

P802.3dj D1.0

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.0 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 8 days to complete so for any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks. Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

613 comments received
 4 withdrawn
 246 in bucket #1
 34 in bucket #2
 329 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
1	0	0	1	0	0	4	5	0	5
116	1	0	2	0	0	10	13	0	13
119	1	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	2
120	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
120F	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
169	0	0	5	0	0	15	20	0	20
170	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
171	0	0	4	0	0	0	3	1	4
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
174A	0	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	5
175	0	0	14	0	0	0	14	0	14
175A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
176	13	0	29	0	0	7	49	0	49
176A	6	0	35	3	0	7	51	0	51
176D	1	0	13	0	0	17	31	0	31
176E	0	0	18	0	0	15	33	0	33
177	2	0	29	0	0	8	39	0	39
177A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
178	1	0	13	0	0	84	98	0	98
178A	0	0	8	0	0	3	11	0	11
179	0	0	21	0	0	28	49	0	49
179A	2	0	5	0	0	2	9	0	9
179B	2	0	3	0	0	2	7	0	7
179C	1	0	4	0	0	1	6	0	6
180	0	0	19	1	0	3	23	0	23
181	0	0	13	0	0	6	19	0	19
182	0	0	17	0	0	6	23	0	23
183	0	0	15	0	0	6	21	0	21
184	1	0	29	0	0	5	35	0	35
185	0	0	8	0	0	6	11	3	14
186	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
187	0	0	7	0	0	0	7	0	7
30	0	0	2	0	0	1	3	0	3
90A	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
93B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
Total	31	0	332	4	0	246	609	4	613

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Monday June 3	Task force session (single meeting) Common topics
Tuesday June 4	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Wednesday June 5	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Thursday June 6	Task force session (single meeting) Motion to adopt responses to bucket and editorial comments. Common topics. Electrical topics. (time permitting)
Monday June 10	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Tuesday June 11	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Wednesday June 12	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Thursday June 13	Task force session. (single meeting) Any remaining comments. Closing business

Common (task force)

Clause	Topic	Comments
Many	AUI generations	581
174	1.6T list of interface widths	180
116, 182	FR1 PHY	311
176, 177, 180-182	Precoding	[<u>21</u> , 146, 145, 540, 541], [<u>547</u> , 582, 147, 148, 85]
178, 174A	BER/FLR	[<u>205</u> , 190, 191, 192, 206], 246
177	Inner FEC coding gain	22
116, 176, 177	Skew	531, 181, 182, brown_03
The topics below may be deferred until Thursday June 6 or later (task force or electrical track if optical/logic tracks not meeting). Will be announced at task force meeting or on reflector.		
176A+	ILT terminology	196
73, 116	ILT Service Interface, RTS	194, 195
176A	ILT Coefficients, Diagrams	[<u>457</u> , 458], 500, 550, [569, 570], 575
176A	ILT Frame, Pattern	[<u>358</u> , 61, 200, 496, 497, 548], 562, 498
176A	ILT General	577
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Clause	Topic	Comments
178	BT filter bandwidth	60, 230, 399,32, 245
179	BT filter bandwidth	124, 225, 388, 410, 412, 217
176D	BT filter bandwidth	425, 422
176E	BT filter bandwidth	133, 131
176E	C2M Input	189, 188
176E	C2M Output	65, 139, 365, 522, 132, 186, 203, 187
178	Channel ILdd	34, 251
176E	Channel ILdd	73, 130
179A	Channel ILdd	524, 585
178	COM	33, 250, 402, 249, 400, 253
179	COM	49, 411, 50, 413
176D	COM	430, 427
179A	COM	57
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #2

Clause	Topic	Comments
	COM CTLE	178: 263, 264, 265, 266 176D: 433 176E: 440
	COM eta0	178: 269, 408 179: 419
	COM f_r	178: 36, 257, 404 179: 53, 415 176D: 432 176E: 439
	COM methodology	215, 359, 360, 421, 437, 443
	COM R_d	255, 256, 396, 397, 391, 392, 137, 141
	COM RR	274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 280, 281, 282, 283, 284, 144, 140
	COM T_r	268, 407, 39, 418, 435, 441
	COM TX FFE	37, 258, 259, 260, 261, 262, 405, 416, 142, 138
	COM voltage	38, 267, 406, 417, 434
	DER0	285, 362
	ERL	28, 29, 43, 231, 237, 238, 239, 240, 241, 242, 244, 252, 48, 51, 218, 219, 227, 220, 221, 58

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #3

Clause	Topic	Comments
179A	HCB + MCB	586
	Linear fit	30, 243, 44, 46, 444
178A	MLSD PAM	211, 212, 286, 287
	Multiple COM	42, 71, 54, 70, 143, 504, 72
	R_0	35, 254, 395, 403, 52, 387, 414, 431, 136, 438
	R_LM	273, 409, 420, 436, 442
	RX ITOL/JTOL	247, 248, 177
	TX FFE	233, 234, 235, 288
	TX Jitter	236, 271, 272, 204
	TX RLcc	232
	TX SNDR/SCMR	27, 31, 41, 270, 45, 47
179	TX SNR_ISI	226
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #1

Clause	Topic	Comments
	TX specifications	180: 326 181: 6, 8, [<u>162</u> , 327] 182: 328 183: 7, 9, [<u>12</u> , 503], [<u>164</u> , 329], 166 185: [380, 381], 578, 579 187: [109, 110]
	RX specifications	180: 517 181: 10, 163 183: 11, [165, 167] 185: 580 187: 117
	Optical channel specifications	[207, 208] [116, 383, 517, 173] [<u>335</u> , 336, 337] 183: [125, 126] 185: 382
	Power budget	[<u>128</u> , 169, 171, 172] 180: [<u>127</u> , 170] 181: 161, 173 183: [<u>502</u> , 168]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Clause	Topic	Comments
	Delay	[114, 115]
	Jitter	180: [519, 520]
	RIN-OMA	[518, 13, 14, 15, 16]
	Test pattern	185: 374
	TDECQ	[324, 325] [17, 18, 19, 20] 1
	TQM	185: 384
	Connector labelling	[590, 592, 587, 588, 589, 591]
	IEC revision	[338, 344, 346] [342, 350] [339, 340, 341, 343, 345, 347, 348, 349, 351, 352, 353, 354, 355] [335, 336, 337]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track

Clause	Topic	Comments
171	Link fault signaling	385
175	FEC error counters	468
176	Deskew	367, 368, 594, 596, 598
176	Subclause reorganization	80, 485, 486, 487, 538
176	Test vectors	298, loewenthal_01
177	Inner FEC sync	505
184	Algorithm	97, 613
184	Diagrams	372, 373, 560
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket1_v2.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

TBD

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket2_v2.pdf

No pulls from the bucket will be possible.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn:
462, 578, 579, 580 (so far)