment	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC 105.5 pert Type E	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b> RMG Conslu	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b> ting	# <mark>371</mark>
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown): Add row after t Proposed Response 2/ 105 SC 105 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> 0 5.5 <i>P</i> 37 Dell Tech	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table shown) Proposed I Cl 105 Grow, Rob Comment	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC 105.5 pert Type E hisplaced editori	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b> RMG Conslu <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b> ting	# <mark>371</mark>
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown):' Add row after t Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Editorial Note is s SuggestedRemedy	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <b>5.5</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b> Dell Tech <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> separated from 105.7.	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table 5 shown) Proposed I Cl 105 Grow, Rob Comment 5 This m Suggested	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC 105.5 pert Type E hisplaced editori IRemedy	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b> RMG Conslu <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b> ting	# <mark>371</mark>
SuggestedRemedy Replace "Editoria inserting new row rows not shown):' Add row after t Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Editorial Note is s SuggestedRemedy	al Note: Change 105.7 as show ws for 25GBASE-T1 after rows " the changed row in the table. <i>Response Status</i> 0 5.5 <i>P</i> 37 Dell Tech Comment Status X	for 25GBASE-T1 as	s shown (unchanged	Suggested Replac Table 5 shown) Proposed I Cl 105 Grow, Rob Comment 5 This m Suggested	IRemedy ce the current E 105-3 (as modif ): Response SC 105.5 pert Type E hisplaced editori IRemedy note and subcl	ditorial Note with: Insert a new ied by IEEE Std 802.3cz-202: <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>37</b> RMG Conslu <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> al note should be deleted as v	x) as follows (und <i>L</i> <b>49</b> ting	# <u>371</u>

C/ 105 SC 105.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.5	P37	L <b>49</b>	# 370	C/ 105 SC 105.5	P 38	L6	# 419
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti	ng		Wienckowski, Natalie	General M	otors	
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	ruction for 105.5. I think this tab						
	minati sort order", though there a nsert after 25GBASE-T as far as			SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Merge cells in row v	vith elipses.		
,	105-3 for 25GBASE-T1 after 25	5GBASE-T.		Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						
				C/ 105 SC 105.5	P 38	L <b>7</b>	# 534
7 105 SC 105.5	P <b>37</b>	L <b>50</b>	# 501	Ran, Adee	Cisco		
luber. Thomas	Nokia			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
comment Type E	Comment Status X			It is unclear what th	e expressions "L=1" etc. mea	n in this table.	
51	should be replaced with an editin	a instruction to	modify Table 105-3	In the table in the b		Land to the design of the	and the state of t
					ase docliment the "Notes" co	numn includes rete	Prences to the
			modify Table 103-3		ase document, the "Notes" co e PHY clause that specifies th		
SuggestedRemedy							
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instrue	ction to insert new rows at the e			subclause within th 165.10"	PHY clause that specifies th	his delay. In this ca	se, it should be "See
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instrue				subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame	PHY clause that specifies th there are different maximum c ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg	is delay. In this ca delay specifications gotiated between t	s depending on the he link partners and
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruc Proposed Response	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status <b>O</b>	and of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame	PHY clause that specifies th	is delay. In this ca delay specifications gotiated between t	s depending on the he link partners and
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruc Proposed Response	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>38</b>	end of Table 105		subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this	e PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding i	tis delay. In this ca delay specifications gotiated between th n in advance for a it: "network planne	s depending on the he link partners and given device.
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruc Proposed Response	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status <b>O</b>	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai	e PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding ints regarding the cable topolo	tis delay. In this ca delay specifications gotiated between th n in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatena	se, it should be "See s depending on the he link partners and given device. ors and administrators tion of devices Table
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status O P 38 Dell Technolog Comment Status X	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai	e PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in the regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer	tis delay. In this ca delay specifications gotiated between th n in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatena	se, it should be "See s depending on the he link partners and given device. rrs and administrators tion of devices Table
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E	ction to insert new rows at the e <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>38</b> Dell Technolog	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai 105–3 contains the at one end of the lin	PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg- either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in the regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer k".	tis delay. In this can delay specifications gotiated between th n in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatenat delay (sum of tran	s depending on the he link partners and given device. rs and administrators tion of devices Table smit and receive delays
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Are editing instruction	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status O P 38 Dell Technolog Comment Status X	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai 105–3 contains the at one end of the lir Therefore it seems	PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg- either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in this regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer k".	bis delay. In this can delay specifications gotiated between the in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatenation delay (sum of tran maximum delay o	s depending on the he link partners and given device. Ins and administrators tion of devices Table smit and receive delays
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response 2/ 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Are editing instruction SuggestedRemedy	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status O P 38 Dell Technolog Comment Status X	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai 105–3 contains the at one end of the lir Therefore it seems	PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg- either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in this regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer k". adequate to list here only the The text in 165.10 can include	bis delay. In this can delay specifications gotiated between the in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatenation delay (sum of tran maximum delay o	s depending on the he link partners and given device. Ins and administrators tion of devices Table smit and receive delays
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response C/ 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Are editing instruction SuggestedRemedy Please add the approx	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>38</b> Dell Technolog Comment Status <b>X</b> ns needed for Table 105-3?	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai 105–3 contains the at one end of the lir Therefore it seems happens with L=8.	PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg- either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in this regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer k". adequate to list here only the The text in 165.10 can include	bis delay. In this can delay specifications gotiated between the in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatenation delay (sum of tran maximum delay o	s depending on the he link partners and given device. Its and administrators tion of devices Table smit and receive delays
SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.5 Lewis, Jon Comment Type E Are editing instruction SuggestedRemedy	ction to insert new rows at the e Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>38</b> Dell Technolog Comment Status <b>X</b> ns needed for Table 105-3? opriate editing instructions	end of Table 105	5-3 as shown.	subclause within th 165.10" Looking at 165.10, "Interleave" parame may be different in The purpose of this conform to constrai 105–3 contains the at one end of the lin Therefore it seems happens with L=8. be lower in some ca SuggestedRemedy Use only one row for	PHY clause that specifies the there are different maximum of ter. Interleaving (or "L") is neg- either direction, so is unknown table (per the text preceding in this regarding the cable topolo values of maximum sublayer k". adequate to list here only the The text in 165.10 can include	ais delay. In this can delay specifications gotiated between the n in advance for a it: "network planne gy and concatena delay (sum of tran maximum delay of a further details abo	s depending on the he link partners and given device. Frs and administrators tion of devices Table smit and receive delays f the PHY, which but how the delay can

C/ 105 SC 105.5 Page 26 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.5	P 38	L8	# 623	C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L19	# 491
AcClellan, Brett	Marvell			Zimmerman, George	CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Mar
Comment Type ER L' isn't defined anywh for 10GBASE-T1 in C	Comment Status X ere in Clause 105 and makes lause 44	the note confusir	ng. Follow the example	Comment Type E There is no subclause SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status X 105.7 in the base standard, a	and no edits to it	in this draft.
SuggestedRemedy				Delete subclause 105.	7, P38 L19-25		
'25GBASE-T1 2x inte	T box into 4 lines with these la rleave', '25GBASE-T1 4x inter s in each row with 'See 165.10	leave', '25GBASI		Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 38	L <b>20</b>	# 352
				Brown, Matt	Huawei		
C/ <b>105</b> SC <b>105.5</b> McClellan, Brett	P 38 Marvell	L16	# 624	Comment Type ER Missing editorial instru	Comment Status X ction.		
Comment Type E missing note d from b	Comment Status X base standard			SuggestedRemedy Add editorial instruction			
				Description of Description			
••	ound-trip delay contributed by	up to four PMA s	tages in a PHY."	Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
insert "dCumulative ro	ound-trip delay contributed by Response Status <b>O</b>	up to four PMA s	tages in a PHY."	Cl 105 SC 105.7	P38	L 20	# 535
insert "dCumulative ro		up to four PMA s			-	L <b>20</b>	# <u>535</u>
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7		up to four PMA s	tages in a PHY." # <u>502</u>	C/ 105 SC 105.7	P38 Cisco Comment Status X	L <b>20</b>	# <u>535</u>
Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E	Response Status O	L 18		Cl <b>105</b> SC <b>105.7</b> Ran, Adee Comment Type <b>E</b>	P38 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X missing.	L 20	# [ <u>535</u>
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E Missing an editing ins SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P 38 Nokia Comment Status X	L 18	# 502	Cl 105 SC 105.7 Ran, Adee Comment Type E Editorial instruction is r SuggestedRemedy	P38 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X missing.	L <b>20</b>	# <u>535</u>
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E Missing an editing ins SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct	Response Status O P 38 Nokia Comment Status X struction to modify clause 105.	L 18	# 502	Cl <b>105</b> SC <b>105.7</b> Ran, Adee Comment Type <b>E</b> Editorial instruction is r SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate ins	P38 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X missing.	L 20 L 45	# <u>535</u> # <u>625</u>
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E Missing an editing ins SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct	Response Status O P 38 Nokia Comment Status X truction to modify clause 105.7	L 18	# 502	Cl <b>105</b> SC <b>105.7</b> Ran, Adee Comment Type <b>E</b> Editorial instruction is r SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate ins Proposed Response	P38 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X missing. struction. <i>Response Status</i> O		
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E Missing an editing ins SuggestedRemedy Add an editing instruct	Response Status O P 38 Nokia Comment Status X truction to modify clause 105.7	L 18	# 502	Cl 105 SC 105.7 Ran, Adee Comment Type E Editorial instruction is r SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate ins Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	P38 Cisco Comment Status X missing. struction. Response Status 0 P38	L 45	
insert "dCumulative ro Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 Huber, Thomas Comment Type E Missing an editing ins SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P 38 Nokia Comment Status X truction to modify clause 105.7	L 18	# 502	Cl 105 SC 105.7 Ran, Adee Comment Type E Editorial instruction is r SuggestedRemedy Add an appropriate ins Proposed Response Cl 105 SC 105.7 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	P 38 Cisco Comment Status X missing. struction. Response Status O P 38 Marvell Comment Status X ing editor's instructions for su	L 45	

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 105

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 105.7

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 105.7
 SC 105.7

Page 27 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 105 SC 105.7	P 39	L1	# 420	C/ 165	SC 165.1	P <b>40</b>	L14	# 511
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors	s		Grow, Robe	ert	RMG Co	onsluting	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	Гуре Е	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy remove blank page Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			"PHYs" the time 25GBA implem this, for	' in this clause e text is addre SE-T1 interfac entations. Gr r example on li	ems exist in many clauses is wrong. There is one 2 ssing the 25GBASE-T1 F ce on a networked device ammar problems left afte ine 17, "the 25GBASE-T1 a list of multiple rates, bu	25GBASE-T1 PHY sp PHY specification, nc , or various 25GBAS r deleting 50 Gb/s an PHYs" where "the"	pecification and most of the multiple instances of E-T1 PHY d 100 Gb/s highlight and "PHYs" would have
C/ 149B SC 149B	P148	L15	# 627	Suggested	•			
VcClellan, Brett	Marvell					d correct grammar as ap etc.) Including: p.41, l. 2		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			161, I. 3		etc.) including. p.41, i. 23	5, p, 42, i, 0, p. 95, i.	37, p. 109, 1. 20, 29, p.
					Resnonse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
use of 'MultiGBASE-T conform to this subcla	1' may be too general here if ne use	ew PHYs are la	ter specified that don't	Proposed F	100001100			
conform to this subcla		ew PHYs are la	ter specified that don't			· -		
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy			ter specified that don't	Cl 165	SC 165.1	P40	L14	# 536
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE-	use		ter specified that don't		SC 165.1	· -		# 536
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy	use		ter specified that don't	C/ <b>165</b> Ran, Adee Comment T	SC 165.1	P <b>40</b> Cisco Comment Status <b>X</b>	L14	
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE- Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.1 Akin, Sami	use T1' with 'Clause 149 and Clause Response Status O P40 VW AG		ter specified that don't	C/ 165 Ran, Adee Comment 7 The phi "The 2. three di	SC 165.1 Fype E rase "The 25G 5GBASE-T1, ifferent PHYs.	P <b>40</b> Cisco	L 14 to be inhereted from SE-T1 PHYs", becau s specified, and is lat	clause 149 which has use that clause specifie
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE- Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.1 Akin, Sami Comment Type E In the first sentence of	use T1' with 'Clause 149 and Clause Response Status O P40	e 165' <i>L</i> <b>10</b> 5 well as the 250	# <u>393</u> GBASE-T1 Physical	C/ 165 Ran, Adee Comment 7 The phi "The 2. three di singula Similarl	SC 165.1 Fype E rase "The 250 5GBASE-T1, ifferent PHYs. re, e.g. in the	P40 Cisco Comment Status X BASE-T1 PHYs" seems 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBA But here only one PHY is third paragraph "a 25GBA instances in this paragra	L14 to be inhereted from SE-T1 PHYs", becau s specified, and is lat ASE-T1 PHY".	clause 149 which has use that clause specifie er referred to in
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE- Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.1 Akin, Sami Comment Type E In the first sentence of Medium Attachment (F SuggestedRemedy	use T1' with 'Clause 149 and Clause <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>40</b> VW AG <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> <sup>T</sup> the paragraph, we have ' as	e 165' <i>L</i> 10 s well as the 250 s' should be 'su	# <u>393</u> GBASE-T1 Physical ıblayer'. It's a typo.	Cl 165 Ran, Adee Comment 7 The phi "The 2. three di singula Similarl and ma	SC 165.1 Type E rase "The 25G 5GBASE-T1, ifferent PHYs. re, e.g. in the ly in two other aybe elsewhere artifacts of this	P40 Cisco Comment Status X BASE-T1 PHYs" seems 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBA But here only one PHY is third paragraph "a 25GBA instances in this paragra	L14 to be inhereted from SE-T1 PHYs", becau s specified, and is lat ASE-T1 PHY". ph, and also in the fir t, e.g. in 165.1.3 "The	clause 149 which has use that clause specifie er referred to in rst sentence in 165.1.2
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE- Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.1 Akin, Sami Comment Type E In the first sentence of Medium Attachment (F SuggestedRemedy	use T1' with 'Clause 149 and Clause Response Status O P40 VW AG Comment Status X The paragraph, we have ' as PMA) sublayers'. The 'sublayers	e 165' <i>L</i> 10 s well as the 250 s' should be 'su	# <u>393</u> GBASE-T1 Physical ıblayer'. It's a typo.	Cl 165 Ran, Adee Comment 7 The phi "The 2. three di singula Similarl and ma	SC 165.1 Fype E rase "The 25G 5GBASE-T1, ifferent PHYs. re, e.g. in the ly in two other aybe elsewhere artifacts of this perate" should	P40 Cisco Comment Status X BASE-T1 PHYs" seems 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBA But here only one PHY is third paragraph "a 25GBA instances in this paragra e.	L14 to be inhereted from SE-T1 PHYs", becau s specified, and is lat ASE-T1 PHY". ph, and also in the fir t, e.g. in 165.1.3 "The	clause 149 which has use that clause specifie er referred to in rst sentence in 165.1.2
conform to this subcla SuggestedRemedy replace 'MultiGBASE- Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.1 Akin, Sami Comment Type E In the first sentence of Medium Attachment (f SuggestedRemedy We should have ' as	use T1' with 'Clause 149 and Clause Response Status O P40 VW AG Comment Status X The paragraph, we have ' as PMA) sublayers'. The 'sublayers	e 165' <i>L</i> 10 s well as the 250 s' should be 'su	# <u>393</u> GBASE-T1 Physical ıblayer'. It's a typo.	C/ 165 Ran, Adee Comment 7 The phi "The 2. three di singula Similarl and ma Other a each op Suggested/ Change	SC 165.1 Fype E rase "The 25G 5GBASE-T1, ifferent PHYs. re, e.g. in the ly in two other aybe elsewhere artifacts of this perate" should Remedy	P40 Cisco Comment Status X BASE-T1 PHYs" seems 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBA But here only one PHY is third paragraph "a 25GBA instances in this paragra be inheritance seem to exis be "The 25GBASE-T1 P	L14 to be inhereted from SE-T1 PHYs", becau s specified, and is lat ASE-T1 PHY". ph, and also in the fir t, e.g. in 165.1.3 "The HY operates".	clause 149 which has use that clause specifie er referred to in est sentence in 165.1.2 e 25GBASE-T1 PHY

C/ 165 SC 165.1

Comments Received IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+	uto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments
C/ 165 SC 165.1 P40 L23 # 6	C/ 165 SC 165.1.2 P40 L 35 # 632
Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommS	ppe, Marve McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type E Comment Status X Clause 78 is in the draft - should be an active cross-ref, not external.	Comment Type E Comment Status X indicate that Auto-Negotiation is optional
SuggestedRemedy Change "Clause 78" to an active cross reference and remove external tag.	SuggestedRemedy Insert 'Optional' before Auto-Negotiation
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 165 SC 165.1.1 P40 L24 # 4	C/ 165 SC 165.1.2 P40 L 37 # 421
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors	Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X Clause 78 is in the draft.	Comment Type E Comment Status X Clause 98 is in the draft.
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
Change "Clause 78" to black and make it a hyperlink. Also on P42L5	Change "Clause 98" to black and make it a hyperlink. Also on P41L42, P41L46, P41L52, P49L5, P96L46, P97L47, P117L40, P117L44, P131L6,
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	P131L33, P141L28, P37L40, P37L43
	Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 165 SC 165.1.1 P40 L27 # 34	
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems	C/ 165 SC 165.1.2 P40 L37 # 665
Comment Type E Comment Status X	Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Inconsistent capilization of "this Clause"	Comment Type E Comment Status X
SuggestedRemedy	Clause 98 is in the draft - should be an active cross-ref, not external.
Compare the capitalisation of clause on line 21 and 28. Choose a style for this a consitant	d make it SuggestedRemedy Change "Clause 98" to an active cross reference and remove external tag.
Proposed Response Response Status O	Proposed Response Response Status O

C/ 165 SC 165.1.2 Page 29 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

Comments R	Received
------------	----------

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.1.2	P <b>40</b>	L 37	# 390	C/ 165	SC 1	65.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L <b>30</b>	# 537
Marris, Arthur	Cadence Des	sign Systems		Ran, Adee			Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	Гуре	Е	Comment Status X		
Clause 98							unications over one, two, or f		
SuggestedRemedy				condu		n an ene	clive rate of 25 Gb/S off each	pair in each ui	ection simultaneously
	oss reference. Also page 41 lir			I thoug	ht this is	s a single	pair PHY at 25 Gb/s total?		
	and make Clause 45, Clause 7 rather than an external.	ro and Clause 90	an active cross	Suggestea	Remedy	/			
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Rewrit	e as nec	essary			
.,				Proposed	Respons	se	Response Status O		
C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L <b>30</b>	# 448						
Carlson, Steve	HSD, Bosch,	Ethernovia		C/ 165		65.1.3	P 41	L <b>30</b>	# 391
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Marris, Art			Cadence Desig	gn Systems	
Leftover reference to	two and four pairs: "over one,	two, or four shiel	ded"	Comment		E	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				-			to "operates"		
Delete "two or four" f	rom the sentence			Suggestea					
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			balanc	ed pair o		using full-duplex communicati ctors" to "operates using full-d ctors"		
C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	<i>P</i> <b>41</b>	L <b>30</b>	# 512	Proposed	Respons	se	Response Status O		
Grow, Robert	RMG Conslu	ting		. <u> </u>					
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			C/ 165	SC 1	65.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L <b>30</b>	# 394
Grammar problem ar	nd other aritifacts left after dele	ting 50 Gb/s and	100 Gb/s.	Akin, Sam	İ		VW AG		
SuggestedRemedy				Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Status X		
	operates using full-duplex cor ductors with an effective rate or nents			full-du an effe	olex com	municati e of 25 C	e first paragraph states 'The 2 ons over one, two, or four shi bb/s on each pair'. Followin	elded balanced g the changes	d pair of conductors wit
Proposed Response	Response Status O						dicate only one shielded balar orial, I am not fully sure if this		
				Suggestea	Remedy	/			
				over of direction	ne shielo on simul	ded balar	5GBASE-T1 PHY each opera need pair of conductors with a / while meeting the requirement to "	n effective rate	of 25 Gb/s in each

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

Page 30 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L <b>30</b>	# 666	C/ 165	SC ·	165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L <b>31</b>	# 503
Zimmermai	n, George	CME Consulti	ng/APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope, Marve	Huber, Th	nomas		Nokia		
Comment T	Гуре Т	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status X		
didn't g	et cleaned up wl	Y each operate…over one, tw hen we deleted the 2 and 4 la			parag	raph see	ems to be	t was changed to being only referring to operation at 50 C ate of 25G on each pair.		
SuggestedF					Suggeste					
operate conduc	es using full-dupl tors with an effe	ce of the first paragraph of 16 ex communications over a sinctive rate of 25 Gb/s in each , temperature, etc.) of automode	ngle shielded ba direction simulta	lanced pair of neously while meeting	Chan "one, each	ge two, or f	our shield	ed balanced pair of conducto	ors with an effe	ctive rate of 25 Gb/s or
Proposed F	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>					balanced Iltaneously	pair of conductors with an el	ffective rate of	25 Gb/s in each
C/ 165	SC 165.1.3	P41	L <b>31</b>	# 405	Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status O		
Wienckows	ski, Natalie	General Motor	s		_					
Comment T	Гуре Т	Comment Status X			C/ 165	SC ·	165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L31	# 466
Only 1	pair of conducto	rs is used.			Tu, Mike			Broadcom		
Suggested	Remedy				Comment	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
		E-T1 PHY each operate using			25GB	BASE-T1	operates	over one cable only.		
	four shielded ba each direction si	lanced pair of conductors wit multaneously	h an effective ra	te of 25 Gb/s on each	Suggeste	dRemed	'y			
To: The balance	e 25GBASE-T1	PHY operates using full-dupl ctors with an effective rate of				sing full-c		nmunications over one shield in each direction simultaned		air of conductors with a
Proposed F	Response	Response Status O			Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status O		
					C/ 165	SC ·	165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L35	# 423
					Wienckow	wski, Nat	alie	General Moto	rs	
					Comment gram		Е	Comment Status X		
					Suggeste	dRemed	ly			
							-			

Change: at 14 062.5 MBd rates. To: at a 14 062.5 MBd rate.

