

P802.3dj D1.0

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.0 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 8 days to complete so for any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks. Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

613 comments received

9 withdrawn

246 in bucket #1 (34 pulled) closed

34 in bucket #2 closed

523 closed so far

90 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	0	0	2	0	0	0	1	1	2
1	0	0	1	0	0	4	0	5	5
116	1	0	2	0	0	10	1	12	13
119	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	2	2
120	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
120F	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
169	0	0	5	0	0	15	0	20	20
170	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
171	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	4	4
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	2	2
174A	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	5	5
175	0	0	14	0	0	0	0	14	14
175A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176	13	0	29	0	0	7	1	48	49
176A	6	0	35	3	0	7	7	44	51
176D	1	0	13	0	0	17	8	23	31
176E	0	0	18	0	0	15	18	15	33
177	2	0	29	0	0	8	1	38	39
177A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	1	0	13	0	0	85	29	70	99
178A	0	0	8	0	0	3	0	11	11
179	0	0	21	0	0	27	18	30	48
179A	2	0	5	0	0	2	4	5	9
179B	2	0	3	0	0	2	0	7	7
179C	1	0	4	0	0	1	0	6	6
180	0	0	19	1	0	3	0	23	23
181	0	0	13	0	0	6	0	19	19
182	0	0	17	0	0	6	0	23	23
183	0	0	15	0	0	6	0	21	21
184	1	0	29	0	0	5	0	35	35
185	0	0	8	0	0	6	0	14	14
186	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
187	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	7	7
30	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	3	3
45	0	0	4	0	0	1	0	5	5
73	0	0	1	0	0	2	1	2	3
90A	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
93B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
Total	31	0	332	4	0	246	90	523	613

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Monday June 3	Task force session (single meeting) Common topics
Tuesday June 4	Tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical (three parallel meetings)
Wednesday June 5	Tracks: Electrical only
Thursday June 6	Task force session (single meeting) Motion to adopt responses to bucket #1 and bucket #2 comments. Common topics: Electrical topics:
Monday June 10	Tracks: Logic, Electrical (two parallel meetings)
Tuesday June 11	Tracks: Electrical (one meeting)
Wednesday June 12	One meeting split as follows: Start as task force to address some common topics Switch to electrical track to address electrical topics
Thursday June 13	Task force session. (single meeting) Any remaining comments. Closing business

Common (task force)

Clause	Topic	Comments (12 open)
174	1.6T list of interface widths	480
116, 182	FR1 PHY	344
176, 177, 180-182	Precoding	[21, 146, 145, 540, 541], [547, 582, 147, 148, 85]
178, 174A	BER/FLR	[205, 490, 491, 492, 206]
177	Inner FEC coding gain	22
185	Test pattern	374
116, 169	Figures, tables	[78, 324], [152, 510]
180	Jitter	519, 520
176A+	ILT terminology	496
176A	ILT General	577
176A	ILT Coefficients, Diagrams	[457, 458], 500, 550, [569, 570], 575
73, 116	ILT Service Interface, RTS	194, 495
176A	ILT Frame, Pattern	[358, 61, 200, 496, 497, 548], 562, 498
Many	AUI generations	581
116, 176, 177	Skew	531, 181, 182
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
Many	Many	<u>clawc_3dj_01a_2406</u>
178, 179, 176D, 176E	BT filter bandwidth	178: 60 , 230, 309,32 , 245 179: 424, 225, 388, 410, 412, 217 176D: 425, 422 176E: 433, 434
178, 179, 179B	ERL/dERL	178: 28, 29 , 43, 237, 238, 239, 240, 244, [234, 244], 252 179: 48, 54 179B: 58
179/176E	ERL Tfx	179: 227 , 218, 219 176E: 220, 224
178, 179, 176D, 179A	COM	178: [33 , 250 , 402, 253], [249, 400] 179: [50, 413], [49, 414] 176D: 430, 427 179A: 57
178A	DER0, MLSD	362 , 287, 286, 244, 212, 285
178, 176D, 176E	COM CTLE parameters	178: 263 , 264, 265, 266 176D: 433 176E: 440
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #2 – continuing on Tuesday June 11

Clause	Topic	Comments (19 open)
176E, 178, 179A	Channel ILdd	176E: 73 , 130 , 129 , 134 178: [34, 251] 179A: 524, 585
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM Rx FFE length parameters	178: [274 , 275 , 276 , 277 , 278], 42, 71W 179: 54 , 70W 176D: 504 , 144 176E: 72 , 140 lusted_3dj_07_2405 (also for eta0), lusted_3dj_01a_2406
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM eta0	178: 269 , 408 , 71W 179: 419 , 70W 176D: [504, heck_3dj_01b_2405], 143 176E: 72
178, 179, 176D	COM voltages	38 , 267, 406, 417, 434
178, 179, 176D, 176E	Reference impedance, COM R_d, COM R_0	178: 395 , [396 , 397 , 255 , 256], 35 , [254, 403] 179: 387, [394 , 392], 52, 414 176D: 141, 431 176E: 137, 136, 438

