

P802.3dj D1.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.1 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.
- ❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 4 days to complete
 - Any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

587 comments received
 22 withdrawn
 141 in bucket #1 closed
 53 in bucket #2 closed
 216 total closed so far
 371 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
1	0	0	4	0	0	1	0	5	5
116	1	0	8	0	0	2	4	7	11
119	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
120F	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
120G	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
169	0	0	2	1	0	2	2	3	5
171	1	0	3	0	0	2	5	1	6
172	1	0	1	0	0	1	0	3	3
174	0	0	3	0	0	2	4	1	5
174A	1	0	8	0	0	1	7	3	10
175	0	0	3	0	0	0	2	1	3
176	1	0	27	0	0	2	17	13	30
176A	0	0	35	0	0	21	25	31	56
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176D	0	0	10	0	0	10	13	7	20
176E	4	0	13	1	0	36	40	14	54
177	0	0	8	0	0	3	9	2	11
177A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	6	0	11	0	0	34	37	14	51
178A	0	0	2	0	0	7	5	4	9
179	5	0	17	0	0	37	45	14	59
179A	0	0	2	7	0	14	10	13	23
179B	0	0	0	3	0	10	10	3	13
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
179D	0	0	2	1	0	1	2	2	4
180	2	0	9	1	0	22	27	7	34
181	0	0	2	0	0	13	11	4	15
182	0	0	10	0	0	23	25	8	33
183	0	0	6	0	0	24	24	6	30
184	2	0	20	0	0	4	15	11	26
184A	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
185	0	0	5	0	0	9	13	1	14
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
187	0	0	8	0	0	0	8	0	8
30	2	0	0	0	0	3	0	5	5
45	3	0	1	1	0	2	0	7	7
90A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	38	0	240	15	0	294	371	216	587

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Thursday Sep 5 (online)	Online Task force Motion to adopt bucket #1 and bucket #2. May view presentation(s) and/or close a few comments
Monday Sep 16	Morning: Task force. Possible motion to adopt bucket #3. Cross-clause (not optical) comments, electrical comments Afternoon: Task force. Remaining cross-clause comments (until done), electrical comments Evening: Electrical track only (if needed)
Tuesday Sep 17	Morning/afternoon: Electrical track, logic track, optical track Evening: Electrical track, logic track, optical track (if needed)
Wednesday Sep 18	Electrical track, logic track, optical track
Thursday Sep 19	Common (task force) track Remaining comments. Prioritized appropriately.

Common (task force) #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Annex reorganization	176A/C/D/E	511
Signaling rate	Many	118, 367, brown_04
Error ratio, block error ratio method	174A	324, 325, 326, healey_02
Error ratio, block error ratio vs BER	174A, 182	318, 314, mi_01
Error ratio, BERadded values	Many	[137, 143, 361, 166, 164, 165, 316, brown_04]
Error ratio, BERadded context	Many	141, 152
Error ratio, target value	184/185	550, kota_xx slide 3
Error ratio, organization	174A	134
Error ratio, nomenclature	Many	[473,133]
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common (task force) #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
AUI architecture and ILT signaling	176D/E, 176, 177	[516, 508, 357, 478, 224, 225, brown_03]
ILT: General	176A	46, [480, brown_03], 481, 482, [483, 484]
ILT: LT types	176A	[209, 77, 132]
ILT: Coefficients and presets	176A	184
ILT: Training patterns	176A	[495, 76], 218
ILT: Precoding	176A, 176, 177	509, [212, 213, 214, 215, 216, 217]
ILT: Message format	176A	336, 335
ILT: State diagrams	176A	64
ILT: Timing	176A	61, 505
ILT: Extender	176A	[492, 493]
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	<u>377</u> , <u>2</u> , 545	<u>1</u> , 546	<u>37</u> , <u>35</u> , 142, <u>547</u>		567	
ERL (10)	<u>526</u> , <u>542</u>], <u>540</u> , <u>531</u> , <u>541</u>], 543		<u>539</u>	[<u>423</u> , 150]		179B: <u>444</u>
MLSD (8)	<u>4</u> , <u>529</u> , <u>530</u>], 363 (CC)	<u>3</u> , <u>535</u> , <u>536</u>]			<u>327</u> healey_01]	179A: <u>208</u>
Frequency masks (9)	ran_01, [374, 527], 378, 379, 380	387, 388, 393				179B: 445
A_v, A_ne, A_fe vs. R_d (9)	<u>376</u> , <u>160</u> , <u>528</u>	<u>161</u> , <u>534</u>	<u>162</u> , <u>410</u> , <u>538</u>	<u>163</u> , 573		
Tx diff PtP, vf, dvf (7)	<u>523</u> , <u>simms_01</u>	<u>524</u> , <u>563</u>	139	[<u>416</u> ran_02] <u>146</u> , <u>570</u>		