Proposed Response Response Status **O** 

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P 41	L <b>35</b>	# 633	C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P 41	L <b>36</b>	# 634
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			· · · //·	omment Status X		
rates' is redundant to M	Bd and incorrectly plural			TX_D, TX_EN and TX_ER a	re not 25GMII signals.	Note that Clause	149 has the same
SuggestedRemedy				error.			
delete 'rates'				SuggestedRemedy change '25GMII TX D, TX E	N and TV ED' to 1250		C
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			<b>o</b>		SIVILITAD and TA	C
				Proposed Response Rea	sponse Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L 35	# 514	0, 405 00, 405 4 0		/ 07	// <b>Tee</b>
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti	ng		C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P <b>41</b>	L37	# 538
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Ran, Adee	Cisco		
There is only one Baud	rate listed, "rates" should be	singular.			omment Status X	to the standard state	550
SuggestedRemedy				Since this PHY uses RS-FE (super)frame is discarded, al			
"at a 14.0625 GBd rate.	II			higher than the 1e-12 stated			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			The performance of this PH	( is defined by the rfer	target, which can	be stated as eqivalent
				to some BER if RS-FEC was	not used. The method	d used in other PH	HYs is comparision of
C/ 165 SC 165.1.3	P 41	L35	# 513	MAC frame loss ratio (FLR). 92.1).	The FLR equivalent of	BER=1e-12 is 6.	2e-10 (see for example
Grow, Robert	RMG Consluti		" 010				
Comment Type E	Comment Status X	ing		The suggested remedy uses instead, but not simply "BER		erformance" or otl	her terms can be used
51	ications use GBd for Baud ra	te (e.g., Clause	30. Clause 48 for	SuggestedRemedy			
	08 for 25GBASE-R, etc.) Als			Change "To maintain a bit er	ror ratio (BER) of less	than or equal to 1	10^–12" to "To maintair
SuggestedRemedy				a frame loss ratio (FLR) equi			
p. 41, l. 35 - 14.0625 G				10^–12".			
p. 42, l. 17 - 14.0625 G				Proposed Response Res	sponse Status <b>O</b>		
· · ·							
p. 44, l. 5 - 14.0625 GB p. 151, l. 4 - 14.0625 GB	Би						
p. 44, l. 5 - 14.0625 GB p. 151, l. 4 - 14.0625 G p. 50, l. 21 - 14.0625 M	Hz						
p. 44, l. 5 - 14.0625 GB p. 151, l. 4 - 14.0625 G	Hz 3 25 GHz						
p. 44, l. 5 - 14.0625 GB p. 151, l. 4 - 14.0625 G p. 50, l. 21 - 14.0625 M p. 107, l. 38 - 0.878 906	Hz 3 25 GHz GHz						

C/ 165 SC 165.1.3

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.1	.3 P 42	L <b>6</b>	# 667	C/ 165	SC 165.1.3.1	I P 42	L 35	# 340
Zimmerman, George	CME Cons	ulting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Gorshe, St	teve	Microchip Tech	nnology	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	Type ER	Comment Status X		
power consumption	y is a mechanism by which 25 during periods of low link utili d a lot of time discussing - na R DIRECTION.	ization." this doesn	't really describe	that the	e FEC symbol s 0)" using the 10	(936, 846, $2^{10}$ " appears to be ize is $2^{10} = 1024$ bits. It appe- bit symbol size of KR-4 and K	ears that it sho	ould be "RS-FEC (936,
SuggestedRemedy				00	,	ect, this should be changed to	RS-FEC (936	846 10)
add "independently	for each direction of the link"	to the end of the se	entence.			, C	101 20 (000,	040, 10)
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Proposed I	Response	Response Status O		
· · ·				C/ 165	SC 165.1.3.3	3 P44	L 22	# 424
C/ 165 SC 165.1	.3.1 P42	L 28	# 539		ski, Natalie	General Motor		"
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Comment		Comment Status X	5	
Comment Type T	Comment Status X				in the draft.	Common Claudo X		
	clause specifies what happens t say anything about the recei			<i>Suggested</i> Chang	2	k and make it a hyperlink.		
determined, but in settings requested	mber L is used as part of the s 165.3.2.2 (PCS Transmit funct in each direction of transmissi	tion) it is written tha ion may be differen	at "The interleaver t signaled during the	Proposed I	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
	e Infofield exchange". This me this should be noted here (an			C/ 165	SC 165.1.6	P <b>45</b>	L32	# 540
	e two simultaneous values of I			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
A reference to the o	definition and content of the in	fofield (in 165.4.2.4	I.5) would also be	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
helpful.		,	,			I here are mainly for state diag		
SuggestedRemedy						sts state diagram conventions, more helpful to the reader.	and is located	d right before the state
Rewrite as necessa	ary					more helpful to the reader.		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Suggested Move t	2	is subclause to 165.3.7.1, mer	ning as neces	sarv
							ging as needs	oury.
				Proposed I	Daananaa	Response Status <b>O</b>		

C/ 165 SC 165.1.6 Page 33 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

mment i lncorre signals referen (Clauss specific ggested Chang posed I 165 Clellan, mment i incorre ggested change	ect refere s corresponder le 149). led in 16 lRemedy ge extern Respons SC 1 , Brett Type ect refere lRemedy	E ence. "Up ponding to ts to the t The elect 55.5.3 W hal referen se 165.2.2.3.3 E ence	boon receip to the indica ransmitter trical speci nce of 149. <i>Respons</i> 3	nt Status X t of this primitivated symbols pe electrical specifications for 25	ve the PMA trans processed to cor ifications for 2.5	Cisco, CommScope, Mar nsmits on the MDI the nform to 149.5.2." The 5G/5G/10GBASE-T1 ve different timing and are ce to 165.5.3 # 653
Incorre signals referen (Clauss specific ggested Chang posed I 165 Clellan, mment incorre ggested change	ect refere s corresponder le 149). led in 16 lRemedy ge extern Respons SC 1 , Brett Type ect refere lRemedy	ence. "Up ponding to ts to the t 5.5.3 y hal referen se 165.2.2.3.3 E ence	boon receip to the indica ransmitter trical speci nce of 149. <i>Respons</i> 3	t of this primitiv ated symbols p electrical speci ifications for 25 5.2 to an active se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>50</b> Marvell	rocessed to cor ifications for 2.5 GBASE-T1 hav e cross-reference	nform to 149.5.2." The 5G/5G/10GBASE-T1 ve different timing and are ce to 165.5.3
signals referen (Clause specifie ggested Chang posed I 165 Clellan, mment incorre ggested change	s corresp nce poin le 149). ed in 16 <i>Remedy</i> le extern <i>Respons</i> <i>SC</i> 1 , Brett <i>Type</i> ect refere <i>Remedy</i>	ponding tr ts to the t The elect 5.5.3 y hal referen se 165.2.2.3.3 E ence	o the indic ransmitter trical speci nce of 149. <i>Respons</i> 3	ated symbols p electrical spec ifications for 25 5.2 to an active se Status <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>50</b> Marvell	rocessed to cor ifications for 2.5 GBASE-T1 hav e cross-reference	nform to 149.5.2." The 5G/5G/10GBASE-T1 ve different timing and are ce to 165.5.3
Chang posed I 165 Clellan, mment i incorre ggested change	se extern Respons SC 1 , Brett Type ect refere IRemedy	IG5.2.2.3.3 E ence	Respons	e Status <b>O</b> P <b>50</b> Marvell		
nposed I 165 Clellan, mment T incorre ggested change	Respons SC 1 , Brett Type ect refere	se 165.2.2.3.3 E ence	Respons	e Status <b>O</b> P <b>50</b> Marvell		
165 Clellan, mment 7 incorre ggested change	SC 1 , Brett Type ect refere	E E ence	3	P 50 Marvell	L <b>4</b>	# 653
Clellan, mment incorre ggested change	, Brett <i>Type</i> ect refere <i>IRemed</i> y	<b>E</b> ence		Marvell	L <b>4</b>	# 653
Clellan, mment incorre ggested change	, Brett <i>Type</i> ect refere <i>IRemed</i> y	<b>E</b> ence		Marvell	L <b>4</b>	# [653
mment incorre ggested change	Type ect refere IRemedy	ence	Comme			
incorre ggested change	ect refere	ence	Comme	nt Status X		
ggested change	Remedy					
change	,	ý				
0	e 149.5.					
		2 to 165.5	5.3			
posed I	Respons	se	Respons	se Status <b>O</b>		
165	SC 1	65.2.2.9.	1	P <b>52</b>	L38	# 669
			•	-		
	,	0	Comme		uning// L Op,	
The all done c	lowed va	alues of p in clause	cs_data_n	node are missi		
ggested	Remedy	V				
The po TRUE	cs_data_ PHY is	_mode pa in state P	rameter ca CS_Data (	an take on one (see Figure 16	5–27)	two values of the form:
posed I	Respons	se	Respons	se Status <b>O</b>		
	omment The al done o are TF uggested Insert The po TRUE FALSE	The allowed vi done correctly are TRUE and ggestedRemed Insert the follo The pcs_data_ TRUE PHY is FALSE PCS is	The allowed values of p done correctly in clause are TRUE and FALSE. <i>iggestedRemedy</i> Insert the following at th The pcs_data_mode pa TRUE PHY is in state P	The allowed values of pcs_data_n done correctly in clause 113). Fro are TRUE and FALSE. IggestedRemedy Insert the following at the end of 1 The pcs_data_mode parameter ca TRUE PHY is in state PCS_Data FALSE PCS is not in state PCS_D	The allowed values of pcs_data_mode are missin done correctly in clause 113). From the state dia are TRUE and FALSE. InggestedRemedy Insert the following at the end of 165.2.2.9.1: The pcs_data_mode parameter can take on one TRUE PHY is in state PCS_Data (see Figure 168 FALSE PCS is not in state PCS_Data (see Figure	The allowed values of pcs_data_mode are missing. (this happed done correctly in clause 113). From the state diagram, it is clear are TRUE and FALSE. InggestedRemedy Insert the following at the end of 165.2.2.9.1: The pcs_data_mode parameter can take on one of the following TRUE PHY is in state PCS_Data (see Figure 165–27) FALSE PCS is not in state PCS_Data (see Figure 165–27)

C/ 165 SC 165.2.2.9.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	P 54	L <b>28</b>	# 670	C/ 165	SC 165	.3.2	P 58	L11	# 467
Zimmerma	an, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Tu, Mike			Broadcom		
Comment	Туре <b>т</b>	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Т	R Co	mment Status X		
		one PCS Reset function and t			The c	ontrol code	s for MultiGE	ASE-T1 is defined in	Table 149-2, no	t Table 149-1.
		e PCS operating functions a			Suggestee	dRemedv				
		om clause to clause, but isn' lauses add a 3rd function to t			00		nces to table	e of control code from	Table 149-1 to	Table 149-2, including
4.					the lis	t below:				, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Suggested	Remedy						1, Figure 16 0, Figure 16			
change	e ""The PCS con	nprises one PCS Reset funct	ion and two simu	ultaneous and		ge 59, line ge 61, line 1		5-7.		
		g functions. " to ""The PCS o			4. Pag	ge 61, line 1	9.			
		asynchronous operating func	tions, and the PO	CS OAM function."		ge 70, line 2 ge 70, line 3				
Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>				ge 70, line 3 ge 79, line 2				
					8. Pag	ge 79, line 2	6.			
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	P 55	L 29	# 657		ge 80, line 9 age 80, line				
Wu, Peter		Marvell	-			age 132, lin				
Comment		Comment Status X			Proposed	Response	Res	ponse Status <b>O</b>		
	51	o be added to the note								
Suggested	Remedy				C/ 165	SC 165	.3.2.2	P 56	L <b>2</b>	# 671
		and tx_lpi_active are only rec			Zimmerm	an, George		CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve
•	apability"	alert_detect, rx_lpi_active and	u tx_ipi_active ai	e only required for the	Comment	Type T	Co	mment Status X		
Proposed	. ,	Response Status O			state the El	transitions i EE capabilit es 165-16 a	n the transm y." is a dupli		am that shall be evious requirem	
					Suggestee	dRemedy				
					Chan	an "that cha	II ha ranorta	d" to "that are reporte	d"	

Change "that shall be reported" to "that are reported"

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2 Page 35 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

	2 P 56	L13	# 542	C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 20	# 735
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, F	Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status	(	post-deadlir
The term L is used in t	he text here without explanat	ion of what it den	otes.	The no	otation "1000 / 14	1.0625 ps" can be confi	using, even if it is not	ambiguous.
One has to read to the determined.	bottom of this subclause to u	understand what I	L means and how it is	Suggested Chang		25 ps" to "(1000 / 14.06	25) ps"	
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed I	Response	Response Status	)	
	introduce the concept of inte inning of this subclause, before		nition of L and how it is			-		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 37	# 672
				Zimmerma	in, George	CME C	onsulting/APL Gp, Ci	sco, CommScope, Marv
C 165 SC 165.3.2.2	P 56	L 20	# 540	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status	(	
		L <b>20</b>	# 543					enerate, at each symbol
Ran, Adee	Cisco					at represent data or co f the PAM4 signalling.		ext refers to symbol bes not happen "at each
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X							
21				symbo	I period". The ad	dded incorrect phrase o	does not seem to add	l any value.
"The symbol period, T				symbo Suggested		dded incorrect phrase o	does not seem to add	l any value.
"The symbol period, T				Suggested delete	Remedy ", at each symbo			
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signali 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number	ng rate is 14.0625	5 GBd).	Suggested delete	<i>Remedy</i> ", at each symbo pdate PICS PC1	ol period,"	.38) deleting the sam	
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signali 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst	5 GBd). read, since it is	Suggested delete Also, u	<i>Remedy</i> ", at each symbo pdate PICS PC1	ol period," 17 Feature text (P132 L <i>Response Status</i> <b>(</b>	.38) deleting the sam	
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signali 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way.	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque	5 GBd). read, since it is	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I	Remedy ", at each symbo pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2	ol period," I7 Feature text (P132 L Response Status C P 56	.38) deleting the sam )	e text
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be is not specified here, b	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signali 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way. the nominal period, without t	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque	5 GBd). read, since it is	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I Cl 165	Remedy ", at each symbo pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2 reve	ol period," I7 Feature text (P132 L Response Status C P 56	.38) deleting the sam <b>)</b> <i>L</i> <b>41</b> nip Technology	e text
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be is not specified here, b SuggestedRemedy Change to "71 1/9" for	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signali 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way. the nominal period, without t	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque 6).	5 GBd). ead, since it is ency deviation (which	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I Cl 165 Gorshe, St Comment Here a	Remedy ", at each symbol pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2 reve Type ER nd other places,	ol period," I7 Feature text (P132 L Response Status C P56 Microch Comment Status X the term "9360-bit (936	.38) deleting the sam <i>L</i> 41 hip Technology ( 6, 846) RS-FEC fram	e text # <u>341</u> es" is used. This
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be is not specified here, b SuggestedRemedy	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signalin 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way. the nominal period, without t out I assume it is per 165.5.3.	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque 6).	5 GBd). ead, since it is ency deviation (which	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I Cl 165 Gorshe, Si Comment Here a termine	Remedy ", at each symbol pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2 reve Type ER nd other places, plogy is incorrect	ol period," 17 Feature text (P132 L Response Status C P56 Microch Comment Status X the term "9360-bit (930 t or at least inconsisten	.38) deleting the sam <i>L</i> 41 hip Technology ( 6, 846) RS-FEC fram t with typical termino	e text # <u>341</u> es" is used. This logy. The 9360-bit entity
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be is not specified here, b SuggestedRemedy Change to "71 1/9" for "71.111" Add "nominal".	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signalin 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way. the nominal period, without t out I assume it is per 165.5.3. matted using equation editor	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque 6).	5 GBd). ead, since it is ency deviation (which	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I Cl 165 Gorshe, St Comment Here a termine is actu	Remedy ", at each symbolic pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2 reve Type ER nd other places, plogy is incorrect ally an FEC code	ol period," I7 Feature text (P132 L Response Status C P56 Microch Comment Status X the term "9360-bit (936	.38) deleting the sam <i>L</i> 41 hip Technology ( 6, 846) RS-FEC fram t with typical termino	e text # <u>341</u> es" is used. This logy. The 9360-bit entity
"The symbol period, T This exercise is not ve nowhere (only much la The ratio evaluates to expressed as ratio any Also, this seems to be is not specified here, b SuggestedRemedy Change to "71 1/9" for "71.111"	is 1000 / 14.0625 ps" ry friendly for the reader. The ter it is found that the signalin 71 + 1/9 ps, and this number way. the nominal period, without t out I assume it is per 165.5.3.	ng rate is 14.0625 can be used inst he allowed freque 6).	5 GBd). ead, since it is ency deviation (which	Suggested delete Also, u Proposed I Cl 165 Gorshe, St Comment Here a termine is actu Suggested In all ir	Remedy ", at each symbolic pdate PICS PCT Response SC 165.3.2.2 reve Type ER nd other places, plogy is incorrect ally an FEC code Remedy	ol period," 17 Feature text (P132 L Response Status P56 Microch Comment Status the term "9360-bit (930 to rat least inconsisten eword. An FEC frame the 9360-bit block is ref	.38) deleting the sam <i>L</i> 41 hip Technology 6, 846) RS-FEC fram t with typical termino consists of multiple F	e text # <u>341</u> es" is used. This logy. The 9360-bit entity

