

## IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L1 # 20  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 Editor to check that frontmatter is current per template  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Check and update as necessary  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L29 # 54  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 Editor needs to get with 802 leadership and determine order of the da amendment assuming WG ballot out of either July or September  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Update editor's note P1 L28-34, and test P1 L35-38, and introduction P12 to include other amendments as necessary.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 TFTD - need to consider with timeline

CI **00** SC **0** P3 L5 # 2  
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 Consider capitalization here as Powered Device is written as a proper noun elsewhere in the document.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace, "multiple powered devices" with "multiple Powered Devices".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **30** SC **30.16.1.1.8** P21 L47 # 119  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 Variable names are in lower case in 148.4.7.2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "SOFT\_AGING\_CYCLES" to "soft\_aging\_cycle"  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **30** SC **30.16.1.1.8** P21 L48 # 23  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 SOFT\_AGING\_CYCLES (and HARD\_AGING\_CYCLES) has been changed to lower case in clause 148. Need to do the same here.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change SOFT\_AGING\_CYCLES and HARD\_AGING\_CYCLES to lower case globally. (P21 L48, P22 L5, P43 L19, P43 P25, at least)  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **30** SC **30.16.1.1.9** P22 L5 # 120  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** EZ  
 Variable names are in lower case in 148.4.7.2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "HARD\_AGING\_CYCLES" to "hard\_aging\_cycle".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 (comment 23 handles this change globally, and, hits this spot as well.)

# IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1.93a**      **P24**      **L31**      # **25**

Zimmerman, George      CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

Template is not needed for draft

**SuggestedRemedy**  
delete P24 L31 - P25 L49

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 148**      **SC 148.2**      **P30**      **L14**      # **56**

Jones, Chad      Cisco Systems

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

"The method of determination of to\_timer by the management entity is beyond the scope of this standard." Modified this sentence last cycle to remove "the node ID and", leaving the sentence a little awkward. I think we needed to keep "the" in front of "to\_timer"

**SuggestedRemedy**  
add the in front of to\_timer: "The method of determination of the to\_timer by the management entity is beyond the scope of this standard."

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
(may be overwritten by comment 125)

**Cl 148**      **SC 148.4.4.6**      **P34**      **L31**      # **57**

Jones, Chad      Cisco Systems

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

arrows from TRANSMIT to BURST and from BURST to TRANSMIT overshoots the boundary.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
redraw such that arrowheads align to the top of the box.

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 148**      **SC 148.4.4.6**      **P34**      **L31**      # **35**

Zimmerman, George      CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

Arrow from "BURST" into "TRANSMIT" state overshoots the boundary...

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Redraw state transition from BURST aligning arrowheads

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 148**      **SC 148.4.7.3**      **P40**      **L27**      # **129**

Jones, Peter      Cisco

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

Extra blank line.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
remove blank line.

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 168**      **SC 168**      **P46**      **L1**      # **36**

Zimmerman, George      CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

There are no annexes yet, but editorial instruction mentions them.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Delete "(see later in this amendment of the addition of corresponding annexes)" from editing instruction.

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 168**      **SC 168.5.2**      **P66**      **L21**      # **46**

Zimmerman, George      CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      **EZ**

Editor's note was accomplished in changes to draft 1.1, no longer needed.

**SuggestedRemedy**  
Delete editor's note at P66 L21

**Proposed Response**      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

---

Cl 168 SC 168.6.3 P69 L36 # 4

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Easy is too subjective here... Improve language.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "To allow an easy synchronization of the measurement equipment," with "To facilitate synchronization of the measurement equipment,".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 168 SC 168.8 P73 L4 # 137

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Fix incorrect reference.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "The 10BASE-T1M mixing segment (1.4.331)" with "The 10BASE-T1M mixing segment (1.4.403)".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 168 SC 168.8 P73 L8 # 41

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

No need for highlight on lines 8 to 12

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove highlight lines 8 to 12

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 168 SC 168.8 P73 L17 # 140

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status D EZ

Fix reference to TCI sub-clause.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "The TCI is specified in 168.8" with "The TCI is specified in 168.9".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make change and make it an active x-ref.