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Topic	179	176D	176E	179ABCD
ILdd budget, reach (11)	[460, 461, 189, mellitz_01, kareti_01], 190	33	[115 lusted_04, ghiasi_03, kareti_02]	179A: [519, 521, 522], 432, 518
Host channel model and parameters (7)	395, [537 lim_01], 193		422, 418	179A: 566, 195
ILdd equations and figures (4)			[420, 148, 196 ran_03]	194
MTF (2)				179A: 520 179B: 126
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>				
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1				

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Topic	178	179	176E	178A	179ABCD
Rx test details (6)	[<u>371</u> , <u>372</u>]	332, 390	154, 158		
Rx test multi-lane (3)	334 (CC)		[155, 157]		
C2M link diagram (2)			[<u>412</u> , 515 ran_03, ghiasi_04]		
DC common mode (2)			147, 417		
S-parameter frequency range (4)				[425, <u>548</u>]	179B: 439, 446
Test fixture spec parameters (3)					179B: 442, 443, 447
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #4

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Test fixture delay (4)	532	[199, 200, 201]		198		
CA types, nomenclature (6)		394, [130, 131], 191				179B: 127, 128
AC coupling (9)	[533, 119, 120, 121]	[122, 123, 125]		[114, 413]		
Rx test methodology (4)		[389, 391, 392] (CC)		153		
Tx FFE preset (2)		333 healey_03 (CC)		569 (CC)		
Tx AC CM (3)		385, 386		575		
Tx jitter (10)	174, 368 (CC)	383 (CC), 175 calvin_01, 181, zivny_01	176	[177, 178], [179 180]		
VEC (9)		564, 577, 561 calvin_04, 565, 578, dawe_01		[322 Calvin_02], [116, 117], 571		
COM (1)					188	
Tx test setup (1)				572		
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>						
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1						

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TQM	185, 187:	[259, 260], issenhuth_01
Tx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[353, 552, 554, 555], 553, maniloff_01, kota_02 463, 464
Rx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[354, 551, 558], 556, 557, maniloff_01, kota_02 465
Optical channel - coherent	187:	467, 468
Power budget - coherent	187:	466
Chromatic dispersion	180: 181: 182: 183: 180, 183	22, 24, johnson_01 28, 29, johnson_01 23, johnson_01 [18, 19, 93], 20, 21, johnson_01, liu_01 [266, 267], johnson_01
Channel insertion loss	181:	39
Tx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	312 86, 168, [320, 321] [89, 171], 172

