P802.3dj D1.0
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.0 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 8 days to complete so for any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks. Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

613 comments received
9 withdrawn
246 in bucket #1 (34 pulled) closed
34 in bucket #2 closed
138 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	0	0	2	0	0	0	1	1	2
1	0	0	1	0	0	4	0	5	5
116	1	0	2	0	0	10	1	12	13
119	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	2	2
120	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
120F	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
169	0	0	5	0	0	15	0	20	20
170	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
171	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	4	4
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	2	2
174A	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	5	5
175	0	0	14	0	0	0	0	14	14
175A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176	13	0	29	0	0	7	7	42	49
176A	6	0	35	3	0	7	7	44	51
176D	1	0	13	0	0	17	12	19	31
176E	0	0	18	0	0	15	22	11	33
177	2	0	29	0	0	8	4	35	39
177A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	1	0	13	0	0	84	51	47	98
178A	0	0	8	0	0	3	0	11	11
179	0	0	21	0	0	28	25	24	49
179A	2	0	5	0	0	2	4	5	9
179B	2	0	3	0	0	2	0	7	7
179C	1	0	4	0	0	1	0	6	6
180	0	0	19	1	0	3	0	23	23
181	0	0	13	0	0	6	0	19	19
182	0	0	17	0	0	6	0	23	23
183	0	0	15	0	0	6	0	21	21
184	1	0	29	0	0	5	1	34	35
185	0	0	8	0	0	6	0	14	14
186	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
187	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	7	7
30	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	3	3
45	0	0	4	0	0	1	0	5	5
73	0	0	1	0	0	2	2	1	3
90A	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
93B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
Total	31	0	332	4	0	246	138	475	613

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
~~Monday June 3~~	~~Task force session (single meeting)~~ ~~Common topics~~
~~Tuesday June 4~~	~~Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)~~
~~Wednesday June 5~~	~~Tracks: Electrical only~~
~~Thursday June 6~~	~~Task force session (single meeting)~~ ~~Motion to adopt responses to bucket #1 and bucket #2 comments.~~ ~~Common topics.~~ ~~Electrical topics.~~
Monday June 10	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, ~~Optical~~ (~~three~~ two parallel meetings)
Tuesday June 11	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Wednesday June 12	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Thursday June 13	Task force session. (single meeting) Any remaining comments. Closing business

Common (task force)

Clause	Topic	Comments (13 open)
174	1.6T list of interface widths	~~180~~
116, 182	FR1 PHY	~~311~~
176, 177, 180-182	Precoding	[~~21~~, ~~146~~, ~~145~~, ~~540~~, ~~541~~], [~~547~~, ~~582~~, ~~147~~, ~~148~~, ~~85~~]
178, 174A	BER/FLR	[~~205~~, ~~190~~, ~~191~~, ~~192~~, ~~206~~]
177	Inner FEC coding gain	~~22~~
185	Test pattern	~~374~~
116, 169	Figures, tables	[~~78~~, ~~321~~], [~~152~~, ~~510~~]
180	Jitter	~~519~~, ~~520~~
176A+	ILT terminology	~~196~~
176A	ILT General	~~577~~
176A	ILT Coefficients, Diagrams	[~~457~~, ~~458~~], ~~500~~, ~~550~~, [~~569~~, ~~570~~], ~~575~~
73, 116	ILT Service Interface, RTS	194, ~~195~~
176A	ILT Frame, Pattern	[358, 61, 200, 496, 497, 548], ~~562~~, 498
Many	AUI generations	581
116, 176, 177	Skew	531, 181, 182
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
Many	Many	~~dawe_3dj_01a_2406~~
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**BT filter bandwidth**	178: ~~60~~, ~~230~~, ~~399~~,~~32~~, ~~245~~ 179: ~~124~~, ~~225~~, ~~388~~, ~~410~~, ~~412~~, ~~217~~ 176D: ~~425~~, ~~422~~ 176E: ~~133~~, ~~131~~
178, 179, 179B	**ERL/dERL**	178: ~~28~~, ~~29~~, ~~43~~, ~~237~~, ~~238~~, ~~239~~, ~~240~~, ~~241~~, [~~231~~, ~~244~~], ~~252~~ 179: ~~48~~, ~~51~~ 179B: ~~58~~
179/176E	**ERL Tfx**	179: ~~227~~, ~~218~~, ~~219~~ 176E: ~~220~~, ~~221~~
178, 179, 176D, 179A	**COM**	178: [~~33~~, ~~250~~, ~~402~~, ~~253~~], [~~249~~, ~~400~~] 179: [~~50~~, ~~413~~], [~~49~~, ~~411~~] 176D: ~~430~~, ~~427~~ 179A: ~~57~~
178A	**DER0, MLSD**	~~362~~, ~~287~~, ~~286~~, ~~211~~, ~~212~~, ~~285~~
178, 176D, 176E	**COM CTLE parameters**	178: ~~263~~, ~~264~~, ~~265~~, ~~266~~ 176D: ~~433~~ 176E: ~~440~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #2 – continuing on Monday June 10

