

P802.3dj D1.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

(preliminary)

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.1 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.
- ❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 4 days to complete
 - Any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

587 comments received

21 withdrawn

167 in bucket #1, with 26 pulled

53 in bucket #2

0 closed so far

372 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
1	0	0	4	0	0	1	3	2	5
116	1	0	8	0	0	2	10	1	11
119	0	0	2	0	0	0	1	1	2
120F	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
120G	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
169	0	0	2	1	0	2	5	0	5
171	1	0	3	0	0	2	6	0	6
172	1	0	1	0	0	1	2	1	3
174	0	0	3	0	0	2	5	0	5
174A	1	0	8	0	0	1	10	0	10
175	0	0	3	0	0	0	3	0	3
176	1	0	27	0	0	2	27	3	30
176A	0	0	35	0	0	21	53	3	56
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
176D	0	0	10	0	0	10	20	0	20
176E	4	0	13	1	0	36	54	0	54
177	0	0	8	0	0	3	11	0	11
177A	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
178	6	0	11	0	0	34	51	0	51
178A	0	0	2	0	0	7	9	0	9
179	5	0	17	0	0	37	58	1	59
179A	0	0	2	7	0	14	23	0	23
179B	0	0	0	3	0	10	13	0	13
179A	0	0	2	7	0	14	23	0	23
179B	0	0	0	3	0	10	13	0	13
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
179D	0	0	2	1	0	1	4	0	4
180	2	0	9	1	0	22	33	1	34
181	0	0	2	0	0	13	13	2	15
182	0	0	10	0	0	23	31	2	33
183	0	0	6	0	0	24	28	2	30
184	2	0	20	0	0	4	25	1	26
184A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
185	0	0	5	0	0	9	14	0	14
186	7	0	15	0	0	4	26	0	26
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
187	0	0	8	0	0	0	8	0	8
30	2	0	0	0	0	3	5	0	5
45	3	0	1	1	0	2	6	1	7
90A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
Total	38	0	240	15	0	294	566	21	587

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Thursday Sep 5 (online)	Online Task force Motion to adopt bucket #1 and bucket #2. May view presentation(s) and/or close a few comments
Monday Sep 16	Morning: Task force. Possible motion to adopt bucket #3. Cross-clause (not optical) comments, electrical comments Afternoon: Task force. Remaining cross-clause comments (until done), electrical comments Evening: Electrical track only (if needed)
Tuesday Sep 17	Morning/afternoon: Electrical track, logic track, optical track Evening: Electrical track only (if needed)
Wednesday Sep 18	Electrical track, logic track, optical track
Thursday Sep 19	Common (task force) track Remaining comments. Prioritized appropriately.

Common (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Annex reorganization	176A/C/D/E	511
Signaling rate	176E+	118, 367
AUI architecture	176D/E, 176, 177, (maybe 120D/120E)	[516, 357, 478, 224, 225, brown_xx]
Error ratio, general	Many	314, 550, 133, 134, 318, 324, 325, 326, 473, healey_xx
Error ratio, BERadded	Many	164, 361, 165, 166, 316, 137, 141, 143, 152, ran_xx
ILT: General	176A	46, [480, brown_xx], 481, 482, [483, 484]
ILT: LT types	176A	[209, 77, 132]
ILT: Coefficients and presets	176A	[186 he_?], 184
ILT: Training patterns	176A	[76, 495], 218
ILT: Precoding	176A, 176, 177	509, [212, 213, 214, 215, 216, 217]
ILT: Message format	176A	336, 335
ILT: State diagrams	176A	508, 64
ILT: Timing	176A	61, 505
ILT: Extender	176A	[492, 493]
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Topic	C178	C179	A176D	A176E	Others
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	[<u>377</u> , 2, 545]	[1, 546]	[<u>37</u> , 35 , 142, 547]		178A: 567
ERL (10)	[<u>526</u> , 542], [<u>540</u> , 531 , 541], 543		539	[<u>423</u> , 150]	179B: 444
MLSD (8)	[4 , 529 , 530], 363 (CC)	[3 , 535 , 536]			178A: [327 healey_?], 179A: 208
A_v, A_ne, A_fe, Tx diff PtP, vf (17)	[160 , 376], 528, 523	534, 524 , 563 , 161	[410, 538], 162 , 139	416 , 163 , 573, 146 , 570	
Frequency masks (9) [ran_?]	[374, 527], 378, 379, 380	387, 388, 393			179B: 445
Host channel (15)		395 , [537 lim_?]	[33 heck_?]	[148, 196, <u>420</u>], 418, 422 , 115	179A: 566 , [194, <u>519</u> , 521, 522], 195
ILdd budget (8)		[<u>460</u> , 461, 189], 190			179A: 432, 518, 520 179B: 126
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #1 - 2nd alternative