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2 Page 36 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2	P 57	L <b>2</b>	# 658	C/ 165	SC 165.3.2	. <b>2.4</b> Pt	9 L 44	# 673
Wu, Peter		Marvell			Zimmerma	n, George	CME	Consulting/APL G	p, Cisco, CommScope, Marve
Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	<i>уре</i> Е	Comment Status	Х	
What do	es "RS" mean h	ere? Reconciliation SUblaye	er or Reed-Solo	man Frames					, It seems that 165.3.2.2.4
SuggestedRe	emedy								should be, but is redundant. ggested remedy I have been
		al mode of operation, EEE-c			careful				quirement to reference in the
		control of the RS via the 25 capable PHYs may enter th			PICS.				
		layer via the 25GMII."			Suggested				
Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status <b>O</b>				165.3.2.2.4 th 2.4 Block stru	rough 165.3.2.2.12. F cture	eplace with:	
					The 65	-bit block strue	cture specified in 149.	3.2.24 is used by 2	5GBASE-T1, with the block
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2.1	P <b>57</b>	L35	# 544		shown in Figu			
Ran, Adee		Cisco			The ma	pping of cont	rol characters is used		and 25GBASE-T1 PCS is as
Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status X							vn in Table 149-2. All 25GMII e transmitted and shall be
	,	used in the text; is there a di	fference?			as an error if			
		,				.6 Ordered se			
		ncoding is not related to the is not an integer mutiple of		ocks, since due to the		e of Ordered s 7 Idle (/I/)	sets is as specified for	the MultiGBASE-I	1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.6.
			00.		Idle cor	ntrol character	s shall be as specified	for MultiGBASE-T	1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.7.
	sed as part of th	e 64B/65B encoding schem	e name but sho	ould not be used on its		8 LPI (/LI/) wer Idle contr	ol characters shall be	as specified for Mu	IltiGBASE-T1 PHYs in
own.					149.3.2	.2.8.			
SuggestedRe	•	and remove the "CED" lehe	I from the DC			.9 Start (/S/)	are are as an acified for		
		, and remove the "65B" labe	i from the RS-r	EC name.		.10 Terminate	ers are as specified for e (/T/)	MUITIGBASE-11 P	HYS IN 149.3.2.2.9.
Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status O						ed for MultiGBASE	-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.10.
						.11 Ordered s	· · ·	cified for MultiGRA	SE-T1 PHYs in 149.3.2.2.11.
C/ 165	SC 165.3.2.2.3	9 P 57	L <b>51</b>	# 636	165.2.2	.12 Error (/E/)	)		
McClellan, B	rett	Marvell					as specified for MultiG		149.3.2.2.12. See 165.3.7.2.4 for further
Comment Ty	rpe E	Comment Status X			informa				1 103.3.7.2.4 IOI IUIUIEI
header d	lisconnected fro	m subclause text			Proposed F	Response	Response Status	0	
SuggestedRe	emedy				-	-			
movo ho	ader after Figur	e 156-6 to be contiguous wit	h subclause te	¢t					

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.4 Page 37 of 71 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.4 P59 L45 # 426	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P61 L10 # 639
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors	McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type T Comment Status X	Comment Type ER Comment Status X
The Block structure is identical to the MultiGBASE-T1 Block Structure in Clause 49.	using Table 149-2 as a reference has some issues, the column headings are 'XGMII
uggestedRemedy	control code', '2.5G/5G/10G BASE-T1
Replace the contents of 165.3.2.2.4 with the following:	control code', and '2.5G/5G/10G
The block structure used by 25GBASE-T1 is the MultiGBASE-T1 block structure defined in 149.3.2.2.4 with the format as shown in Figure 149-8. The characters in the 65-bit block in	BASE-T1 O code' instead of 25GMII and 25GBASE-T1
Figure 149-8 are either data characters or control characters and, when transferred across	
the 25GMII interface, the corresponding TXC or RXC bit is set accordingly.	copy Table 149-2 to 165.3.2.2.5 and label as Table 165-2, change the column headers
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	indicated, and change the reference to Table 165-2
	Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
7/165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P60 L48 # 637	
IcClellan, Brett Marvell	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P61 L10 # 635
Comment Type E Comment Status X	McClellan, Brett Marvell
header disconnected from subclause text	Comment Type E Comment Status X
	incorrect reference to Table 149-1, should be Table 149-2
insert page break	incorrect reference to Table 149-1, should be Table 149-2 SuggestedRemedy
insert page break	SuggestedRemedy change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 lir 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 5
Proposed Response         Response Status         O           Cl 165         SC 165.3.2.2.5         P 61         L 10         # 638	SuggestedRemedy change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 lir
insert page break Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P 61 L 10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell	SuggestedRemedy change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 lir 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 3 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs. If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference
insert page break proposed Response Response Status O 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P 61 L 10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes	SuggestedRemedy change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 lin 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 4 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs. If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.
insert page break Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P 61 L 10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes SuggestedRemedy insert 'All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not	SuggestedRemedy         change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 line 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 8 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs.         If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.         Proposed Response       Response Status
insert page break troposed Response Response Status O 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P61 L10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes tuggestedRemedy insert 'All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not be transmitted and shall be treated as an error if received.'	SuggestedRemedy         change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 line 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 3 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs.         If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.         Proposed Response       Response Status       0         Cl 165       SC 165.3.2.2.5       P 61       L 10       # 425
insert page break Proposed Response Response Status O 27 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P61 L10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes SuggestedRemedy insert 'All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not be transmitted and shall be treated as an error if received.'	SuggestedRemedy         change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 line 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 4 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs.         If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.         Proposed Response       Response Status         Cl 165       SC 165.3.2.2.5       P 61       L 10       # 425         Wienckowski, Natalie       General Motors
insert page break Proposed Response Response Status O 27 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P 61 L 10 # 638 AcClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes SuggestedRemedy insert 'All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not be transmitted and shall be treated as an error if received.'	SuggestedRemedy         change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 line 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 4 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs.         If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.         Proposed Response       Response Status         O         Cl 165       SC 165.3.2.2.5       P 61       L 10       # 425         Wienckowski, Natalie       General Motors         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X
insert page break Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.5 P 61 L 10 # 638 McClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Type T Comment Status X missing statement on additional control codes SuggestedRemedy insert 'All 25GMII control code values that do not appear in the table shall not be transmitted and shall be treated as an error if received.'	SuggestedRemedy         change Table 149-1 to Table 149-2 on page 61 lines 10 and 19, also change page 58 line 11, also change page 59 line 10, page 70 lines 2 and 3, page 79 lines 25 and 26, page 30 lines 9 and 11. Update associated PICs.         If an associated comment to create a new Table 165-2 is accepted, then these reference will be to Table 165-2.         Proposed Response       Response Status         O         Cl 165       SC 165.3.2.2.5       P 61       L 10       # 425         Wienckowski, Natalie       General Motors         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         The MultiGBASE-T1 Control Codes are in Table 149-2, not Table 149-1.

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.14 P 62 L 39 # 504	Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.22 P67 L34 # 736
Huber, Thomas Nokia	Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
Comment Type E Comment Status X Awkward grammar in the sentence	Comment Type TR Comment Status X post-deadlin Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames
uggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
Change:	change "eight Reed-Solomon frames" to "sixteen Reed-Solomon frames"
The RS-FEC encoding takes the 8460-bit vector, consisting of tx_group130x65B, and the 10-bit OAM_field, and shall generate the 90 10-bit parity symbols (900 bits total). To: The RS-FEC encoding takes the 8460-bit vector, consisting of tx_group130x65B and the	Proposed Response Response Status O
10-bit OAM_field, and generates the 90 10-bit parity symbols (900 bits total).	Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.2.23 P67 L35 # 737
Proposed Response Response Status O	Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
	Comment Type TR Comment Status X post-deadlin
C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.2.18 P65 L51 # 674	Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames
immerman, George CME Consulting/APL Gp, Cisco, CommScope, Marve	SuggestedRemedy
omment Type E Comment Status X	change "eight RS-FEC frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC frames"
Similarly, 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 are identical to clause 149, and can be referenced. (note I've left EEE capability since this seems to be an area we discuss	Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
diverging frequently, and the numbers are different in the wake time table)	
diverging frequently, and the numbers are different in the wake time table)	Cl 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545
	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2.3 P68 L 37 # 545 Ran, Adee Cisco
Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler	
uggestedRemedy Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18. 165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as	Ran, Adee Cisco
uggestedRemedy Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18. 165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.19 165.3.2.2.20 Selectable precoder The PCS transmit process shall precode the Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in	Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it
Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18. 165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.19 165.3.2.2.0 Selectable precoder The PCS transmit process shall precode the Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.0. 165.3.2.2.21 PAM4 encoding	Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7.         The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the
SuggestedRemedy Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18. 165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.19 165.3.2.2.0 Selectable precoder The PCS transmit process shall precode the Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.20.	Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7.         The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented
SuggestedRemedy         Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows:         165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler         The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18.         165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding         The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.19         165.3.2.2.20 Selectable precoder         The PCS transmit process shall precode the Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.20.         165.3.2.2.21 PAM4 encoding         The PCS transmit process shall encode each precoder output symbol as specified in 149.3.2.2.21	Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7.       The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented         SuggestedRemedy
SuggestedRemedy Replace 165.3.2.2.18 through 165.3.2.2.21 each as follows: 165.3.2.2.18 PCS scrambler The PCS scrambler operates as specified in 149.3.2.2.18. 165.3.2.2.19 Gray mapping for PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall map pairs of bits to Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.19 165.3.2.2.20 Selectable precoder The PCS transmit process shall precode the Gray-coded PAM4 symbols as specified in 149.3.2.2.20. 165.3.2.2.21 PAM4 encoding The PCS transmit process shall encode each precoder output symbol as specified in 149.3.2.2.21	Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         It is not stated that the receive function includes undoing the effect of the selected precoding. Precoding is a separate function from PAM4 mapping in Figure 165–6, but it does not appear in Figure 165–7.       The channel description in the precoder options is not sufficient; even if it matches the actual channel, at least a mod4 operation (not trivial) has to be implemented         SuggestedRemedy       Add a box "Undo selected precoder" in Figure 165–7.         Add content similar to 165.3.2.2.20 in a subclause under 165.3.2.3 describing the decoding used for each precoder option (e.g., G(n)=(P(n)+P(n-1)) mod 4 for 1+D). It can be

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/
 165
 Page 39 of 71

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC
 165
 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC
 165
 8/15/2022 9:50:59 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	3 P69	L13	# 771	C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	2.4 P69	L 33	# 739
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadlin
	artial PHY frames per PHY fra	me, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-	Wake signal should I	pe composed of 16 RS frames	;	
FEC frames.				SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				change "eight RS-Fra	ames" to "sixteen RS-Frames'	1	
Change 16 to 32				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
C/ 165 SC 165.3.2	3 <i>P</i> 69	L17	# 427	C/ 165 SC 165.3.3	P70	L12	# 675
			# 427	Zimmerman, George	CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marv
Nienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	rs		Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Similarly, 165.3.3 thr	ough 165.3.4 are identical to c	lause 149	
grammar				SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Replace 165.3.3 and			
Change: and subject To: and is subject				165.3.3 Test-pattern	generators erator mode shall operate as s	necified in 149 3	3
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			1 0	scrambler polynomials	peolined in 140.0.	.0.
iopoood i tooponoo				The PCS Transmit fu	Inction shall employ side-strea	m scrambling as	specified in 149.3.4.
				Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 165 SC 165.3.2		L <b>22</b>	# 738				
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			C/ 165 SC 165.3.5	P <b>71</b>	L 23	# 767
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Sleep signal should b	e composed of 16 RS frames			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadlir
SuggestedRemedy				51	partial PHY frames per PHY fra	ame, where each	,
change "eight RS-FE	C frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC	frames"		FEC frames.	•	,	
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			SuggestedRemedy			
				Observe 40 to 20			
				Change 16 to 32			

C/ 165 SC 165.3.5

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3.5	P <b>71</b>	L 28	# 766	C/ 165 S	C 165.3.5	P71	L <b>44</b>	# 769
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, Ragn	ar	Marvell		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment Type	TR	Comment Status X		post-deadlir
document due to inco	nsistent with L=8 super frame prrect definition of 16 partial Pl mes per PHY frame, where ea	HY frames per PH	HY frame. There should	There shou FEC frame SuggestedRem	s. '	tial PHY frames per PHY frai	me, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-
SuggestedRemedy				00		ine 44 and 45		
0	to use 32 partial PHY frames that assumes 16 partial PH	•	5	Proposed Resp		Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed Response	Response Status O							
				C/ 165 S	C 165.3.5	P <b>71</b>	L <b>44</b>	# 428
C 165 SC 165.3.5	P <b>71</b>	L <b>43</b>	# 768	Wienckowski, N	Vatalie	General Moto	rs	
lonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Comment Type		Comment Status X		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	The equation	on for Sn wa	s updated, but the text is still	the same from	Clause 149.
			,	Suggested	adu			
FEC frames.	artial PHY frames per PHY fra	ame, where each	,	0	ach partial P partial PHY fr	PHY frame is 450 bits long, b rame is 1170 bits long, begin <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b>	0 0	( )
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy		ame, where each	,	Change: E To: Each p	ach partial P partial PHY fr	rame is 1170 bits long, begin	0 0	(
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and	16 to 32nd	ame, where each	,	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp	ach partial P partial PHY fr	rame is 1170 bits long, begin	0 0	( )
FEC frames. uggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and proposed Response	16 to 32nd Response Status <b>O</b>	ame, where each	,	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp	ach partial P partial PHY fr ponse	rame is 1170 bits long, begin <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	ning at Sn whe	re (n mod 1170) = 0.
FEC frames. uggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and proposed Response 165 SC 165.3.5	16 to 32nd Response Status <b>O</b>		PHY frame has 8 RS-	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp Cl 165 St Tu, Mike Comment Type	ach partial P partial PHY fr ponse C 165.3.5 TR	rame is 1170 bits long, begin Response Status O P71 Broadcom Comment Status X	ning at Sn when	re (n mod 1170) = 0.
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.3.5 AcClellan, Brett	16 to 32nd Response Status <b>0</b> P <b>71</b>		PHY frame has 8 RS-	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp Cl 165 St Tu, Mike Comment Type	ach partial P partial PHY fr ponse C 165.3.5 TR	rame is 1170 bits long, begin <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>71</b> Broadcom	ning at Sn when	re (n mod 1170) = 0.
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3.5 AcClellan, Brett Comment Type T	16 to 32nd <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> <b>71</b> Marvell	L 44	PHY frame has 8 RS- # 648	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp Cl 165 So Tu, Mike Comment Type The size of SuggestedRem	ch partial P partial PHY fr ponse C 165.3.5 TR a partial PH pedy	rame is 1170 bits long, begin Response Status O P71 Broadcom Comment Status X Y frame is 1170 bits, not 450	ning at Sn when	re (n mod 1170) = 0.
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.3.5 AcClellan, Brett Comment Type T If the PHY frame is 1,	16 to 32nd Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>71</b> Marvell Comment Status <b>X</b>	L 44	PHY frame has 8 RS- # 648	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp Cl 165 Su Tu, Mike Comment Type The size of SuggestedRem Change the	C 165.3.5 TR a partial PHY fr bonse C 165.3.5 TR a partial PH redy e sentence to	rame is 1170 bits long, begin <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>71</b> Broadcom <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Y frame is 1170 bits, not 450 b:	ning at Sn when	# [ <u>469</u>
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy change 15 to 31 and Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3.5 McClellan, Brett Comment Type T If the PHY frame is 1, SuggestedRemedy change "Each partial	16 to 32nd Response Status <b>O</b> P <b>71</b> Marvell Comment Status <b>X</b>	L 44 it is 1170 symbols eginning at Sn wh	PHY frame has 8 RS- # <u>648</u> s long. here (n mod 450) = 0."	Change: E To: Each p Proposed Resp Cl 165 Su Tu, Mike Comment Type The size of SuggestedRem Change the	C 165.3.5 TR a partial PHY fr onse C 165.3.5 TR a partial PH redy e sentence to al PHY frame	rame is 1170 bits long, begin Response Status O P71 Broadcom Comment Status X Y frame is 1170 bits, not 450	ning at Sn when	# [ <u>469</u>

C/ 165 SC 165.3.5 Page 41 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ <b>165</b>	SC 165.3.5	P <b>71</b>	L <b>48</b>	# 770	C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P <b>72</b>	L 28	# 744
Jonsson,	Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment	Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		post-deadline
	should be 32 pa rames.	rtial PHY frames per PHY fram	ne, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-	lpi_off:	set no longer ex	ists and has been replaced wit	th master and s	lave specific versions
					Suggested	lRemedy			
00	dRemedy	70, 17654 to 36365, and 18720	with 27440		replac	e "lpi_offset" wit	h "lpi_master_offset, lpi_slave	_offset	
	0		with 37440.		Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
Proposed	Response	Response Status O							
	00 /07 0 0				C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P <b>72</b>	L 29	# 745
C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P <b>72</b>	L17	# 740	Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marvell		
lonsson,	0	Marvell			Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		post-deadline
Comment Sleep		Comment Status X e composed of 16 RS frames		post-deadline			blaced with master and slave vestate a value already defined		ues are incorrect, and it
Suggeste	dRemedy				Suggested	IRemedy			
chang	ge "eight RS-FEC	frames" to "sixteen RS-FEC f	rames"				a fixed value equal to lpi_qr_ti		
Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			period 165-03		it with "The values for these ti	ming parameter	s are given in Table
					Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P <b>72</b>	L <b>22</b>	# 743					
Jonsson,	Ragnar	Marvell			C/ 165	SC 165.3.6	P <b>73</b>	L10	# 746
	Type E	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marvell		
	lescription in lines sed to two parts o	s 22-24 is easily misunderstoo	d to imply a sec	quence of signals, as	Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		post-deadline
Suggeste	dRemedy	0					ve refresh signal is incorrect o 2, not 43 (see Table 165-3)	r misleading in t	the Figure 165-13. It
		of this cycle is known as the q iet period is defined in 165.3.6.			Suggested	IRemedy			
		period and lasts for a time lpi_r			Redra	w location of sla	ve refresh signal at location 42	2	
define		quiet period and lasts for a time he another part of this cycle is ime."			Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed	Response	Response Status 0							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.3.6 Page 42 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	6 P73	L 28	# 747	C/ 165 SC 16	5.3.7 P75	L <b>5</b>	# 640
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			McClellan, Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	lave refresh signal is incorrect o 42, not 43 (see Table 165-3)	r misleading in t	ne Figure 165-14. It	diagrams is iden	eptions listed below it seems that tical to clause 149. This is as it	should be, but is re	
SuggestedRemedy				referencing claus Exceptions:	se 149 for most of the text and fig	gures	
Redraw location of s	lave refresh signal at location 4	2		1.rfer_timer defir			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			3.A definition for related comment			
C/ 165 SC 165.3.6	5.1 P74	L15	# 772		instead of XGMII Figure references to 165 instead	d of 149	
lonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			SuggestedRemedy			
FEC frames. SuggestedRemedy Change "PHY frame	to "RS-FEC frame" in lines 15		PHY frame has 8 RS-	25GMII replaces Replace the text "The PCS state of 25GMII replaces Reference to 149	of 165.3.7.22 Variables with: diagram variables are as defined XGMII and the following modific 0.4.4.1 is replace by 165.4.4.1."	in 149.3.7.2.3 with	
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			"The PCS timers	of 165.3.7.2.3 Timers with: are as defined in 149.3.7.2.3 wi llowing modified definitions:	th the exception th	hat 25GMII replaces
C/ <b>165</b> SC <b>165.3.6</b> Graba, Jim Comment Type <b>E</b> Typo SuggestedRemedy		L 18 me 92"	# 507	"The PCS timers XGMII and the for rfer_timer Timer that is trig rfer_timer_done Replace the text "The PCS function XGMII and the for Reference to 149 Replace the text "The PCS countur In 165.3.7.3 delet	are as defined in 149.3.7.2.3 wi llowing modified definitions: gered every 12.5 µs ±1%. Wher	with the exception 2." 7, Figure 165–18 a	s its terminal count, n that 25GMII replac and Figure 165–19 a

