P802.3dj D1.1
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.1 comment resolution.

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.

❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be "parked" and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.

➢ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 4 days to complete

➢ Any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

❖ Review the proposed response
  ➢ Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  ➢ If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  ➢ If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  ➢ Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  ➢ The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  ➢ Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
❖ Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

587 comments received
26 withdrawn
141 in bucket #1 closed
53 in bucket #2 closed
445 total closed so far
142 left to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
1	0	0	4	0	0	1	0	5	5
116	1	0	8	0	0	2	2	9	11
119	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
120F	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
120G	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
169	0	0	2	1	0	2	0	5	5
171	1	0	3	0	0	2	0	6	6
172	1	0	1	0	0	1	0	3	3
174	0	0	3	0	0	2	1	4	5
174A	1	0	8	0	0	1	4	6	10
175	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	3	3
176	1	0	27	0	0	2	2	28	30
176A	0	0	35	0	0	21	20	36	56
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176D	0	0	10	0	0	10	1	19	20
176E	4	0	13	1	0	36	24	30	54
177	0	0	8	0	0	3	1	10	11
177A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	6	0	11	0	0	34	12	39	51
178A	0	0	2	0	0	7	3	6	9
179	5	0	17	0	0	37	28	31	59
179A	0	0	2	7	0	14	0	23	23
179B	0	0	0	3	0	10	7	6	13
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
179D	0	0	2	1	0	1	2	2	4
180	2	0	9	1	0	22	14	20	34
181	0	0	2	0	0	13	6	9	15
182	0	0	10	0	0	23	9	24	33
183	0	0	6	0	0	24	4	26	30
184	2	0	20	0	0	4	0	26	26
184A	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
185	0	0	5	0	0	9	2	12	14
186	7	0	15	0	0	4	0	26	26
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
187	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	8	8
30	2	0	0	0	0	3	0	5	5
45	3	0	1	1	0	2	0	7	7
90A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	38	0	240	15	0	294	142	445	587

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Thursday Sep 5 (online)	Online Task force Motion to adopt bucket #1 and bucket #2. May view presentation(s) and/or close a few comments
Monday Sep 16	Morning: Task force. Possible motion to adopt bucket #3. Cross-clause (not optical) comments, electrical comments Afternoon: Task force. Remaining cross-clause comments (until done), electrical comments Evening: Electrical track only (if needed)
Tuesday Sep 17	Morning/afternoon: Electrical track, logic track, optical track Evening: Electrical track, logic track, optical track (if needed)
Wednesday Sep 18	Electrical track, logic track, optical track
Thursday Sep 19	Common (task force) track Remaining comments. Prioritized appropriately.

Common (task force) #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Annex reorganization	176A/C/D/E	~~511~~
Signaling rate	Many	~~118~~, ~~367~~, ~~brown_04~~
Error ratio, block error ratio method	174A	~~324~~, ~~325~~, ~~326~~, ~~healey_02~~
Error ratio, block error ratio vs BER	174A, 182	<mark>318, 314,</mark> ~~mi_01~~
Error ratio, BERadded values	Many	[~~137~~, ~~143~~, ~~361, 166, 164, 165, 316, brown_04~~]
Error ratio, BERadded context	Many	~~141~~, ~~152~~
Error ratio, target value	184/185	550, kota_02 slide 3
Error ratio, organization	174A	134
Error ratio, nomenclature	Many	[473,133]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. <mark style="background-color:cyan">Cyan highlight</mark>: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common (task force) #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT: Message format	176A	336**, 335**
ILT: Coefficients and presets	176A	184**
ILT: Training patterns	176A	[495*, 76], 218**
ILT: Precoding	176A, 176, 177	509*, [~~212, 213, 214, 215~~, ~~216**~~, 217]
ILT: State diagrams	176A	64**
ILT: Timing	176A	61**, 505
ILT: Extender	176A	[492*, 493]
ILT: LT types	176A	[209*, 77, 132]
AUI architecture and ILT signaling	176D/E, 176, 177	[516, 508, 357, 478, 224, 225, brown_03]
ILT: General	176A	46, [480, brown_03], 481, 482, [483, 484]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 **: High priority, *: Medium priority		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	377, 2, 545	1, 546	37, 35, 142, 547		567	
ERL (10)	[526, 542], [540, 531, 541], 543		539	[423, 150]		179B: 444
MLSD (8)	[4, 529, 530], 363 (CC)	[3, 535, 536]			[327 healey_01]	179A: 208
Frequency masks (9)	ran_01, [374, 527], 378, 379, 380	387, 388, 393				179B: 445
A_v, A_ne, A_fe vs. R_d (9)	376, 160, 528	161, 534	162, 410, 538	163, 573		
Tx diff PtP, vf, dvf (7)	523, simms_01	524, 563	139	[416 ran_02] 146, 570		

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Topic	179	176D	176E	179ABCD
ILdd budget, reach (11)	[~~460~~, ~~461~~, ~~189~~, ~~mellitz_01~~], *190, ~~kareti_01~~	~~33~~	[**115** ~~lusted_04~~, ~~ghiasi_03~~, ~~kareti_02~~]	179A: [~~519~~, ~~521~~, ~~522~~], ~~432~~, ~~518~~
Host channel model and parameters (7)	395, [537 lim_01], *193*		**422**, *418*	179A: ~~566~~, ~~195~~ ~~diminico_01~~
ILdd equations and figures (4)			[~~420~~, ~~148~~, ~~196 ran_03~~]	~~194~~
MTF (2)				179A: ~~520~~ 179B: ~~126~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1				