---

Cl 168 SC 168.8.2 P74 L20 # 5

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Align structure with clause 168.8.1.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert the following two sentences as a new paragraph before the mixing segment return loss specification, "Mixing segment return loss includes any TCI return loss. See 168.9.1.2 for specification of TCI return loss."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 168 SC 168.9.1.1 P76 L11 # 6

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Insertion loss is not a proper noun.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "168.9.1.1 TCI Insertion Loss" with "168.9.1.1 TCI insertion loss"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

---

Cl 168 SC 168.9.1.2 P76 L17 # 7

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Return loss is not a proper noun.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "168.9.1.2 TCI Return Loss" with "168.9.1.2 TCI return loss"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 169 SC 169.2 P88 L30 # 71

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

We should include a pointer to 168.8 for those that only come to read the PoE section so they can see the mixing segment specifications.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new sentence: "See 168-8 for a discussion of the mixing segment characteristics."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

(fixed typo of - for intended .)

Add new sentence: "See 168.8 for mixing segment characteristics."

---

Cl 169 SC 169.4.6 P97 L39 # 8

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Delete column with no information.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete the "Additional Information" column in Table 169.4.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 169 SC 169.4.7 P97 L42 # 90

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

item 1, Ibad, in Table 169-4 has a min of 30mA and a max of 0mA. I'm no mathematician, but 0 is lower than 30 so I don't understand how 0 can be the max. was that supposed to be something like 40 or 50 instead of 0?

*SuggestedRemedy*

replace the max of 0mA with the appropriate number. Or perhaps the numbers need flipped, 0mA min and 30mA max.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change Ibad Max to -

(see [https://www.ieee802.org/3/da/public/1123/clause169\\_clean.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/da/public/1123/clause169_clean.pdf) )

---

Cl 169 SC 169.4.7 P98 L13 # 9

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Remove unnecessary parameter capitalizations in Table 169-5.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "Output Slew Rate" with "Output slew rate" (Item 3). Replace, "MPD Maintain power" with "MPD maintain power" (Item 7).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3 P100 L41 # 11

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "MPD State Diagram" with "MPD state diagram".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.3 P102 L2 # 12

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

MPS is not capitalized in 169.4.11.1

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Maintain Power Signature" with "maintain power signature".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.4 P102 L33 # 107

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Vmpd should be VMPD.

SuggestedRemedy

capitalize the subscript text. Editors given editorial license to fix any other subscript capitalization errors they notice.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P105 L24 # 14

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Top Level MPD state diagram" with "Top level MPD state diagram".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.4 P105 L31 # 13

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "MPD Discovery." with "MPD discovery".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5 P106 L2 # 15

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "MPD Power" with "MPD power".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5.1 P106 L45 # 16

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "MPD Inrush" with "MPD inrush".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5.1 P106 L49 # 112

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

at least three occurrences of Vmpd, replace with VMPD

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Vmpd with VMPD.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5.2 P107 L5 # 19

Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Clause 169.5.5 is already named "MPD power". Consider a more descriptive clause header.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "MPD Power" with "MPD unit load".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## IEEE P802.3da D1.1 Physical Layer Specifications and

---

Cl 169	SC 169.6	P107	L 22	# 17
--------	----------	------	------	------

Maguire, Valerie

Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E

Comment Status D

EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "Additional Electrical Specifications" with "Additional electrical specifications".

*Proposed Response**Response Status W*

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

Cl 169	SC 169.6.2	P107	L 31	# 18
--------	------------	------	------	------

Maguire, Valerie

Copperopolis; CME Consulting

Comment Type E

Comment Status D

EZ

Follow Style guidelines.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace, "Fault Tolerance" with "Fault tolerance".

*Proposed Response**Response Status W*

PROPOSED ACCEPT.