C/ 165 SC 165.3.7

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3	.7.2.1	P <b>75</b>	L <b>41</b>	# 546	C/ 165	SC 165.3.7	.2.3	P <b>78</b>	L <b>8</b>	# 470
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Tu, Mike			Broadcom		
Comment Type E	Comment S	Status X			Comment	ype <b>TR</b>	Comme	ent Status X		
The constant name obscure. Wherever understand if the nu places, so the merit	it is used in the te umber 16 was use	ext or in idagrar d instead (the	ns, it would be e number 16 is alr	asier for the reader to	16 FEC el	errors within rors within 31.	one rfer_time 25 usec, or a	er interval. In 802.3	3ch 10GBASE-T	e is set when there are 1 this translate to 16 , we should keep the
Similarly for RFRX_	_CNT_LIMIT (88).				We ne	ed to revise 45	.2.3.87.2 PC	S high RFER (3.2	324.9) for 25GB	ASE-T1 as well.
SuggestedRemedy					See tu	201 01 09 1	6 2022 ndf f	for additional detai		
			nd instances of R	RFRX_CNT_LIMIT with	Suggested		0_2022.pui i		15.	
88, and delete the c					00		change "12	.5 us" to "32.5 us".		
Proposed Response	Response S	Status O			1. 011	age 70, inte o	, onlange 12	.0 43 10 02.0 43		
						age 27, line 4				
C/ 165 SC 165.3.	.7.2.2	P <b>76</b>	L3	# 342		.87.2 PCS hig read as a one.		indicates that the	MultiGBASE-T1	PCS receiver is
Gorshe, Steve		Microchip Teo	chnology							nterval. When read as a
Gorshe, Steve Comment Type E	Comment S	Microchip Teo S <i>tatus</i> X	chnology		zero, b	t 3.2324.9 ind	icates that th	ne MultiGBASE-T1	PCS is detectin	ng fewer than 16 RS-
Comment Type E		Status X		If so, rf_valid should	zero, b FEC el the hi_	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149	e MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r	
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa		Status X		If so, rf_valid should	zero, b FEC e	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149	e MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r	ng fewer than 16 RS-
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved	age supposed to be	Status X e in strictly alph	nabetical order?		zero, b FEC el the hi_	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149 <i>Respons</i>	e MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r	ng fewer than 16 RS-
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic	age supposed to be	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page	nabetical order?		zero, b FEC ei the hi_ Proposed I	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC <b>165.3.7</b>	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149 <i>Respons</i>	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b>	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1."	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up	age supposed to be cal order is intende	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page	nabetical order?		zero, b FEC ei the hi_ Proposed I CI 165	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se Status <b>O</b> P <b>78</b>	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1."	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response	age supposed to be al order is intende <i>Response</i> S	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O	nabetical order?	ge, it should be	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I CI 165 Jonsson, F Comment	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 <i>Comme</i>	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>78</b> Marvell	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1."	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # <u>741</u>
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3.	age supposed to be al order is intende <i>Response</i> S	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77	nabetical order?		zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I CI 165 Jonsson, F Comment	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de <i>Response</i> SC <b>165.3.7</b> agnar <i>Type</i> <b>TR</b> ignal should b	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 <i>Comme</i>	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>P78</b> Marvell ent Status <b>X</b>	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1."	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # <u>741</u>
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3. Martino, Kjersti	age supposed to be cal order is intende <i>Response</i> S	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77 Inneos	nabetical order?	ge, it should be	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I Cl 165 Jonsson, F Comment Sleep s Suggested	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR signal should b Remedy	icates that th vithin one rfe efined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 Comme e composed	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>P78</b> Marvell ent Status <b>X</b>	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1." <i>L</i> 16	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # [741
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3. Martino, Kjersti Comment Type E Include explicit text	age supposed to be cal order is intende <i>Response</i> S <b>.7.2.2</b> <i>Comment</i> S indicating that lpi_	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77 Inneos Status X	and the next pag	ge, it should be	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I Cl 165 Jonsson, F Comment Sleep s Suggested	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR signal should to Remedy "eight RS-FE	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 2.3 Comme e composed C frame" to '	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se Status <b>O</b> P78 Marvell ent Status <b>X</b> I of 16 RS frames	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1." <i>L</i> 16	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # [741
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3. Martino, Kjersti Comment Type E Include explicit text with other definition	age supposed to be cal order is intende <i>Response</i> S <b>.7.2.2</b> <i>Comment</i> S indicating that lpi_	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77 Inneos Status X	and the next pag	ge, it should be # <u>506</u>	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I Cl 165 Jonsson, F Comment Sleep s Suggested change	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR signal should to Remedy "eight RS-FE	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 2.3 Comme e composed C frame" to '	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>P78</b> Marvell ent <i>Status</i> <b>X</b> I of 16 RS frames 'sixteen RS-FEC fi	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1." <i>L</i> 16	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # <u>741</u>
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3. Martino, Kjersti Comment Type E Include explicit text with other definition SuggestedRemedy	age supposed to be cal order is intende <i>Response</i> S .7.2.2 <i>Comment</i> S indicating that lpi_ is	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77 Inneos Status X _refresh_detec	and the next pag	ge, it should be # <u>506</u>	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I Cl 165 Jonsson, F Comment Sleep s Suggested change	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR signal should to Remedy "eight RS-FE	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 2.3 Comme e composed C frame" to '	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>P78</b> Marvell ent <i>Status</i> <b>X</b> I of 16 RS frames 'sixteen RS-FEC fi	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1." <i>L</i> 16	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # <u>741</u>
Comment Type E Is the list on this pa be moved SuggestedRemedy If strictly alphabetic cleaned up Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3. Martino, Kjersti Comment Type E Include explicit text	age supposed to be cal order is intende <i>Response</i> S .7.2.2 <i>Comment</i> S indicating that lpi_ is	Status X e in strictly alph d on this page Status O P77 Inneos Status X _refresh_detec hen"	and the next pag	ge, it should be # <u>506</u>	zero, b FEC er the hi_ Proposed I Cl 165 Jonsson, F Comment Sleep s Suggested change	t 3.2324.9 ind rored blocks v fer variable de Response SC 165.3.7 agnar Type TR signal should to Remedy "eight RS-FE	icates that th vithin one rfe sfined in 149 <i>Respons</i> 2.3 2.3 Comme e composed C frame" to '	ne MultiGBASE-T1 r_timer interval. Bi .3.8.1 and 165.3.8 se <i>Status</i> <b>O</b> <b>P78</b> Marvell ent <i>Status</i> <b>X</b> I of 16 RS frames 'sixteen RS-FEC fi	PCS is detectin t 3.2324.9 is a r 1." <i>L</i> 16	ng fewer than 16 RS- eflection of the state of # 741

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.3.7.2.3 Page 44 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3	.7.2.6 <i>P</i> 80	L 37	# 509	C/ 165	SC 165.3.8.1	P 8	7 L7	# 547
Graba, Jim	Broadcom			Ran, Adee		Cisco	)	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Ty	rpe <b>T</b>	Comment Status	х	
RX_FRAME include	es unreliable Wake frames.			It seems	that only few	of the status variable	s defined in 54.2.1 are	e listed here.
	ne description: "If the optional EE irst 8 WAKE frames."	EE is supported, I	RX_FRAME shall be	in both c	lirections is co	nveyed over the 25G	MII.	e the LPI real-time stat
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			listed.	us of training p	arameters would be	Important for managei	ment, but they are not
C/ 165 SC 165.3	.7.3 P84	L <b>37</b>	# 505				ement interface shoul lest to the link partner	d include at least reset, and loopback mode.
Martino, Kjersti	Inneos			SuggestedR	emedy			
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X			Expend	the manageme	ent interface section	per the comment, and	further as necessary.
Figure 165-18 is mi 'LI' from RX_E	issing the dashed line box aroun	d the transition to	R_TYPE(rx_coded) =	Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status	0	
SuggestedRemedy Add dashed line				C/ 165	SC 165.3.8.3	P8	7 L 45	# 548
Add dashed line	Response Status <b>O</b>			C/ 165 Ran, Adee	SC 165.3.8.3	P8 Cisco		# 548
Add dashed line	Response Status <b>0</b>					-	)	# 548
Add dashed line Proposed Response	· -	L1	# 641	Ran, Adee <i>Comment Ty</i> The pres part of th	rpe <b>T</b> sence of a loop ne PCS manag	Cisco Comment Status back function should	x	e PCS functions, not as
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett	.8 P87 Marvell	L1	# 641	Ran, Adee <i>Comment Ty</i> The pres	rpe <b>T</b> sence of a loop ne PCS manag	Cisco Comment Status back function should	X be listed as part of th	e PCS functions, not as
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E	.8 P 87 Marvell Comment Status X			Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2.	rpe <b>T</b> sence of a loop ne PCS manag Is. 2 (PCS Transr	Cisco Comment Status back function should ement, which typical nit function) currently	X be listed as part of th	e PCS functions, not as iables and register
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E It appears that 165.	.8 P 87 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> X .3.8 PCS management is identic	cal to clause 149	with the exception of	Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2. function	rpe <b>T</b> sence of a loop he PCS manag ls. 2 (PCS Transr can be fed by	Cisco Comment Status back function should ement, which typical	X I be listed as part of th ly only lists control var	e PCS functions, not as iables and register
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E It appears that 165.	.8 P87 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> X .3.8 PCS management is identic II. This is as it should be, but is	cal to clause 149	with the exception of	Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2. function SuggestedR	ype <b>T</b> sence of a loop he PCS manag is. 2 (PCS Transr can be fed by <i>emedy</i>	Cisco Comment Status back function should lement, which typical nit function) currently the receive function.	X I be listed as part of th ly only lists control var does not even mentic	e PCS functions, not as iables and register on that the transmit
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E It appears that 165. reference to 25GMI clause 149 for the e	.8 P87 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> X .3.8 PCS management is identic II. This is as it should be, but is	cal to clause 149	with the exception of	Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2. function SuggestedR	ype <b>T</b> sence of a loop he PCS manag is. 2 (PCS Transr can be fed by <i>emedy</i>	Cisco Comment Status back function should lement, which typical nit function) currently the receive function.	X I be listed as part of th ly only lists control var does not even mentic	e PCS functions, not as iables and register on that the transmit
Add dashed line Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E It appears that 165. reference to 25GMI clause 149 for the e SuggestedRemedy Replace all text of 1	.8 P87 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> X .3.8 PCS management is idention II. This is as it should be, but is entire text. 165.3.8 with "PCS management	cal to clause 149 redundant. I sug	with the exception of gest referencing	Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2. function SuggestedR Add text	ope <b>T</b> sence of a loop he PCS manages. 2 (PCS Transmin can be fed by <i>emedy</i> to 165.3.2.2 (1997)	Cisco Comment Status back function should lement, which typical nit function) currently the receive function. PCS Transmit functio	X I be listed as part of th ly only lists control var does not even mentic	e PCS functions, not as iables and register on that the transmit effect of loopback mode
Cl 165 SC 165.3 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E It appears that 165. reference to 25GMI clause 149 for the e SuggestedRemedy	.8 P87 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> X .3.8 PCS management is idention II. This is as it should be, but is entire text. 165.3.8 with "PCS management	cal to clause 149 redundant. I sug	with the exception of gest referencing	Ran, Adee Comment Ty The pres part of th mapping 165.3.2. function SuggestedR Add text	ype <b>T</b> sence of a loop ne PCS manages. 2 (PCS Transmin can be fed by <i>emedy</i> to 165.3.2.2 ( the content of 1	Cisco Comment Status back function should lement, which typical nit function) currently the receive function. PCS Transmit functio	X I be listed as part of th ly only lists control var does not even mentic n) that describes the e	e PCS functions, not as iables and register on that the transmit effect of loopback mode

C/ 165 SC 165.3.8.3 Page 45 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.3	.9.1 P88	L16	# 773	C/ 165	SC 165.3.9.4	3 P 89	L15	# 774
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		post-deadline
There should be 32 FEC frames.	2 partial PHY frames per PHY f	rame, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-	There FEC fr		tial PHY frames per PHY frame	, where each	n PHY frame has 8 RS-
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Change "PHY fram	e" to "RS-FEC frame".			Chang	je "PHY frame" to	"RS-FEC frame".		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.3	.9.2.1 <i>P</i> 88	L <b>34</b>	# 508	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.2	P 91	L <b>30</b>	# 337
Graba, Jim	Broadcom			Maguire, \	/alerie	Copperopolis		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	Type E	Comment Status X		
OAM symbols may	be unreliable during the begin	ning of Wake		Interfa	ce is capitalized	when appearing after "MDIO" (s	ee clause 45	5 header).
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Change according	to pp 5-6 in graba_3cy_01_08 <sup>-</sup>	16.pdf		Replac	ce, "MDIO interfa	ce" with "MDIO Interface"		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.3	.9.4.1 P88	L 48	# 549	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.2	P91	L <b>31</b>	# 429
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motors		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	Type E	Comment Status X		
	body of this subclause is comp			45.2.1	.7.4 is in the draf			
	te diagram in this subclause, on the subclause, on the subclause is the su	,	,	Suggested	Remedy			
diagrams defined e					je "45.2.1.7.4" to 138L35	black and make it a hyperlink.		
-				Proposed	Resnanse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
There is no need fo	or this "conventions" subclause	•			Response			
	or this "conventions" subclause				Response			
There is no need fo SuggestedRemedy Delete subclause 1					Response			

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P92	L <b>9</b>	# 338	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4	P <b>92</b>	L 20	# 775
Maguire, Valerie	Copperopolis			Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR Comme	nt Status X		post-deadline
Interface is capitalized	when appearing after "MDIO"	(see clause 45	header).	There should be 32 partial PHY fra FEC frames.	ames per PHY fra	ame, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-
SuggestedRemedy							
Replace, "MDIO interfa	ace" with "MDIO Interface"			SuggestedRemedy Change "16th" to "32nd", 17550 to	36270 and 176	45 to 36365	
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			<b>C</b>			
				Fibbosed Response Respons	e Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P 92	L10	# 642		Dee	1.4	# 550
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.2	P 93	L <b>1</b>	# 550
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Ran, Adee Comment Type E Comme.	Cisco nt Status X		
incorrect reference for	the 802.3-2022 base			Comment Type E Comme. Unnecessary capitalization in "Fra		neically in the te	xt where "start" is not
SuggestedRemedy				capitalized.		peloally in the tes	At where start is not
change 45.2.1.193.7 to	0 45.2.1.243.7			SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Change to "frame delimiter" in hea	iding and text.		
				Proposed Response Respons	e Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P 92	L10	# 430				
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors	6		C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.2	P 93	L3	# 551
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Ran, Adee	Cisco		
45.2.1.7.5 is in the dra	ft.			Comment Type E Comme	nt Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				Here "Octet x" (x=1 to 3) but in sub	osequent subclau	uses it is "Octx" (>	<=4 and above).
Change "45.2.1.7.5" to	black and make it a hyperlink.			SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Change to be consistent, one way	or another.		
				Proposed Response Respons	e Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.3	P 92	L <b>31</b>	# 431				
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors	6					
Comment Type E Incorrect reference. 4	Comment Status X 5.2.1.193.7 doesn't exist in 802	2.3-2022.					
SuggestedRemedy							
Change :45.2.1.193.7"	to "45.2.1.243.7".						
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.2 Page 47 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