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Topic	178	179	176E	178A	179ABCD
Rx test details (6)	[**371**, **372**]	332, 390	*154*, 158		
Rx test multi-lane (3)	**334** (CC)		[155, 157]		
C2M link diagram (2)			[412, ~~515 ran_03~~, ~~ghiasi_04~~]		
DC common mode (2)			147, 417		
S-parameter frequency range (4)				[425, 548]	179B: 439, 446
Test fixture spec parameters (3)					179B: 442, 443, 447
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #4

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Test fixture delay (4)	532	*[199, 200, 201]*		*198*		
CA types, nomenclature (6)		394, *[130, 131]*, 191				179B: *127, 128*
AC coupling (9)	*[533, 119, 120, 121]*	*[122, 123, 125]*		*[114, 413]*		
Rx test methodology (4)		*[389, 391, 392]* (CC)		153		
Tx FFE preset (2)		*333 healey_03* (CC)		*569* (CC)		
Tx AC CM (3)		*385, 386*		*575*		
Tx jitter (10)	***174**, **368*** (CC)	383 (CC), *175 calvin_01, 181*, zivny_01	***176***	*[177, 178]*, *[179 180]*		
VEC (9)		*564, 577, 561 calvin_04, 565, 578*, dawe_01		*[322 Calvin_02]*, *[116, 117]*, *571*		
COM (1)					188	
Tx test setup (1)				*572*		

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TQM	185, 187:	[~~259~~, ~~260~~], issenhuth_01
Tx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[~~353~~, ~~552~~, ~~554~~, ~~555~~], ~~553~~, maniloff_01, kota_02 ~~463~~, ~~464~~
Rx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[~~354~~, ~~551~~, ~~558~~], ~~556~~, ~~557~~, maniloff_01, kota_02 ~~465~~
Optical channel - coherent	187:	~~467~~, ~~468~~
Power budget - coherent	187:	~~466~~
Chromatic dispersion	180: 181: 182: 183: 180, 183	~~22~~, ~~24~~, johnson_01 ~~28~~, ~~29~~, johnson_01 ~~23~~, johnson_01 [~~18~~, ~~19~~, ~~93~~], ~~20~~, ~~21~~, johnson_01, liu_01 [~~266~~, ~~267~~], johnson_01 ==(some comments missed in this agenda slide but now resolved: ~~25,26,27~~)==
Channel insertion loss	181:	~~39~~
Tx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	~~312~~ ~~86~~, ~~168~~, [~~320~~, ~~321~~] [~~89~~, ~~171~~], ~~172~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Rx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	[~~311~~, ~~261~~], ~~403~~, ~~404~~ ~~169~~, ~~262~~ ~~173~~
Power budget - IMDD	180: 183:	~~66~~ ~~319~~
Optical channel - IMDD	183:	~~94~~
Tap weights (TDECQ)	180: 181: 182: 183:	[~~202~~, ~~68~~], welch_01 (68,79, 83, 96 may re-open on Wednesday) [~~203~~, ~~79~~], welch_01 [~~204~~, ~~83~~], welch_01 [~~205~~, ~~96~~], welch_01
TDECQ	182: 183: 182, 183: 181, 183	~~167~~ [~~170~~, ~~88~~, ~~90~~, ~~91~~, ~~92~~] [313, 315], mi_02 [80, 84, 97]
TDECQ test setup	180, 181, 182, 183:	[67, 78, 82, 95], ghaisi_01
Test patterns	182:	317
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Tx compliance	182:	25, 27
Signal detect	180:	400
RIN	180:	407, 408, 409
ILT	180, 181, 182, 183:	[98, 103, 105, 106, 111, 113], issenhuth_02 [100, 101,102, 108, 109, 110], issenhuth_02
Test points	180:	399, issenhuth_02
MDI	180, 182:	[341, 342], dambrosia_02, issenhuth_02
Jitter	180:	402, 562
Pulled from bucket #1		99, 107
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Time sync - Introductory clauses - Path data delay variables - Physical layer clause tables	174,169,116 175,176,177,184,186 178,179,180,181,182,183,185,187	[268, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273 274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286 287, 288, 289, 290, 291, 292, 294]
PTP accuracy (ER1)	171,186	[254, 255, 256, 301, 302, 303, 356, 457, 458, **huber_02**]
PMA service interface	176	[13, 17, 228, 229, 235, 236, 237, 238, 585]
Features, Symbol lock	176	[14, 16], 182, [296, 297]
Deskew	177	[159, 5]
IBSF	177	[359, 469, 470, 471, **he_01a**]
Delay, Pilot sequence	184	559, 560, **kota_01a**
Pseudocode	184	[243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 249, 250, 252, **huber_01b**]
Convolutional interleaver	184	50
Coherent PMD interface	184,186 (affects 185, 187)	[251, 257, 514]
Payload Type value	186	253
Summary of functions	186	56
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf
The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:
14, 16, 46, 50, 56, 99, 107, 116, 117, 153, 175, 179, 180, 181, 182, 188, 193, 215, 224, 225, 253, 296, 565, 571, 572, 578 (26 comments total)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf
No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

The proposed responses for bucket #1 and #2 (with the exception of the pulled comments listed above) were adopted by Motion #1 on 5 September 2024.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
62, 63, 72, 73, 74, 75, 81, 85, 87, 124, 186, 212, 213, 214, 215, 309, 453, 475, 476, 497, 512, 579, 580, 581, 582, 583