Clause	Topic	Comments (28 open)
176E, 178, 179A	**Channel ILdd**	176E: ~~73~~, ~~130~~, ~~129~~, ~~134~~ 178: [34, 251] 179A: 524, 585
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**COM Rx FFE length parameters**	178: [~~274~~, ~~275~~, ~~276~~, ~~277~~, ~~278~~], ~~42~~, ~~71W~~ 179: ~~54~~, ~~70W~~ 176D: *504*, 144 176E: ~~72~~, *140* ~~lusted_3dj_07_2405 (also for eta0), lusted_3dj_01a_2406~~
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM eta0	178: ~~269~~, ~~408~~, ~~71W~~ 179: ~~419~~, ~~70W~~ 176D: [504, heck_3dj_01b_2405], *143* 176E: ~~72~~
178, 179, 176D	COM voltages	~~38~~, ~~267~~, ~~406~~, ~~417~~, 434
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**Reference impedance, COM R_d, COM R_0**	178: 395, [396, *397*, *255, 256*], 35, [254, 403] 179: 387, [391, *392*], 52, 414 176D: *141*, 431 176E: *137*, 136, 438
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #3

Clause	Topic	Comments (27 comments)
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**COM Tx FFE**	178: 37, [258, 259, 260, 261, 262], 405 179: 416 176D: 142 176E: 138
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**COM Rx FFE coefficient limits**	178: [279, 280, 281, 282, 283, 284 lim_3dj_01_2405], ~~42, 71~~ ~~179: 54, 70~~ 176D: [504 heck_3dj_01b_2405], 144 176E: ~~72~~, 140
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**COM f_r**	178: 36, 257, 404 179: 53, 415 176D: 432 176E: 439
178, 179, 176D, 176E	**COM T_r**	178: 268, 407 179: 39, 418 176D: 435 176E: 441
178, 178, 176D, 176E	**TX Jitter**	178: [236, 271, 272] 178, 178, 176D, 176E: [204 ran_3dj_03_2405]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #4

