

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.5 P108 L22 # 164  
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis; aff'l w/ CME Consulting  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 This condition is an event in time, not in location.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace "Where the MPD PI..." with "When the MPD PI..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.4.6 P43 L44 # 167  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 the transition from COMMIT to ABORT, the arrowhead does not touch the boundary of ABORT  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 make arrowhead for the transition from COMMIT to ABORT touch the boundary of ABORT.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.3 P77 L29 # 171  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 rouge "0" and "180" floating in the drawing. Delete these.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete the "0" and "180" that seem to have no purpose in Fig 168-13  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE - see comment 255.

Cl 168 SC 168.9.4 P85 L41 # 173  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Table 168-4 allowed to span across pages. This table is not that big that it needs to span pages. Can we force it to stay together?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change table attributes to disallow spanning pages.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.10.2.1 P86 L48 # 174  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Text is awkwardly spaced, looks like spacing setting is set to "justify" instead of "align left". Also on page 87, line 5  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change line spacing attributes to match the surrounding text, i.e. "align left" instead of "whole line justify".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4 P98 L42 # 179  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 item e), we added react in the last cycle. Reading again it should have been "react to".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add "to" in item e): "To sense, react TO, and recover from..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Add "to" in item e): "To sense, react to, and recover from..."

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.4.3 P99 L18 # 180  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 PI should be MPI.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 replace PI with MPI.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.10 P107 L46 # 187  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 PI should be MPI.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change PI to MPI  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.6 P105 L34 # 184  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 two errors on this line. An extra "it" after MPSE that isn't needed.  
 V\_{Discovery} looks like a cut paste error where \_{Discovery} should be subscript without  
 the curly brackets or underscore.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 delete "it" after MPSE and make V\_{Discovery} match Table 169-3 item 2  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.11 P107 L53 # 188  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 need an "if" before "short\_circuit\_detected is true" but I think this is better as a bulletized  
 list.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 either add to "...if overload\_detected is TRUE, IF short\_circuit\_detected is TRUE, or if..."  
 OR  
 bulletize:  
 full operating voltage shall be removed from the TCI for any of the following reasons:  
 \*in the absence of the MPD MPS  
 \*if overload\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if short\_circuit\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if commanded to do so by a management entity.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change to read:  
 full operating voltage shall be removed from the TCI for any of the following reasons:  
 \*in the absence of the MPD MPS  
 \*if overload\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if short\_circuit\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if commanded to do so by a management entity.

Cl 169 SC 169.4.6 P105 L36 # 185  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 three things on this line:  
 DISCOVERY\_LOW again  
 need "the" before discovery event current  
 and need a comma after discovery event current  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to: "entrance of a DISCOVERY\_LOWx state and measurement of the discovery  
 event current, IDiscovery."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change to read:  
 full operating voltage shall be removed from the TCI for any of the following reasons:  
 \*in the absence of the MPD MPS  
 \*if overload\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if short\_circuit\_detected is TRUE  
 \*if commanded to do so by a management entity.