Jonsson, Ragnar       Marvell       post-deadline         Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X       post-deadline         There schould be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames.       SuggestedRemedy       Comment Status X       post-deadline         Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11       Inter schould be 32 partial PHY frames, where each PHY frame has 8 RS- FEC frames.       SuggestedRemedy         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P 93       L 49       552         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 51       # [71]         Ran, Adee       Cisco       Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X       The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16.         SuggestedRemedy       Change 16th sch2.4.7.       SuggestedRemedy       Change 115 an ultiple of 32, not 16.       SuggestedRemedy         Coll 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # [643]         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # [643]         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # [686]         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # [686]         C/1 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50 <t< th=""><th>Comments Received</th><th>IEEE</th><th>P802.3cy D2</th><th>2.0 10G+ Auto Task Fo</th><th>rce Initial W</th><th>orking Group</th><th>ballot comments</th><th></th><th></th></t<>	Comments Received	IEEE	P802.3cy D2	2.0 10G+ Auto Task Fo	rce Initial W	orking Group	ballot comments		
Comment Type       The comment Status X       post-deadline         There should be 32 partial PHY trames per PHY trame, where each PHY trame has 8 RS- FEG trames.       SuggestedRemedy         Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16 th 0 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11       There should be 32 partial PHY trames, where each PHY trame has 8 RS- FEG trames.         Proposed Response       Response Status       O         Cit 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P33       L49         Yehn < condition' should not be followed by 'then'. 'Then' is used after 'it'.       Also in 165.4.2.4.6 and 165.4.2.4.7.       SuggestedRemedy         Comment Type       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR         Comment Type       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR         SuggestedRemedy       Change 16 to 32.       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR         Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       P34       L50         Cit 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # [843]         Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR         Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       E       Comment Type TR         Comment Type TR       Comment Type TR       Comment Type	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.3	P 93	L <b>9</b>	# 776	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.4.6	6 P94	L <b>51</b>	# 777
There should be 32 partial PHY frames per PHY frame, where each PHY frame has 8 RS-FEC frames.         Suggested/Remedy         Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11         Proposed Response       Response Status 0         C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P93       L49       552         C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Ran, Adee       Cisco       C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Ran, Adee       Cisco       C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Rin, Adee       Cisco       C// 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Rin, Adee       Cisco       Comment Type       The DataSwFFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16.       Suggested/Remedy         Suggested/Remedy       Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If"       Proposed Response       Response Status 0       C// 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L50       # 686         C// 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # 643       Comment Type       The DataSwFFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwFFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwFFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwFFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value	Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Jonsson, F	Ragnar	Marvell		
FEC frames.       FEC frames.         Suggested/Remedy       Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16 to 32 in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11         Proposed Response       Response Status 0         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P 33       L 49       # 552         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P 33       L 49       # 552         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 51       # arti         Ran, Adee       Cisco       Comment Status X       Tu, Mike       Broadcom         Comment Type       E       Comment Status X       The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16.       Suggested/Remedy         SuggestedRemedy       Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If"       Proposed Response       Response Status 0         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # 643         McClellan, Brett       Marvell       Comment Status X       O         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # 685         McClellan, Brett       Marvell       Comment Status X       Comment Status X       The L=8 superframe boundary."         The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiple of 32.       Vhen the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. the switch from PAM	Comment Type TR C	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		post-deadline
Change 16 to 32 in line 9, change 16 th to 32nd in line 10, and change 15 to 31 in line 11       Change 16 to 32.         Proposed Response       Response Status       O         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P93       L49       # 552         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P93       L49       # 552         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Ran, Adee       Cisco       Comment Type E       Comment Status X       The DataSwPFC24 should be a multiple of 32, not 16.         SuggestedRemedy       Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If"       Proposed Response       Response Status O         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # 643         McClellan, Brett       Marvell       Marvell       Comment Status X       The definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section         SuggestedRemedy       Change this cast to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."       C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L 50       # 686         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L 50       # 686       SuggestedRemedy       Comment Status X       The definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section       Suggest	•	PHY frames per PHY fran	ne, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-			al PHY frames per PHY fra	ame, where each	PHY frame has 8 RS-
Proposed Response       Response Status       O         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P93       L49       # 552         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L51       # 471         Ran, Adee       Cisco       Comment Status X       "When -condition' should not be followed by 'then'. 'Then' is used after 'if'.         Also in 165.4.2.4.6       and 165.4.2.4.7.       SuggestedRemedy       Change this sentence to:       "When 'condition' should not be followed by 'then'' to 'If'         Proposed Response       Response Status       O       Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # 643         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # 643       Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L50       # 886         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L50       # 643       Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L50       # 886         McCiellan, Brett       Marvell       Comment Type       R Comment Status X       The definition of timing-tock should be moved to this section       SuggestedRemedy         "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of	SuggestedRemedy				Suggestea	lRemedy			
Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.5       P93       L49       # 552         Ran, Adee       Cisco       Cisco       Broadcom         Comment Type       E       Comment Status X       "When -condition" should not be followed by "then". "Then" is used after "if".         Also in 165.4.2.4.6       and 165.4.2.4.7.       SuggestedRemedy       Change this sentence to:       "When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."         Proposed Response       Response Status O       Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.0       P95       L50       # 686         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.0       P95       L50       # 686         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L50       # 686         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P95       L50       # 686         Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza       Marvel         Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X       The DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32.	Change 16 to 32 in line 9, c	hange 16th to 32nd in line	e 10, and chang	e 15 to 31 in line 11	Chang	e 16 to 32.			
Ran, Ade Cisco Comment Type E Comment Status X "When <condition" "if".<br="" "then"="" "then".="" after="" be="" by="" followed="" is="" not="" should="" used="">Also in 165.4.2.4.6 and 165.4.2.4.7. Suggested/Remedy Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If" Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 "Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 "Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.0 P95 L50 # 686 Comment Type TR Comment Status X "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a DHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 superframe boundary." Suggested/Remedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Proposed Response Response Status O</condition">	Proposed Response R	esponse Status O			Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
Comment Type E Comment Status X "When <condition" "if".<br="" "then"="" "then".="" after="" be="" by="" followed="" is="" not="" should="" used="">Also in 165.4.2.4.6 and 165.4.2.4.7. SuggestedRemedy Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If" Proposed Response Response Status 0 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 McClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Status X "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 13 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." Proposed Remedy Change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 superframe boundary." SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 superframe boundary." Proposed Response Response Status 0 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 686 Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza Marvel Comment Type E Comment Status X the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer m</condition">	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.5	P <b>93</b>	L <b>49</b>	# 552	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.4.6	6 P <b>94</b>	L 51	# 471
"When < condition" should not be followed by "then". "Then" is used after "if".	Ran, Adee	Cisco			Tu, Mike		Broadcom		
Also in 165.4.2.4.6 and 165.4.2.4.7. SuggestedRemedy Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If" Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 686 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 68	Comment Type E C	Comment Status X			Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		
Also In 103.4.2.4.8 and 103.4.2.4.7. SuggestedRemedy Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If" Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 686 C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 68	"When <condition" r<="" should="" td=""><td>not be followed by "then".</td><td>"Then" is used a</td><td>after "if".</td><td>The Da</td><td>ataSwPFC24 shou</td><td>uld be a multiple of 32, not</td><td>16.</td><td></td></condition">	not be followed by "then".	"Then" is used a	after "if".	The Da	ataSwPFC24 shou	uld be a multiple of 32, not	16.	
SuggestedRemedy       Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If"       Change this sentence to: "When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."         Proposed Response       Response Status <b>0</b> Point frame boundary."         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # 643         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # 643         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # 643         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # 686         McClellan, Brett       Marvell       Marvel       Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X       * DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."       The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."       SuggestedRemedy       move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1."       Proposed Response       Response Status <b>0</b>	Also in 165 / 2 / 6 and 165	4247			Suggestea	IRemedy			
Delete "then" in these 3 places, or change "When" to "If" Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6 P94 L50 # 643 McClellan, Brett Marvell Comment Type TR Comment Status X "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10 P95 L50 # 686 Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza Marvel Comment Type E Comment Status X the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."		.4.2.4.7.							
Proposed Response       Response Status       O         Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P94       L 50       # 643         McClellan, Brett       Marvell       Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # 686         Comment Type       TR       Comment Status       X       Marvell       Comment Status       X       Marvel       Comment Status       X       Marvel       Comment Type       E       Comment Status       X       Marvel       Marvel       Comment Type       E       Comment Status       X       Marvel       Marvel       Comment Type       E       Comment Type       E       Comment Status       X       Marvel       Marvel       Marvel       Marvel       Marvel       Marvel       Com		ces or change "When" to	\"If"					32 the switch fror	n PAM2 to PAM4
Cl 165       SC 165.4.2.4.6       P 94       L 50       # 643         McClellan, Brett       Marvell         Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X         "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary."       C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # 686         SuggestedRemedy       Change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."       C/ 165       SC 165.4.2.4.10       P 95       L 50       # 686         Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza       Marvel       Comment Type       E       Comment Status X       the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section         SuggestedRemedy       move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1."         Proposed Response       Response Status       O		, Ç							
McClellan, Brett       Marvell         Comment Type       TR       Comment Status X         "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32.       Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza       Marvel         SuggestedRemedy       Comment Status V       Rezavi Majomard, Seid Alireza       Marvel         SuggestedRemedy       Nove these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1."       Proposed Response       Response Status       O					Toposeu	Response			
Comment Type TR Comment Status X "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Comment Type E Comment Status X the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." Comment Type E Comment Status X the definition of timing-lock should be moved to this section SuggestedRemedy move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : "In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1." Proposed Response Response Status O	C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.6	P 94	L <b>50</b>	# 643	C/ 165	SC 165.4.2.4.1	0 P95	L <b>50</b>	# 686
"DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."	McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Razavi Ma	ijomard, Seid Alire	za Marvel		
is a multiple of 16 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a PHY frame boundary." The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status <b>0</b>	Comment Type TR C	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
The L=8 superframe boundary is at multiples of 32. SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." SuggestedRemedy move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1." Proposed Response Response Status <b>0</b>					the de	finition of timing-lo	ck should be moved to this	s section	
SuggestedRemedy change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary." move these lines from line 30-32 of clause 165.4.4.1 to line 50 of clause 165.4.2.4.10 : " In the TRAINING state, whenever SLAVE operating in loop timing locks the MASTER timing reference, it sets timing_lock_OK=1." Proposed Response Response Status <b>0</b>			curs on a PHY	frame boundary."	Suggestea	lRemedy			
change text to: "DataSwPFC24 shall be set to an integer multiple of 32. When the value of DataSwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 superframe boundary."	•	,							
DataŠwPFC24 is a multiple of 32 the switch from PAM2 to PAM4 occurs on a L=8 Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>		C24 shall be set to an inte	eger multiple of	32. When the value of				n loop timing lock	is the MASTER timing
Proposed Response Response Status O	DataSwPFC24 is a multiple					-			
	Proposed Response R	esponse Status <b>O</b>							

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.4.10

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2	2.4.10	P 96	L <b>5</b>	# 553	C/ 165 SC	C 165.4.2.4.	10	P 96	L18	# 688
Ran, Adee		Cisco			Razavi Majoma	ard, Seid Alire	eza I	Marvel		
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment	Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment St	tatus X		
Some values in Tab	0			, I	The 40ms f	or half-duple	ex is too long.			
expressions are use like ranges on first re	,	s are not easier	r to understand t	his way. Also, they look	SuggestedRem	edy				
Ū	Ū				change 40n	ns to 30ms				
Also in Table 165-10	D.				Proposed Resp	onse	Response Sta	atus <b>O</b>		
SuggestedRemedy							·			
Change the express	sions to what the	y evaluate to. A	dd explanation i	n the text if necessary.				Dee		" 740
Proposed Response	Response	Status O				C 165.4.2.4.	-	P <b>96</b>	L18	# 749
					Jonsson, Ragna			Marvell		
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2	2.4.10	P 96	L <b>5</b>	# 687	Comment Type		Comment St		a long it abouid	post-deadli
Razavi Majomard, Seid		Marvel	-•			,	an-ouplex trans	mission is to	o long. It should	be changed to 30ms.
Comment Type T					SuggestedRem					
Comment Type <b>T</b> The 40ms for half-du	Comment	Status X			change 40n	ns to 30ms				
The 40ms for half-du	Comment	Status X			00	ns to 30ms	Response Sta	atus <b>O</b>		
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy	<i>Comment</i> uplex is too long	Status X			change 40n	ns to 30ms	Response Sta	atus <b>O</b>		
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r	<i>Comment</i> uplex is too long ns	Status X			change 40n Proposed Resp	ns to 30ms	Response Sta	atus <b>O</b> P <b>96</b>	L 53	# 554
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy	<i>Comment</i> uplex is too long	Status X			change 40n Proposed Resp	ns to 30ms oonse			L 53	# 554
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response	Comment uplex is too long ns Response	Status X			change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC	ns to 30ms conse C 165.4.2.6		P <b>96</b> Cisco	L 53	# 554
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response	Comment uplex is too long ns Response	Status X	L 5	# 1748	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type	ns to 30ms conse C 165.4.2.6 T	,	P <b>96</b> Cisco tatus <b>X</b>		# 554
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response	Comment uplex is too long ns Response	Status X	L 5	# [ <u>748</u> ]	Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque	C 165.4.2.6 T ency of the S	Comment St END_S signal s	P <b>96</b> Cisco tatus <b>X</b> shall be 703.	125 MHz"	
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response CI 165 SC 165.4.2 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR	Comment uplex is too long ns Response 2.4.10 Comment	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X		post-deadline	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl	ns to 30ms conse C 165.4.2.6 T ency of the S ly the nomina	Comment St END_S signal s	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom	125 MHz"	# <u>554</u> f the clock driving the
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response CI 165 SC 165.4.2 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR	Comment uplex is too long ns Response 2.4.10 Comment	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X			change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 Sc Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl "signal" (wh	T ency of the S ly the nomination we typica	Comment St END_S signal s al signaling rate ally call "patterr	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom n").	125 MHz" inal frequency of	
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response CI 165 SC 165.4.2 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR	Comment uplex is too long ns Response 2.4.10 Comment	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X		post-deadline	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl "signal" (wh The frequer	T C 165.4.2.6 T ency of the S ly the nomination we typication ncy can be w	Comment St END_S signal s al signaling rate	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom n").	125 MHz" inal frequency of	
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.4.2 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR The 40ms mandator	Comment uplex is too long ms <i>Response</i> 2.4.10 <i>Comment</i> ry half-duplex tra	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X		post-deadline	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl "signal" (wh The frequer SuggestedRem	T C 165.4.2.6 T ency of the S ly the nomina nich we typica ncy can be w redy	Comment St END_S signal s al signaling rate ally call "patterr vithin the range	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom n"). defined in 16	125 MHz" inal frequency of 55.5.3.6.	f the clock driving the
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.4.3 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR The 40ms mandator SuggestedRemedy	Comment uplex is too long ms <i>Response</i> 2.4.10 <i>Comment</i> ry half-duplex tra	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X nsmission is too		post-deadline	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl "signal" (wh The frequer SuggestedRem	T ency of the S ly the nomina- nich we typica- ncy can be w redy ne frequency	Comment St END_S signal s al signaling rate ally call "patterr vithin the range	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom n"). defined in 16	125 MHz" inal frequency of 55.5.3.6.	
The 40ms for half-du SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.4.1 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type TR The 40ms mandator SuggestedRemedy change 40ms to 30r	Comment uplex is too long ns <i>Response</i> 2.4.10 <i>Comment</i> ry half-duplex tra ns	Status X Status O P96 Marvell Status X nsmission is too		post-deadline	change 40n Proposed Resp Cl 165 SC Ran, Adee Comment Type "The freque It is probabl "signal" (wh The frequer SuggestedRem Change "Th the SEND_	T c 165.4.2.6 T ency of the S ly the nomina- nich we typica- ncy can be w wedy ne frequency S signal is".	Comment St END_S signal s al signaling rate ally call "patterr vithin the range	P 96 Cisco tatus X shall be 703. e, or the nom n"). defined in 16 S signal shall	125 MHz" inal frequency of 55.5.3.6.	f the clock driving the

C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.6

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

<u></u>				
C/ 165 SC 165.4.2.6	6.1 <i>P</i> 98	L <b>21</b>	# 432	C/ 165 SC 165.4.3.1 P101 L 33 # 644
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motors	5		McClellan, Brett Marvell
Comment Type E 98.5.1 is in the draft	Comment Status X			Comment Type E Comment Status X typo
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy
Change "98.5.1" to bla Also P98L24, P98L27	ack and make it a hyperlink.			change 'quietre' to 'quiet' Proposed Response Response Status O
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
C/ 165 SC 165.4.3	P 101	L15	# 555	C/ 165 SC 165.4.3.1 P101 L 34 # 750
Ran, Adee	Cisco	210	<i>"</i> 333	Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment Type E Comment Status X post-deadli
	uses are gratuitous content and	a burden for r	eaders.	Misspelling of "refresh" in QR
16E 4 2 1 is not referre		d has and nor	motivo roquiromont	SuggestedRemedy
	ed to by any other subclause, ar (which includes normative requi			Change "quietre fresh signalling" to "quiet refresh signalling" Proposed Response Response Status O
	native requirements and is also	not referred to	by any other	Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
subclause.				Cl 165 SC 165.4.3.1 P108 L 35 # 599
SuggestedRemedy				Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
Delete 165.4.3 and its	subclauses, or move the conte	nt to an inform	ative annex.	Comment Type E Comment Status X
Alternatively, if there is specification) it should	s something to write about the N	/IDI (e.g. mech	anical connnector	A note was dropped during comment resolution for draft 1.2. This note is probably unnecessary, but a possible text for the note is suggested.
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			SuggestedRemedy
				If the note is needed, the suggested text for the note is: NOTE – the receiver can be expected to ignore the first 150 ns following a transition to quiet refresh signaling.
		L33	# 433	Proposed Response Response Status O
C/ 165 SC 165.4.3.1	1 P101	L 33	# 433	
Cl 165 SC 165.4.3.1 Wienckowski, Natalie	1 P 101 General Motors		# 433	
Wienckowski, Natalie			# 433	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E typo SuggestedRemedy	General Motors Comment Status X		# 433	
Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type E typo SuggestedRemedy Change: During training	General Motors		π 433	

C/ 165 SC 165.4.3.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.4.4.1 P103 L29 # 685	C/ 165 SC 165.5 P107 L1 # 556
Razavi Majomard, Seid Alireza Marvel	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type E Comment Status X	Comment Type E Comment Status X
timing-lock_OK is not mentioned in the state diagram	Shouldn't PMA electrical specifications be under the PMA main subclause (165.4)?
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
line 30-32 from clause 165.4.4.1 should be moved to clause 165.4.2.4.10 startup	Consider moving the hierarchy of 165.5 to become 165.4.6.
sequence, page 95, line 50	Proposed Response Response Status O
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	
	C/ 165 SC 165.5.1 P107 L5 # 557
C/ 165 SC 165.4.4.1 P103 L 30 # 645	Ran, Adee Cisco
AcClellan, Brett Marvell	Comment Type T Comment Status X
Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b> timing_lock_OK is defined but never used as a state machine variable	Test modes are functional specifications, and should be defined under 165.4.2.2 (they override the normal transmit functionality defined there).
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
delete definition for timing_lock_OK	Move 165.5.1 to become 165.4.2.2.2.
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	Add a reference to the test modes to 165.4.2.2 (which currently only has normal operation mode or transmit zero).
	$\neg$ Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
C/ 165 SC 165.4.5 P106 L23 # 659	
Nu, Peter Marvell	C/ 165 SC 165.5.1 P107 L37 # 558
Comment Type E Comment Status X _mGigT1 should be replaced with_25GigT1	
	Ran, Adee Cisco Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b>
NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_mGigT1 and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram	" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol clock or TX_TCLK_879"
NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_mGigT1 and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented> NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_25GigT1 and	" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol
NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_mGigT1 and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented> NOTE—The	" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol clock or TX_TCLK_879"
NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_mGigT1 and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented> NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_25GigT1 and link_status_25GigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented.	" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol clock or TX_TCLK_879" "reduced version" and "or" are unclear.
NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_mGigT1 and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented> NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_25GigT1 and link_status_25GigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented.	<ul> <li>" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol clock or TX_TCLK_879"</li> <li>"reduced version" and "or" are unclear.</li> <li>"TX_TCLK_879 is equal to 878.90625 MHz"</li> <li>A clock is not equal to its frequency. And this is and exact value with no tolerance.</li> </ul>
and link_status_mGigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented> NOTE—The variables link_control and link_status are designated as link_control_25GigT1 and link_status_25GigT1, respectively, by the Auto-Negotiation Arbitration state diagram (Figure 98–7) if the optional Auto-Negotiation function is implemented.	" the PHY shall provide access to a frequency reduced version of the transmit symbol clock or TX_TCLK_879" "reduced version" and "or" are unclear. "TX_TCLK_879 is equal to 878.90625 MHz"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/gener	al required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 165	Page 51 of 71
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn	SC 165.5.1	8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line			

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 16	.5.1	P 107	L 38	# 515	C/ 165	SC 16	5.5.1.1	P 108	L14	# 560
Grow, Robert		RMG Conslut	ting		Ran, Ade	е		Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comm	ent Status X			Comment	Туре Т		Comment Status X		
IEEE Style Manu point.	al 16.3.2 also s	ays to use space se	eparators to the	right of the decimal	measi	urement in	struments	test setups of transmitter . These are not test fixture	es - which are so	ometimes part of test
SuggestedRemedy If not changed to	0.878 906 25 G	Hz, should be 878	.906 25 MHz.					igure 97B–2, Figure 97B– in 165.5.5.	-3, Figure 93–5).	This clause actually
Proposed Response		nse Status O				d the uses tuated.	of "test fix	kture" in this context in cla	ause 149, but this	s error should not be
					Suggestee	dRemedy				
C/ 165 SC 16	.5.1	P <b>108</b> Cisco	L <b>8</b>	# 559	Chang figure		clause title	e to "Test setups" and cha	ange "fixture" to '	'setup" in the text and
Ran, Adee <i>Comment Type</i> <b>1</b>	0	ent Status X			Proposed	Response	F	Response Status <b>O</b>		
the RS-FEC bloc once, not as the Also, when perfo	n the remainder k error ratio (rfe number of nonz rming such a te mode is define	r), not the BER; ea ero bits. st, here are typicall d for a transmitter i	ch errored block y two PHYs invo		Suggestee	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ata commu <i>dRemedy</i> clarify wha	nication o	P 108 Cisco Comment Status X nly" - unclear. As oppose s, or delete this phrase. Response Status O	L 18 d to what?	# <u>561</u>
SuggestedRemedy										
in a link betweer	or enabling mea two PHYs, inclu		oder and decode	or ratio of a link partner r, transmit and receive	<i>Cl</i> <b>165</b> Ran, Adee			P <b>109</b> Cisco	L <b>3</b>	# 562
Proposed Response	Respor	nse Status O			<i>Comment</i> Why i			Comment Status X r measuring transmitter jit	tter?	
					one; if		ants to us	5-30 seems sufficient, an e a single-ended scope th setup.		