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Rx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	[<u>311</u> , 261], 403, 404 169, 262 173
Power budget - IMDD	180: 183:	66 319
Optical channel - IMDD	183:	94
Tap weights (TDECQ)	180: 181: 182: 183:	[<u>202</u> , 68], welch_01 [<u>203</u> , 79], welch_01 [<u>204</u> , 83], welch_01 [<u>205</u> , 96], welch_01
TDECQ	182: 183: 182, 183: 181, 183	167 [<u>170</u> , 88, 90, 91, 92] [313, 315], mi_02 [<u>80</u> , 84, 97]
TDECQ test setup	180, 181, 182, 183:	[<u>67</u> , 78, 82, 95], ghaisi_01
Test patterns	182:	317
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Tx compliance	182:	25, 27
Signal detect	180:	400
RIN	180:	407, 408, 409
ILT	180, 181, 182, 183:	[98, 103, 105, 106, 111, 113], issenhuth_02 [100, 101, 102, 108, 109, 110], issenhuth_02
Test points	180:	399, issenhuth_02
MDI	180, 182:	[341, 342], dambrosia_02, issenhuth_02
Jitter	180:	402, 562
Pulled from bucket #1		99, 107
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Time sync - Introductory clauses - Path data delay variables - Physical layer clause tables	174,169,116 175,176,177,184,186 178,179,180,181,182,183,185,187,174, 169,116	[268, 270, 272] [274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286] [287, 288, 289, 290, 291, 292, 294, 269, 271, 273]
PTP accuracy (ER1)	171,186	[254, 255, 256, 301, 302, 303, 356, 457, 458, huber_02]
PMA service interface	176	[13, 17, 228, 229, 235, 236, 237, 238, 585]
Features, Symbol lock	176	[14, 16], 182, [296, 297]
Deskew	177	[159, 5]
IBSF	177	[359, 469, 470, 471, he_3dj_01_2409]
Delay, Pilot sequence	184	559, 560, kota_01
Pseudocode	184	[243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 249, 250, 252, huber_01]
Convolutional interleaver	184	50
PMD interface	184,186 (affects 185, 187)	[251, 257, 514]
Payload Type value	186	253
Summary of functions	186	56
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

14, 16, 46, 50, 56, 99, 107, 116, 117, 153, 175, 179, 180, 181, 182, 188, 193, 215, 224, 225, 253, 296, 565, 571, 572, 578 (26 comments total)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf

No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

The proposed responses for bucket #1 and #2 (with the exception of the pulled comments listed above) were adopted by Motion #1 on 5 September 2024.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):

62, 63, 72, 73, 74, 75, 81, 85, 87, 124, 186, 309, 453, 475, 476, 497, 512, 579,
580, 581, 582, 583

Electrical track #1 - 2nd alternative

Topic	C178
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	[377 , 35, 567], [2, 545], [1, 546], [37, 142, 547]
ERL (10)	[526 , 542], [540 , 531 , 541 , 444], [423 , 150], 543, 539
MLSD (8)	[529 , 4, 3, 535], [530 , 536], [327 healey_?], 363, 208
A_v, A_ne, A_fe, Tx diff PtP, vf (17)	[160 , 161], 376 , [162 , 163], 528, 534, [523 , 524 , 563 , 146 , 570], [410, 538], 139, 416 , 573
Frequency masks (9)	[374, 527], 378, 379, 380, 387, 388, 393, 445 ran_?
Host channel (15)	[395 , 537 lim_?, 422], [33 heck_?], [148, 196, 420], 115, 566 , [194, 519 , 521, 522], 195, 418
ILdd budget (8)	[460 , 461, 189], 432, 518, [520 , 126], 190
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>	

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #1 (matt's suggestion)

Topic	Comments
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	178: [377, 2, 545] 179: [1, 546] 176D: [37, 35, 142, 547] 178A: 567
ERL (10)	178: [526, 542], [540, 531, 541], 543 176D: 539 176E: [423, 150] 179B: 444
MLSD (8)	178: [4, 529, 530], 363 (CC) 179: [3, 535, 536] 178A: [327 healey_?] 179A: 208
A_v, A_ne, A_fe, Tx diff PtP, vf (17)	178: [160, 376], 528, 523 179: 534, 524, 563, 161 176D: [410, 538], 162, 139 176E: [416 ran_02], 163, 573, 146, 570
Frequency masks (9) [ran_01]	178: [374, 527], 378, 379, 380 179: 387, 388, 393 179B: 445
Host channel (16)	179: 395, [537 lim_?], 193 176D: [33 heck_?] 176E: [148, 196, 420], 418, 422, [115 lusted_01] 179A: 566, [194, 519, 521, 522], 195
ILdd budget (8)	179: [460, 461, 189], 190 179A: 432, 518, 520 179B: 126
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>	

Matt suggests that you drop a few rows from this page and increase font size to 12 so it's easily readable. Fewer comments per page will be less intimidating to the task force. Don't worry about having too many slides; clarity is key.

I prefer this view over slide 7.

However, after discussion with Kent, if the comments need to be addressed in groups by color, then maybe Adees alternate on slide 8 is better.

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation