

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P8 L13 # 56
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 Editor titles have shifted with Val coming back on board, put editors in alphabetical order
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Editor-in-Chief" on line 14 to "Technical Editor"
 Move "Valerie Maguire, ... Managing Editor" before "George Zimmerman,... Technical Editor"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P8 L14 # 20
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 George is the Technical Editor and Val is the Managing Editor.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change George's title to Technical Editor
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Accomodated by 56 which also flips the order.
 Proposed response to comment 56 is:
 Change "Editor-in-Chief" on line 14 to "Technical Editor"
 Move "Valerie Maguire, ... Managing Editor" before "George Zimmerman,... Technical Editor"

Cl **1** SC **1.5** P21 L36 # 57
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 Add TPS "Transmit Power Signature" to abbreviations
SuggestedRemedy
 Add TPS "Transmit Power Signature" to abbreviations
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change to AIP
 "transmit power signature" is not capitalized throughout document.
 Add TPS "transmit power signature" to abbreviations

Cl **30** SC **30.16.1.1.8** P25 L1 # 1
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; aff'l w/ CME Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 Tidy Editing Instruction text so that insertion instructions are consistent throughout the document.
SuggestedRemedy
 P25 L1: Replace "Insert new subclauses (30.16.1.1.8 through 30.16.1.1.14)" with "Insert new subclauses 30.16.1.1.8 through 30.16.1.1.14..."; P26 L50: Replace "Insert 30.17..." with "Insert new subclause 30.17..."; P37 L19: "Insert 79.3.9..." with "Insert new subclause 79.3.9..."; P48 L1: "Insert 148.4.7 ..." with "Insert new subclause 148.4.7..."; P54 L3: Replace "Insert new section 148.5.3.a..." with "Insert new subclause 148.5.3.a..."; P54 L13: Replace "Insert new section 148.5.3.7..." with "Insert new subclause 148.5.3.7..."
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148** SC **148.4.4.3** P41 L42 # 61
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 Missing space after period "claim.See"
SuggestedRemedy
 insert space between period and "See"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148** SC **148.4.4.2** P41 L42 # 17
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** EZ
 Typo.
SuggestedRemedy
 ... type of claim.See 148.4.7.2 ..' should read '!... type of claim. See 148.4.7.2 ...' (misisng space).
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.6 P44 L37 # 10

Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The action 'start_append_commit timer' in the BURST state of Figure 148-4 'PLCA Control state diagram' should read 'start_append_commit_timer' (remove the '_' after 'start' and add an '_' between 'commit' and 'timer').

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.7 P45 L2 # 21

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

empty page. Is that because of the "change figure" note and the space will go away once integrated in 802.3? Or is there a hidden page break?

SuggestedRemedy

fix blank page.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

No hidden page break. This is because of the structure of the amendment, which puts a full-page figure prior to a header & another full page figure. Move editing instruction ("Change Figure 148-5 and Figure 148-6 as shown:") at top of page 46 to page 45.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.5.7 P47 L50 # 87

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGP,CSCO,MRVL,ONSMI,SO
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Two arrowheads where path join in Figure 148-6 - 2 instances - (there should be only the one in the joining arc...

SuggestedRemedy

delete arrowhead coming from the left at P47 L50 (join from WAIT_MAC and TRANSMIT), and delete downward arrowhead from FLUSH state at P47 L50 where arc to "C" joins with arc from WAIT_MAC & TRANSMIT.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P48 L18 # 22

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

unneded comma "HARD claims (with COMMIT requests), "

SuggestedRemedy

delete the comma after "requests)"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.1 P48 L23 # 23

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

"DPLCA" versus "D-PLCA". Every instance on this page includes the hyphen.

SuggestedRemedy

Change DPLCA to D-PLCA. Editors given license to search and replace through the document.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.2 P49 L6 # 12

Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

The definition of the txop_claim_table variable (that's actually an array) says:

This variable contains the claim state of the 256 transmit opportunities IDs. The claim state of each ID can be:

- a. NONE, meaning ...
- b. SOFT, meaning ...
- c. HARD, meaning ...