SuggestedRemedy

Delete figure 153-32 and add " and jitter" to the title of figure 165-30.

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

C/ 165 SC 165.5.1.1

C/ 165 SC 165.5.1.	.1 <i>P</i> 109	L11	# 354	C/ 165	SC 165.5.2	P110	L <b>1</b>	# 751
Fischer, Peter	BKS Kabel-Se	ervice AG		Jonsson,	Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment		Comment Status X		post-deadline
Output of the balun sl	hould be specified				ence to laning is 00Gbps.	probably obsoleted, given the	at 802.3cy no loi	nger supports 50Gbps
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	•			
Define output impeda	ance for the balun in relation to	the digital scope	e/ capturing device	•••	ove reference to I	aning		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>				Response			
				Fioposeu	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.5.1.	.1 P109	L19	# 355					
Fischer, Peter	BKS Kabel-Se	ervice AG		C/ 165	SC 165.5.2	P <b>110</b>	L1	# 435
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X				vski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Output of the balun sl	hould be specified			Comment	21	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy						he subscript "i" in the text.		
Dofino output impode	waa fan tha halve in valatien te	4h a C a a 4m		Sugaester	dRemedy			
Denne output impeda	ance for the balun in relation to	the Spectrum a	nalyser		-			
	Response Status O	the Spectrum a	nalyser	Chang negati lane (l	ge: Note that the ive sides of the t DL) signals DLi<	source lane (SL) signals SL ansmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv l pair on lane i.</n>	gnal pair on lan	e i and the destination
Proposed Response	Response Status O	L 41	# 434	Chang negati lane (l end's To: N	ge: Note that the ive sides of the tr DL) signals DLi< differential signa lote that the sour	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv I pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative
Proposed Response	Response Status O	L 41		Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides	ge: Note that the ive sides of the ti DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sour of the transmitte	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv l pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ttion lane (DL) signals
Proposed Response	Response Status 0 P109	L 41		Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides	ge: Note that the ive sides of the ti DL) signals DLi< differential signa lote that the sour of the transmitte > and DL <n> are</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv I pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ttion lane (DL) signals
Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.5.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T	Response Status O P109 General Moto	L 41		Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides DL <p signal</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the ti DL) signals DLi< differential signa lote that the sour of the transmitte > and DL <n> are</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv l pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ttion lane (DL) signals
Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.5.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T	Response Status O P109 General Moto Comment Status X	L 41	·	Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides DL <p signal</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the tr DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sour of the transmitte > and DL <n> are l pair.</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv I pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair the positive and negative sig</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ttion lane (DL) signals
Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.5.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T As only 1 pair is used SuggestedRemedy In Figure 165-34, rem	Response Status O P109 General Moto Comment Status X	L 41 ors the lines.	# [ <u>434</u>	Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides DL <p signal</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the tr DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sour of the transmitte > and DL <n> are l pair.</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv I pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair the positive and negative sig</n>	gnal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ttion lane (DL) signals
Proposed Response	Response Status O P109 General Moto Comment Status X d, we don't need a subscript on nove subscript "i" from SL, S	L 41 ors the lines.	# [ <u>434</u>	Chang negati lane (i end's To: N sides DL <p signal Proposed</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the tr DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sour of the transmitte > and DL <n> are pair. Response</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv I pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair the positive and negative sic <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b></n>	ignal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina les of the receiv</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ation lane (DL) signals er end's differential
Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.5.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T As only 1 pair is used SuggestedRemedy In Figure 165-34, rem and DL <n>.</n>	Response Status O P109 General Moto Comment Status X d, we don't need a subscript on	L 41 ors the lines.	# [ <u>434</u>	Chang negati lane (i end's To: N sides DL <p signal Proposed</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the tr DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sour of the transmitte and DL <n> are pair. <i>Response</i> SC 165.5.2 vski, Natalie <i>Type</i> E</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv l pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair the positive and negative sic <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i>115</n>	ignal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina les of the receiv</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ation lane (DL) signals er end's differential
Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.5.2 Wienckowski, Natalie Comment Type T As only 1 pair is used SuggestedRemedy In Figure 165-34, rem	Response Status O P109 General Moto Comment Status X d, we don't need a subscript on nove subscript "i" from SL, S	L 41 ors the lines.	# [ <u>434</u>	Chang negati lane (l end's To: N sides DL <p signal Proposed Cl 165 Wienckow Comment gramm Suggested Chang</p 	ge: Note that the ive sides of the ti DL) signals DLi< differential signal lote that the sourd of the transmitte and DL <n> are pair. <i>Response</i> SC 165.5.2 vski, Natalie <i>Type</i> E mar</n>	ransmitter end's differential s p> and DLi <n> are the positiv l pair on lane i. ce lane (SL) signals SL a r end's differential signal pair the positive and negative sic <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i>115 General Moto</n>	ignal pair on lan ve and negative and SL <n> are th and the destina les of the receiv</n>	e i and the destination sides of the receiver he positive and negative ation lane (DL) signals er end's differential

C/ 165 SC 165.5.2 Page 53 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.5.2	P <b>117</b>	L <b>25</b>	# 438	C/ 165	SC 165.5.3	P 110	L 26	# 565
Vienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors		Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Typ	be T	Comment Status X		
Clause 45 is in the d	aft.			"The elec	trical input sh	all be AC-coupled"		
SuggestedRemedy Change "Clause 45"	to black and make it a hyperlin	k.		A transm and outpu		y output, but this is a full-dup	olex PHY so ther	e are no separate input
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			SuggestedRe	medy			
				Change t	he quoted phr	ase to "The transmitter shall	be AC-coupled"	
C/ 165 SC 165.5.3	P110	L	# 569	Proposed Re	sponse	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Ran, Adee	Cisco							
Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X			C/ 165	SC 165.5.3	P110	L 33	# 566
	ransmitter operating above 14			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
	est 30 dB at the Nyquist frequent or specification for transmitter e			Comment Typ "A mated		Comment Status X ir has been included in the tr	ransmitter specif	cations defined in this
time, and no option of In high-speed backpl among the important high-loss channel ca easily handled by the addition to placing ur power and area to im SuggestedRemedy Consider adding a sp can be 60 ps for 20%	ar specification for transmitter e ane and copper cable PHYs, tr Tx parameters; without specify in create a large precursor ISI a analog front end, and can imp inecessary equalization burder plement Tx equalization than F pecification for transmitter maxi to 80%, as in 130.7.1, or may ecursor equalization function to	qualization (pre- ransition time an <i>v</i> ing them, a slow at the receiver inp act the linearity on receivers (it Rx equalization). mum transition to be lower).	-emphasis). Ind Tx equalization are w transmitter over a put. Such ISI is not of receiver circuits, in t is much cheaper in time (a possible limit	"A mated subclause Which co Also in Ta SuggestedRe Clarify. Proposed Re	connector pa e." nnector is tha able 165-12. <i>medy</i> sponse	ir has been included in the tr t? The MDI connector is not <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	specified.	
time, and no option of In high-speed backpl among the important high-loss channel ca easily handled by the addition to placing ur power and area to im SuggestedRemedy Consider adding a sp can be 60 ps for 20% Consider adding a pr example of how this	ar specification for transmitter e ane and copper cable PHYs, tr Tx parameters; without specify n create a large precursor ISI a e analog front end, and can imp necessary equalization burder plement Tx equalization than F pecification for transmitter maxi to 80%, as in 130.7.1, or may ecursor equalization function to can be specified.	qualization (pre- ransition time an <i>v</i> ing them, a slow at the receiver inp act the linearity on receivers (it Rx equalization). mum transition to be lower).	-emphasis). Ind Tx equalization are w transmitter over a put. Such ISI is not of receiver circuits, in t is much cheaper in time (a possible limit	"A mated subclause Which co Also in Ta SuggestedRe Clarify. Proposed Re Cl 165	connector pa e." nnector is tha able 165-12. <i>medy</i> sponse SC <b>165.5.3</b>	ir has been included in the tr t? The MDI connector is not <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 110	·	cations defined in this
time, and no option of In high-speed backpl among the important high-loss channel ca easily handled by the addition to placing ur power and area to im SuggestedRemedy Consider adding a sp can be 60 ps for 20% Consider adding a pr example of how this	ar specification for transmitter e ane and copper cable PHYs, tr Tx parameters; without specify in create a large precursor ISI a analog front end, and can imp inecessary equalization burder plement Tx equalization than F pecification for transmitter maxi to 80%, as in 130.7.1, or may ecursor equalization function to	qualization (pre- ransition time an <i>v</i> ing them, a slow at the receiver inp act the linearity on receivers (it Rx equalization). mum transition to be lower).	-emphasis). Ind Tx equalization are w transmitter over a put. Such ISI is not of receiver circuits, in t is much cheaper in time (a possible limit	"A mated subclause Which co Also in Ta SuggestedRe Clarify. Proposed Res Cl 165 Jonsson, Rag Comment Typ	connector pa e." nnector is tha able 165-12. <i>medy</i> sponse SC <b>165.5.3</b> gnar be <b>E</b>	ir has been included in the tr t? The MDI connector is not <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	specified.	# 752
time, and no option of In high-speed backpl among the important high-loss channel ca easily handled by the addition to placing ur power and area to im SuggestedRemedy Consider adding a sp can be 60 ps for 20%	ar specification for transmitter e ane and copper cable PHYs, tr Tx parameters; without specify n create a large precursor ISI a e analog front end, and can imp necessary equalization burder plement Tx equalization than F pecification for transmitter maxi to 80%, as in 130.7.1, or may ecursor equalization function to can be specified.	qualization (pre- ransition time an <i>v</i> ing them, a slow at the receiver inp act the linearity on receivers (it Rx equalization). mum transition to be lower).	-emphasis). Ind Tx equalization are w transmitter over a put. Such ISI is not of receiver circuits, in t is much cheaper in time (a possible limit	"A mated subclause Which co Also in Ta SuggestedRe Clarify. Proposed Re Cl 165 Jonsson, Rag Comment Tyµ The singl SuggestedRe	connector pa e." nnector is tha able 165-12. <i>medy</i> sponse SC 165.5.3 gnar be E e sentence pa <i>medy</i>	ir has been included in the tr t? The MDI connector is not Response Status <b>O</b> P110 Marvell Comment Status <b>X</b>	specified.	# <u>752</u> post-deadlin

C/ 165 SC 165.5.3

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 165 SC 165.5.3.2 P110 L5 # 563	C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.6 P110 L37 # 567
Ran, Adee Cisco	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type T Comment Status X	Comment Type T Comment Status X
"SNDR distortion" - the "D" in SNDR stands for distortion.	Is there no specification for the Tx clock frequency of the SLAVE PHY?
SuggestedRemedy Delete "distortion". Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	At the minimum, the short-term rate of variation of the SLAVE transmitter when the MASTER is in LPI mode should be specified - just as it is specified for the MASTER (and for similar reasons) - likely, the same maximum rate can be used.
	It may also be helpful to state that when the master is not in LPI transmit mode, the SLAVE PHY frequency is equal to that of the MASTER due to loop timing.
C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.3 P110 L25 # 564	SuggestedRemedy
Ran, Adee Cisco	Per comment
Comment Type T Comment Status X "Time Interval Error" - capitalization is not needed.	Proposed Response Response Status O
Also in 165.5.3.3.1 (line 36).	C/ 165 SC 165.5.4.1 P110 L52 # 568
Suggested Remedy	Ran, Adee Cisco
Change to lower case.	Comment Type T Comment Status X
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals
	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and
C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.4 P112 L25 # 459	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals
C/ 165 SC 165.5.3.4 P112 L 25 # 459 John Abbott Corning Incorporated	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value.
C/         165         SC         165.5.3.4         P 112         L 25         # 459           Iohn Abbott         Corning Incorporated	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value. Change "shall be received" to "are expected to be decoded".
C/ 165       SC 165.5.3.4       P 112       L 25       # 459         Iohn Abbott       Corning Incorporated         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         In comparing equations 165-12 and 165-13 to clause 149, it seems to me that the low frequency limit "5" in equation 165-13 should scale as one goes from 2.5 to 5 to 10 to 25Gb/s, since every other limit in clause 165 is the 149 limits x 2.5 (i.e. 25Gb/s = 2.5 10Gb/s). However, "5" was used in clause 149 for 2.5,5,10.	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value. Change "shall be received" to "are expected to be decoded". Proposed Response Response Status <b>Q</b>
Cl 165       SC 165.5.3.4       P112       L 25       # 459         John Abbott       Corning Incorporated         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         In comparing equations 165-12 and 165-13 to clause 149, it seems to me that the low frequency limit "5" in equation 165-13 should scale as one goes from 2.5 to 5 to 10 to 25Gb/s, since every other limit in clause 165 is the 149 limits x 2.5 (i.e. 25Gb/s = 2.5 10Gb/s). However, "5" was used in clause 149 for 2.5,5,10.	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value. Change "shall be received" to "are expected to be decoded". Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
C/       165       SC 165.5.3.4       P112       L 25       # 459         John Abbott       Corning Incorporated         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         In comparing equations 165-12 and 165-13 to clause 149, it seems to me that the low frequency limit "5" in equation 165-13 should scale as one goes from 2.5 to 5 to 10 to 25Gb/s, since every other limit in clause 165 is the 149 limits x 2.5 (i.e. 25Gb/s = 2.5 10Gb/s). However, "5" was used in clause 149 for 2.5,5,10.         SuggestedRemedy       scale "5 MHz" in 165-13 if appropriate. Thank you!	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value. Change "shall be received" to "are expected to be decoded". Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 165 SC 165.5.4.2 P114 L19 # 472
C/       165       SC 165.5.3.4       P112       L 25       # 459         John Abbott       Corning Incorporated         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         In comparing equations 165-12 and 165-13 to clause 149, it seems to me that the low frequency limit "5" in equation 165-13 should scale as one goes from 2.5 to 5 to 10 to 25Gb/s, since every other limit in clause 165 is the 149 limits x 2.5 (i.e. 25Gb/s = 2.5 10Gb/s). However, "5" was used in clause 149 for 2.5,5,10.         SuggestedRemedy       scale "5 MHz" in 165-13 if appropriate. Thank you!	BER can't be 1e-12 after RS-FEC decoding (As stated in some other comments), and especially it can't be a "shall" on the receiver's input signals Also in 165.5.4.2. SuggestedRemedy Change BER to RS-FEC frame error rate, with the appropriate value. Change "shall be received" to "are expected to be decoded". Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 165 SC 165.5.4.2 P114 L 19 # 472 Simms, Bill NVIDIA Comment Type E Comment Status X

Page 55 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

165 SC 165.5	5.4.2 P114	L <b>30</b>	# 510	C/ 165	SC 165.5.5.1	P114	L <b>50</b>	# 779
edarat, Hossein	Ethernovia			Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marvell		
omment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		post-deadline
802.3cy where the	evel and bandwidth are taken fron signaling bandwidth is 2.5x wider		and are not correct for		to include this mu	meaning in multiplying with th ultiplication in the coefficients of		
IggestedRemedy	place 2500 Mile with 8750 Mile	( 2500*2 5) and	d rankaaa 152 dDm/Uz	Suggested	,			
	eplace 3500 MHz with 8750 MHz (to maintain the same noise powe					30480, 0.51054 to 0.17018, an	d remove "x0	.3334" in equation (165-
oposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		,		ame change shou	uld be made to equation (165-		
				Proposed	Response	Response Status O		
165 SC 165.5	5.5 P114	L <b>35</b>	# 780					
Minico, Christopher	MC Commun	ications		C/ 165	SC 165.5.5.1	P115	L3	# 436
omment Type T	Comment Status X		post-deadline	Wienckow	ski, Natalie	General Motors		
	e specifications should have same				,			
	onsistent with what's tested. The			Comment	51	Comment Status X		
	z =f</=10000 MHz) and the link</th <td></td> <th></th> <td>awkwa</td> <td>ard working</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>			awkwa	ard working			
	erefore the test fixture specificatio MHz based on D2.0. This range v			Suggested	IRemedy			
	erefore I suggest keeping the min			Chano	e: The reference	e insertion loss of the TP2 or T	P3 test fixture	es
	.5.5.2 for all test fixture specificati					rtion loss at TP2 or TP3 of the		-
	address the test fixture minimum		max frequency should	Proposed		Response Status 0		
lggestedRemedy								
In 165 5 5 2 1 Inor	rtion loss equation(165–17) and (	(165 19) obongo	min fraguanay to 1	C/ 165	SC 165.5.5.2	P115	L <b>32</b>	# 753
MHz.		(105–16) change	i min nequency to 1	Jonsson, I	0	Marvell		
	urn loss equation(165–20)change	min frequency t	o 1 MHz also include	Comment	Type E	Comment Status X		post-deadline
In 165.5.5.3.3 Mod	this subclause line 10. le Conversion equation(165–21)c					entical to (165-15), apart from s the spec to define only one "tfr		stfref" instead of "htfref".
	sstalk equation(165–22)change m	nin frequency to	1 MHZ.	Suggested	IRemedy			
oposed Response	Response Status O			Elimin	ate equation (165	5-16) and change "htfref" in equ	uation (165-1	5) to "tfref"
				Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
				•				

C/ 165 SC 165.5.5.2

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7	P 118	L <b>4</b>	# 570	C/ 165 SC	165.7.1.1	P 118	L18	# 571
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type	Е	Comment Status X		
	ays "single shielded balanced paed, balanced conductors".	air of conductors'	', the second says	In equation 1 equation; f_N		defined "in MHz", so there i fined.	is no need to hav	e "MHz" in the
Either use consisten	t language, or say it once.			SuggestedReme Changfe "f_N	,	n the equation.		
	ir that is shielded (not each con t saying because it is "pair", no		also balanced.	Proposed Respo	onse	Response Status 0		
Also, the term "link s SuggestedRemedy	egment" appears in the heading	g but not in the te	ext.	C/ 165 SC	165.7.1.1	P118	L <b>22</b>	# 460
Change the text to				John Abbott		Corning Inco	orporated	
Change the text to								
25GRASE T1 is door	igned to operate over link segm	onto compring a	shielded belenced pair	Comment Type	T	Comment Status X		
of conductors that m supports an effective	igned to operate over link segm eet the requirements specified a data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d	in this subclause rection simultane	. This link segment	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gb	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence	Comment Status X 5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1	)Gb/s and S would = 65 should have
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen	eet the requirements specified data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d nt pair" to "link segment" across	in this subclause rection simultane	. This link segment	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gb	g section 16 cy Fmax = b/s. Hence 000 = 10,00	5.7 in clause 165 to sectior 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1	)Gb/s and S would = 65 should have
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response	eet the requirements specified a data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	in this subclause rection simultane the draft.	. This link segment eously.	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gt Fmax=2.5*40 SuggestedReme Change 9000	g section 16 cy Fmax = b/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 edy 0 to 10,000	5.7 in clause 165 to sectior 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response	eet the requirements specified a data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	in this subclause rection simultane	. This link segment	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gt Fmax=2.5*40 SuggestedReme Change 9000 reason to us	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to sectior 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response	eet the requirements specified a data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	in this subclause rection simultane the draft.	. This link segment eously.	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gk Fmax=2.5*4( SuggestedReme Change 900( reason to us you!	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el ead of 10,000 maybe tha	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.7.1 Jonsson, Ragnar	eet the requirements specified data rate of 25 Gb/s in each d nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	in this subclause rection simultane the draft.	. This link segment eously.	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gk Fmax=2.5*4( SuggestedReme Change 900( reason to us you!	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el ead of 10,000 maybe tha	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.7.1 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type E The subscript "MHz"	eet the requirements specified e data rate of 25 Gb/s in each di nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> I.1 <i>P</i> 118 Marvell	in this subclause rection simultane s the draft. <i>L</i> <b>18</b> fons for "f" in this	. This link segment eously. # 754 post-deadline	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gk Fmax=2.5*4( SuggestedReme Change 900( reason to us you!	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el ead of 10,000 maybe tha	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.7.1 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type E The subscript "MHz"	eet the requirements specified data rate of 25 Gb/s in each di nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> I.1 <i>P</i> 118 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> is inconsistent with other notat	in this subclause rection simultane s the draft. <i>L</i> <b>18</b> fons for "f" in this	. This link segment eously. # 754 post-deadline	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gk Fmax=2.5*4( SuggestedReme Change 900( reason to us you!	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el ead of 10,000 maybe tha	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a
of conductors that m supports an effective Change "link segmen Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.7.1 Jonsson, Ragnar Comment Type E The subscript "MHz" inconsistent with line SuggestedRemedy	eet the requirements specified data rate of 25 Gb/s in each di nt pair" to "link segment" across <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> I.1 <i>P</i> 118 Marvell <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> is inconsistent with other notat	in this subclause rection simultane the draft. <i>L</i> <b>18</b> lons for "f" in this uation (165-23)	. This link segment eously. # 754 post-deadline	In comparing max frequen 2.5 for 25Gk Fmax=2.5*4( SuggestedReme Change 900( reason to us you!	g section 16 cy Fmax = o/s. Hence 000 = 10,00 dy 0 to 10,000 e 9000 inst	5.7 in clause 165 to section 4000*S (equation 149-17) clause 149 would lead one 00MHz., rather than 9000MI in section 165.7.1.1 and el ead of 10,000 maybe tha	where S=1 for 10 to think clause 1 Hz in equation 16 sewhere as appr	OGb/s and S would = 65 should have 55-23 and elsewhere. opriate (if there is a