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #3

Clause	Topic	Comments (5 open)
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM Tx FFE	178: 37 , [258, 259, 260, 261, 262], 405 179: 416 176D: 442 176E: 438
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM Rx FFE coefficient limits	178: [279, 280, 281, 282, 283, 284 lim_3dj_01_2405], 42, 74 179: 54, 70 176D: [504 heck_3dj_01b_2405], 444 176E: 72, 140
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM f_r	178: 36, 257, 404 179: 53, 415 176D: 432 176E: 439
178, 179, 176D, 176E	COM T_r	178: 268, 407 179: 39, 418 176D: 435 176E: 441
178, 178, 176D, 176E	TX Jitter	178: [236, 271, 272] 178, 178, 176D, 176E: [204 ran_3dj_03_2405]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Electrical track #4

Clause	Topic	Comments (59 open)
178, 179	TX SNDR/SCMR/SNR_TX	178: <u>27</u> , 31, 41, 270 179: 45, 47
176E	C2M Input	[<u>188</u> , 189]
176E	C2M Output	[<u>186</u> , 187, 203], [65, 132, 139, 365], 522
178	Tx RLcc	232, 242
178, 179, 176D, 176E, 179A	COM methodology	359, [<u>360</u> , 421, 437, 443], 215
179A	HCb + MCB	586
178, 179, 176E	Linear fit	[<u>30</u> , 243, 44, 46, 444]
178, 179, 176D, 176E	Assorted COM parameters	42, 71, 54, 70 , 143, 504, 72
178, 179, 176D, 176E	R_LM	[<u>273</u> , 409, 420, 436, 442]
178	TX FFE	233, <u>234</u> , 235, 288
179	TX SNR_ISI	226
178, 179	RX ITOL/JTOL	247, 248, 177, <u>246</u>
176D, 176E	AUI informative notes	<u>62</u> , <u>64</u>
179	Tx output specs	<u>452</u> , <u>511</u> , <u>512</u> , <u>513</u> , <u>514</u> , <u>515</u> ,
	pulls from bucket #1, to be sorted	, <u>390</u> , <u>523</u> , <u>55</u> , <u>40</u>

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Topic** = editorial slides

Optical track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
	TX specifications	180: 326 181: 6, 8, [162, 327] 182: 328 183: 7, 9, [42, 503], [164, 329], 466 185: [380, 384], 578, 579 187: [409, 410]
	RX specifications	180: 517 181: 40, 463 183: 44, [465, 467] 185: 580 187: 417
	Optical channel specifications	[207, 208] [416, 383, 473] [335, 336, 337] 183: [425, 426] 185: 382
	Power budget	[428 , 469, 474, 472] 180: [427, 470] 181: 464, 473 183: [502, 468]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
	Delay	[414 , 415]
	RIN-OMA	[518 , 43, 44, 45, 46]
	TDECQ	[324 , 325] [17 , 48, 49, 20] 4
	TQM	185: 384
	Connector labeling	[590 , 592, 587, 588, 589, 594]
	IEC revision	[338 , 344, 346] [342 , 350] [339 , 340, 341, 343, 345, 347, 348, 349, 351, 352, 353, 354, 355] [335 , 336, 337]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Page done

Clause	Topic	Comments
174	Link fault signaling	385
175	FEC error counters	468
176	Test vectors (SM-PMA)	[298, loewenthal_3dj_01a_2406]
177	Inner FEC-syne	505
184	Algorithm	[613 , 97]
184	Diagrams	[372 , 373], [307, 560]
176	Subclause reorganization (SM-PMA)	[80, 485, 486, 487, 538]
175	timesyne	332
184	reorder	[178, 92]
184	Algorithm	93, 94, 96, 99, 100
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i> Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Note: Comments #93 and #178 were pulled from the bucket during the June 10 logic track comment consideration (Day 2) call.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #2 – continuing on Monday June 10

(Note: starting at 10am ET)

Clause	Topic	Comments (12 open)
476	Deskew (200GbE/400GbE)	[368, 367, 594, 596, 598, shrikhande_3dj_01_2406]
177, 184	pad insertion, functional	[84, 489], 89
477	Inner FEC syne	492 (withdrawn)
476	timesyne	597
73	Priority table	149
73	ITL-RTS-SI	194 [†]
416	skew (common)	531 [†]

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

[†] These comments (from the common track) are included for discussion only, in an attempt to try and build some initial consensus within the logic track. These comments will not be closed in the logic track.

Page done

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Page done

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket1_v2.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

40, 55, 62, 64, 78, 84, 89, 92, 93, 94, 96, 99, 100, 106, 129, 134, 149, 152, 178, 307, 321, 332, 390, 452, 489, 492, 510, 511, 512, 513, 514, 515, 523, 597 (34 comments)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p0/8023dj_D1p0_comments_proposed_bucket2_v2.pdf

No pulls from the bucket will be possible.

Bucket #1 comments (not pulled) and bucket #2 comments adopted on Thursday June 6.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
462, 578, 579, 580, 606, 607, 71, 70, 106