We don't normally use a letter list to define the variable values, see the dplca_txop_claim variable defined in subclause 148.4.4.2 'PLCA Control variables' for an example.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the text:

This variable contains the claim state of the 256 transmit opportunities IDs. The claim state of each ID can be:

- a. NONE, meaning ...
- b. SOFT, meaning ...
- c. HARD, meaning ...

is changed to read:

This variable contains the claim state of the 256 transmit opportunities IDs. The claim state of each ID can be:

- NONE, meaning ...
- SOFT, meaning ...
- HARD, meaning ...

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.3 P50 L9 # 13

Law, David HPE
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Although there is no rule, function names are generally all upper case, and that is the case for the existing functions in Clause 148 'PLCA Reconciliation Sublayer (RS)', see 148.4.5.3 'Functions'.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the following changes be made to the function names.

- max_hard_claim -> MAX_HARD_CLAIM
- pick_free_txop -> PICK_FREE_TXOP
- hard_claiming -> HARD_CLAIMING
- soft_claiming -> SOFT_CLAIMING
- clear_txop_table -> CLEAR_TXOP_TABLE
- clear_soft_claims -> CLEAR_SOFT_CLAIMS

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P51 L10 # 14

Law, David HPE
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

The transition from the DISABLED state to the WAIT_BEACON state in Figure 148-8 'D-PLCA Control State Diagram' is missing a transition qualifier. Assuming this is an unconditional transition, the transition qualifier should be UCT (see IEEE Std 802.3-2022 subclause 21.5.3, item d).

SuggestedRemedy

Add the transition qualifier 'UCT' to the transition from the DISABLED state to the WAIT_BEACON state in Figure 148-8.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P51 L32 # 86

Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGP,CSCO,MRVL,ONSMI,SO
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Two arrowheads where path join in Figure 148-8 (there should be only the one from the side...)

SuggestedRemedy

Delete rising arrowhead at P51 L32 (right side of page)

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.6 P52 L17 # 59
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Clean up box on TXOP_END -
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete overlaid boxes on TXOP_END state in state diagram
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.1.2.1 P56 L43 # 25
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing comma after "...between THEN and END..."
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to "...between THEN and END, ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.6 P52 L41 # 16
 Law, David HPE
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
 The transitions from the UPDATE_SOFT and the UPDATE_HARD states to the NOTIFY state and from the DISABLED state to the WAIT_TXOP_END state in Figure 148-9 'D-PLCA Aging State Diagram' are missing transition qualifiers. Assuming that these are unconditional transitions, the transition qualifier should be UCT (see IEEE Std 802.3-2022 subclause 21.5.3, item d).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add the transition qualifier 'UCT' to the transitions from the UPDATE_SOFT and the UPDATE_HARD states to the NOTIFY and from the DISABLED state to the WAIT_TXOP_END state in Figure 148-9.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.4.1 P60 L32 # 64
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The 10BASE-T1M PCS Reset bit is in 45.2.3.72.1 , not 45.2.3.72
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.3.72 to 45.2.3.72.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P55 L23 # 63
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Clause 147 is in the draft - should not be an external xref
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change Clause 147 to an active xref
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.3 P102 L16 # 78
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The inrush timer is in Table 169-5. Since the other timers have pointers, it should too.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "See Table 169-5" to the end of the description of mpse_inrush_timer.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Need a '.' at end.
 Add "See Table 169-5." to the end of the description of mpse_inrush_timer.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.3 P102 L19 # 79
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing period at the end of the decription of tdiscover_high_timer
 SuggestedRemedy
 add period to match other timers...
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.4 P102 L38 # 74
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 duplicate colon. (discover_short::)
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete one of the colons
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.5 P104 L23 # 66
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Below line 22 on Figure 169-3, and on all of Figure 169-4, the font size on transition conditions seems to have shrunk to 7 pt from the nominal 8pt.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix font size on transition conditions - all should be 8 pt (same as internal state processes)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.5 P104 L31 # 31
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 transitions into left hand line missing arrowheads
 SuggestedRemedy
 add arrowheads to exit from DISCOVERY_HIGH_MARK1 at line 31, 40, and 52
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 (may be overwritten by other, more complex state diagram comments)