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.1

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.1 P118 L27 # 572	Cl 165 SC 165.7.1.2 P119 L3 # 573
Ran, Adee Cisco	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type T Comment Status X	Comment Type T Comment Status X
"The insertion loss is illustrated in Figure 165–40"	The differential charateristic impedance should apply to the insertion loss specification, so it should appear before 165.7.1.1.
Figure 165-40 does not illustrate an insertion loss of any link segment. It illustrates the limit imposed by equation 165-23.	This statement does not need a standalone subclause, it can be added to 165.7.1.
	Also, the statement is repeated in 165.7.1.3.1.
Change the first sentence to "The insertion loss of a 25GBASE-T1 link segment shall meet Equation (165–23) as illustrated in Figure 165-40".	SuggestedRemedy
	Move the content of this subclause to 165.7.1 and delete this subclause heading.
In the figure add a label "meets equation constraints" above the curve, and change the title to "Link segment insertion loss limit".	Delete the sentence "The reference impedance for the return loss specification is 100 $\Omega$ " in 165.7.1.3.1.
Delete the quoted sentence.	Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
Proposed Response Response Status O	
	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3 P119 L5 # 574
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.1 P118 L Figure # 593	Ran, Adee Cisco
tephan Schreiner Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik	Comment Type E Comment Status X
Comment Type E Comment Status X X-Axes Grid is very dense.	The term "Return loss" is strictly adequate for the content of 165.7.1.3.1.
SuggestedRemedy Using a frequency step of 500 MHz for the grid instead of 250 MHz.	The other subclauses under 165.7.1.3 discuss parameters that are dependent on reflections as well as insertion loss between them, so they should not be grouped under "Return loss". This hierarchy should be flattened.
	SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response Response Status <b>0</b>	
	Delete the subclause heading of 165.7.1.3.1, merging its content into 165.7.1.3 "Return loss".

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3 Page 58 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3	1 <i>P</i> 119	L23	# 575	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P120 L1 # 755
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
Comment Type E Font size mismatch in " Also in 165.7.1.3.1 and	Comment Status X 30<=f<=9000".			Comment Type E Comment Status X post-deal the word "Noise" should not be captialized SuggestedRemedy
SuggestedRemedy Correct the font size				Change "Noise" to "noise".
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Proposed Response Response Status O
Cl 165 SC 165.7.1.3. Stephan Schreiner Comment Type E X-Axes grid starts at 1 M the X-Axis Grid is very of	Rosenberger Comment Status X //Hz, which is different to the	L Figure Hochfrequenzted figures before ar		Cl       165       SC       165.7.1.3.2       P 120       L 6       #       464         Hidaka, Yasuo       Credo Semiconductor, Inc.       Comment Type       E       Comment Status X       Missing caption of table 165-15.         SuggestedRemedy       SuggestedRemedy       SuggestedRemedy       SuggestedRemedy       SuggestedRemedy
SuggestedRemedy Start the frequency grid of 250 MHz	at 0 MHz and use a frequen	cy step of 500 M	Hz for the grid instead	Add a table caption such as "Parameters of echo metrics."Proposed ResponseResponse StatusO
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Cl 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P120 L6 # 392
SuggestedRemedy		<i>L</i> Figure Hochfrequenzted	# <u>595</u> chnik	Marris, Arthur       Cadence Design Systems         Comment Type       ER       Comment Status       X         XXX       SuggestedRemedy       Change name of "Table 165–15—XXX" to something more meaningful         Proposed Response       Response Status       O
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Cl 165       SC 165.7.1.3.2       P 120       L 6       # 579         Ran, Adee       Cisco         Comment Type       E       Comment Status X         The title of Table 165-15 seems like a placeholder.         SuggestedRemedy         Use an appropriate title.         Proposed Response       Response Status O

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 C/

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 Page 59 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3	3.2 P120	L <b>6</b>	# 439	C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P121 L13 # 582
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	S		Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E Comment Status X
The table needs a title				Equation variable hn should be formatted as in the equation.
SuggestedRemedy				Also for Pr in step 4
Table 165-15-Echo Me	trics Parameters			SuggestedRemedy
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Apply italic and subscript formats as necessary.
				Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3	3.2 P120	L 47	# 580	
Ran, Adee	Cisco			C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P121 L13 # 756
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
What is K in equation	165-27? ut not K. Should it be N?			Comment Type E Comment Status X post-dead
	It not K. Should It be N?			the "n" in "hn" should be subscript
SuggestedRemedy Correct if necessary.				SuggestedRemedy
,				Change "n" in "hn" to subscript
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response Response Status O
	3.2 <i>P</i> 121	L <b>9</b>	# 581	
Ran, Adee	Cisco			C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 P121 L 36 # 760
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell
Equations 165-30, 165	5-31, 165-33 may need some ti	dying up - son	ne letters are too small	Comment Type TR Comment Status X post-dead
	e the subscript k in 165-31) are ith the rest of the equations.	too large. The	Sigma signs are too	After the latest updates to the ETM algorithm, the REM and ETM calculations have become too different to be described in one sequence of calculation steps. Therefore, the
SuggestedRemedy				should be separated into two separate sections.
Improve if possible				SuggestedRemedy
	Response Status <b>0</b>			Create a new sub-section titled "Calculating the Residual Echo Metric (REM)" that include steps 1 through 5. Create another sub-section titled "Calculating Echo Tail Metric (ETM)"
Proposed Response				containing steps 6 through 8.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 Page 60 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1	-	<i>L</i> 1	# 583	C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3	3.2 P12	22 L 26	# 758
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, I	Ragnar	Marve		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment	51	Comment Status		post-deadline
	eds some tidying up. Some lette and unaligned with the rest of the		to be seen. The Sigma	The si	gnal "g_n^m" is	not defined anywhere		
signs are too small a	and unaligned with the rest of the	e equations.		Suggested	lRemedy			
	uired for setting the span of the			Add de	efinition of "g_n^	°m"		
the propagation delay e.g. using the length	ensitive to this estimate. Thereful y in a cable does not require su of the cable and an approximat which is a readily available from	ich a detailed eq te speed of light	uation. It can be done, in the medium, or	Proposed	Response	Response Status	0	
SuggestedRemedy				C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3	3.2 P12	22 L 26	# 585
	or replace it with less prescripti	ive text.		Ran, Adee	9	Cisco	)	
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Comment	51	Comment Status		
, ,				Step 8	mentions "part	ial response g_n^m" b	but I don't see wher	e that is defined.
				Suggested	lRemedy			
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1		L <b>21</b>	# 757	Add a	reference to wh	ere g_n^m is defined,	or define it if it isn't	t.
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			Proposed	Response	Response Status	0	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		post-deadline					
	(165-38) is different from the "R n confusing. It would be more a			C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.3	3.2 P1	22 L 26	# 759
echo response.				Jonsson, I		Marve		
SuggestedRemedy				Comment	-	Comment Status		post-deadline
Change "RE_k" in (1	65-38) to "PE_k"				51			ed to be in previous version
Proposed Response	Response Status 0					so wording in Step 8		
				Suggested	lRemedy			
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1	I.3.2 P122	L <b>24</b>	# 584		e "associated R ated ETM."	EM. The ETM(m) is the	his REM evaluated	at Ndiscard_etm." to
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Proposed	Response	Response Status	0	
Comment Type T	Comment Status X							
Missing value in the t I assume the value s	third case of equation 165-38. should be 0.							
SuggestedRemedy								
Add "0" for the third of	case.							
Proposed Response	Response Status O							

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.3.2 Page 61 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.	.1.3.3 <i>P</i> 122	L 29	# 586	C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.4	P1	19	L <b>24</b>	# 577
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Ran, Adee		Cisc	D		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment T	/pe T	Comment Status	Х		
Unnecessary capita been introduced in ?	lization in "Residual Echo Metrie 165.7.1.3.2.	c". Also, the acro	nym REM has already	"The co	upling attenuati	on is illustrated in Fi	gure 165–4	42"	
SuggestedRemedy					65-42 does not by equation 10	illustrate a coupling 5-41.	of any link	segment. It il	lustrates the limit
	essary capitalization and delete	(REIVI).		SuggestedF	emedy				
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>					-T1 link segment sh Juation (165–41)"	all meet th	e coupling atte	enuation values
C/ <b>165</b> SC <b>165.7.</b> Ran, Adee	.1.3.4 P 122 Cisco	L <b>45</b>	# 587	"the cou		n of a 25GBASE-T1 (165–41) as illustra			the coupling
Comment Type E Unnecessary capita	Comment Status X					el "meets equation c ng attenuation limit		below the cur	ve, and change the titl
Also, the acronym E	ETM should be defined where it	is first used in tex	xt, which is in step 8 of	Delete t	he quoted sente	ence.			
165.7.1.3.2.									
103.7.1.3.2.				Proposed R	esponse	Response Status	0		
				Proposed R	esponse	Response Status	0		
SuggestedRemedy	essary capitalization and delete	"(ETM)".			•		-		# 40
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi		echo tail metric (ETM)	Proposed R  C/ 165 Wienckows	SC 165.7.1.4	Р1	-	L 6	# 440
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM".		echo tail metric (ETM)	C/ 165	SC <b>165.7.1.4</b> ki, Natalie	Р1	<b>23</b> eral Motors		# 440
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi		echo tail metric (ETM)	CI <b>165</b> Wienckows Comment T Annex	SC <b>165.7.1.4</b> ki, Natalie / <i>pe</i> <b>T</b> 65A does not c	P 1 Gene Comment Status	23 eral Motors X und screeni	ing attenuation	n test methodology. As
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM". <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>		、 <i>,</i> ,	CI <b>165</b> Wienckows Comment T Annex	SC <b>165.7.1.4</b> ki, Natalie /pe <b>T</b> 65A does not c ie same as it wa	P1 Gene Comment Status efine the Coupling a	23 eral Motors X und screeni	ing attenuation	n test methodology. A
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM Proposed Response C/ 165 SC 165.7. Ran, Adee	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM". <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	is REM" to "The e	echo tail metric (ETM) # 588	Cl 165 Wienckows Comment T Annex this is th SuggestedF Change To: An	SC 165.7.1.4 ki, Natalie /pe T 65A does not c e same as it w emedy : Annex 165A nex 149A (This	P1 Gene Comment Status efine the Coupling a	23 eral Motors X Ind screeni nnex 149A	ing attenuation should be ref	n test methodology. A
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.7. Ran, Adee Comment Type <b>T</b>	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM". <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .1.3.4 <i>P</i> 122 Cisco	L 50	# [588	C/ 165 Wienckows Comment T Annex <sup>7</sup> this is th SuggestedF Change To: An Also P1	SC 165.7.1.4 ki, Natalie /pe T 65A does not c le same as it wa eemedy : Annex 165A lex 149A (This 24L2	P 1 Gene Comment Status efine the Coupling a as for Clause 149, A should be in green w	23 eral Motors X and screeni nnex 149A vith no hyp	ing attenuation should be ref	n test methodology. A
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM Proposed Response Cl 165 SC 165.7. Ran, Adee Comment Type T The text is about ET SuggestedRemedy	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM". <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .1.3.4 <i>P</i> 122 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> TM but the equation has REM(N	L 50	# [588	Cl 165 Wienckows Comment T Annex this is th SuggestedF Change To: An	SC 165.7.1.4 ki, Natalie /pe T 65A does not c le same as it wa eemedy : Annex 165A lex 149A (This 24L2	P 1 Gene Comment Status efine the Coupling a as for Clause 149, A	23 eral Motors X and screeni nnex 149A vith no hyp	ing attenuation should be ref	n test methodology. A
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece In step 8 of 165.7.1. of segment m, ETM Proposed Response CI 165 SC 165.7. Ran, Adee Comment Type T	.3.2, change "The ETM(m) is thi I(m), is this REM". <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> .1.3.4 <i>P</i> 122 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> TM but the equation has REM(N	L 50	# [588	C/ 165 Wienckows Comment T Annex <sup>7</sup> this is th SuggestedF Change To: An Also P1	SC 165.7.1.4 ki, Natalie /pe T 65A does not c le same as it wa eemedy : Annex 165A lex 149A (This 24L2	P 1 Gene Comment Status efine the Coupling a as for Clause 149, A should be in green w	23 eral Motors X and screeni nnex 149A vith no hyp	ing attenuation should be ref	n test methodology. A

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1.4

Comments Received
-------------------

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.1	.4 P123	L Figure	# 596	C/ 165	SC 165.7.1.6	6 P124	L <b>6</b>	# 647
Stephan Schreiner	Rosenberger	Hochfrequenztech	nik	McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment 7	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X		
X-Axes Grid is very d	ense.			The ma	ax link delay sho	ould be scaled for 11 meters,	vs the original 1	5 meters in 802.3cy
SuggestedRemedy				Suggested	Remedy			
Using a frequency ste	ep of 500 MHz for the grid inste	ad of 250 MHz.		change	94ns to 69ns			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1	.5 P123	L <b>54</b>	# 761	C/ 165	SC 165.7.2	P124	L18	# 646
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell			McClellan,	Brett	Marvell		
Comment Type <b>T</b> The screening attenu	Comment Status X ation should be defined up to 9	GHz	post-deadline	Comment 7 incorre	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ct reference	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy Change "4000" to "90	000".			Suggestedl change	Remedy e 165C.5 to 165	A.5		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		
C/ 165 SC 165.7.1	.5 P123	L <b>54</b>	# 457	C/ 165	SC 165.7.2	P124	L18	# 441
Brychta, Michal	Analog Device	s		Wienckows	ski, Natalie	General Moto	rs	
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment 7	Гуре Т	Comment Status X		
Many other specificat	tions in subclause 165.7 cover l	pandwidth up to 90	000MHz. That	Incorre	ct reference, 16	65C.5 doesn't exist.		
	ple 165.7.1.4 Coupling attanuat			Suggested	Remedv			
6	n should be specified "only" in ra	ange up to 4000 M	IHZ (	00	e: 165C.5			
SuggestedRemedy				To: 16				
Consider if screening	attanuation could be / should b	e specified up to s	9000MHz.	Proposed F	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Proposed Response	Response Status O							

C/ 165 SC 165.7.2

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.2.1	P <b>124</b>	L <b>25</b>	# 442	C/ 165	SC 165.7.2.1	I P12	5 <i>L</i> 1	# 589
Wienckowski, Natalie	General Motor	S		Ran, Adee		Cisco		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment 7	Туре Т	Comment Status	х	
The frequency range u	sed needs to be changed.			"PSAN	EXT is illustrate	ed in Figure 165–43"		
SuggestedRemedy				Figure	165-43 does no	t illustrate any PSA_It	illustrates the limit i	imposed by equation 165-
	NEXT loss is derived using Ecosis is derived using Equation (9			42.	r PSAACRF in	,		
1 (	,			AISO TO	r PSAACRF IN	165.7.2.2.		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Also fo	r MDI return los	s in 165.8.2.1.		
				Suggested	Remedy			
C/ 165 SC 165.7.2.1	P <b>124</b>	L 35	# 474	Change	e "shall meet th	e values determined us	sing Equation (165–	-42)"
Zimmerman, George	CME Consulti	ng/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	to "aball m	naat Equation (	165–42) as illustrated I	NY Figure 165 42"	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Shair h	neer Equation (	105–42) as mustrated i	by Figure 165-43.	
The upper frequency for segment upper frequence	or ANEXT and AFEXT should ncy.	be at least as h	igh as with the link		igure add a lab ANEXT limit".	el "meets equation cor	nstraints" below the	curve, and change the title
SuggestedRemedy Change 4000 to 9000	on P124 L35 and P126 L6. (ed	quations 165-42	and 165-43)	Delete	the quoted sen	tence.		
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		,	Apply s	similarly in 165.	7.2.2 and in 165.8.2.1,	with apppropriate a	djustments.
r roposeu nesponse	Response Status			Proposed F	Response	Response Status	0	
				C/ 165	SC 165.7.2.2	2 P12	5 L 36	# 443
				Wienckows	ski Natalie	Gener	al Motors	
				Comment 7		Comment Status		
					51	used needs to be change		
				To: TI	e: The power A	ACRF is derived using derived using Equatio		frequency range defined