Topic	C178
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	[377 , 35, 567], [2, 545], [1, 546], [37, 142, 547]
ERL (10)	[526 , 542], [540 , 531 , 541 , 444], [423 , 150], 543, 539
MLSD (8)	[529 , 4, 3, 535], [530 , 536], [327 healey_?], 363, 208
A_v, A_ne, A_fe, Tx diff PtP, vf (17)	[160 , 161], 376 , [162 , 163], 528, 534, [523 , 524 , 563 , 146 , 570], [410, 538], 139, 416 , 573
Frequency masks (9)	[374, 527], 378, 379, 380, 387, 388, 393, 445 ran_?
Host channel (15)	[395 , 537 lim_?, 422], [33 heck_?], [148, 196, 420], 115, 566 , [194, 519 , 521, 522], 195, 418
ILdd budget (8)	[460 , 461, 189], 432, 518, [520 , 126], 190
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>	

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Topic	C178	C179	A176D	A176E	Others
Rx test details (6)	[371, 372]	332, 390		154, 158	
Rx test multi-lane (3)	334 (CC)			[155, 157]	
C2M link diagram (2)				[412, 515 ran_?]	
DC common mode (2)				147, 417	
S-parameter Frequency range (4)					178A: [425, 548] 179B: 439, 446
Test fixture spec parameters (3)					179B: 442, 443, 447
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Topic	C178	C179	A176D	A176E	Others
Test fixture delay (4)	532	[199, 200, 201]		198	
CA types, nomenclature (6)		394, [130, 131], 191			179B: 127, 128
AC coupling (9)	[533, 119, 120, 121]	[122, 123, 125]		[114, 413]	
Rx test methodology (3)		[389, 391, 392] (CC)			
Tx FFE preset (2)		333 (CC)		569 (CC)	
Tx AC CM (3)		385, 386		575	
Tx jitter (6)	174, 368 (CC)	383 (CC)	176	177, 178	
VEC (4)		564, 577, 561		[322 Calvin_?]	
Pulled from bucket #1	116, 117, 153, 175, 179, 180, 181, 182, 188, 193, 565, 571, 572, 578				
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>					
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TQM	185, 187:	[259, 260], dambrosia_xx
Tx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[353, 552, 554, 555], 553, maniloff_xx, kota_xx 463, 464
Rx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[354, 551, 558], 556, 557, maniloff_xx, kota_xx 465
Optical channel - coherent	187:	467, 468
Power budget - coherent	187:	466
Chromatic dispersion	180: 181: 182: 183: 180, 183	22, 24, johnson_xx 28, 29, johnson_xx 23, johnson_xx [18, 19, 93], 20, 21, johnson_xx [266, 267], johnson_xx
Channel insertion loss	181:	39
Tx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	312 86, 168, [320, 321] [89, 171], 172

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Rx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	[<u>311</u> , 261], 403, 404 169, 262 173
Power budget - IMDD	180: 183:	66 319
Optical channel - IMDD	183:	94
Tap weights (TDECQ)	180: 181: 182: 183:	[<u>202</u> , 68], welch_xx [<u>203</u> , 79], welch_xx [<u>204</u> , 83], welch_xx [<u>205</u> , 96], welch_xx
TDECQ	182: 183: 181, 183	167, 313, mi_xx [<u>170</u> , 88, 90, 91, 92], 315 [<u>80</u> , 84, 97]
TDECQ test setup	180, 181, 182, 183:	[<u>67</u> , 78, 82, 95]
Test patterns	182:	317
Test points	180:	399
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Tx compliance	182:	25, 27
Signal detect	180:	400
RIN	180:	407, 408, 409
MDI	180, 182:	[341, 342], dambrosia_xx
ILT	180, 181, 182, 183:	[98, 103, 105, 106, 111, 113], issenhuth_xx [100, 101, 102, 108, 109, 110], issenhuth_xx
Jitter	180:	402, 562
Pulled from bucket #1		99, 107
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Time sync	Many	[268, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273, <u>274</u> , 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286, 287, 288, 289, 290, 291, 292, 293, 294, nicholl_3dj_xx_2409]
PTP accuracy (ER1)	171,186	[254, 255, 256, 301, <u>302</u> , 303, 356, 457, 458, huber_3dj_xx_2409]
PMA service interface	176	[13, 17, 228, 229, 235, 236, 237, 238, <u>585</u>]
Features, Symbol lock	176	[<u>14, 16</u>], <u>182</u> , [<u>296</u> , 297]
Deskew	177	[5, <u>159</u>]
IBSF	177	[<u>359</u> , 469, 470, 471, he_3dj_xx_2409]
General	184	<u>50</u>
Delay	184	[559, kota_3dj_xx_2409]
Pilot sequence	184	[560, kota_3dj_xx_2409]
Pseudocode	184	[243, 246, 247, 249, 250, 252], [<u>244</u> , 245], huber_3dj_xx_2409
PMD interface	184,186	[251, 257, <u>514</u>]
Payload Type value	186	<u>253</u>
General	186	<u>56</u>
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

14, 16, 46, 50, 56, 99, 107, 116, 117, 153, 175, 179, 180, 181, 182, 188, 193, 215, 224, 225, 253, 296, 565, 571, 572, 578 (26 comments total)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf

No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

A third bucket (Bucket #3) may be announced early next week.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):

62, 63, 72, 73, 74, 75, 81, 85, 87, 124, 309, 453, 475, 476, 497, 512, 579, 580,
581, 582, 583