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.5 P105 L23 # 32
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status X EZ
 transitions into left hand line missing arrowheads
 SuggestedRemedy
 add arrowheads to exit from DISCOVERY_HIGH_MARK4 at line 23 and 39
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 (may be overwritten by other, more complex state diagram comments)

Cl 169 SC 169.4.4.5 P105 L30 # 85
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmI,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 arrowheads missing where paths join in Figure 169-3 and 169-4
 SuggestedRemedy
 add arrowheads at line joinings at P105 L30, L40, L50 on the left side of the page, and P106 L22 and L39 (left hand side of page)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.5 P106 L10 # 33
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 missing word: "the link to determine at least one MPD remains"
 SuggestedRemedy
 add if: "the link to determine if at least one MPD remains"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.2 P110 L31 # 39
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 floating "|" character. Delete.
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete "|" just after figure 169-5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.3 P111 L52 # 96
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmi,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 V_On_MPD is not a variable, it is a constant, and is already defined and properly used in 169.5.3...
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete V_On_MPD from 169.5.3.3 Variables, at P111 L52
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P114 L29 # 88
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmi,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Missing arrowheads at arcs joining in Figure 169-6 and 169-7
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add arrowheads on arcs joining from the right at P114 L40, P114 L51, P115 L31, P115 L44 and add arrowheads on arcs joining from the left at P114 L41, P115 L24, P115 L36, and P115 L50
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P114 L40 # 40
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 more state transitions missing arrowheads.
 SuggestedRemedy
 two transitions to the left edge at line 40 and 51, one transition to the right edge at line 41.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P115 L24 # 41
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 more state transitions missing arrowheads.
 SuggestedRemedy
 two transitions to the left edge at line 33 and 43, three transition to the right edge at line 24, 36, and 50.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5.3 P119 L33 # 43
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 sentence ends with two periods.
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete one period.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5 P119 L36 # 51
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI,APLGp,CSCO,MRVL,ONSmi,So
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Table 169-9 has the wrong title. It is about the MPD TPS parameters, not the MPSE discovery parameters (which is the title of Table 169-3).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change title of Table 169-9 to "MPD Transmit Power Signature (TPS) parameters"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Think this should be, "Change title of Table 169-9 to "MPD transmit power signature (TPS) parameters" to align with capitalization in title of clause 169.5.5.3.

IEEE P802.3da D1.3 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.6.1.1.1 P120 L33 # 44

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

quotation marks are never closed.
 "An impulse test consisting of a 1500 V, 10/700 waveform, applied 10 times, with a 60 s interval between pulses. The shape of the impulses is 10/700 (10 µs virtual front time, 700 µs virtual time to half value), as defined in ITU-T Recommendation K.44.

SuggestedRemedy

close the quote:
 "An impulse test consisting of a 1500 V, 10/700 waveform, applied 10 times, with a 60 s interval between pulses. The shape of the impulses is 10/700 (10 µs virtual front time, 700 µs virtual time to half value)", as defined in ITU-T Recommendation K.44.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.6.1.1.2 P120 L51 # 45

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

quotation marks are never closed.
 "An impulse test consisting of a 1500 V, 10/700 waveform, applied 10 times, with a 60 s interval between pulses. The shape of the impulses is 10/700 (10 µs virtual front time, 700 µs virtual time to half value), as defined in ITU-T Recommendation K.44.

SuggestedRemedy

close the quote:
 "An impulse test consisting of a 1500 V, 10/700 waveform, applied 10 times, with a 60 s interval between pulses. The shape of the impulses is 10/700 (10 µs virtual front time, 700 µs virtual time to half value)", as defined in ITU-T Recommendation K.44.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.6.1.1.2 P121 L5 # 46

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

spacing for this paragraph is wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

change spacing of the paragraph to single line.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.7.1 P121 L46 # 47

Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

appearance of PSE. Should be MPSE. I searched the doc and found this lone occurrence.

SuggestedRemedy

Change PSE to MPSE.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.