Clause	Topic	Comments (55 open)
178, 179	**TX SNDR/SCMR/SNR_TX**	178: 27, 31, 41, 270 179: 45, 47
176E	**C2M Input**	[188, 189]
176E	**C2M Output**	[186, 187, 203], [65, 132, 139, 365], 522
178	**Tx RLcc**	232, 242
178, 179, 176D, 176E, 179A	COM methodology	359, [360, 421, 437, 443], 215
179A	HCB + MCB	586
178, 179, 176E	**Linear fit**	30, 243, 44, 46, 444
178, 179, 176D, 176E	Assorted COM parameters	~~42, 71, 54, 70~~, 143, 504, ~~72~~
178, 179, 176D, 176E	R_LM	[273, 409, 420, 436, 442]
178	TX FFE	233, 234, 235, 288
179	TX SNR_ISI	226
178, 179	**RX ITOL/JTOL**	247, 248, 177, 246
	pulls from bucket #1, to be sorted	62, 64, 390, 452, 511, 512, 513, 514, 515, 523, 55, 40
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Optical track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
	TX specifications	180: ~~326~~ 181: ~~6~~, ~~8~~, [~~162~~, ~~327~~] 182: ~~328~~ 183: ~~7~~, ~~9~~, [~~12~~, ~~503~~], [~~164~~, ~~329~~], ~~166~~ 185: [~~380~~, ~~381~~], ~~578~~, ~~579~~ 187: [~~109~~, ~~110~~]
	RX specifications	180: ~~517~~ 181: ~~10~~, ~~163~~ 183: ~~11~~, [~~165~~, ~~167~~] 185: ~~580~~ 187: ~~117~~
	Optical channel specifications	[~~207~~, ~~208~~] [~~116~~, ~~383~~, ~~173~~] [~~335~~, ~~336~~, ~~337~~] 183: [~~125~~, ~~126~~] 185: ~~382~~
	Power budget	[~~128~~, ~~169~~, ~~171~~, ~~172~~] 180: [~~127~~, ~~170~~] 181: ~~161~~, ~~173~~ 183: [~~502~~, ~~168~~]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
	Delay	[~~114~~, ~~115~~]
	RIN-OMA	[~~518~~, ~~13~~, ~~14~~, ~~15~~, ~~16~~]
	TDECQ	[~~324~~, ~~325~~] [~~17~~, ~~18~~, ~~19~~, ~~20~~] ~~1~~
	TQM	185: ~~384~~
	Connector labeling	[~~590~~, ~~592~~, ~~587~~, ~~588~~, ~~589~~, ~~591~~]
	IEC revision	[~~338~~, ~~344~~, ~~346~~] [~~342~~, ~~350~~] [~~339~~, ~~340~~, ~~341~~, ~~343~~, ~~345~~, ~~347~~, ~~348~~, ~~349~~, ~~351~~, ~~352~~, ~~353~~, ~~354~~, ~~355~~] [~~335~~, ~~336~~, ~~337~~]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
~~171~~	~~Link fault signaling~~	~~385~~
~~175~~	~~FEC error counters~~	~~468~~
~~176~~	~~Test vectors (SM-PMA)~~	~~[298, loewenthal_3dj_01a_2406~~
~~177~~	~~Inner FEC sync~~	~~505~~
~~184~~	~~Algorithm~~	~~[613, 97]~~
~~184~~	~~Diagrams~~	~~[372, 373]~~, ~~[307, 560]~~
~~176~~	~~Subclause reorganization (SM-PMA)~~	~~[80, 485, 486, 487, 538]~~
~~175~~	~~timesync~~	~~332~~
~~184~~	~~reorder~~	~~[178, 92]~~
~~184~~	~~Algorithm~~	~~93~~, ~~94~~, ~~96~~, ~~99~~, ~~100~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Note: Comments #93 and #178 were pulled from the bucket during the June 10 logic track comment consideration (Day 2) call.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #2 – continuing on Monday June 10 (Note: starting at 10am ET)

Clause	Topic	Comments (12 open)
176	Deskew (200GbE/400GbE)	[368, 367, 594, 596, 598, shrikhande_3dj_01_2406]
177, 184	pad insertion, functional	[84, 489], 89
177	Inner FEC sync	492
176	timesync	597
73	Priority table	149
73	ITL TRS SI	194[1]
116	skew (common)	531[1]

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
[1] These comments (from the common track) are included for discussion only, in an attempt to try and build some initial consensus within the logic track. These comments will not be closed in the logic track.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Page done

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket1_v2.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:
40, 55, 62, 64, 78, 84, 89, 92, 93, 94, 96, 99, 100, 106, 129, 134, 149, 152, 178, 307, 321, 332, 390, 452, 489, 492, 510, 511, 512, 513, 514, 515, 523, 597 (34 comments)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket2_v2.pdf
No pulls from the bucket will be possible.

Bucket #1 comments (not pulled) and bucket #2 comments adopted on Thursday June 6.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
462, 578, 579, 580, 606, 607, 71, 70, 106