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.5 P108 L22 # 189  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 "Where the MPD PI is not exposed" either this is MPD MPI (which we just said two words earlier) or this is MPI. I'd suggested the latter.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change MPD PI to MPI  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.4 P116 L1 # 192  
 Jones, Chad Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 three things here:  
 need a comma after TRUE in the first paragraph.  
 Need a comma after FALSE in the second paragraph.  
 Two periods at the end of the second paragraph.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 add comma after TRUE on line 1. add comma after FALSE on line 4. delete extra period at end of line 5.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P9 L1 # 204  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Stds board secretary is now Alpesh Shah  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change Konstantinos Karachalios to Alpesh Shah  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.405a P21 L19 # 207  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Multidrop Powered Device and Multidrop Powe Sourcing Equipment definitions need to be bold.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change format so the words defined in 1.4.405a and 1.4.405b are bold.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 79 SC 79.3.9.3 P36 L19 # 210  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Editing instruction is imprecise. The new section will not be right after 79.3.8, but rather, after the last subsection in 79.3.8, which is 79.3.8.3  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 79.3.8 to 79.3.8.3 in editing instruction.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.3 P98 L19 # 230  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 The top row of Table 169-1 got messed up. The word contact should not be there, and System type should not be bold.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete header "Contact" in first column (leaving header blank), Make first body row (System type) not bold.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.4.3 P99 L31 # 231  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Figure 169-2 text is in the wrong font - should be sans-serif like other figures (Arial or similar - editor to check)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change fonts in figure 169-2 to align with Figure 169-1.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.2 P109 L47 # 232  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ  
 I believe V\_MPD is a variable, not a constant.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete V\_MPD and definition at P109 L47-48  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.3 P110 L42 # 234  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ  
 V\_Mark\_th, V\_Off\_MPD, V\_Reset\_th, V\_type0\_th, and V\_type1\_th are constants, they are listed in the constant section. They can't also be variables.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete V\_Mark\_th, V\_Off\_MPD, V\_Reset\_th, V\_type0\_th, and V\_type1\_th from the variables section (along with their descriptions - (P110 L42 through P111 L5, except P110 L49-51 (V\_MPD)...)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P115 L17 # 235  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Nomenclature in state diagrams is "=" for an equality condition, not "=="  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace == with = on output branches from PON\_EVAL and PON\_LOAD\_ON in Figure 169-8 (8 instances)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.3.6 P115 L17 # 236  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Vtype1\_th should be have type1\_th in subscript  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change Vtype1\_th to V\_type1\_th (subscript type1\_th) on output branches of PON\_EVAL and PON\_LOAD\_ON (6 instances)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5 P117 L25 # 238  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 V\_TYPE0\_TH and V\_TYPE1\_TH have case inconsistent with variables in state diagrams  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make V\_TYPE0\_TH and V\_TYPE1\_TH V\_type0\_th and V\_type1\_th as in state diagrams  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

Cl 169 SC 169.5.5 P117 L39 # 239  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 I\_MPD\_DISABLED has case inconsistent with other values  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change I\_MPD\_DISABLED to I\_MPD\_Disabled in Table 169-8 and 169.5.5.1 (P118 L2)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.9.2 P85 L23 # 259  
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Missing word.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "determined Equation" to "determined using Equation".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P8 L12 # 245  
 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting/ADI, APL Gp, Cisco, Marvell, OnSem  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 "Task Force name" should not be in Chair's title...  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete "Task Force name" on P8 L12 from chair's title  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P50 L2 # 262  
 Baggett, Tim Microchip  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Transition into DISABLED state has misspelled variable "ldplca\_en" in second term. Term should refer to variable "dplca\_en"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "plca\_reset + !ldplca\_en + !plca\_en" to "plca\_reset + !dplca\_en + !plca\_en"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.2 P56 L12 # 254  
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Units should have space.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "50m" to "50 m".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 (note to editor - nonbreaking space)

Cl 148 SC 148.4.7.5 P50 L29 # 263  
 Baggett, Tim Microchip  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Second entry in LEARNING state refers to DPLCA\_AGING in caps. This is a variable (defined in 148.4.7.2 P47L52) and not a constant. As such it should be in lower case letters.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "DPLCA\_AGING" to "dplca\_aging"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.3 P77 L32 # 255  
 Brandt, David Rockwell Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ  
 Figure 168-13, 180 is misplaced from the BALUN.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move "180" to just below "0".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3da D1.2 10 Mbps Multidrop Enhancements

---

Cl 168 SC 168.2 P56 L9 # 266

Baggett, Tim Microchip

Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ

Sentence incorrectly refers to the "10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148". Clause 148 is PLCA. The 10BASE-T1S reference should be to Clause 147.

When corrected, the sentence will still be awkwardly repetitive referring to the "10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode". Delete repetition.

Finally, "operation ON the" is awkward and should probably be "operation OF the".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation on the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

To: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation of the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

*Proposed Response* Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
(align with usage of half duplex)

Change: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation on the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 148 when the Clause 147 PHY is running half-duplex in multidrop mode."

To: "The 10BASE-T1M PHY builds on the operation of the 10BASE-T1S PHY defined in Clause 147 when running half duplex in multidrop mode."

---

Cl 168 SC 168.12.4.7 P94 L27 # 271

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ

Item TCI1 Feature says without PMA loading. This is in contradiction to e.g. 168.9.1 " PMA loads specified for the TCI are to be connected if the DTE is electrically disconnected from the TCI.". Similiar for TCI3

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove TCI1 and TCI3 from table

*Proposed Response* Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.