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

C/ 165 SC 165.7.2.2

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.7.	3.1 <i>P</i> 119	L <b>24</b>	# 576	C/ 165 SC 165.7	.12.1 P125	L 23	# 763
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment Type T	Comment Status X		post-deadlin
"The 25GBASE-T1	return loss is illustrated in Figur	re 165–41"		The PSANEXT sho	ould be defined up to 9GHz		
Figure 165-41 does imposed by equation	not illustrate a return loss of ar n 165-24.	ny link segment.	t illustrates the limit	SuggestedRemedy Expand Figure 165	-43 from 4000MHz to 9000MHz		
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
	BASE-T1 link segment pair sha at all frequencies from 30 MHz t		s determined by using				
to	OFODACE TA link comment			C/ 165 SC 165.7	7.12.2 P126	L 6	# 764
	25GBASE-T1 link segment (165–24) as illustrated in Figur	re 165-44".		Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
In the figure add a l	label "meets equation constrain		ve, and change the title	Comment Type <b>T</b> The PSAACRF sho	Comment Status X build be defined up to 9GHz		post-deadline
to "Link segment ret				SuggestedRemedy Change "4000" to "	9000".		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
C/ 165 SC 165.7.	3.2 <i>P</i> 119	L 53	# 578	C/ 165 SC 165.7	.12.2 <i>P</i> 126	L31	# 765
Ran, Adee	Cisco			Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type T	Comment Status X		post-deadlin
Unnecessary capita subclause text.	lization in "Echo Tail and Resid	lual Echo Metrics	". Also "Noise" in the		ould be defined up to 9GHz		
SuggestedRemedy Remove the unnece	essary capitalization.			SuggestedRemedy Expand Figure 165	-44 from 4000MHz to 9000MHz		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 165 SC 165.7.	12.1 P124	L <b>36</b>	# 762				
Jonsson, Ragnar	Marvell						
Comment Type T The PSANEXT shou	Comment Status X uld be defined up to 9GHz		post-deadline				
SuggestedRemedy	222.24						
Change "4000" to "9	9000".						
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165 SC 165.7.12.2 Page 65 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165	SC 165.8.2.1	P 126	L <b>7</b>	# 458	C/ 165	SC 165.8.	2.1	P 127	<i>L</i> Figure	# 597
Brychta, M	<i>l</i> ichal	Analog Devices	i -		Stephan S	chreiner		Rosenberger	Hochfrequenztec	nnik
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment	Status X		
		re is specified up to 10000 MH			X-Axe	s Grid is very	dense.			
		equency range up to 9000MHz end in 165.7 and 165.8 on the			Suggested	lRemedy				
	ney should be diff				Using	a frequency s	tep of 500 MHz	for the grid inste	ead of 250 MHz.	
Suggested	dRemedy				Proposed	Response	Response	Status O		
	or relevant 165.7	and 165.8 specifications freque	ency range either	up to 9000MHz, or						
Proposed	Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			C/ 165	SC 165.1	)	P 129	L <b>5</b>	# 590
					Ran, Adee	)		Cisco		
	SC 165.8.2.1	P <b>127</b>	L <b>4</b>	# 405	Comment	Туре Т	Comment	Status X		
C/ 165	30 165.8.2.1		L <b>4</b>	# 465					ons depending on the link portport	
Tu, Mike	T	Broadcom							en the link partners	
Comment	51	Comment Status X							•	
		MDI return loss is too restricti Im frequency to 9GHz instead		HY designs. Also					network planners and concatenatio	and administrators n of devices".
Suggested	dRemedy				The				t and many in a late	delesse fear ea
See p	roposed limits in	vakilian_3cy_01_08_16_2022	2.pdf"						it and receive data its shown in Table	165–16" is irreleval
Proposed	Response	Response Status 0			with di	fferent values	of interleave in	the transmit and	d receive direction	s. The maximum
							n both sides cho nstraints can be		known that in a sp	ecific link the choice
	SC 165.8.2.1	P <b>127</b>	<i>L</i> Figure	# 598				0		
C/ 165			0						equirement only fo	r the maximum dela
	Schreiner	Rosenberger H	ochfrequenztechi	nik		PHY. Which h	appens with L=0	3.		
Stephan S		Rosenberger H Comment Status X	ochfrequenztechi	nik		,	appens with L=8			
Stephan S Comment	Туре Е	U U	ochfrequenztech	nik	Text c	an be added	o explain that th	e actual delay n		ner or both partners network manageme
Stephan S Comment There	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is a vertical blue	Comment Status X	ochfrequenztech	nik	Text c	an be added sts a lower va	o explain that th	e actual delay n		ner or both partners
Stephan S Comment There Suggested	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is a vertical blue dRemedy	Comment Status X	ochfrequenztech	nik	Text c reques Suggestec Delete	an be added sts a lower va <i>IRemedy</i> the first three	to explain that the the second s	e actual delay n ng this informat 165-16, leaving o	tion is available to	ner or both partners
Stephan S Comment There Suggested Remo	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is a vertical blue dRemedy	Comment Status X line at the 0 MHz position.	ochfrequenztech	nik	Text c reques Suggestec Delete	an be added sts a lower va <i>IRemedy</i> the first three	to explain that th lue of L, assumi	e actual delay n ng this informat 165-16, leaving o	tion is available to	ner or both partners network manageme
Suggested Remo	<i>Type</i> <b>E</b> is a vertical blue <i>dRemedy</i> ve the vertical blue	Comment Status X line at the 0 MHz position. line at the 1 MHz position.	ochfrequenztech	nik	Text c reques Suggestec Delete and re	an be added sts a lower va <i>IRemedy</i> the first three move the "Int	to explain that the the second s	e actual delay n ng this informat 165-16, leaving o	tion is available to	ner or both partners network manageme

C/ 165 SC 165.10 Page 66 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.11.2.2 P130	L <b>36</b> # 445	C/ 165 SC 165.11.4.1 P131 L39	# 592
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors	3	Ran, Adee Cisco	
Comment Type E Comment Status X typo		Comment Type T Comment Status X Item G3 status should be "!AN:M".	
SuggestedRemedy		SuggestedRemedy	
Change: IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020,		Per comment	
To: IEEE Std 802.3cy-202x,		Proposed Response Response Status O	
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>			
C/ 165 SC 165.11.2.2 P130	L <b>36</b> # 591	Cl 165 SC 165.11.4.2.5 P135 L30	# 778
	L 36 # [59]	Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell	
Ran, Adee Cisco Comment Type E Comment Status X		Comment Type TR Comment Status X	post-deadline
Incorrect amendment name.		Alert happens at the fifth frame after 8 frame boundary.	
SuggestedRemedy		SuggestedRemedy	
Change "ch-2020" to "cy-202x".		Change "beginning of" to "fifth frame after".	
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>		Proposed Response Response Status O	
C/ 165 SC 165.11.2.2 P130	L <b>44</b> # 450	- Cl 165 SC 165.11.4.2.6 P136 L6	# 742
Carlson, Steve HSD, Bosch, E		Jonsson, Ragnar Marvell	
Comment Type E Comment Status X		Comment Type TR Comment Status X Sleep signal should be composed of 16 RS frames	post-deadline
Incorrect citation			
SuggestedRemedy		SuggestedRemedy change "eight RS-FEC frame" to "sixteen RS-FEC frame"	
Change: IEEE Std 802.3ch-2020, To: IEEE Std 802.3cy-202x,		Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>			
		C/ 165 SC 165.11.4.2.8 P137 L1	# 446
		Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors	
		Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b> Table 149-1 has nothing to do with the OAM state diagrams.	
		SuggestedRemedy	
		Change: Table 149-1	
		To: Figure 149-24	

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/
 165

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC
 165.11.4.2.8

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC
 165.11.4.2.8
 SC

Page 67 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165 SC 165.1	1.4.2.8 P13	37 L6	# 468	C/ 165A SC 165A.1	P 149	L 30	# 676
Tu, Mike	Broad	com		Zimmerman, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marv
Comment Type TR	Comment Status	Х		Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
The OAM state dia	grams are shown in Figur	e 149-24 and Figure 1	49-25.		e connectors in a clause 165	link segment, the	e figure says 4. Also,
SuggestedRemedy				the wording could be	mproved in the label.		
Change from "Tab	e 149-1 and Figure 149-2	5" to "Figure 149-24 ar	nd Figure 149-25".	SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status	0			link segments four in-line con to 2 in-line connectors and up		
				Proposed Response	Response Status <b>0</b>		·····g···,
C/ 165 SC 165.4	1.4.3.3 <i>P</i> 13	39 L 10	# 339				
Maguire, Valerie	Coppe	eropolis		C/ 165A SC 165A.1	P149	L 30	# 406
Comment Type E	Comment Status			Wienckowski, Natalie	General Moto	ors	
Interface is capital	zed when appearing after	"MDIO" (see clause 4	5 header).	Comment Type T	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy Replace, "MDIO in	terface" with "MDIO Interf	ace"			o/s up to 2 inline connectors fo t, but the text on the link segm		5A-1 is not.
Proposed Response	Response Status	0		SuggestedRemedy Change: four in-line o To: two in-line conne			
C/ 165A SC 165A	P14	l9 L1	# 444	Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>		
Wienckowski, Natalie	Gener	ral Motors					
Comment Type E	Comment Status	х		C/ 165A SC 165A.1	P149	L 32	# 678
There is no Annex	165B.			Zimmerman, George	CME Consult	-	co, CommScope, Marve
SuggestedRemedy				Comment Type <b>T</b>	Comment Status X		
0	w Annex 165A and Annex nex 165A as follows:			It is not clear where th	e "PHY ends" in the figure - the treatly matter in the figure the		
Proposed Response	Response Status	0		SuggestedRemedy	, ,	C	
		l9 L 43	# 628	,	dotted vertical lines on the ver ane)	y left and right s	ides of the figure (the
			# 020	Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
McClellan, Brett	Marve Comment Status			. ,			
Comment Type E HTF used without	definition in this Annex	*					
SuggestedRemedy	'Host Test Fixture (HTF)'						
replace 'HIF' with							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165A SC 165A.1 Page 68 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM

# IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165A	SC 165A.1	P 149	L 33	# 677	C/ 165A SC 165A.2.1	
Zimmerma	n, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve	McClellan, Brett	
Comment T	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status X			Comment Type T Comme	ent S
		s (there are many different te			the Host PCB insertion loss shou	ld be
,	-	ed differently in the text of 16	5A.3. Align the	figure with the text.	SuggestedRemedy	
Suggested	,				change <= to >=	
0		P0 to TP5 Channel"			Proposed Response Respon	se Si
Proposed F	Response	Response Status O				
C/ 165A	SC 165A.2.1	P150	L16	# 670	C/ 165A SC 165A.4	
			-	# 679	Zimmerman, George	
Zimmerma			ing/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Marve	Comment Type TR Comme	ent S
Comment T	51	Comment Status X		but the commence of the	This section does NOT describe	
		ordings for what is being reco nmended maximum insertion			used for the Tx/Rx function to MD	) retu
"recom	mended printed	circuit board insert loss", and	d "recommended	d maximum insertion	SuggestedRemedy	
loss" -		nese are all "recommended n	naximum insertio	on loss from TP0/TP5	Change the title of 165A.4 to "Exa	ampl
( . ( )		and a set of the MIDII			•	
		onnection of the MDI".			Proposed Response Respon	se Si
Suggested	Remedy				Proposed Response Respon	ise Si
Suggested Change	<i>Remedy</i> e "The recomme	nded maximum insertion for		oss is" to "The		ise Si
Suggested Change recomr the MD	<i>Remedy</i> e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16,	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF	25 to the host-sid	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of	C/ 165A SC 165A.4	ise Si
Suggested Change recomr the MD Change	<i>Remedy</i> e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra	25 to the host-sid	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett	
Suggested Change recomr the MD Change mm tra	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF	25 to the host-sid ace insertion loss rtion loss is" to '	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2	Cl <b>165A</b> SC <b>165A.4</b> McClellan, Brett Comment Type <b>E</b> Comme	
Suggested Change recomr the MD Change mm tra recomr Similar	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b ty change the wo	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse	25 to the host-sid ice insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' igth, and is"	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference	
Suggested Change recomm the MD Change mm tra recomm Similar lines 21	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximus Il is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b 'ly change the wo 7, 28, and 30	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "reco	25 to the host-sid ice insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' igth, and is"	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy	ent S
Suggested Change recomm the MD Change mm tra recomm Similar lines 27	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximus Il is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b 'ly change the wo 7, 28, and 30	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len	25 to the host-sid ice insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' igth, and is"	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 'Figure 149C-2' to 'Figure	ent S e 165
Suggested Change recomr the MD Change mm tra recomr Similar	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximus Il is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b 'ly change the wo 7, 28, and 30	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "reco	25 to the host-sid ice insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' igth, and is"	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy	ent S e 165/
Suggestedi Change recomm the MD Change mm tra recomm Similar lines 27 Proposed F Cl 165A	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b rly change the wo 7, 28, and 30 Response SC 165A.2.1	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "reco Response Status <b>0</b> P150	25 to the host-sid ace insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' ogth, and is" ommended minin	bss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum mum insertion loss" on # 680	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 'Figure 149C-2' to 'Figure	ent S e 165/
Suggestedi Change recomr the MD Change mm tra recomr Similar lines 27 Proposed F C/ 165A	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b rly change the wo 7, 28, and 30 Response SC 165A.2.1	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "reco <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 150 CME Consulti	25 to the host-sid ace insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' ogth, and is" ommended minin	oss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum mum insertion loss" on	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 'Figure 149C-2' to 'Figure	ent S e 165/
Suggested/ Change recomm the MD Change mm tra recomm Similar lines 21 Proposed F C/ 165A Zimmerma	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu DI is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b rly change the wo 7, 28, and 30 Response SC 165A.2.1 an, George	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "reco Response Status <b>0</b> P150	25 to the host-sid ace insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' ogth, and is" ommended minin	bss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum mum insertion loss" on # 680	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 'Figure 149C-2' to 'Figure	ent S e 165/
Suggested/ Change recomm the MD Change mm tra recomm Similar lines 21 Proposed F C/ 165A Zimmerma Comment T font siz	Remedy e "The recomme mended maximu Di is" on line 16, e "The recomme ace length. The re mended loss is b dy change the wo 7, 28, and 30 Response SC 165A.2.1 an, George Type E	nded maximum insertion for m insertion loss from TP0/TF nded printed circuit board tra ecommended maximum inse ased on a 76.2 mm trace len ording on line 29 for the "recc <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> 150 <i>CME</i> Consult <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> rfrequency span, and missin	25 to the host-sid ace insertion loss rtion loss is" to ' igth, and is" mmended minir <i>L</i> 25 ing/APL Gp, Cis	boss is" to "The de PCB connection of s is based on a 76.2 "This maximum mum insertion loss" on # [680 sco, CommScope, Marve	Cl 165A SC 165A.4 McClellan, Brett Comment Type E Comme incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy change 'Figure 149C-2' to 'Figure	ent S e 165/

Proposed Response Response Status **0** 

McClellan,	SC 165A.2.1	P1	50	L 32	# 629
	Brett	Marv	ell		
Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status	Х		
the Ho	st PCB insertior	n loss should be great	er than	the minimum req	uirement
Suggested	lRemedy				
chang	e <= to >=				
Proposed	Response	Response Status	0		
C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P1	51	L 19	# 682
Zimmerma	an, George	CME	Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cisc	co, CommScope, N
Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status	Х		
used f Suggested		ction to MDI return los	ss (equi	valent of 149C.4.	1).
••	-	A.4 to "Example mod	lels for <sup>·</sup>	Tx/Rx function to	MDI return loss"
	Response	Response Status			
• 					
C/ 165A	SC 165A.4	P1	51	1.00	
		1	51	L <b>20</b>	# 630
McClellan,	, Brett	Marv	ell	L <b>20</b>	# 630
McClellan, Comment	, Brett		ell	L 20	# 630
McClellan, Comment	, Brett <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ect reference	Marv	ell	L 20	# 630
McClellan, Comment incorre Suggested	, Brett <i>Type</i> <b>E</b> ect reference <i>IRemedy</i>	Marv	ell	L 20	# 630

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 165A SC 165A.4

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 165A SC 165A.4	P 151	L <b>20</b>	# 681	C/ 165A	SC 165A.5		P 152	L <b>6</b>	# 684		
Zimmerman, George	CME Consult	ing/APL Gp, Cis	co, CommScope, Marve	Zimmerman	, George		CME Consul	ting/APL Gp, Cis	sco, CommScope, Mar		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment Ty	/pe E	Comment	Status X				
	(149C-2) is identical to the fig			we say '	specified' twic	e					
moreover, adds no value as it is a simple concatenation of words, already stated clearly in the text.					SuggestedRemedy						
SuggestedRemedy					Change "than that specified for power sum alien near-end crosstalk specified in" to "than that specified for power sum alien near-end crosstalk in"						
<u> </u>	gure 149C-2" and delete Figu	ıre 165A-3		•				ilk in"			
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			Proposed R	esponse	Response	Status O				
	-			C/ Particip	SC Particip	ants	P <b>7</b>	L11	# 353		
C/ 165A SC 165A.4	P 151	L <b>41</b>	# 631	Fischer. Pet	•		BKS Kabel-S	Service AG			
McClellan, Brett	Marvell			Comment Type E Comment Status X							
Comment Type E Comment Status X					Till when will be Valerie Maguire listed as Working Group Treasurer?						
<i>,</i> ,					I will be valer	ie maguire list	ed as working	Group Treasurer	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Element column entrie	es should use subscripts					le maguire list	ed as working	Group Treasurer	?		
SuggestedRemedy	es should use subscripts nat from Table 149C-2, fix the	e micro symbol ir	n the Unit column	SuggestedR If a new	emedy	up Treasurer is	Ū	·			
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr		e micro symbol ir	n the Unit column	SuggestedR If a new	<i>Remedy</i> Working Grou has been off	up Treasurer is	s available repla	·			
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status <b>O</b>			SuggestedR If a new the term	<i>Remedy</i> Working Grou has been off	up Treasurer is icially ended.	s available repla	·	ect name, if not wait ti		
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status <b>O</b> P152	L3	# 683	SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R CI TOC	Permedy Working Grou has been off esponse SC TOC	up Treasurer is icially ended.	s available repla	ace with the corr			
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5 Zimmerman, George	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status <b>O</b> P152	L3		SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R	Remedy Working Grou has been offi esponse SC <b>TOC</b> ana	up Treasurer is icially ended. <i>Response</i>	s available repla Status O P13	ace with the corr	ect name, if not wait ti		
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5 Zimmerman, George	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status O P152 CME Consult Comment Status X	L3	# 683	SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R C/ TOC Murty, Rama Comment Ty	Permedy Working Grou has been off esponse SC TOC ana vpe E	up Treasurer is icially ended. Response	s available repla Status O P13 Broadcom	L 1	ect name, if not wait ti		
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5 Zimmerman, George Comment Type ER We removed the 'lanin	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status O P152 CME Consult Comment Status X	L3	# 683	SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R C/ TOC Murty, Rama Comment Ty	Permedy Working Grou has been off esponse SC TOC ana /pe E d to add a hea	up Treasurer is icially ended. Response	s available repla Status <b>O</b> P13 Broadcom s Status <b>X</b>	L 1	ect name, if not wait ti		
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5 Zimmerman, George Comment Type ER We removed the 'lanin SuggestedRemedy	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status O P152 CME Consult Comment Status X	L3 ing/APL Gp, Cise	# 683 co, CommScope, Marve	SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R C/ TOC Murty, Ram Comment Ty It is goo SuggestedR	Permedy Working Grou has been offi esponse SC TOC ana /pe E d to add a hea Permedy	up Treasurer is icially ended. <i>Response</i> <i>Comment</i> ading and prov	s available repla Status <b>O</b> P13 Broadcom s Status <b>X</b>	L1	ect name, if not wait ti		
SuggestedRemedy copy the subscript forr Proposed Response Cl 165A SC 165A.5 Zimmerman, George Comment Type ER We removed the 'lanin SuggestedRemedy	nat from Table 149C-2, fix the Response Status <b>O</b> P152 CME Consult Comment Status <b>X</b> Ig' but forgot it here.	L3 ing/APL Gp, Cise	# 683 co, CommScope, Marve	SuggestedR If a new the term Proposed R C/ TOC Murty, Ram Comment Ty It is goo SuggestedR	Permedy Working Grou has been off esponse SC TOC ana /pe E d to add a hea Permedy heading "Cor	up Treasurer is icially ended. <i>Response</i> <i>Comment</i> ading and prov	s available repla Status <b>O</b> P13 Broadcom Status X ride a bookmark	L1	ect name, if not wait til		

CI TOC SC TOC

IEEE P802.3cy D2.0 10G+ Auto Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI TOC	SC TOC	P13	L10	# 662
Murty, Ran	nana	Broadcom		
Comment 7 Add sp	51	Comment Status X ubclause number and text.		
Suggested Per cor	,			
Proposed F	Response	Response Status O		

C/ TOC SC TOC Page 71 of 71 8/15/2022 9:51:00 AM